The Potential Manifestation of Place as a Brand Component of Regional Meat:
The Cases of Cumbrian Salt Marsh Lamb and Herdwick Lamb

Gillian Rodríguez

School of Agriculture, Food and Rural Development
Newcastle University

Dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

June 2015
School of Agriculture, Food and Rural Development

Newcastle University

The Potential Manifestation of Place as a Brand Component of Regional Meat:

The Cases of Cumbrian Salt Marsh Lamb and Herdwick Lamb

Gillian Rodríguez

Dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
Abstract

Purpose – the purpose of this research is to explore respondents’ knowledge of regional foods including the pre-product stage i.e. in the landscape. Herdwick lamb and Cumbrian salt marsh lamb are both highly visible in the landscape and form part of the ‘lifescape’ of local residents.

Design/method/approach – taking a phenomenological stance the research examines the experiential claims of respondents; means-end chain analysis was selected to gather customer values relating to this broader product concept. Ladder maps were drawn up for each of two sets of twenty respondents residing in the production region of either lamb. Hierarchical value maps are produced to reveal salient connections.

Findings – show that respondents hold a very wide range of perceptions, experiences and associations with the ‘pre-products’, which influences their judgement about the freshness, flavour, quality of the meat. The ability to fulfil other functions by buying regional meat became apparent, in particular the need to make a contribution to the local economy, to support the ecology, and to know the place through community interaction. Respondents were found to interact with the landscape on two levels, perception and inner reflection.

Practical implications – effective regional food brands may be characterised by branding actions which do not have the food product details at their core. The development of relationships, events and brand communities in a shared place may sustain producers who have their volume output limited by what the land will bear.

Originality and value – the limitations of some marketing structures are considered for adaptation including: Boatwright et al.’s (2009) value opportunity analysis and Keller’s (2008) consumer based brand equity model. An opportunity for creation of a new category of attribute, relating to experience of ‘pre-products’ in the landscape is discussed.
Dedication

To my late father, and to my mother who in their late 20’s decided to leave town and raise a family in Coniston. Thanks to my husband who has done so much – extra, so that I could work on this.
Acknowledgements

Many thanks to Prof. Ritson, Dr Kusnezof and Dr Tregear for their support. Thanks also to the 40 respondents for affording their time and effort on extended interviews.
# Table of Contents

**Contents**

Abstract ....................................................................................................................................... i  
Dedication .................................................................................................................................. ii  
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................. iii  
Table of Contents ...................................................................................................................... iv  
Tables ...................................................................................................................................... xiv  

Chapter 1 Introduction ............................................................................................................... 1  
  1.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 1  
  1.2 Background: The importance of regional food to Cumbria ........................................... 1  
  1.3 Consumer perception of regional foods ........................................................................... 3  
  1.4 The selection of two Cumbrian regional food products ................................................... 4  
  1.5 Aims and objectives .......................................................................................................... 5  
  1.6 Research design ................................................................................................................. 6  
  1.7 Anticipated contribution ..................................................................................................... 7  
  1.8 Structure of thesis .............................................................................................................. 7  
  1.9 Summary ........................................................................................................................... 9  

Chapter 2 The Concept Of Regional Food And The Context Of Naturally Embedded Food Products In Cumbria ................................................................................................................ 10  
  2.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 10  
  2.2 Cumbria’s boundaries ......................................................................................................... 10  
    2.2.1 A metropolitan view of Cumbria ............................................................................. 10  
    2.2.2 Economic data for Cumbria ................................................................................... 12  
    2.2.3 The importance of sheep farming to Cumbria ....................................................... 13  
    2.2.4 The importance of regional foods in Cumbria ....................................................... 15  
    2.2.5 The entrepreneurial opportunities regional foods offer to Cumbria ................. 16  
    2.2.6 Conceptualising Cumbria as an attribute of regional food ................................... 18
## 2.3 EU legislation and terminology relating to regional foods

- **2.3.1 Rationale for designation**
- **2.3.2 EU regulations**
- **2.3.3 Regulation, protection and motivation for regional food businesses**
- **2.3.4 Implications of EU regulations**
- **2.3.5 Terminology and characteristics of regional foods**
- **2.3.6 Speciality foods**
- **2.3.7 Naturally embedded food products (NEFPs)**
- **2.3.8 Regional foods**
- **2.3.9 Measures of success of the regional foods sector**

### 2.4 Summary

## Chapter 3 Place branding and food choice relating to NEFPs

- **3.1 Introduction**
- **3.2 NEFPs in the local consumptionscape**
  - **3.2.1 Possessions, identity and places**
  - **3.2.2 Perspectives on place**
  - **3.2.3 Place and person**
  - **3.2.4 Consumer attitudes and ‘their place’**
  - **3.2.5 The lifescape concept**
  - **3.2.6 Place and food product**
- **3.3 The context of branding product and place**
  - **3.3.1 The construct of brand and brand function**
  - **3.3.2 The early branding process, brand visioning and identity**
  - **3.3.3 An examination of consumer values**
  - **3.3.4 Agricultural commodity branding**
  - **3.3.5 Multiple-retailer reassurances of meat quality**
  - **3.3.6 Branding considerations for agricultural products**
3.3.7 Place branding

3.4 The structure of the literature on food choice

3.4.1 Culture, consumption situation and food choice

3.4.2 The fit of NEFPs in consumers’ perceptions

3.4.3 Consumer food choice and meat

3.4.4 Lamb, from anonymous commodity to regional character

3.4.5 Lamb as a food product

3.4.6 Literature specific to the consumption of lamb

3.5 Summary

Chapter 4 The Cumbrian Context of HL and CSML

4.1 Introduction to Case Studies

4.2 Case Study One: The HL as a Cumbrian regionally embedded food

4.2.1 The HLs’ Identity with Lakeland, and EU Status

4.2.2 Identity, possessions, places and the past

4.2.3 Lakeland as a place-brand ingredient for HL – recent connections

4.2.4 Herdwick’s PDO registration

4.2.5 Heritage, husbandry and headlines relating to HL

4.2.6 Discussion and questions relating to HL as a potential brand

4.3 Summary

4.4 Case study two: salt marsh lamb as a Cumbrian regionally embedded food

4.4.1 Introduction to the product concept and to the associated literature

4.4.2 Salt marsh lamb defined and UK resources

4.4.4 Salt marsh ecology and grazing

4.4.5 Human intervention and the salt marsh as a land resource

4.4.6 Salt marsh lamb husbandry

4.4.7 Regions placing value on salt marsh lamb
4.4.8 The culinary character of salt marsh lamb ....................................................... 108
4.4.9 The concept of sea salt ..................................................................................... 108
4.5 Salt marsh lamb summary ....................................................................................... 109
4.6 Synthesis the history and development of the cases of HL and CSML ............. 110

Chapter 5 Theoretical Approach and Research Process ............................................. 112
5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 112
5.2 The Adoption of a qualitative or quantitative research paradigm in marketing..... 113
5.2.1 Origins of phenomenology .............................................................................. 115
5.2.2 Rationale for adoption of the phenomenological approach amongst others.... 116
5.3 Means-end chain analysis ...................................................................................... 118
5.3.1 Origen and development of MEC analysis ...................................................... 118
5.3.2 MEC analysis and alternative methods ............................................................ 119
5.3.3 A critique of MEC: Limitations and Mitigations ............................................. 121
5.3.4 A defence for MEC .......................................................................................... 123
5.4 Components of means-end chain methodology .................................................... 123
5.4.1 Cognitive links ................................................................................................. 124
5.4.2 Types of consequences .................................................................................... 124
5.4.3 Establishing value linkages or connections .................................................... 124
5.4.4 MEC outputs for branding and communications ............................................. 126
5.5 Data generation ...................................................................................................... 127
5.5.1 Consideration of research objectives and respondents .................................... 127
5.5.2 Recruiting respondents ..................................................................................... 128
5.5.3 Approach to data collection for MEC .............................................................. 130
5.5.4 Themes for discussion and visual prompts ...................................................... 131
5.5.5 Data Collection ................................................................................................ 132
5.6 Ethical considerations ............................................................................................ 133
5.7 Analysis of findings and identification of emergent constructs ......................... 134
Chapter 6

6.3.9 CSML Environment

6.3.10 CSML Social

6.3.11 CSML Commercialisation

6.3.12 CSML HMV Summary

6.4 Comparison of HL and CSML results

6.4.1 The respective codes for HL and CSML

6.4.2 The ‘local’ construct for HL and CSML

6.4.3 The ‘environment’ construct for HL and CSML

6.4.4 The ‘distribution’ construct for HL & the Community construct for CSML

6.4.5 The ‘commercialisation’ construct for CSML

6.55 The ‘heritage’ construct for HL and ‘credibility’ construct for CSML

6.4.7 The ‘time’ construct for CSML

6.4.8 The constructs of ‘sensory’ for HL, ‘flavour’ and ‘organoleptic’ for CSML

6.4.9 The ‘husbandry’ construct for HL and ‘credibility’ construct for CSML

6.5 Summary

Chapter 7

7.1 Introduction

7.2 Perceptions and values relating to regional lamb

7.2.1 Perceptions of place (incorporating embedded lamb)

7.2.2 Internal Identity Reflections

7.2.3 Experiencing place through community

7.3 Implications from the derived hierarchy of benefits

7.3.1 Consideration of terminal values

7.3.2 HL terminal values and supporting chains

7.3.3 CSML terminal values and supporting chains

7.3.4 Comment on HL and CSML HVMs

7.4 The process of transition from value chains to brand development
7.4.1 Brand development ................................................................. 195
7.4.2 HL and the CBBE model-salience ........................................... 198
7.4.3 HL and the CBBE model-performance .................................... 199
7.4.4 HL and the CBBE model-judgements ..................................... 200
7.4.5 HL and the CBBE model-brand imagery ................................ 200
7.4.6 HL and the CBBE model-feelings ........................................... 201
7.4.7 HL and the CBBE model-resonance ....................................... 201
7.4.8 HL and the CBBE model- .................................................... 202
7.4.9 Brand identity for HL and CSML .......................................... 202
7.4.9 HL, CSML and the Prism of Brand Identity ............................ 203
7.4.10 Model proposal for embedded meats ................................. 209
7.5 Summary .................................................................................. 210

Chapter 8 Conclusion and Recommendations ............................... 213
8.1 Introduction .............................................................................. 213
8.2 Where regional meats best fit within a typology of regional food. .. 213
8.3 Show the importance of regional food within Cumbria and the specific role and contribution played by sheep farming. ................................................................. 214
8.4 Reveal and review consumers’ perceptions and values relating to regional lamb. . 215
8.5 Synthesise the history and development of the cases of HL and CSML . . 215
8.6 To evaluate consumer characterisations of HL and CSML in their production environments .................................................................................................................. 217
8.7 The hierarchy of benefits, identified by consumers which can be linked to Cumbrian HL and CSML. ................................................................. 218
8.8 Discuss branding recommendations for HL and CSML producers on the basis of research findings. ................................................................. 220
8.9 Discussion on theoretical, practical and policy implications of brand recommendations ................................................................. 221
8.9.2 Practical implications of the empirical findings. ....................... 222
8.9.3 Policy implications of the empirical findings ................................................. 223
8.10 Reflection on the thesis ........................................................................................... 224
8.10.1 Soft-laddering interviews ................................................................................. 224
8.10.2 Working with the data collected ........................................................................ 224
8.10.3 Derivation of an interpretivist perspective using MEC ..................................... 225
8.11 Recommendations for further study ........................................................................ 226
8.11.1 Brand development semiotics .......................................................................... 226
8.11.2 Attribute classification and embedded meats ................................................... 226
8.11.3 Brand visioning for the future .......................................................................... 226
8.12 Summary ................................................................................................................. 226
References .......................................................................................................................... 228
Appendices .......................................................................................................................... 276
Appendix A The salient claims in current Herdwick sales promotional materials ..... 277
Appendix B Invitation to participate as respondent ..................................................... 278
Appendix C Herdwick Respondent Details .................................................................. 279
Appendix D Cumbrian Salt Marsh Lamb Respondent Details ...................................... 280
Appendix E Themes Guide for HL and CSML interviews & Prompts ......................... 281
Appendix F Transcript Sample HL .............................................................................. 286
Appendix G Transcript sample CSML .......................................................................... 293
Appendix H Attribute descriptors and coding HL .......................................................... 299
Appendix I Attribute descriptors and coding CSML ..................................................... 300
Appendix J Ladder Map for HL consumer 1 ................................................................. 302
Appendix K Ladder Map for HL consumer 2 .................................................................. 303
Appendix L Ladder Map for HL consumer 3 .................................................................. 304
Appendix M Ladder Map for HL consumer 8 ................................................................. 305
Appendix N Ladder Map for HL consumer 9 .................................................................. 306
Appendix O Ladder Map for HL consumer 10 ............................................................... 307
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL consumer 11</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL consumer 13</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL consumer 16</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL consumer 20</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 4</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 5</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 6</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 7</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 14</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 15</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Z</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 17</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AA</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 18</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AB</td>
<td>Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 19</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AC</td>
<td>Value codes HL</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AD</td>
<td>Summary Implication Matrix HL</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AE</td>
<td>Hierarchical value map HL</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML consumer 2</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AG</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML consumer 3</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AH</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 4</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AI</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML consumer 6</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJ</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 7</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AK</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML consumer 10</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AL</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML consumer 11</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AM</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 13</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AN</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 14</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AO</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 15</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AP</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 5</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix AQ</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 8</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix AR</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 9</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix AS</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 12</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix AT</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML consumer 16</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix AU</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML consumer 17</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix AV</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML consumer 18</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix AW</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 19</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix AX</td>
<td>Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 20</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix AY</td>
<td>Value codes CSML</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix AZ</td>
<td>Summary implication matrix CSML</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix AAA</td>
<td>Hierarchical value map for CSML</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tables

Table 2.1  The Value to Cumbria of Herdwick and Cumbrian Salt Marsh Lamb ............. 14
Table 2.2  Theoretical Interpretation of Appellations ......................................................... 23
Table 2.3  A Typology of Regional Foods .............................................................................. 32
Table 3.1  Themes Pertinent to Developing a Definition of ‘Brand’ ........................................ 50
Table 3.2  Negative Perceptions of Brands .......................................................................... 51
Table 3.3  Cross Tabulation of Attributes and Cues, for Meat Purchase ............................ 84
Table 4.1  Lamb registered with PDO status in the UK (Fresh Meat) ................................ 91
Table 4.2  The Herdwick Year ............................................................................................ 95
Table 4.3  Four Varieties of L’Agneau Pré-salé ................................................................... 106
Table 5.1  Characteristics of Quantitative and Qualitative Paradigms .............................. 113
Table 5.2  Comparative Table of Qualitative Methodological Approaches ....................... 116
Table 5.3  Limitations of MEC and Corresponding Actions .............................................. 122
Table 5.4  Respondent Populations for Consideration ........................................................ 127
Table 6.1  Coding of Attributes Identified by Herdwick Lamb Consumers .................... 142
Table 6.2  Coding of Attributes Identified by Salt Marsh Lamb Respondents ................ 151
Table 6.3  HL Place Attribute 1, Local ............................................................................... 163
Table 6.4  CSML Place Attribute 1, Local ....................................................................... 164
Table 6.5  HL Place attribute 3, Meat/Environment .......................................................... 166
Table 6.6  CSML Place attribute 6, Environment ............................................................... 167
Table 6.7  HL Place Attribute 6 Breed Personality .............................................................. 169
Table 6.8  HL Place attribute 4, Local Distribution Network ............................................ 171
Table 6.9  CSML Place attribute 3, Community ................................................................. 171
Table 6.10 CSML Place attribute 5, Commercialisation .................................................... 173
Table 6.11 HL Place attribute 5, Heritage ........................................................................ 174
Table 6.12 CSML Place attribute 7, Credibility ................................................................. 175
Table 6.13 CSML Place attribute 4, Time ......................................................................... 175
Table 6.14 HL Place Attributes 7 Sensory ........................................................................ 177
Table 6.15 CSML Place attribute 2, Flavour ...................................................................... 178
Table 6.16 CSML Place attribute 8, Organoleptic .............................................................. 179
Table 6.17 HL place attribute 8 Husbandry ....................................................................... 180
Table 7.1  Matrix of Dominant Chains and Both Lamb Cases ............................................ 183
Table 7.2  MECCAS Model of Advertising (Reynolds and Gutman, 1984) ..................... 194
Table 7.3  The Value Opportunity Analysis (VOA) ............................................................ 197
Figures

Figure 2.1 The Dynamic Facets of Territorial Distinctiveness in Foods ....................... 18
Figure 3.1 Brand Identity Prism ..................................................................................... 42
Figure 3.2 The McDonald’s Positioning Ladder ............................................................... 54
Figure 3.3 Customer-Based Brand Equity Pyramid ....................................................... 59
Figure 3.3 The Total Food Quality Model .................................................................... 72
Figure 3.4 Factors Affecting Perceived Authenticity of Regional Foods ..................... 73
Figure 6.2 Example of a Ladder Map for CSML(1) ....................................................... 153
Figure 7.1 Customer-Based Brand Equity Pyramid (Keller, 2008:58) ......................... 198
Figure 7.3 Kapferer’s (2008) Prism of Brand Identity Applied to HL .......................... 207
Figure 7.4 Kapferer’s (2008) Prism of Brand Identity Applied to CSML ..................... 208
Figure 7.5 Brand Community Building Model for Embedded Meats .......................... 209
Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 Introduction
This thesis investigates the significance of place in marketing of two regional meats from Cumbria with specific provenance, namely Herdwick lamb and Cumbrian salt marsh lamb. Both products currently face brand development challenges. Although there have been a number of studies (Tregear et al., 1998; Henchion & McIntyre, 2000) which have looked at consumer perception and marketing of regional food, recommendations are generalised to the level of the product category, rather than specific to a particular brand. Formulation of place-marketing-related recommendations in this field is further complicated by the nature of the production being the output of agricultural husbandry rather than industrial processes. Taking an interpretive approach, informed by literature on regional food, brand development and place-related marketing, this thesis explores perceptions of Herdwick lamb and Cumbrian salt marsh lamb held by consumers local to the place of production, with a view to making marketing recommendations for their brand development.

The thesis begins by outlining the background to the study. The aims and objectives are then presented, followed by an outline justifying the research design adopted. The anticipated contribution of the study is discussed from the perspective of stakeholders and the Cumbrian economy. Finally, the structure of the thesis is described by chapter.

1.2 Background: The importance of regional food to Cumbria
The market for food in Cumbria is unusual, in that there is a relatively small local market of under half a million people as noted in the 2011 Census (Cumbria Observatory, 2012) with an influx of a significant 40.1 million visitors in 2011, comprising of 35 million day trippers and 5.1 million overnight visitors (Cumbria Tourism, 2012). Whilst neither of these populations is homogeneous, it seems reasonable to suppose that communications for a ‘native’ regional food product, should successfully resonate with local ‘food-conscious’ consumers, if they are to stimulate place-association value with visitors.

Cumbria has seen resurgence in the provision of regional foods, both traditional and speciality (Li & Ness, 1998; Youngs, 2003). Cumbria has benefited from the national trend
in favour of locally produced food, and food which communicates its provenance explicitly-linked to consumers’ food safety or environmental concerns including for example: Nook Farm Honey, South Lakes Organic Milk, Appleby Creamery (Frewer et al., 2001).

In Cumbria there have been both push and pull factors stimulating this development; the push came from awareness of European policy affording protection to regional food producers, namely news of a change in European regulations (No 2082/92 & No 2081/92 OJ L208 of 1992) relating to ‘designations of origin’. Also contributing to the push were rebuilding attempts in much of the regional farming sector after Cumbria became one of the worst affected areas in the country for the foot and mouth outbreak of 2001 (Convery et al., 2005). The mass slaughter of livestock, and subsequent support mechanisms offered opportunities for diversification of farm income sources and stimulated some farmers’ interest in marketing their own produce, or in diversifying into new products such as baking E.g. Country Fayre (Kirkby Stephen). The pull factors manifested themselves in consumer’s heightened awareness of food provenance arising from a series of widely publicised food scares including BSE, E-Coli and Salmonella (Knowles et al., 2007).

By participating in alternative distribution options such as farmers’ markets, farm shop, or developing links with regional distributors, farmers benefitted from extra returns associated with direct or local sales. The system these options would replace, or at least partially replace, is the traditional ‘price-taker’ role at the livestock auction. The new initiatives would require the farmer, or network of farmers to take on new roles and skills in processing and marketing their products. Contingent to the success of these is a marketing perspective on such development, or more precisely, a consideration of the breadth of consumers’ perception in relation to meat, which has rarely been appreciated.

It is important to recognise the wider food environment, in particular the role of non-farming entrepreneurs in the regional foods sector. These are local or incoming residents who have identified new market opportunities in the regional food sector and responded with a raft of new products which are offering value clearly linked to ‘place of production’, for example Hawkshead Relish and Cumberland Mustard (Ansoff, cited in Kotler, 1988, p.47; Baker, 2003).
It is possible to identify two classes of entrepreneurs within the regional foods producers in Cumbria (with some exceptions): entrepreneurs who are producers, processors and retailers mainly the local agricultural sector; and 2) entrepreneurs who are purchasers, processors and retailers such as local or incoming entrepreneurs who see potential in the growing market (Anderson and McAuley, 1999). The local heritage, culture, community and land ties of the agricultural sector, offer authenticity linked to terroir related concepts specific to the growing conditions of aspect, rainfall, altitude, soil qualities (Barham, 2003). This aspect of food output influence characteristics of place must be a central consideration to the study of ‘regional foods’.

The farm as a production unit offers much less flexibility than the (usually small-scale) semi-industrial production units, used by those more ‘recipe-defined’ regional food businesses which buy-in raw materials, sourced either locally or not. The farm unit then places some restrictions on the responsiveness of farmers to market changes/conventional market process requirements.

1.3 Consumer perception of regional foods

Following the recent food scares such as bovine spongiform encephalopathy BSE, bird flu, foot and mouth, horse meat/beef verification issues, consumer interest in food provenance has increased (Frewer et al., 2001; Lloyd et al., 2006; Venn et al., 2006). Consumers are therefore looking for information which enables them to discriminate between foods. Communications relating to some regional products have clear and lengthy claims relating to provenance and heritage, particularly those with longer shelf-lives such as Romney’s Kendal Mint Cake, Sarah Nelson’s Grasmere Gingerbread. Fresh products such as meat, fish (with the exception of Morecambe Bay Potted Shrimps) and cheese do not have such a strong tradition of packaging and branding despite their possession of important regional credentials.

Additionally the identity of farming outputs via their name, e.g. Herdwick lamb produced by the farming sector, is generally shared, and not specific to one farm. Whilst production output (the meat produced by one farm) may reflect environmental constraints/terroir.
qualities common/distinct to those of nearby farms. However, regional food producers who buy-in raw-materials, are more able to develop a business/product-specific names and brand/s. There is at least a perceived commons aspect to farm production (Hardin, 1968). There is therefore a relationship to explore between the business structure and brand development for regional foods.

1.4 The selection of two Cumbrian regional food products

Much of farm livestock production in Cumbria as elsewhere in the UK has traditionally been sold through the auction system and as one generic meat or another, essentially, beef, lamb or pork. Very different breeds of stock, from Belted Galloway to Highland Cattle, or Manx Laughton to Dorsett or Tamworth to Saddleback have been raised on considerably different terrain/feed, in different environments and subjected to different husbandry practices, yet have been communicated and sold to the consumer as the same basic commodity. It is within this livestock sector, specifically with the production of lamb, that there are some recent initiatives to brand meat as regional food in Cumbria. It is in this context that examination of the place of production becomes so significant.

Animal husbandry has become an element which some consumers now consider when purchasing meat. This development has largely come about by elements in popular culture, such as TV programmes which have covered the theme. Jimmy’s Farm and River Cottage have covered the process of food production in detail and included some regional perspectives, whilst Jamie Oliver’s foray into meat issues, has given national prominence to Cumbrian producer Peter Gott (Sillfield Farm, Endmoor, Kendal) and his ethics associated with meat production.

The selected products are two types of lamb produced in Cumbria; these are Herdwick lamb (HL) and Cumbrian salt marsh lamb (CSML). These products used as ‘case study’ examples for examination of the value of place in regional food product marketing.
The products selected feature visually in distinct places/environments within Cumbria: the high Lakeland fells, and the salt marshes of the south-western coast. One has a strong regional heritage and gastronomic claims relative to the zone of production, and one claims gastronomic value relative to terroir features, more recognised in France than in the UK. Both products are produced by a range of producers able to make similar claims for their output.

There is no commercial sponsorship involved in this thesis; the products were selected as representing distinct geographical zones, with distinct ‘terroir’ features and associated gastronomic claims whilst at the same time representing a single commodity. They seemed to characterize the potential for value-adding as a result of marketing practice, to raise products out of anonymity towards belonging to a place.

HL is supremely suited to its environment of the high Lakeland fell; and it has a substantial heritage and history with the local farming community. CSML is not breed-specific communications for this product draw on the success of the French ‘Agneau pré-salé’, and claims made about the quality of the meat resulting from an animal grazing in a saline environment.

Despite the regional cultural traditions associated with the HL and the landscape, or the longevity of the practice of coastal farmers to use the grazing of the salt marsh, these vistas of the product within the landscape have yet to establish themselves within the format of food brands.

1.5 Aims and objectives.

Overall Aim

The overall aim of this study was to explore the potential manifestation of place as a brand component of regional meat. The cases of Cumbrian Salt Marsh Lamb and Herdwick Lamb
The objectives for this research were to:

(i) Show where regional meat best fit within a typology of regional food
(ii) Show the importance of regional food within Cumbria and the specific role and contribution played by sheep farming.
(iii) Reveal and review consumers’ perceptions and values relating to regional lamb, and place
(iv) Synthesise the history and development of the cases of HL and CSML
(v) Obtain and evaluate consumer characterisations of HL and CSML in their production environments.
(vi) Derive the hierarchy of benefits, identified by consumers which can be linked to HL and CSML.
(vii) Discuss branding recommendations for HL and CSML producers on the basis of research findings.

1.6 Research design

The research undertaken used a qualitative interpretive approach suited to the collection and analysis of respondents’ perceptions of a regional product. The interviewing technique was selected in accordance with the requirements of means-end chain analysis. This process was deemed most efficient to elicit customer values relating to the product, which would inform elements of brand design.

Means-end chain analysis involves linking lower level concrete or abstract product characteristics, with functional or psychosocial consequences, arising from consumption, which then contribute towards achievement of instrumental or terminal life values (Gutman, 1982b; 1991).

Means-end chain analysis was selected because identity of the products with the region was seen as playing an important part in consumer choice, and in the essence of ‘regional products’. Credence variables are also seen as key in the communication of gastronomic, ‘terroir’ and heritage related attributes. The cognitions and rationalisations used by consumers in considering their lamb choices would be revealed using this method, and understanding of these linkages feed into development of product communications.
Data was collected by forty, one to one, semi-structured interviews, where the interviewer aimed to elicit different levels of benefit from the respondent, arising from the discussion on either HL or CSML (twenty respondents for each lamb). The composite hierarchy of benefits or means-end chain analysis (for each lamb) which resulted from the interviews was then used in developing the respective brand offerings.

1.7 Anticipated contribution

The thesis sought to capitalize on opportunities presented by consumers’ growing interest in what can be summarised as ‘terroir’ factors, whether motivated by gastronomic desires or food security/sustainability/animal husbandry concerns, there is a perception of added-value from regional products (Henchion & McIntyre, 2000; Weatherell et al., 2003).

The selected products have traditionally been ‘hidden beneath a commodity umbrella brand’ that of “lamb”, the challenge was to communicate clearly the attributes which the products possess, which correspond to benefits identified by consumers. Analysis of this process may therefore inform regional development via the development of regional food branding, particularly where opportunities to exploit current market conditions are not taken up owing to lack of experience, facilitating networks or training.

Literature concerning consumer food decision-making has rarely considered food as part of a consumers ‘lifescape’ (Convery et al., 2005). This holistic view of food, touches on literature from sustainability, including environmental, rural development and local geography streams.

The place-identity marketing focus represents a real potential strength for Cumbria’s regional meats it is a relatively new academic research strand, to which this thesis also contributes.

1.8 Structure of thesis

The following section will introduce the structure of the thesis by outlining the content of each chapter.

Chapter 1 introduces the main themes to be examined and links between them. It outlines the research objectives, and gives an indication of the methodology to be employed to satisfy
these. It also contains a justification for the research in the form of its contribution, and an outline of the sequence of contents.

The context section comprises the literature review, which is broken down into three chapters:

The first chapter (Chapter 2) contains an analysis of the place of Cumbria, its boundaries and its nomenclature. The economic importance of sheep farming to Cumbria is highlighted, and the range of Cumbrian regional foods outlined. EU regulations which guide place related food registration and protection are discussed. A typology of regional food is offered with a motive to achieve some clarity amongst the terminology often used interchangeably.

Chapter 3 introduces the concepts of consumptionscape, place and lifescape. How does the literature conceptualise ‘place’, and is the notion of shared geographical boundaries for regional products, associated with peoples’ identity-related boundaries? The brand-related literature is evaluated from the perspective of the branding challenges faced by farmers producing regional meat; the literature considered ranges from general marketing theory to agricultural/food initiatives, bearing in mind the context and heritage relating to the examples given. Place branding is evaluated, consideration is given to contradictions between place-linked regional food steeped in culture and heritage, and ‘brands’ as the epitome of pop culture (Kanner, 2013). The context of food choice in relation to regional foods. Food choice literature is critically reviewed, before considering lamb choices relative to the specific themes of identity, meat and place. The importance of place and identity, to these specific ‘regional’ foods is considered, having a relatively high visibility to locals in the background to their daily activities. The definition NEFPs is explored with reference to some of the food models. Consumer perceptions of naturally embedded food is also considered.

Chapter 4 comprises the two case study sections. Here the literature pertaining to the history and development of HL and CSML are reviewed. The HL case begins with Viking related myths associated with the arrival of HL in Cumbria up to recent achievement of PDO status for the breed. The CSML case considers the dynamic geographic state of the marsh, the French, and others’ reverence for their CSML, and the challenge of communicating the special qualities of the product to Cumbrian consumers.
Chapter 5 covers the theoretical approach adopted to achieve the research objectives. The phenomenological approach is presented as the philosophical position adopted in relation to the research process. The implications of such orientation are discussed as appropriate for the conceptualisation of food within a ‘lifescape’ perspective. Means-end chain analysis together with the technique of laddering is introduced as a research method, which is effective for elicitation and analysis of consumer values. The research process includes an outline of the plan for primary data collection. Next the process of data generation described and the transformation of transcripts to ladder diagrams is reported.

Chapter 6 presents results of the primary data phase in two sections, one relating to HL and one to CSML. Discussion will involve the product attributes identified by respondents, and the extracted hierarchies of progressively more abstract values, and implications of these for brand development.

Chapter 7 offers a discussion of the results of the thesis, presented firstly for HL and secondly for CSML. The results outline the product attributes identified as important by respondents.

Chapter 8 contains the final conclusions of the thesis; the themes of place and identity emerge as brand components for regional lamb. The thesis results are compared to the literature. Reflection and evaluation of the research process is finally considered in relation to theory, practice and policy in this section. Finally the recommendations for further research are included.

1.9 Summary

HL and CSML are dynamic in the marketplace, reflecting seasonal changes in their qualities and availability. They are symbols of the landscape and at the same time they share the landscape and are identified with the landscape. In possessing these relatively protected USPs, HL and CSML need to forge a new product category within distribution channels amongst ‘meat’ in order to enable an income to be generated from difficult terrain. As such they provide the core argument for studying consumer perceptions of regional lamb. The thesis uses an interpretive approach and means-end chain analysis to elicit information which reveals respondents’ value linkages relative to the products. Analysis of this data, together with critical analysis, and reflection on relevant literature, allows for brand recommendations to be offered for HL and CSML producers, along with identification of further areas for research.
Chapter 2 The Concept Of Regional Food And The Context Of Naturally Embedded Food Products In Cumbria

2.1 Introduction
The purpose of this chapter is to outline the Cumbrian context of naturally embedded food products. It will consider the boundaries of ‘Cumbria’ as a place, and the importance of sheep farming to Cumbria. The range of regional food in Cumbria will be introduced. The evolving EU legal context for association of food products with place is then briefly considered. In order to clarify the semantics linked to place-related food products, attention then moves to consider food branded with a variety of claims including: local, regional and speciality and naturally embedded food products. Finally a typology of regional foods is developed based on available literature.

2.2 Cumbria’s boundaries
Cumbria lies in the northwest of England bordering Scotland.

2.2.1 A metropolitan view of Cumbria
Brace (1999) cites Cosgrove et al.’s

“three concentric rings around London designating the city, English Heartland ......– comprising the Home Counties, East Anglia, parts of the Midland, Wessex and the Cotswolds,......and Wild Upland Britain.”

(Cosgove et al., 1996: 538 cited in Brace, 1999:93)

It is ‘Wild Upland Britain’ which contains Cumbria. Historical trading practices brought spices to its ports, which resulted in unique food flavours (Mason and Brown, 2007). The county’s borders and name have been redrawn in living history, and it has an important core of the Lake District National Park boundary within it.

Cumbria is a relatively recent regional administrative boundary/brand. The chronology of the emergence of Cumbria as a place, can be measured against Paasi’s (1986) four phases of regional construction: 1) assumption of territorial shape; 2) development of conceptual or symbolic shape 3) development of institutions 4) establishment as part of the regional consciousness of society.
1) In terms of ‘territorial shape’ Cumbria formed after the Local Government Act of 1974 when the county boundaries of Cumberland, Lancashire and Westmorland were redrawn. 2) The conceptual place of Cumbria is muddied by the heritage of its past. 3) An institutional legacy exists relating to previous territorial identities: The Westmorland Gazette (founded 1818) dominates as the local weekly newspaper in South Cumbria, whilst the Cumberland News fulfils the same function in the north of the county. Similarly the Westmorland Shopping Centre is in Kendal, Westmorland Services on the M6 (Tebay) The Westmorland Youth Orchestra, Westmorland General Hospital (Kendal), Westmorland Cricket and Croquet clubs. The Westmorland County Agricultural Society (founded 1799) organises the annual Westmorland County Agricultural Show. Notably the Westmorland coat of arms (Granted 1926) includes the head of a Herdwick ram; the ram’s forehead denotes a sheer man’s hook, used in the wool industry. The borough of Kendal also includes this hook in its insignia. Whilst regional consciousness remains fairly hybrid, these entities present themselves as codified tangible symbols of regional identity (Mueller and Schade, 2012).

The name ‘Cumberland’ remains in the name of Cumberland Building Society, Cumberland County Cricket Club, Cumberland Fell Runners Club, The West Cumberland Times and Star, and Cumberland Sausage (PGI registered) (Lefebure, 1970). Cumberland Sauce is often considered as originating from Cumberland; however the name is linked to the Duke of Cumberland, who had a preference for it (Mason, 1999).

Nomenclature incorporating ‘Lancashire’ has a less visible heritage in Cumbria. Barrow-in-Furness, Coniston, Dalton-in-Furness, Grange-Over-Sands and Ulverston all previously formed part of Lancashire. The difference with the post 1974 situation is that unlike the lost counties of Cumberland and Westmorland, Lancashire remains a county, so that continued use of the name outside its borders may be contentious.

To add to this heritage of place names, there is also the term Lakeland, often also shortened to The Lakes, or South Lakeland and North Lakes. This region relates to the Lake District National Park within Cumbria. An older resident in Coniston may then feel an affinity for all of: Lancashire, Cumbria and South Lakeland; the same quandary relates to naming the origin of regional food products, particularly where heritage is a defining attribute. The existence of Cumbria as part of the regional consciousness of society (4) is therefore yet to be achieved.

Cumbria’s national position is part of the North Western region together with Lancashire, Greater Manchester, Merseyside and Cheshire. The region extends to 14,000 square
kilometres, with a population of 7 million people, 4.1 million of whom comprise the workforce. The region hosts 350,000 businesses, 1,700 of which are foreign-owned. The gross value added (GVA) is £78 billion or fourth largest of the UK regions. However GVA per head is 87% of the UK average, “over the past decade Cumbria was the 5th fastest growing of the 37 NUTS2 (county type) areas in the UK with an overall growth rate of 56.4% in GVA compared to 49.7% nationally” (Cumbria Observatory Online). In terms of household income, median income in 2012, in Cumbria was £25,524, somewhat lower than the GB average of £28,413 (Cumbria Observatory Online). In terms of policy development for Cumbria, national policy framework defines Regional Economic Strategy (RES) which includes measures for Cumbria. Organisations involved include: the Government Office for the North West (GONW), The North West Regional Assembly (NWRA). The highly populated area of the Liverpool to Manchester axis lies at some distance from Cumbria, which has only 7% of the region’s population; these factors are thought to reduce the ability of Cumbrian causes to gain attention at regional level. (Roe & Cuerden 2004:1) Cumbria is known as the poorest performing sub-region of the North West, in both employment and in GVA terms. (Regeneris Consulting 2005:8).

2.2.2 Economic data for Cumbria

In terms of published resources concerning Cumbria, statistics provided by the previous North West Development Agency rarely provided a county breakdown and in some cases data for Cumbria was added in as an estimate. (Promar International, North West Food and Drink Cluster Study, 2002). The Cumbria Economic Bulletin (2005) provides a macroeconomic overview, UK trends and information on corporate activities in Cumbria, in particular jobs lost and gained per company. Cumbria Economic Intelligence Partnerships produce a biannual statistical report which indicates barriers to growth and opportunities for future development. The publication has a remit too broad for this thesis. However it is useful for setting the food sector in context in Cumbria (showing growth in employment by sector, population and age profile). North West Food Alliance newsletters perform the function of a trade publication including reviews of technology, training and support measures. Whilst promoting networking opportunities and food events throughout the North West. Cumbria Life Magazine (A Cumbria Newspapers publication) is a rather glossy review of developments in food and tourism, including articles on new regional food businesses and achievements of regional food producers and chefs.
The audit of Cumbria Local Enterprise Partnership describes Cumbria as:

“A truly rural county and England’s key upland area, the landbased sector is integral to our economy. As England’s most sparsely populated county ours is not a landscape of commuter villages. Without large service centres providing significant employment and opportunities our rural economy must drive itself.”

Cumbria LEP (2013).

This extract highlights the need for productive rural activities, and significant amongst those is sheep farming.

2.2.3 The importance of sheep farming to Cumbria

Table 2.1 summarises the importance of sheep farming to Cumbria. In terms of its culture and heritage and remaining rural communities, hill-farming dominates the land use within the Lake District National Park (LDNP). Despite this visual dominance;

“Direct employment in Cumbrian agriculture and supply-chain industries accounts for around 3.1% of employment and generated £150 million in Gross Value Added in 2006, down from £235 million in 1996” (Cumbria Vision, 2009:13).

59% of commercial land use within LDNP is permanent grass, and 34% is sole right rough grazing (Harvey et al., 2013). The case studies in Chapter 4 show further heritage details relating to Herdwick and CSML. In June 2010, just over 1,000 commercial agricultural holdings were recorded for the LDNP with around 1,000 full-time farmers, 50% of these farms are over 50ha, and 25% are less than 20ha. The number of breeding ewes was 319,000 (Harvey et al., 2013).

Since 2000 the financial viability of hill farming in particular has come into question, with doubts about the continued sustainability of this practice. This precarious situation has come
about following a number of key events: firstly changes in the Common Agricultural Policy (CAP) meant that farm subsidies became based on environmental protection, rather than number of livestock held by the farm, namely English Nature’s Wildlife Enhancement Scheme payments or opportunities to achieve Tier 2 ESA payments (Waller and McCormick, 2008; Fraser, 2015). This change discouraged farmers from maintaining high stock levels.

Table 2.1 The Value to Cumbria of Herdwick and Cumbrian Salt Marsh Lamb

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Importance measured by:</th>
<th>Theme:</th>
<th>Measurement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Volume output</td>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>30% decline in Cumbrian sheep flock 2001-2010 (Harvey et al., 2013).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GVA or financial value</td>
<td>Financial</td>
<td>Regional Economic Figures within Farming and supply chain industries GVA £150 million (Cumbria Vision, 2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>County area involved in production</td>
<td>Geographic</td>
<td>55% of the LDNP registered as agricultural land (Defra Agricultural Census, 2002) 278,863 ha common land in Cumbria (CCC website)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value in environmental conservation</td>
<td>Current EU/Defra policy priorities</td>
<td>74% of LDNP is in agri-environment schemes (LDNP, 2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment level</td>
<td>Socio-economic</td>
<td>Within the broader figure of 2,500 employed in farming in the LDNP plus Cumbria peripheral to the LDNP (LDNP, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural/heritage value</td>
<td>Cultural</td>
<td>52 million tourist days, value £2.2 billion to the economy (Cumbria Tourism, 2012). Unquantified as individual and community identity and value.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifescape value</td>
<td>Consumer</td>
<td>Unquantified as individual and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Unfortunately in Cumbria this change was accompanied by the severe foot and mouth outbreak of 2001, which involved heavy culling of livestock, many of which were not later replaced. The situation in 2010 shows a decline overall in the sheep flock of 30% from the 2000 flock (Harvey et al., 2013). A survey of 40 hill farms across the Lake District to the Howgill Fells, showed that 33% of farm income came from livestock sales, whilst 56% came from support payments. This survey also showed that in addition to reducing stock numbers, farms were “considering reducing the numbers of pure-bred native sheep breeds with more cross breeding and the use of other hill sheep breeds such as Lleyns and Cheviots.” (Waller & McCormick, 2008:6).

Salt-marsh grazing occurs in Cumbria around Morecambe Bay, Walney Channel, the Duddon Estuary and the Solway Firth. There is a balance to be sought between avian use of the salt marshes and traditional grazing practices. Future predictions for Cumbria’s salt marshes include: the constant dynamic cycle of the marshes owing to sediment deposition and erosion may suffer from predicted increased storminess; potential energy-related infrastructure projects including tidal, large-scale wind, and pylons which could interfere with coastal processes and threats from commercial-scale turf cutting (Cumbria.gov.uk).

For the herdwick breed, to remain a feature of the Lakeland fells, it must contribute a greater value towards farm incomes. Investment in marketing of the breed is one way of achieving this (Waller & McCormick, 2008). The continued presence of CSML on the coastal marshes is also precarious given future environmental/development predictions.

2.2.4 The importance of regional foods in Cumbria

The literature available falls short of providing precise data for number of regional food businesses in Cumbria. Two strategies remain open to the researcher, those being to use data from related organisations such as Made in Cumbria, and to apply the generic, rural development themes evident in other regional food studies (Tregear et al., 1998; Morely 2000, Henchion & McIntyre, 2000; Ilbery & Kneafsey, 2000, Morris & Kirwan, 2010). Mason’s (1998) inventory of UK regional foods, includes for Cumbria: traditional food such as Cumberland Rum Butter, Herdwick Sheep, Herdwick Macon Ham, Damsons, Cumberland
Ham, Cumbrian Air Dried Ham, Cumberland Rum Nicky, Grasmere Gingerbread, Hawkshead Wig, Kendal Pepper Cake and Kendal Mint Cake. The literature does not provide an outline of the importance of regional foods in Cumbria.

On a national scale, Defra’s strategy for quality regional food was published in January 2003. Defra’s policy instruments included £36 million per year for two years invested through the Rural Enterprise Scheme, a processing and marketing grant totalling £44 million between 2001-6, and LEADER+ a six year EU programme to enhance economic prosperity in rural areas. With further support being afforded to farmers’ markets and networking initiatives. Local/regional food was then heralded as a development priority, in an agricultural climate in Cumbria which was barely recovering from the shock of foot and mouth (Feb.-Sept. 2001).

Made in Cumbria had 57 food members in 2013, including The Smokery at HMP Haverigg, The Moondawn Real Chai Company, Cumberland and Westmorland Sausage Company and Grasmere Gingerbread. (This figure contrasts with the 2001 figure stating 250 regional food companies exist in Cumbria). Just like the Heinz connotation these are a mixed bunch, between speciality and regional foods. Two monthly farmers ‘markets take place, one in Kendal, one in Carlisle. However there are many food festivals, local agricultural shows, summer shows and other food events where regional food is available. Cumbrian regional food is permanently available via the Made in Cumbria Shop in Kendal, an online shop, Burton services M6 north, Southwaite Services M6 north, and various other small concessions including : Beetham Village Shop, Conistion Post Office, Kendal Library, Rheged , Witherslack Community Shop and Yew Tree Barn: The Gallery.

In the absence of detailed profiling of Cumbria’s regional food businesses, Roe and Cuerden (2004) found that 83% of Cumbria’s work places employ 10 people or less. The broad traditional outline of a regional food business would be then, rurally based, with under 10 employees. The opportunities which regional foods might pose for Cumbria are considered next.

2.2.5 The entrepreneurial opportunities regional foods offer to Cumbria
The literature is not specific to Cumbria in this respect but general to ‘rural areas’. Commercial opportunities are offered by embodying attributes of place in food and crafts (Anderson & McCauley, 1999). Regional foods provide a catalyst for local or incoming entrepreneurs to Cumbria, not only in production of regional foods themselves, but in
ancillary services such as regionally based attractions, leisure facilities and networks (post-offices, B&B booking offices) which reinforce their local identity by offering regional foods.

‘Local’ entrepreneurs were found to depend on personal relationships, to encourage custom, whilst offering products/services which were fairly standard with urban equivalents (Anderson & McAuley, 1999). Distinction is made between entrepreneurs who are ‘cosmopolitans’ who migrate from urban areas to invest in rural businesses, and are clear about their requirement to capture the essence of rurality in their output and local (see Tregear et al., 2007 on product qualification as a mechanism for linking local and non-local actors, p21). In considering the craft/food/service outputs of these businesses, they define a critical component common to these which is:

“they (include) symbols of the idyll, they are couched in a language which is lingua franca for all those who value the qualities associated with rurality” (Anderson and McAuley, 1999:180).

They identify the incorporation of the ‘rural idyll’ into the product/service as facilitating the ‘consumption of the countryside’. This study was broader than ‘regional foods’; it considered rural based craft and service businesses, it does take a holistic consumer view, as consumers get on with the process of life, rather than a ‘consumption per category’ grocers’ perspective found in the output of Mintel. Anderson and McAuley’s (1999) concepts are reminiscent of The Countryside Agency’s ‘Eat the View’ title, and of discussions concerning commoditisation of the countryside (Goulding, 2000). Tregear (nd) warned that:

“...the adept manipulation of tradition and territory symbols by individual firms becomes commercially counterproductive when large discrepancies appear between end product symbols and actual production practices.” (Tregear, nd:5).

There is a policing role for the protection of the value of authenticity in regional foods, one which used to be wielded by Made in Cumbria, but which has faded in recent years (Pers. Comm.).

Cumbria is a region replete with renowned landscape of beauty, as a backdrop to the development of its regional food resources. How landscape might be analysed as an attribute of regional foods is covered in the following section.
2.2.6 Conceptualising Cumbria as an attribute of regional food

‘Cumbria’ is a name given to a region/place which has its own set of landscape features. The concept of region in relation to food, suffers some of the same semantical difficulties as regional food. Kneafsey (2010) cites the interchangeability which is afforded to regional with ‘local’ and ‘alternative’ (food networks). Similarly Tregear & Giraud (2011) cites the ‘inconsistent use of concepts and terms’ as an obstacle to progressing the knowledge on alternative and local food networks. The attributes consumers prize in regional food products have been outlined by Tregear et al (1998) as ‘old-fashioned’ or ‘traditional’, by Kupiec & Revell (1998) as ‘hand-crafted’, ‘exotic’ or ‘gourmet’. It is logical to assume that different consumers may perceive different distinguishing attributes from the same product, for example, Cumbrians are likely to perceive Cumberland sausage in a different way to those visitors who may encounter the product for the first time. Clearly the understanding of what is typical of a region will change over the longer-term. The dynamic nature of the factors influencing ‘typicity’ and food were summarised by Tregear (2001) in figure 2.1.

Figure 2.1 The Dynamic Facets of Territorial Distinctiveness in Foods


The four other factors influencing typicity (as in figure 2.2) are given as migration, trade, industrialisation and agricultural policy. Migration influences the human element of typicity through dissemination of new recipes and production techniques which result in traditional production techniques being modified. The historical presence of Romans and Vikings will have shaped food production processes to some extent in Cumbria. A more recent example of migration into Cumbria is post 1871, when the exhaustion of ores in Cornwall’s mines...
encouraged large numbers of skilled miners to move to other mining regions, especially to the USA and Australia, and to a lesser extent Cumbria. (CASA). What is interesting to note from this study is the interaction between two variables: land and people, the debate above over designations relating to what is now Cumbria, would not form an extra facet to the diagram above, because changes in names are irrelevant to the land. There could be an additional ‘environmental change’ box to reflect climate change, and natural geomorphic developments such as salt marsh accretion. These dynamic elements usefully provide important content for communications of regional food heritage.

Berard & Marchenay (2007) consider three different values of place association which are afforded to food products, ranging from place of origin, to abstract historical link, to being rooted in time and shared knowledge (echoes of embedded foods 2.3.3). Evidence of Berard & Marchenay’s (2007) second element is clear in the case of Cumbria. Trade routes returning spice to the Cumbrian ports resulted in sausages, sauces and cakes being fortified with new flavours. Industrialisation took workers away from the land; artisans of the food sector set aside their traditions and succumbed to the wages of the factories and the textile mills of the North. The damsons of the Lythe Valley were originally grown for use in textile dying. Since the development of more efficient dyes, the damsons have formed the basic resource for micro businesses producing, beer, gin, jams and chutneys (Mason 1999). Communication of the heritage of the region from generation to generation is highly significant in maintaining these banks of knowledge, and value relating to place.

2.3 EU legislation and terminology relating to regional foods

The following section considers the background to the development of EU regulations on regional foods, the regulations and their evolution amongst other legal protection instruments, and specific actions and responses resulting from these in the UK.

2.3.1 Rationale for designation

The rights of ownership, of regional food production sites and rights to use regional food product names have become significant. The following quote illustrates the natural relationship between location, and intrinsic properties of the food product. It infers that (authentic) companies are merely guardians of this process, whose guardianship will be judged by their customers, whilst protected from imitators or appropriators by law:

“Appellation d’origine” (AO) and geographic indication (GI) products are collective property. In this respect they are public goods whose management is
delegated to their users. The intellectual property, both of the name used and the intrinsic properties of the goods, includes a patrimonial aspect which justifies public intervention against misuse.” (Barjolle and Sylvander, 2000:14)

Barjolle and Sylvander (2000) catalogued the pre-existing systems and orientations of various member states, to the EU regulations discussed below. They included a discussion on ‘latitude-based definitions’ of quality; with countries of Northern European latitude defining minimum health and safety standards as constituting a “vertical” approach to quality, whilst accepting that product differentiation is the business of individual companies. The opposing (Southern European) view is that of ‘quality’ which differentiates between products as “horizontal”. This takes health related quality as one aspect amongst others which may not be evident before purchase, such as various sensorial qualities (p7). The justification for legal protection of the specialist products of particular regions comes from the threat of imitation, or appropriation of names, which traditionally represent products produced under specific conditions, by imitators producing using less-costly processes. The paper acknowledges a heritage of this type of regulation in Latin/Southern European countries (and in Switzerland), and poses that new pan-European regulations would be perceived as less novel in this region than in Northern Europe. Unlike the Southern European countries which have codes of practice relating to the use of place names and images, the UK is largely without restriction on such activities (on certified rural products see, Mutersbaugh, 2005). Clearly the emerging EU policy affirmed the need for European regulation to prevent the degeneration of regional food names, and to clarify food provenance issues for consumers.

2.3.2 EU regulations

Regional food producers were potentially afforded mechanisms for protection of their ‘regional’ status in the form of EU regulations. Directives from the EU included three distinct categories explained below. These classifications were formalised in European Regulations No (EEC) 2081/92 (OJ L 208 of 1992) and No (EEC) 2082/92 (OJ L 208 OF 1992).

The Protected Designation of Origin (PDO) could protect products produced, processed and prepared within a particular geographical area, and with features and characteristics relating to the geographical area. It defines protected designation of origin (PDO) as follows

.....geographical name of a region, district, town or locality used to designate a product from the area thus named, which is distinguished by its
differentiating qualities and characteristics due principally to the natural environment and the method of production and/or ageing (OJ L208 of 1992).

Lakeland Herdwick now holds this status as does the French Pres-Sales de la Baie de Somme (UK-PDO-0005-0891, FR-PDO-005-0604). This regulation applied to products linked to a geographical area.

Regulation No. 2081/92 also permitted Protected Geographical Indication (PGI) which is intended for products produced or processed or prepared within a geographical area. The PGIs are less stringent in that only one part of the process must take place in the region of origin, providing a much wider access to protection by this regulation.

Regulation (EEC) No 2082/92 (OJ L 208 of 1992) on certificates of special character for agricultural products and foodstuffs potentially affords protection to products which are traditional or have customary names and have features which distinguish them from other similar products. In traditional speciality guaranteed (TSG), the process may include special methods but these need not be linked to the place of origin. Such features are not due to the geographical area, or based on technical advances in production methods.

Producers have to apply to the EU for approval of one of these statuses, if they wish to register their product with the EU, and use the quality mark on their products, to assist in product differentiation. Sans et al (2000:420) compared the motives of the applicants who obtained PGI status in 1996 for Quercy Lamb, Tamasco de Aragon and Scotch Lamb. These included: to develop and maintain the quality standards, to maintain exclusive rights to use regional images, to help build customer loyalty, for assistance in marketing, to differentiate the product, to permit recognition of quality. The designation permits use of a recognisable quality logo on packaging and promotional materials.

These regulations were updated and modified in 2006 after the USA and Australia lodged a complaint with the World Trade Organisation (WTO) against EU protection for geographical indications (GIs) for food and agricultural products. The argument drew on the fact that pre-existing GIs outside the EU were not given adequate protection, where they conflicted with EU registered GIs. Further the WTO reported that Regulation 2081/92 was conflicting with the Article 3.1 of the Trade-Related Aspects of International Property Rights TRIPS Agreement (London Economics, 2008).
The response from the EU was a new set of regulations, Regulation 510/2006 relating to PDOs and PGIs and Regulation 509/2006 relating to TSGs. The objectives for regulations 510/2006 were:

(a) Improving incomes of farmers;
(b) Encouraging the diversification of agricultural production;
(c) Achieving a better balance between supply and demand;
(d) Development of remote or less-favoured regions; and,
(e) Retaining rural populations.

Amendments related to: The application process, labelling of products, enforcement activities and control of compliance. The changes meant that (amongst other things) the Commission could now accept applications for consideration from third countries directly (London Economics, 2008).

The most recent development of the EU regulation is (EU) No 1151/2012 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 21 November 2012 on quality schemes for agricultural products and foodstuffs; it brings the schemes under one piece of legislation (OJ L343, 14.12.2012). The revised objectives are:

(a) Securing fair returns for the qualities of their products;
(b) Ensuring uniform protection of the names as an intellectual property right in the territory of the Union;
(c) Providing clear information on the value-adding attributes of the product to consumers.

Significantly, Article 55 of this new regulation includes consideration of support for farmers’ needs to sell direct, and thereby increase their margins: 'local farming and direct sales labelling scheme to assist producers in marketing their produce locally'.

Moran (1993) offers an interesting selection of theoretical perspectives on GIs. These are summarised in the table 2.2:

Considering table 2.2 although Moran’s (1993) comments were formulated around consideration of the wine industry these regulations can then be seen as offering some leverage to regional food producers in a UK national context of food distribution dominated by major supermarkets. The push for change has come through EU policy evolution rather
than consumer demand. Fandos and Flavian's work (2006) sought to explore the PDO status as a generator of competitive advantage for Jamon de Teruel. Interestingly they found that information and images which related to the traditional product or the region of origin, or other associated cultural aspects would:

“improve customers’ feelings and affects towards PDO products, positively and significantly improving consumer loyalty” Fandos and Flavian (2006:657).

Table 2.2 Theoretical Interpretation of Appellations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theoretical perspective</th>
<th>Interpretation of geographical indications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>Attempt to capture the economic rent of localities and regions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical social theory</td>
<td>Commodity producers’ actions to resist the subsumption by fully capitalistic form of production (Friedmann, 1978; Marsden et al., 1986)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neoclassical economic theory</td>
<td>Appellation systems are a type of collective monopoly, which impose entry barriers on producers wishing to begin production (Perrier-Coronet, 1990)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Moran (1993:268)

There is clearly a production orientation to these latter developments, and as such have little meaning/value for the consumer; in response literature supporting more focus towards consumers has emerged. In the UK the advisory role of the butcher has been found highly significant. (McEachern & Seaman, 2005; McEachern & Warnaby, 2005).

Plantina and Privitera’s work (2006) on sopressata, a traditional Calabrian salted meat with PDO certification found that consumers were unfamiliar with the EU classification and therefore it held no value for them. This is certainly a consideration for HL and CSML producer groups to heed, as these EU designations are not widely known of in the UK.

The regulations continue to evolve and further modifications to this regulation are expected in 2014, to include ‘product of island farming’. The early development of these EU regulations was significant in that regional food producers were potentially afforded mechanisms for protection of their ‘regional’ status. However unlike the Italian Tutelage legislation, which existed to protect local products in Italy, prior to the EU legislation of 1992, the British legal tradition in this field has been weak and in fact has worked directly
against such protections. The registration of trade marks in the UK has traditionally prohibited the exclusive use of geographic names, in the interest of fair play (Maguire, 1994). It was as late as 1994 that the UK trade mark law was overhauled, in response to the EC Directive on the Harmonisation of Trade Marks Law (89/104/EEC. 21.12.88).

The non-supportive legal heritage, and tradition of culinary vagrancy, relative to Italy or France, leaves UK producers with a considerable educational challenge, in rooting products to place in consumers’ minds, and associating the same with EU symbols.

2.3.3 Regulation, protection and motivation for regional food businesses

International and national institutions having acted to produce a protection mechanism for regional foods offered some security to regional businesses. The protection measure was also a signal of value of these entities and encouraged the development new regional food businesses via the practice of rekindling old recipes/old production units and forgotten traditions to create oxymoronic ‘new traditional businesses’ (Cumbrian examples: Hawkshead Wig – Mason & Brown, 2007; Little Salkeld Flour Mill; Ivan Day Historic Food).

Considering a broader spectrum of motives for buying/developing a regional food business, the rural regional food business offers the entrepreneur satisfaction, “the delight of doing what one aspires to do” (Anderson & McAuley, 1999:182). These authors also cite the ‘local status’ as an alternative currency which might be attached to either the family or product, which forms the focal point of a rural business. Barjolle and Sylvander (2000) from a pan-European study of regional food supply chains, identify further life/business objectives, such as survival, development of new or existing products for distribution, preserving rural activities, maintaining the land, and contributing to regional prosperity, or maximising production rights (Sylvander, Barjolle and Arfini, 2000). Some of these reflect principles, now termed sustainable, which people chose to uphold (McLoughlin et al. 2010). Various academics have charted and evaluated the impact of GI regulations across Europe, some of those are summarised below.

2.3.4 Implications of EU regulations

There is rather a broad section of literature covering the process and implications of the achievement of these registrations (Thienes, 1994; Tregear et al., 2007; Belletti et al., 2000, 2007; London Economics, 2008).
Firstly a European perspective is provided via the conclusions of The London Economics Report (2008) which found that the objective of harmonisation of implementation across the EU has not been achieved with differences occurring in agencies involved with the implementation, timings set to allow for objections to be received, and procedures employed for the control of compliance. The report found a concentration of registrations in France and Italy, comprising 40%, with the addition of four further countries, Spain, Germany, Portugal and Greece, they account for 90% of registrations. Reasons for taking up the opportunity to register were expressed as “to gain or secure market share”, “protection for the use of names” and “sending quality assurances to consumers” (ibid, p258).

An EU 27 survey of consumer awareness of the followings food symbols PDO, PGI, TSG, Organic, Fairtrade, found 62% of consumers had no awareness of any (ibid¸ p259). It is not clear who was sampled for this survey, simply ‘a consumer survey across 27 states’ (ibid, p31). However the results may indicate confusion arising from the absence of a single, clear definition of regional foods. This situation also creates some pragmatic difficulties for the researcher; literature which describe similar food products using different terminology requires the use of broad search boundaries, for example “Producer constructions of quality in regional speciality food production: a case study from south west England” (Ilbery & Kneafsey, 2000), “Food commodities, geographical knowledges and the reconnection of production and consumption: The case of naturally embedded food products” (Morris & Kirwan, 2010). The following section addresses these issues further.

2.3.5 Terminology and characteristics of regional foods

This section summarises the definitions found in the literature relating to various terms which are sometimes used as synonyms for, or collectively with, the term regional food.

Focussing on the UK, and on semantics, the excerpt below clearly exemplifies ambiguity commonly associated with the term ‘regional food’. In this instance it is confused with ‘locally produced food’. Terminology is particularly significant here, given the multitude of potential synonyms (speciality food, local food, locality food) and lack of clear understanding as to what criteria distinguish these terms. UK government policy signalled the importance of regional food:

“We believe one of the greatest opportunities for farmers to add value and retain a bigger slice of retail price is to build on the public’s enthusiasm for locally produced food, or food with a clear regional
provenance. Increasing the market share of such food would have benefits for farmer and consumer alike”. (Report of the Policy Commission on the Future of Farming and Food, 2002 online accessed 30 February, 2009)

Enteleca’s report (2000) commissioned by MAFF and the Countryside Agency, considers tourist’s attitudes towards regional and local foods. The results of this report were based on a literature review, national face to face in home survey of 1600 residents, 1200 visitor interviews in four study regions and hall tests with 240 holidaymakers. Enteleca found that tourists had a vague view of what is ‘local’, and noted this as being further confused by the increasing availability of ‘regional’ products. They also revealed confusion in the minds of tourists, between ‘local’ and ‘speciality’ foods. Perceptions of tourists were seen as being linked to the individual’s geographical knowledge, personal experience, akin to Tregear et al’s ‘personal knowledge’ (below). They found tourists relatively unaware of any official criteria of designation. They also claimed that government policy used different definitions for different reasons (p1-2).

Enteleca (2000) admitted the absence of a universally agreed definition of local food. The definition offered to tourists whilst conducting primary research on local food was:

‘…food and drink that is produced or grown in the local area or local speciality food that has a local identity’(ibid p11). However, this definition does not distinguish itself sufficiently from that of regional food. The report uses ‘regional’ as a synonym for local, or as well as local in much of its writing, which serves to confuse the boundary between the two terms.

The following three definitions of ‘local food’ anchor the term to concern with distance to market, and local benefits:

“Food derived from a system, based on organic and sustainable forms of agricultural practice, where the production, processing and trading are largely contained and controlled within the area where it was produced, thereby
delivering health, economic, environmental and social benefits to the communities in those areas”.

(Sustain, 2002) online. Accessed 3 June 2009

“for consumers choosing local food is about supporting the local community and economy. It is offering this support that makes the product special.” (Groves, 2005:6)

The NFU definition of ‘local’ is simply ‘as near as you can get it.’ (Holmes, 2005).

Food miles, freshness and local economy emerge as themes associated with local food, with organic and sustainable qualities as preferred extra qualities.

Ilbery & Maye (2006:355) cite the Curry Report (2002) as making a further distinction between local and locality food products, with the former representing food produced and consumed within a short geographical radius, whereas the latter may be widely consumed but possess a local identity, such as Loch Fyne oysters. Whilst this is a technical observation, there is little comment in the literature on customer loyalty in relation to their home region. This perspective is relevant to retailers, and recognises a different distribution system and development strategies apply to local and locality/regional foods. This example shows the term locality being used as a synonym for regional food. Another term which comes into the mix is ‘speciality food’, the following section highlights literature concerned with the characteristics of speciality food.

2.3.6 Speciality foods

The DTZ Pied Consulting report on UK Speciality Food and Drink Sector 1999, clearly focuses on ‘speciality foods’ a similarly ambiguous term to ‘local food’. The definition used to orientate the report’s scope came from Food From Britain’s definition:

“...the term “speciality” is defined broadly to embrace identified food and drink producers which have “individual”, “different”, “country” or “fine" food characteristics. It excludes commodity products which lack individual differentiated identity. Normally, speciality food and drink products will be low volume high added value of high quality and with “speciality” appeal that may be enhanced by regional attributes”.

27
DTZ define the term ‘speciality food’ as differentiated from mainstream or commodity products, targeting niche markets and commanding a premium price. This report considers the work by Tregear et al., above, yet misrepresents the results of that study with: “the focus group research indicated that regionality and authenticity are the fundamental attributes of speciality foods” (p18) whilst Tregear et al., do not consider ‘speciality foods’ and do conclude that: “consumer perceptions of regionality are tied closely to perceived authenticity” (p392). Based on the information resulting from examination of speciality, fancy, and regional food the report develops a new definition of ‘speciality food’:

“Differentiation can be achieved through a variety of ways including:

- Manufacturing process (hand crafted)
- Raw material (pure, unique, organic material)
- Product quality
- Packaging (linked to branding)
- Exploiting regional identity; or
- Marketing and distribution support.”

(DDZ, 1999:20)

Whilst the DTZ (ibid) report defines speciality food as a potential mix of the variables included in the bullet point list above, some of these elements echo EU directives: hand crafted relating to TSG; unique raw materials relating to PDO status. ‘Speciality food’ clearly encompasses a wider category of firms than does regional food. Indeed DTZ (ibid) find a range of other terms attributable under the generic term ‘speciality’ applicable in the UK, USA and European markets: fancy; deli; fine; speciality; premium and deluxe. DTZ concluded that ‘speciality’ is defined by the product, whilst the size of company, or technology employed is immaterial, a stance at odds with the original Food From Britain definition. Notably, on consideration of the wide range of market segments in which speciality foods are to be found (p6), the DTZ feel that a single definition may not be able to encompass all of these. DTZ recognised and reported the confusion in the market.
2.3.7 Naturally embedded food products (NEFPs)

The term ‘embedded’ is found largely in geography influenced literature on regional food networks, (Murdoch, Marsden & Banks, 2000; Hinrichs, 2003, Lee, 2000; Sage, 2003; Sonnino & Marsden, 2006) although it originated from the work of Karl Polanyi (1957) a Hungarian social philosopher (cited in Barham, 2003). Morris & Kirwan (2010) link the term specifically to meats and cheeses, in a discussion of producer and consumer knowledges relating to these products and their various links to grassland biodiversity. In particular they look at the tendency to ‘fetishise’ or give “excessive and irrational devotion or other commitment” to foods (oxforddictionaries.com). This is a perspective adopted from Marx, to describe the “disjuncture between their use and exchange value that contributes to an obscuring of the social relations associated with the production of goods” (ibid p132). They also consider the “co-production of the economic and the cultural” (citing Jackson et al., 2006 and Bridge and Smith, 2003). Sage (2003) considers the “socially embedded” features of production linked to limited volume supply. The typology in table 2.2 shows much similarity between regional food and NEFP; however regional food is a broader concept able to accommodate food which is not visible in the landscape, such as a Cornish pastie. This term NEFP is suited to analysis of the supply chain, or food network, rather than a term used in branding, although it efficiently incorporates ideas of terroir, landscape and community. It is certainly reminiscent of the place link qualifiers of the GI regulations as well as linking to connotations of sustainability (Raynolds, 2000). It does have a specific fit for regional meats, whilst perhaps falling short of covering those recipe-based regional foods such as rum-butter which brings together aspects of heritage from trade-links of the past.

2.3.8 Regional foods

ADAS (2003 & 2007) used Defra’s definition of regional food in both their Market Research Reports on Quality Regional Food Businesses:

“Regional food (sometimes called locality food) is food produced within a particular geographical area (whether administrative region, county, town or other appellation) and is marketed as coming from that area. However, it may be sold within or outside that area. Regional food is perceived to have a distinctive quality because of the area in or the method by which it is produced.”

(ADAS, 2003:2).
This, and the following definition offered by Groves (2005) incorporate the concepts of origin, provenance and typicity, which were evident in EU 2081/92 replaced by 510/2006, and subsequently 1151/2012, and have an administrative heritage in mainly Southern European countries.

"Regional can represent distance and create the same emotions as local, but it also triggers associations with heritage, reputation, quality, and speciality, products unique to a region, although now these products may be available throughout the UK" (Groves, 2005:6).

DTZ’s ‘speciality food’ is clearly a broader concept than that of ‘regional food’, whereas local food seems linked to commodity (fresh) products, food miles and distribution efficiencies. The latter definitions of regional food (DEFRA cited in ADAS, 2003 & 2007, & Groves, 2005) draw more closely on the EU’s PDO and PGI definitions.

Given the definition of embedded food NEFP summarises specificity of aspects of the EU regulations 2081/92 and includes a view on culture, and both consumer and producer ‘knowledges’. The choice of this definition to adopt for the product cases in this thesis would seem justified.

The elements within this definition include place or territory, connotations of ‘typicity’ meaning typical of or ‘embedded in’ that location, as over time associations have developed between food, product and place, to the extent that the food product becomes a cultural marker for the location (For example Wabberthwaite Sausage, Grasmere Gingerbread).

2.3.9 Measures of success of the regional foods sector

The remit of the UK reports cited above is highly quantitative to establish base-line data for the (ill-defined) sector, and subsequently measure its growth (ADAS 2003 & 2007). The requirement to show propitious use of public funds is clear. Belletti et al., (2007) reported on the impact of geographical indications on the internationalisation of agric-food products based on case study products from Italy. Findings showed that as a tool to develop exports the GI needed favourable conditions in: target market knowledge of product specificity, company aptitude for international activity, the production chain aspects and product characteristics, such as perishability.
At the regional level, regional food resources offer important economic opportunities, regional identity and community confirming potential. Both commercial and social networks are strengthened by optimum sustainable exploitation of regional foods. Regional infrastructure and food production also contributes towards more dynamic income circulation in locales which offer few alternative economic opportunities (Anderson & McAuley, 1999).

Regional foods comprise significant national resources which facilitate economic gains (ADAS, 2007). The regional food sector proved difficult to delineate based on the approaches adopted in reports cited above. A wider perspective on the national value of regional foods helps characterise the national identity (act as nation brand components), and contribute to the country’s heritage (Anholt, 2002). The reports cited above fail to answer questions relating to a broader set of criteria and values, including: community strength, social capital as well as produced economic capital. At local and individual level regional food initiatives can provide employment opportunities/entrepreneurship opportunities/destination attractions/heritage and community affirming activities in areas with otherwise limited resources. They may offer opportunities for people to stay in the place they were born/brought-up, rather than having to migrate for reasons of employment. Table 2.3 summarises the terminology discussed in this section.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria List</th>
<th>Local food</th>
<th>Speciality foods</th>
<th>Naturally embedded food products</th>
<th>Regional foods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scale of operations</td>
<td>Measurement criteria vary: number of hectares for farm output, domestic kitchen or micro to industrial unit or macro for processed local food.</td>
<td>Size of operation or technology irrelevant (DTZ, 1999)</td>
<td>Terroir or socio-cultural imposed limits.</td>
<td>Measurement criteria vary: number of hectares for farm output, domestic kitchen or micro to industrial unit or macro for processed regional food.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification opportunities</td>
<td>Producer identity displayed – dependent on consumer’s local knowledge. Membership of local producer groups E.g Made in Cumbria.</td>
<td>TSG Membership of local producer groups E.g Made in Cumbria.</td>
<td>PDO, PGI, TSG. Membership of local producer groups E.g Made in Cumbria.</td>
<td>PDO, PGI, TSG. Membership of local producer groups E.g Made in Cumbria.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>30 mile radius CPRE (2012)</td>
<td>No limit</td>
<td>Terroir or socio-cultural defined limits</td>
<td>Region parameters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal husbandry constraints</td>
<td>In the case of meat – local grazing capacity</td>
<td>No limit – raw materials can be bought-in.</td>
<td>In the case of meat – grazing the capacity of the valued terroir feature. Availability of knowledge</td>
<td>In the case of meat – grazing capacity of the valued terroir feature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volume and production constraints</td>
<td>Dependant if a limitation is imposed on local grazing time.</td>
<td>Low volume targeting niche markets (DTZ., 1999)</td>
<td>Dependant if a limitation is imposed on terroir feature grazing time. E.g Number of Days on salt marsh or high fell.</td>
<td>Dependant if a limitation is imposed on terroir feature grazing time. E.g Number of Days on salt marsh or high fell.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current structures and support</td>
<td>The Local Action on Food is a group of national organisations established in 2008 and coordinated by Sustain.</td>
<td>EU</td>
<td>EU</td>
<td>EU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reach (i.e. markets)</td>
<td>30 mile radius CPRE (2012)</td>
<td>Niche, deli, butcher, regional supermarket, farmers’ markets, food catering sector. If processed, international.</td>
<td>Niche, deli, butcher, regional supermarkets, farmers’ markets, regional food catering sector. If processed, international.</td>
<td>Niche, deli, butcher, regional supermarkets, farmers’ markets, regional food catering sector. If processed, international.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Technology</td>
<td>Raw or lightly processed - cheese, sausages, pies and baked goods CPRE (2012)</td>
<td>Simple to complex technology may be employed. Eg Hawkshead Relish, Pinks Sausages.</td>
<td>Complex such as Melton Mowbray Pork Pies PGI, to simple such as Lakeland Herdwick PDO</td>
<td>Complex such as Melton Mowbray Pork Pies PGI, to simple such as Lakeland Herdwick PDO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: compiled from multiple sources cited within Table 2.3.
2.4 Summary

The literature has shown that the place of Cumbria has been transient (within living memory) and involves overlaying of different boundaries and their nomenclature according to time and specific locations. An area of land can therefore orientate itself within various conceptual locators, including the LDNP, Cumberland/Westmorland and Cumbria. Cumbrian regional food has been influenced by the spice trade and migration. Sheep farming is now heavily dependent on environment-related payments and although Herdwick Lamb now benefits from PDO status, farmers are considering its replacement with more reliable and productive breeds (Waller & McCormick, 2008:6). CSML faces an uncertain future owing to predicted climate change and energy related developments under consideration for coastal sites. The typology of regional foods clarifies the co-production of culture and economic output as significant in NEFPs. It is the consumers’ perception of place incorporating the visual appreciation of economic and cultural food production activities which will be examined in the following chapter.
Chapter 3 Place branding and food choice relating to NEFPs

3.1 Introduction
The Cumbrian lamb which is the focus of this thesis has been identified as a naturally embedded food product (NEFP). Before going on to examine Herdwick Lamb (HL) and Cumbrian salt marsh lamb (CSML) in detail, it is now appropriate to consider the attributes of a ‘place’ in which the agricultural products are embedded. The themes covered here include ‘consumptionscapes’, ‘place’ and ‘lifescapes’ which are relevant to a product being ‘embedded in a place’. Given the brand-related intentions of this thesis, it is important to orientate the study within the brand literature, and to examine influencing factors on the potential brands’ power and reach; of relevance here are the (agricultural) product and ‘place brand’ literature, and examination of the brand construct. In addition consideration must be given to the pragmatic process of brand development reflecting consumer values linked to NEFPs. In this vein it will be useful to appraise the dimensions of human values and gain insight into the structure of values. Consumer conceptualisation of NEFPs will be examined through appraisal of existing food models, and more precisely the literature concerning meat consumption. First consideration is given to the consumptionscape aspect of place.

3.2 NEFPs in the local consumptionscape
The term “servicescape” is well established in the services marketing literature (Baker, 1987; Bitner, 1992) as the physical and atmospheric aspects of the consumption setting. Aubert-Gamet (1997) affirms that consumers transform servicescapes to consumptionscapes when they use the servicescape to enact personally meaningful experiences. Ilbery et al (2006) considered the emergence of supply chains around ‘product’ and ‘place’ and ideas of the development of an “alternative food economy” (Winter, 2003; Watts et al., 2005) which focuses on themes of short supply chains, quality, and social and territorial embeddedness. Ilbery et al’s research considered the process of ‘relocalisation’ of food and endogenous rural development. Farmers’ markets provide an alternative distribution system for meat (Youngs, 2003; Sage, 2003; Szmigin et al., 2003; Kirwan, 2005). Ger & Belk (1996) discuss the resistance to creolization of consumptionscapes in the context of imposing westernised fast foods on developing nations. The farmers’ market provides an opportunity to ring-fence local food. The clientele of farmers’ markets are found to value this type of exchange contact because of the existence of feelings of “localness, naturalness, personal trust
and a sense of community” (Holloway & Kneafsey, 2000). That which consumers gain from the farmers’ market which they can’t achieve in the supermarket is a direct relationship with the food they buy, the food is locally identifiable, traditionally produced, and information is verifiable by the producer (Kirwan, 2005). The type of consumers using farmers’ markets regularly, were classified using Buckley et al.’s (2005) ‘Food Related Lifestyles’ (FRL) as ‘Rational’ or ‘Adventurous’ which translates to middle aged or above, retired/employed, with high level of education. These results emerged following adaptation of the model (ibid) by Wycherley et al., (2008) to assess orientation to speciality foods. For meat purchasers, contact with the producer provides a clear link back to the land, and other assurances which support their identity with place.

Massey (1994) offers a dynamic view of place:

“[…] absolutely not static. If places can be conceptualised in terms of the social interactions which they tie together, then it is also the case that these interactions themselves are not motionless things, frozen in time. They are processes.”

Massey (1994:147)

Massey’s (1994) perception of place has a social rather than a terroir focus, it is more aligned with the concepts of consumptionscapes discussed above. Kalandides (2011) is wary of the notion of identity as “that of a group with a territorial base” in that it does not easily account for change and migration. His concerns echo the discomfort in the writing about Heidegger’s association of people and place in Germany of the 1940s (see 3.2.2).

Kalandides (2011) outlines various uses of the term ‘place identity’:

1. Place identity as part of individual (human) identity;
2. Place identity as formative of group identity;
3. Mental representations of place by an individual;
4. Group perceptions of place;
5. Identification of a group with territory; and
Kalandides (2011) goes on to examine ideas relating to ‘a sense of place’. He finally concurs with Massey (1994) that:

…the gives a place its specificity is not some long internalized history, but the face that it is constructed out of a particular constellation of social relations, meeting and weaving together at a particular locus (Massey, 1994:154).

Even without specific reference to the land, this quote would seem to suitably fit the agricultural scenarios of the farmers’ market, agricultural show or agricultural auction where ‘experience’ is highly valued. The literature shows that the consumptionscapes of NEFPs include characteristics of localness, personal trust, sense of community, traditional products and opportunity for the verification of authenticity of products. It is also important to consider literature relating to the value of the ‘product from a particular place’, which is presented in the next section.

3.2.1 Possessions, identity and places

Literature from the field of buyer behaviour investigates the significance of purchases to consumers. Belk (1988) shows that the association between individual’s sense of self and their possessions is far from a concern of the contemporary; he quotes the work of William James (1890) who describes how we define ourselves by the sum of all our possessions. The concept can be taken further into history by considering ‘grave goods’ as a reflection of the deceased’s power during life (Alekshin, 1983 cited in Belk, 1988). The proposition that consumers define their identity by their purchase selection is widely supported in the branding literature (De Chernatony, 2006, 2007; Kapferer, 2007; Keller, 2003).

The proposition that products which share our place of origin potentially constitute stronger identity markers is not without foundation. Consumers’ food identity discourses become most apparent when they are deprived of their norms of behaviour. Studies on migrants’ food behaviour bring together the components of food and place, and exemplify the missing identity contributions offered by ‘usual food interactions’ in the consumer’s place of origin. Jonsson et al., (2002) describes the dual pressures on Somalian migrants in Sweden, as they try to simultaneously maintain their own cultural
identity and adapt to their new circumstances. Four main food concerns were aired in this study: the longing for cultural taste (certain ingredients: sorghum is rarely available in Sweden), food as folk medicine (spices such as black cumin are uncommon in Sweden), culturally safe food (relating to sourcing halal meat and the Muslim faith) and food for bringing up Somalian children where certain foods play a part in cultural ceremony and rituals, deemed essential for cultural continuity.

Food’s cultural role is emphasised in a study which looked at older womens’ identity and food rituals associated with Christmas. English migrants to New Zealand transpose some of their traditions to a very different climate, and feel the urge to replicate family rituals experienced in England when they were children. These are relived in New Zealand with grandchildren to produce “a very special time” (Wright-St Claire et al., 2005:341). Here we see actions compelled by recollections of positive childhood experiences, whilst the Somalian study illustrates compulsion to maintain traditions through a sense of duty to culture, faith and identity. NEFPs are partly a result of traditional practice, which follows from climatic and topographic resources of the locale. The strong representations evident in migrant experiences of food from the home country, as representing culture, place and identity, reflects the significance of certain foods and food rituals to the individual. Although an inventory of regional foods exists (Mason, 1999) insight into ties between Cumbrian consumers and Cumbrian NEFPs has yet to be revealed. The following section considers how consumers develop attitudes about place.

3.2.2 Perspectives on place

NEFPs do not necessarily represent an entire region. This implies the construction of other boundaries around foods. Boisen et al., (2011) considered scalar hierarchies, which represent multi-layered spatial identities, for example connotations associated with the North West region, Cumbria, The Lake District, Langdale Valley may all cover the latter, depending on the perceptions of the individual. NEFP producers are usually located in one site, if the production unit is a farm, it may have its own microclimate, along with specific geophysical features. Rather than the term ‘region’, ‘place or landscape’ seem more appropriate terms to evaluate. Various perspectives on the term ‘landscape’ can be found in the literature. The following quote seems particularly apt for NEFPs:

38
“Landscape can be understood as a ‘meeting ground’ – a place where nature and culture are intertwined – a place that holds the past and the present, as well as tangible and intangible values”. (Phillips, 2005, cited in Brown & Kothari, 2011)

Cresswell (2004) offers a distinction between landscape and place, where landscape is closely tied to the function of vision, and the viewer is outside of the landscape looking at it. On the other hand places are “to be inside of” and include “attachments and connections between people and place” (p10-11) the latter being akin to Bourdieu’s (1989) “social space”. This dichotomy offers an interesting approach for the consideration of NEFPs in the ‘landscape’ of regions which a person visits, and NEFPs in the ‘place’ of a person’s own origin.

In order to fully consider the relationship between people, products and place, it would seem prudent to introduce the work of Martin Heidegger, which is regarded as:

“the most important and sustained inquiry into place to be found in the history of Western thought.” (Malpas, 2007:3).

Heidegger’s work is most accessible to the non-philosophy student via the analysis of intermediaries such as Seamon & Mugerauer (1985) or Malpas (2007) who has produced a couple of monographs considering place: Place and Experience: A Philosophical Topography (1999) and Heidegger’s Topology (2007). His work reflects on the philosophy of Heidegger (20th-century philosopher) amongst others (notably Wordsworth). Malpas’s work (2007) aimed to consider:

“the way in which the concept of place relates to certain core philosophical issues such as the nature of ground, of the transcendental, and of concepts of unity, limit and bound,...”

(ibid. Chapter 1, page, 2)

Malpas is not summarising the work of Heidegger without prejudice; instead he is forcing the examination of place through Heidegger’s writing, with the aim to “engage with Heidegger as a ‘live’ thinker”. He considers Heidegger’s three phases: 1910-30 ‘being and time’, when the philosopher focussed on the ‘meaning of being’, the period of 1930 to approximately 1945, which focussed on the ‘truth of being’ and 1945 onwards which considered the ‘place of being’.
Malpas summarises the work of other writers on place. Edward Casey (1997) in his text *The Fate of Place*, noted that space had often taken priority over place as an element for consideration in Western philosophical tradition, space being a much more anonymous element, than place. Malpas cites Joseph Fell’s quote:

“The entirety of Heidegger’s thinking turned out to be a protracted effort at remembering the place in which all human experience – practical or theoretical, willed or reasoned, poetic or technical- has always come to pass.” (Fell, 1985, cited in Malpas, 2007:3)

Malpas (2007) also describes place as an ‘evanescent’ concept, elusive and hard to pin down. Defining what place is and how to comprehend it seems to have presented philosophers with a dilemma, regarding it as:

“A function of human responsiveness or affectivity

*A social or cultural ‘construction’*

*A neutral site”*

Malpas (2007:5)

Malpas (2007) offers an interesting perspective on boundaries. The term ‘place’ has Latin and Greek roots meaning ‘broad or open way’, it can also be linked to a place which is the intersection of roads, such as a square where community gatherings may occur. The German word for place is which is linked to the idea of a gathering is *ort*, which originally indicated the point of a weapon, the focus of its energy (*Ortshaft* being a village or settlement). However it is also tied to an idea of boundedness which rather than being a limiting factor, is instead the area from which something begins to unfold, so it is the origin of something rather than its limits.

The perception of place is complex, involving a person’s reaction to subjective, inter-subjective and objective structures which interplay with what the tangible place itself offers.

“Wordsworth’s Lake District, must be understood in terms of a complex conjunction of factors involving the natural landscape, the pattern of weather and of sky, the human ordering of spaces”
and resources, and also those individual and communal narratives with which the place is imbued.” (Malpas, Place and Experience, 1999:185)

The interplay of mental frameworks involved in perceiving a place, and the reflection of what is seen against what is known, or what has been experienced, leads Malpas (ibid) to cite Combray “a place that is, of course, half fictional and half real” (p185). This interdependence between place and person was noted in Heaney’s observation on Wordsworth and the Lake District Landscape as being both “humanised and humanizing” (ibid. 184).

There is a similarity between the writing on perception of place, and that of perception of brand, in particular the elements of Kapferer’s (2008) brand identity prism. Is it possible to propose two parallel sets of relationships 1) between consumer interaction with place and its products 2) consumer internalisation of these immediate perceptions, both have a role to play in the nature of being. Kapferer’s brand identity prism (ibid) is split vertically between that which is visible externally (Figure 3.1 the left half) and that which is internal, or that which represents the brand’s spirit (the right half).

The use of territory and tradition as tools to be employed by producers for commercial advantage, has been documented by Tregear (undated). This study found producers to be firmly defending territorial advantages of their products when located in a competitive market, whilst less so if in a less-competitive market. Mueller & Schade’s paper (2012) focuses on symbols and place identity, they cite Appleyard (1979) on the consideration of an environment as a symbol which become representative of “someone or some social group”. The use of symbols by one producer may then influence perception of the wider rural environment. The connection between symbols chosen to represent NEFPs and their acceptance by the local population is important.

3.2.3 Place and person
Philosophers have traditionally concerned themselves with the meaning of life. This may be also interpreted as understanding ‘being’ a topic which concerned Heidegger ‘Place of Being’ (the focus of his studies from 1940 onwards, Malpas, 2007:2). Malpas links these concepts to place, stating:
“I would prefer to say that being and place are inextricably bound together in a way that it does not allow one to be seen merely as an ‘effect’ of the other, rather being emerges only in and through place.” (Malpas, 2007:6)

Figure 3.1 Brand Identity Prism

Source: Kapferer (2008:183)

A non-philosopher might interpret this as we are a product of our environment, and the place in which we spent a significant time when growing up has a strong input into our identity. Place for the individual is:

“structured in the process of one’s everyday-life and hence is based on the day-to-day practices of individuals. It is a perpetual, personal interpretation of the meanings emerging from time-space specific situations” (Knapp, 2005 after Paasi, 1986 & 1991)
Malpas (2011) offers a quote from Paul Cezanne which illustrates nostalgic emotional ties with the landscape:

“within us they have not gone to sleep for ever, the vibrating sensations reflected by this good soil of Provence, the old memories of our youth, of these horizons, of these landscapes, of these unbelievable lines which leave in us so many deep impressions.” (ibid p13).

Malpas (2007: 18) offers Doreen Massey’s view of Heideggerian view of space/place as being:

“There are a number of distinct ways in which the notion of place which is derived from Heidegger is problematical. One is the idea that places have single essential identities. Another is the idea that the identity of place – the sense of place- is constructed out of an introverted, inward-looking history based on delving into the past for internalized origins......Another problem with the conception of place which derives from Heidegger is that it seems to require the drawing of boundaries....[Another aspect of] the Heideggerian approach, and one which from the point of view of the physical sciences now looks out of date, is the strict dichotomization of time and space...” (Cited in Malpas, 2007:18).

These comments might reflect a person’s view of inadequacies of the nostalgic view of place, in terms of modern society and current scientific knowledge, but to a marketer, much of this echoes the idea of nostalgia, and the drawing of boundaries relates closely to the idea of personal identity, and where we regard ourselves as being from.

3.2.4 Consumer attitudes and ‘their place’

Grunert (2006) explains that the most strongly held attitudes are based on direct experience and which are connected to a network of linkages in the mind. For example many consumers will voice a concern for animal husbandry, but few will have direct experience of the process of animal husbandry, or want to have it, leaving their focus on the product label (McEachern & Seaman, 2005). For these people their attitude of
concern is based upon abstract understanding of animal husbandry and not direct experience, therefore following Grunert (ibid) less likely to affect meat-consumption behaviour. Grunert’s work (2006) takes support from pan-european studies (Holm and Mohl, 2000; Ngapo et al., 2004) and consequently tends to take a rather generic view on European consumers. Duffy et al (2005) report on the UK communications gap between food producers and consumers and found fragmented communications efforts on the part of producers, coupled with a very passive approach to food-related information from consumers. It is therefore not surprising to find a gap in the literature considering ‘regional consumers’ perceptions of their own region’s foods, and how this might inform the branding process. The boundaries which encompass a NEFP are next examined.

3.2.5 The lifescape concept

The term ‘lifescape’ has been used to represent the perspective of a person within their day to day environment (Convery et al., 2005). Seamus Heaney (1991) identified two ways in which a place can be known: “lived, illiterate and unconscious” or “learned, literate and conscious” (cited in Malpas 2011:13). This ‘unconscious’ aspect of place is interesting from a marketing communications perspective because it includes everyone in the ‘sensing of place’ without formal attention being given to it. Mueller & Schade (2012) draw on German sociological literature and in particular Low’s work (2011) on cities to distinguish, “elements of space which are perceptible with the senses and the collective development of meaning associated with them”. This observation adds the dimensions of time, and experience of a place by the inhabiting community. In the same vein (of internal branding) Mueller & Schade (2012) quote Appleyard’s early work:

“Expression of personal or group identity can be achieved through the connotative character of an environment. This is perhaps the most intangible and forgotten quality of environmental action, but it is most significant, for it affects the visceral quality, the feel of a place.” (Appleyard, 1979:149, cited in Mueller & Schade, 2012:83)

Malpas also picks up this theme he considers people’s changing interactions with place. He cites David and Wilson (1999) in relation “to investigate changes in the construction
of place, self and identity,” and links it to the work of Heidegger, emphasising the limitations of the term ‘landscape’ in representing the “place of both mind and body ‘being’ in a relationship with place” (Malpas, 2011:48). This suggests inhabitants possess an insider-knowledge of place, which influences their personal criteria against which to measure new communications about place, the term ‘lifescape’ encompasses this perspective (Convery et al., 2005).

Malpas’s earlier text Place and Experience (1999) includes a chapter on ‘Place, Past and Person’. In this he quotes Poulet’s observation on Proustian Space (1977):

“Beings surround themselves with the places where they find themselves, the way one wraps oneself up in a garment that is at one and the same a disguise and a characterization. Without places, beings would be only abstractions. It is places that make their image precise and that give them the necessary support thanks to which we can assign them a place in our mental space, dream of them, remember them.”  (Poulet, Proustian Space, 1977:26-7 cited in Malpas, 1999:176)

Places clearly are normally populated, and individuals may be conscious of a strong identity with the landscape, but may also participate communally in a ‘regional identity’, participation in an abstract ‘we-feeling’ (cultural identity, community) which may formalise itself in local newspapers, educational institutions or parish council meetings, celebratory events. Lawler (2008, cited in Taylor, 2010:3) writes that “identities are socially produced” they result from a shared socio-cultural environment.

Places then are the context of life experiences, in what Malpas (1999) terms ‘mental life’ when we insert the experiences we have had, to build our self-identity, the role of place is critical and therefore identities are place-bound (ibid, p177; Convery et al., 2005). Whilst Taylor (2010) in her analysis of discourse relating to place, identifies the ‘born and bred’ narrative which is used to reflect successive generations living in the same place and building a ‘born and bred’ identity from “blood and tradition”. Taylor (2010) also cites Jenkins (1996) who wrote that “primary identities are generally robust and resilient to change because they were established early in life” (Jenkins, 1996:21 cited in Taylor 2010:12). Also of relevance here is the “repertoire of nature and landscape” identified in Taylor’s (2010) research, which manifested itself as a
description of place in terms of “its greenness, rurality and features of landscape.” Through her interviews with women (only) concerning their perspective on place, Taylor (2010:83) found that some women revealed a sense of belonging to a given landscape, and exhibited a discomfort at being (later in life) distanced from that landscape, such that they planned to reconstruct feelings of belonging, by moving back to the landscape with which they felt an emotional connection. Given that our identities are at least in part formed by our places of origin and childhood, is it the case that we may wish to take action which conforms to rejection or reinforcement of the identity of our youth? Or for those who are “lived, illiterate and unconscious” choose not to process thoughts about either origin or direction. Perhaps Heaney has unwittingly offered a segmentation variable for NEFPs.

NEFPs which are explicitly visual in the landscape have potentially more salience with local consumers, than those which are assembled indoors, drawing instead on history and heritage of the region (such Grasmere Gingerbread, Cumberland Rum Butter).

Having considered literature on how the person might identify with place, it is now appropriate to consider the literature on a product’s relationship with place.

3.2.6 Place and food product

The links between food product and place have been defined by Tregear (2001) who offered three main facets of territorial distinctiveness in foods. These comprise firstly: geophysical or climate, soil, topography or particular flora and fauna which combined result in distinctive food products. Secondly: the traditions of production, processing and preparing food which may be distinctive and used within a specific geographical area only. Cook et al (1998) encouraged us to think of food as “small cultural artefacts”. Thirdly: the consumer’s perception, identification and recognition, of attractive qualities in the food product, which distinguish it from other similar food products. This framework can provide a useful checklist for inputs relevant to the branding process; however the congruence between production practice and claims made in communications is not always evident.

Tregear (undated) also measured producers’ awareness and use of ‘tradition’ as a product attribute, relating to ‘hand-crafted production methods’ and local sourcing of ingredients. However producers were found to be making such claims at the same time they were investing in mechanisation, and wider sourcing of ingredients. There is a
point of integrity here; if product symbols diverge from production practices, once this becomes apparent to consumers, these actions may serve to undermine the entire sector. The issue of authenticity in production and in communications-claims is signalled as vital to retain the value of the regional food resource for the community (Tregear et al., 2007).

In the same ‘honesty’ vein, Burnett and Danson (2004) discussed the ‘constructions of rurality and Scottish quality food promotion’, and noted problems arising from unmanaged, and insensitive constructs of place, such as representations of an un-peopled landscape (citing McCone et al., 1995) and consequences on perceived values of employment in rural food businesses. This idea of construction of rurality, brings to mind the time dimension associated with authenticity. Boisen et al., (2011) discuss the ‘thick and thin’ spatial identities of place, using thickness as a measure of greater authenticity and heritage (citing Terlouw, 2009).

Burnett and Danson (2004) also suggest that local peculiarities should take precedence over widely used and expected ‘Scottish’ images, with the objective of emphasising ‘specificity’ of the product. Ilbery and Kneafsey (2000) similarly highlighted the potentially contradictory attributes of tradition and dynamism, authentic production methods and adherence to food safety regulations as presenting communication challenges. Boisen et al., (2011) similarly point out the intention to add value by promoting a ‘Food Valley’ concept can offer little benefit or identity to businesses outside the food sector.

Morley et al., (2000) cited intellectual property concerns in relation to the use of place-names. The Melton Mowbray case highlighted the potential misunderstandings relating to place of origin, and the challenge from Northern Foods illustrated the potential for competitive conflict. Amidst this virtual anarchy in the use of place-related branding, Henchion and McIntyre (2000:633) cite Irish examples of collaboration in the creation of a regional image, including that of West Cork, where public and private agencies worked together to devise an integrated regional branding strategy. Whilst the author’s view is that in some situations, a variety of development organisations serve emerging NEFP food businesses better than one, in the case of place-related brand development, particularly given experiential learning over the past decade, some coordination, and long-term planning (incorporating EU designations) may help avoid problems of the
3.3 The context of branding product and place

The term NEFPs, describes products embedded in a place; in terms of brand related literature this brings into relevance a number of different literature streams. Mainstream brand literature is dominated by recommendations to action on behalf of the firm and focussed on product or service outputs, this literature does not easily transfer to a place. The predominant (pop) culture littered with brand paraphernalia is the antithesis to the rural culture of the embedded foods, it is replete with heritage icons and natural resources. From the company or farm perspective on brand development, it is important to consider how contradictory perspectives on branding might coexist in the case of naturally embedded meat. Amongst the literature on branding there is a positivist group who consider brand-related literature which proposes the brand process be undertaken as an important activity for profit maximising firms (Aaker, 2010; De De Chernatony, 2006, 2007; Haig, 2003; Kapferer, 2008; Keller, 2003; Murphy 1987, 1990) and a counter-view from those who find brands representative of the excesses of the capitalist system or the epitome of the pop culture (Schlosser, 2001; Bakan, 2004; Boyle, 2003; Klein, 2010; Kanner, 2013). Place marketing is defined by Kotler et al., (1999) as: “a place-product that has to be positioned in a global market of geographies….and matching of place offering and place demand”. A separate strand of literature views place marketing as evolving in parallel with developments in marketing, especially services and experience marketing, but also having roots in regional planning development (Kavaratzis & Ashworth, 2008). Anholt (2005) defines place branding as “framing the place’s reputation assets”. Whilst Govers & Go (2009) identify the constituents of place brand equity as “brand loyalty, awareness and perceived quality” achieved by building on values and symbols that compose place brand identity.

The cases are not simply ‘small businesses’, but agricultural in nature, hence the limited small-business, brand-related literature has little to offer (Wong & Merilees, 2005; Ahonen, 2008). Similarly concepts in relation to efficiency, innovations, and measures of success can be different in agriculture so there is an agricultural brand dimension

48
which has a role to play, whilst the manufacturing/retail sector is the domain of most brand texts (Tregear & Gorton, 2009). The cases focussed on in this thesis are not places, they are products which are embedded in places; and so potentially require a unique mix of branding ideas from the varied literature outlined here.

To select one of the ‘positivists’ who is recognising the limitations which accompany terroir qualities in a product, Kapferer (2008:52) sets out five conditions for ‘building a market leader’ and he illustrates these using the case of New World wine Jacob’s Creek, comparing it against Old World Wines which are both protected and constrained by their provenance features from achieving the volume required for some markets’ distribution requirements. This constraint is equally applicable to NEFPs. However the motivations for developing regional foods and their brands are various, including regaining recognition and reward for the craft involved in production, to favouring direct selling over other distribution options, or capitalising on the heritage and traditions of a region. The NEFP producer must then accept that there is a volume/core value relationship, and at a critical level this factor will limit revenue, as with the Old World Wines (and with some SME wineries in the New World, Mowle and Merilees, 2005).

The positive aspect of this situation is the potential opportunity to establish a sustainable competitive advantage based on the specific resources of the place (D’Aveni, 1994 cited in Thode & Maskulka, 1998). The dialogic nature of brand development requires the consumer perception of place as an integral component to the process. Communications challenges may emerge if terroir features are understood as technical by producers, whilst consumer perceptions of place may be expressed in emotional terms. If brands are to be developed for the case products, then examination of the construct of the brand is the next logical consideration.

3.3.1 The construct of brand and brand function

Broadly defined the brand is a multidimensional construct which possesses boundaries comprised of company actions and consumer perceptions. The features within this domain include the brand’s attributes and social, symbolic, experiential and emotional values (De Chernatony & Dall’Olmo Riley, 1998).

The metamorphosis of product into brand can perhaps be illuminated by the following; once a product can be identified, and is requested for repeat purchase by customers it
achieves ‘consumer based brand equity’. This is defined by Keller as “the differential effect of brand knowledge on consumer response to the marketing of a brand” (Keller, 1993:2). For this thesis, it is the communication of unique qualities of NEFPs through the branding process which is of interest. To reflect the method of production and breed limitations, both lamb products in question need to achieve a premium price. In order to do so they need to be identifiable, and to have some way to explain/defend their premiums in the marketplace – to offer Keller’s brand information (above).

Given the limited (by volume) ambitions of most NEFP producers, it may be pertinent to ask, what does branding offer? De Chernatony and Dall’Ollmo Riley (1998) identified twelve broad themes found in their analysis of one hundred examples of trade and academic literature from the 1980s and 1990s, which related to the functions and definition of a brand, these have been compiled in Table 3.1:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Legal Instrument</td>
<td>7 Image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Logo</td>
<td>8 Value system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Company</td>
<td>9 Personality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Shorthand</td>
<td>10 Relationship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Risk reducer</td>
<td>11 Adding value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Identity system</td>
<td>12 Evolving entity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table compiled from De Chernatony & Dall’Olmo Riley. (1998, p426 & 432)

Some of these elements are visual, and involved in the communication process, such as logo. Some are strategic and concerned with competitive advantage: legal instrument, company, risk reducer, adding value, position, goodwill. Some are focussed on consumer satisfaction through identity tool, value agreement, relationship elements, vision, or shorthand. The authors consider these roles as overlapping for example value system and personality, and at the same time expressing extreme opposite positions on the role of branding, for example brand as a logo, simply a sign or easily recognised differentiating symbol (Watkins, 1986; Aaker, 1991; Dibb et al., 1994; Kotler et al., 50
1996), and brand as a much more holistic identity system (Kapferer, 1997). A number of specific dimensions are available to the case products which can be added as footnotes to 5 & 6 in the table above. These relate to farm quality assurances (risk reducing function) or EU regional-food status (identity protection function).

The brand functions expressed in the Table 3.1 have been outlined by marketers. They summarise the pragmatic process of branding and offer the basis for evaluations of company efficiency and effectiveness. For the case products, their movement from commodity to identifiable and unique product, focuses mainly on developing an identity, which is recognised, appreciated and understood.

In order to uncover what is irksome to consumers about branding, and find clues as to what actions should be avoided when considering the branding process, a different set of literature become relevant, that which looks at brands’ role in society.

Arvidsson (2006) considers Klein’s (2001) disdain of brands in society, summarised by the following functions of brands (Table 3.2):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: compiled from Arvidsson (2006:16)

These views support the argument that branding as a social phenomenon is not always received positively. For this thesis, consideration of the discussion on brands and ‘informational capital’ is not central, and will not be entered into. However, the presentation of the potential risk of ‘building in’ elements to the brand which will be perceived negatively, is appropriate. In consideration of direct sales of NEFP, it is the distinction between heritage visit and theme park experience which has to be sensitively managed (Goulding, 2000). Arvidsson’s (2006) second theme is particulary relevant to the lifescape perspective already discussed.
The range of branding functions shown, represents a diverse set of perspectives which may form the basis for writing about brands. It seems logical therefore to expect that even within literature favouring the branding process, the recommended strategies and processes to develop brands, will exhibit similar diversity. The next section considers the early stages of brand development.

### 3.3.2 The early branding process, brand visioning and identity

This section considers the process of establishing brands in the current environment and in consumer consciousness. In order for brands to be successful, consumers must perceive them as relevant to their lives and their values. Resonance is a term frequently used in relation to brands and particularly the process of sustaining brands over time (Keller, 2003). In order to achieve and maintain relevance with consumers, and thus resonate with them, brands are rooted in the dynamic elements of current environmental trends, consumer/company values and identity.

De Chernatony (2007) describes brand visioning as “*considering how a brand could benefit its stakeholders over a long time horizon*”. (p99) De Chernatony (ibid) defines three linked and self-supporting components of brand vision, as future environment, purpose and values. To illustrate these, future environment requires consideration of life/environmental changes, envisaged over the future. Then considers how the product may be reinvented to maintain relevance/take leadership in such a future. The purpose element of brand visioning, reveals how the brand will contribute towards making the world a better place, this may be exemplified through the Body Shop’s ethical stance in relation to animal testing of its products, or other ‘mission statement–like’ and differentiating sentiment. The third component is brand values, De Chernatony (ibid) cites Rockeach (1973) in defining values as:

> “A value is an enduring belief that a specific mode of conduct or end-state of existence is personally or socially preferable to an opposite or converse mode of conduct or end-state of existence.”(De Chernatony, 2007:6)

Alternatively Schwartz (1992) defines values as “*guiding principles in the life of a person*”. The power of the brand comes from the combination of functional, performance-related values coupled with emotional values. The consumer perceives the
brand as a holistic entity, and receives both functional and emotional values from it, whilst ‘new consumers’ are motivated by the desire for experiences, over benefits and features (Baker, 2003:121)

Kapferer (1997) reminds us that the brand remains a dynamic entity in his rather contradictory quote,

“...a brand only grows over a long period by remaining consistent....Nevertheless, a brand which does not change with the times fossilises and loses its relevance”

(Kapferer, 1997:169)

Kapferer (1997) alludes to the components of the brand, the contribution made by one set of values which are relevant to what is current, but that may need to be modified along with changing trends, and another set of values which are retained over time as they reflect the essence of the brand. De Chernatony (2007:117) differentiates between generic category values, which are regarded as the ‘entry price’ for the category, such as exceeding consumer expectations, excellence in internal and external communications and innovation, and the mission-like core values of the brand, such as Sir Richard Branson’s:

“We give top priority to the interests of our staff; second priority to those of our customers; third to our shareholders.”

(Macrae, 1996:232)

Collins & Porras (1996) consider the constant and transient elements of brands, examining the role of core and periphery brand values in brand-building over the long-term, and recommend techniques for identifying core values. These include asking the following questions:

Would the team want to be true to these values for the next hundred years, regardless of environmental change?

Does this value provide a clear guide for behaviour, communication and continuing development?
Is this value credible and consistently achievable?
Does this value set your brand apart from competitors?
Is this value based on some logic?
Is this value understandable and able to inspire staff?
(Collins & Porras, 1996)

The early development of a brand should then include assessment of core (long-term) and periphery (short-term values) as well as functional and emotional benefits. The source of brand values is not an exact science, De Chernatony et al., (2004) outline methods for identification of brand values, namely the laddering technique, surveys and interviews which can be applied both with consumers and internal organization employees (Chapter 6). Other techniques used to identify salient values include: the Mars Group method (to identify the best brand elements to export to a new habitable planet Mars) (Collins and Porras, 1996). Alternative techniques include identifying brand artefacts, such as “advertising, pricing, the type of people working on the brand, the offices and brochures, the language used by staff” Shein (1984) and critical episodes within the brand’s history, such as severe competitive episodes or new opportunities (Chernatonly, 2007). Kapferer cites Light’s (ND) chain of means-ends (which incorporates values, and more tangible elements towards the base) as a short cut to positioning a brand (Figure 3.2).

Figure 3.2 The McDonald’s Positioning Ladder

Source: Light, ND cited in Kapferer,(2008:180)
Significant in terms of resource use, relating to the value-defining processes De Chernatony (2007) writes of the emergence of brand components from ‘the team’ within an organisation, branding emerges an internal research process recommended for ‘a small group with facilitator’. The process of branding is a creative one, with interchangeable variables and often fictitious components.

Thus the branding literature advises that brands are inseparably linked to the consumption environment, competitors’ marketing actions, and company/consumer values (De Chernatony et al., 2004; De Chernatony, 2007). These spheres of influence provide sources of innovation relative to periphery values which allow brands to remain relevant. Successful ‘pitching’ of periphery values, which take account of customers ‘values, allows customers to feel “in sync” with the brand (Keller, 2003). Within the organisation, there are a group of employees working with the brand and they guide and plan future brand development.

Brand visioning therefore outlines a ‘finding yourself’ process for the brand which is clearly a requirement when developing a chocolate bar, or soft-drink. However authentic NEFPs ‘already know who they are’. The process of visioning is therefore much more one of selection and annunciation. As for the future, traditional farming practices tend to push the past into the future, to be sustainable, and to continue forwards with change limited by geographical and other constraints. However, it is also important to remember the consumers’ role in constructing brand meaning, and to acknowledge the dialogic nature of brand promotion (O’Reilly, 2005).

In meeting current consumer values, the process outlined above does have something to offer. There is clearly research to be undertaken to establish the role of the case products in consumers’ self-image for example. Whilst acknowledging the requirement for the brand to transform over time, as it evolves to match new consumer interests, such response is necessarily limited, where the base product for that brand is animate. The focus in relation to the two NEFP cases continues on the first phases of brand development, and will now consider literature concerning the formulation of brand identity.

Because the identity of one brand will be influenced by wider company activity, it is pertinent first to consider some options on brand portfolio design. For new entrants to the world of branding it is particularly important to consider the implications of using a
single brand name; this falls within the theme of brand architecture (Kapferer, 2008). Strategies adopted in relation to the use of a brand name can provide either limitations in individual brand activities (decisions must take account of the brand family as a whole) or economies in communications spending per product (as the impact of the shared brand name is achieved through different product’s communications budgets) and importantly in most industries offers great potential for growth. In some instances the brand takes pre-eminence within the company; consider the Nivea brand and all its brand extensions. Here the company supports the growth and expansion of its brands. There is a company/brand relationship motivated by volume growth (Kapferer 1997:308). This approach is in stark contrast to the classical conception of branding expressed as an equation:

\[
1 \text{ brand} = 1 \text{ product} = 1 \text{ promise}
\]

(Kapferer, 1997:300)

This type of branding uses the brand personality rather in the human sense, that is, each brand is unique to one product. Aaker and Keller (1990) refer to brand extension as the use of a name on a product in a different category (that in the same category being a line-extension). Companies are better able to make decisions on brand name selection at the outset, if they have a vision of how their product portfolio may develop (Keller, 2008:153).

There are certain requirements for building world class brands, one of them being the ability of the production unit/s to supply the global market (Kapferer, 2008:52). The type of product which can be produced ad-infinitum, such as producing a concentrate which can be mixed with water to produce a soft drink, or assembling micro-chips and plastic to produce mobile phones (Kapferer, 2008:40). Clearly in the case of the products involved in the current study, mass-production is not possible. The specific terrain used for production is limited, and the stocking density of the land is limited. On the contrary, if the product is to retain authenticity, then the volume limitation becomes a key attribute. Over-popularity of a NEFP brand, could result in levels of demand so high that they become detrimental to the industry, potentially producing the same type of backward bending supply curves found in endangered fisheries. It is therefore important that the NEFP consumer understands this credence attribute (of
limited supply) clearly, so that they may begin to use it as a search attribute, and recognise the rationale for the price premium.

It is pertinent at the outset for individual producers intending to develop their brand, to calculate returns possible from their meat sales, through their chosen channels and estimate the market opportunities for the development of other products and services, and branding options for these. Clearly limitations of supply affect marketing decisions beyond the limits of branding. Market targeting, pricing and distribution require detailed analysis, which is beyond the scope of this thesis.

A contemporary and growing phenomenon in branding is the association of brands in the form of co-branding. This is seen as natural, in an era of networking, and greater confidence in flexible and novel working patterns. The association with another brand can add some aspect to the union which is better, than developing the same aspect ‘in-house’ in short there is a synergy at work. Kapferer (2007) identifies certain situations where co-branding occurs:

1. To extend a brand beyond its traditional market
2. To achieve communications targets with new markets
3. To reach a new distribution channel
4. To move up a level, in both price and distribution
5. To achieve credibility through use of an ingredient brand
6. As a response to market fragmentation
7. To promote through association
8. To provide a buzz
9. To show force against a threat
   Kapferer (2007:167-9)

Most of the examples offered in this text relate to national or international brands Kapferer (2007). Jamie Oliver and Tefal are offered as an example for 3 above. Similarly celebrity chef endorsement for frozen ready meals exemplify number 4 above. Particularly significant from the small company perspective, is the consideration of impact, and how by association, small companies can achieve greater impact number 7 above. The growth and success of regional food groups, such as ‘Made in Cumbria’ offer testament to strength in numbers, and represent an investment in the place attribute
across products. There is a transience and experiential aspect to the co-branding at a farmers’ market, and a more permanent situation in specialist regional shops (Holloway and Kneafsey, 2000; Baker, 2003). There is also an element of ‘complete solution’ which multiple brands can offer the consumer, exemplified by washing machine-washing powder combinations, or recipe-style advertising used to promote Sainsbury-branded product combinations.

Brand identity is found in the literature as a fairly disparate concept. Kapferer (2007) summarises some proprietary models used by industry: Unilever’s ‘brand key’, Johnson & Johnson’s ‘footprint’ which take the format of checklists of concepts related to brand identity (p171). Early in the brand’s evolution key decisions need to be made concerning the development of brand identity. Keller (2001) defines four steps of brand building, which relate to customers’ questions of the brand:

- Who are you? (brand identity)
- What are you? (brand meaning)
- What about you? What do I think or feel about you? (brand response)
- What about you and me? What kind of association and how much of a connection would I like to have with you? (brand relationships)

It is important to view brand development from perspectives of the company and the consumer. Brand image is the perception of the brand held by consumers, whilst brand identity is the identity projected by the brand developer (De Chernatony 2007:47). Keller’s (2008) consumer-based brand equity pyramid shows that the power of the brand is in customers’ accumulated perceptions and experience of the brand over time. The left route within the pyramid represents a “rational route”, whilst the route within the right side of the pyramid represents an “emotional route”. Accompanied by the stages of brand development (left) and branding objectives appropriate at each stage (right), this pyramid provides quite a comprehensive model for brand building.
De Chernatony’s (2007:47) brand visioning process by default reveals certain brand values. His model also includes the culture of the organisation, the positioning of the product in the market, the personality of the brand which corresponds to the relationships between brand and stakeholders. Congruence between all these factors allows for a confident presentation of the brand in the marketplace.

“An image results from decoding a message, extracting meaning, interpreting signs.” (where signs come from formulated identity or noise) Kapferer, 2007:175

Kapferer’s statement echoes the communications literature (Pickton and Broderick, 2005 : Fill, 2011) His model similarly excludes the predisposition of the recipient consumer (p174). Given the importance of congruence between brand and consumer values it is pertinent to examine values further in the next section.
3.3.3 An examination of consumer values

Values are limited by a person’s biological and social makeup, and by their needs. How many needs do we have? Freud (1922) suggested two, Maslow (1954) five, and Holbrook offers eight (Schroder, 2003). Rokeach estimated the total number of terminal values that a grown person possesses is about 18, the number of instrumental values is 60-72. This thesis will attempt to reveal those which relate to considerations of lamb purchase.

Rokeach (1973) developed five assumptions about the nature of human values:

1. the total number of values a person possesses is relatively small
2. all men everywhere possess the same values to different degrees
3. values are organized into value systems
4. the antecedents of human values can be traced to culture, society and its institutions, and personality.
5. the consequences of human values will be manifested in virtually all phenomena that social scientists might consider worth investigating and understanding.

Rokeach (1973:3).

Following (particularly assumption 5) the values that a person holds are therefore central to all our actions and decision-making, a person’s values serve as “the criteria, or standards in terms of which evaluations are made” (Williams, 1968:283, cited ibid p4).

Rokeach describes the value system as:

“...... an enduring organization of beliefs concerning preferable modes of conduct or end-states of existence along a continuum of relative importance” (Rockeach, 1973:5).

Rokeach describes a value as a “preference”, “a conception of the desirable” – some kinds of preference do not implicate modes of behaviour or end-states of existence; for instance preferences for certain kinds of food, would not qualify as “conceptions of the desirable”(ibid:10). Rokeach also perceived values as hierarchical in the mind of the individual, with some having preference over the others.
Rokeach (ibid) considered that if values were stable, individual and social change would be impossible. If values changed constantly then society would be unstable. He considered the tendency for values to have an enduring character, as the result of them being initially taught or learned in isolation from other values, and in ‘an all or nothing’ manner. For example, it is desirable to be honest (not a little bit honest), to be logical, or to strive for salvation or peace.

Rokeach (ibid) illustrated that in life situations, we are faced with competing values, and we find ourselves in situations where we are forced to weigh one value against another; we might trade-off gaining career advantage by incurring some degree of dishonesty, or being less obedient than we normally would to pursue what drives us independently. As we mature and gain life experience, we learn to organise the isolated, absolute values which we have been taught in this, or that context, into a hierarchical system, where each value is ordered in priority or importance relative to other values (ibid. p6).

Values like beliefs have cognitive, affective and connative components: cognition about the correct way to behave or the correct end-state to strive for. It is affective in the sense that we can feel emotional about it, either affectively for or against it, or we can approve or disprove of those who exhibit positive or negative instances of it. Finally, the behavioural component is that action we take to complement the value.

Values are classified into two groups, those which are intrinsic or self-transcendent, meaning they are rewarding to pursue. Helping friends and family, connecting with nature and creativity are examples of such actions. The opposite group are extrinsic or self-actualisation values and these are strived for because approval from others is deemed important. Wealth, social status, power and concern about image are the concerns linked to these values (Crompton, 2010).

Taking the view that a value is someone’s conception of the desirable, then it is not necessarily the case that it is so for all. Rokeach (1973) gives the example of the sentiment ‘Children should be seen and not heard’ which infers different behaviour is desirable for children and adults. A person need not apply his own values to all others equally, but with versatility. We may use double standards of values when in competition with others and single standards when in a situation of cooperation.
Similarly we may adopt different values as the situation demands, McEachern & Schröder (2004) noted, we may take care to purchase local meat for a special occasion.

Instrumental and terminal values comprise two separate yet functionally interconnected systems. All values concerning modes of behaviour are instrumental to the attainment of all the values concerning end states. There are two kinds of instrumental values: moral values and competence values. Moral values relate to modes of behaviour hence do not necessarily include values that concern end-states of existence. Competence or self-actualisation values have a personal rather than interpersonal focus and are not so concerned with morality. Their violation leads to feelings of shame about personal inadequacy, rather than feelings of guilt about wrong-doing (as with moral values). Certain values are personal, such as good health, whilst others are social such as, environmental responsibility. Some people are more socially aware than others and they tend to have more social and less personal values (Rockeache, 1973).

So behaving honestly and responsibly leads us to believe we are behaving morally, whereas behaving logically, intelligently or imaginatively leads us to believe we are behaving competently. A person can experience conflict between: two moral values – honestly and lovingly, and between two competence values – imaginatively and logically, and between competence and moral values – act politely and offer intellectual criticism

The ‘oughtness’ of terminal and instrumental values relates to social pressures. A person phenomenologically experiences ‘oughtness’ to be objectively required by society in somewhat the same way he perceives an incomplete circle as objectively requiring closure (ibid:9). Ought is related to instrumental values, which concern morality, rather than competence. The ‘oughtness’ comes from societal pressures to behave in certain ways, the ‘oughtness’ related to competence values is less pressured from society, and therefore more subdued.

Terminal values are then idealized end-states of existence, and instrumental values are idealised modes of behaviour (ibid:12) NB. An attitude differs from a value in that an attitude refers to an organization of several beliefs around a specific object or situation. (Rockeache, 1968a, 1968b, cited in ibid:18. For the case products consumers would have values relating to agricultural products which may play a part in perhaps health or
hedonism-related end-states. Therefore it is important to consider how branding has developed in this category.

### 3.3.4 Agricultural commodity branding

This section considers the brand literature relevant to the agricultural sector. The practice of branding cattle with a producer’s mark, is sometimes used in textbooks as almost a metaphor for the process of branding which has now become so much more elaborate (Blackett & Boad, 1999). Ironically, it is only due to recent health scares that most cattle do retain various formats of identity which allow traceability back to the farm, whilst very few cattle achieve a non-commodity meat status in the retail domain.

Thode & Maskulka (1998) incidentally refer to the prices of agricultural commodities, and that their prices may rise and fall through time, through the forces of supply and demand. This leaves individual producers of agricultural commodities in a control-free oblivion, a state they have resided in for decades. The industry structure and the heritage of farming, has left them with the options of continuing with things as they always have been i.e. taking the price offered at auction, or reject the whole industry, as a pioneer champion of both their craft and consumer satisfaction. This involves marketing direct to consumers and bearing all associated extra efforts, costs and risks. They (ibid) also mention that:

> “unlike strict agricultural commodities, perceived quality in terms of ripeness, flavour concentration, sugar levels and the like, is a price discriminator for wine grapes” (Thode & Maskulka 1998:388)

But it is difficult to think of an agricultural product where similar differentiating criteria are not present; cereal grains vary in size, variety and humidity; salt from the Algarve is sold for different purposes, salads or cooking according to taste; there is little homogeneity across harvests. However ‘agricultural commodities’ do exist. In the past they were the stuff of central economic plans. They are traded on ‘futures markets’ before they have even been produced, and some are eventually given an identity by the supermarkets as anonymous beef, lamb, flour, white fish etc bearing the retailer’s brand.
Origin/place of production for meat does not necessarily identify the country where the animal was born or reared. The FSA (2008) advise:

_There is no statutory definition of “place of origin or provenance” in the Food Labelling Regulations 1996 or of “origin of provenance” in Directive 2000/13/EC. Both are in Codex and the World Trade Organisation Rules, the country of origin is deemed to be the place of last substantial change. This is consistent with section 36 of the Trade Descriptions Act 1968 where the approach is that for the purposes of the Act._ FSA, (2008: 6) Country of Origin Labelling Guidance.

Wilson (1991) in his article on dairy product brands in Europe, comments upon the increasing concentration and power of the grocery retail trade, and states:

_“The conventional response of the food industry ...is to seek to counteract that power through branding”_ (Wilson, 1991:4).

Even in 1991, the dairy industry (structured around regional producer cooperatives) was only just recognising the need to switch - from serving the producer to serving the consumer. Concerns brought out in this paper were those associated with distributor own brands, rapidly following the development of private brands, in the milk and dairy product ranges. Part of this concern related to the fact that the newer products such as ‘set yoghurt’ and ‘fromage frais’ were identified as product types rather than brands. They were commodity-like, the feeling was that a trick had been missed by the dairy industry companies, to develop strong brands which may have been used to strengthen the bargaining power of the dairy companies against retailers.

The 1967 Agriculture Act established the Meat and Livestock Commission (MLC) which was funded by a levy per head of cattle. Included in its broad remit was promotion (Palmer et al., 2006) A decade after its founding Scottish and Welsh farmers agreed to pay additional levy for the promotion of regional brands (ibid). In October 2002, EBLEX came into being, and after an initial period of research a set of strategic priorities was identified. These included a brand strategy which sought to identify and
establish a positioning for English beef and lamb in relation to “Welsh Lamb” and “Scottish Beef” as well and cheaper imported meat (ibid). The (levy funded) Agriculture and Horticulture Development Board (AHDB) was set up in 2008, one of its objectives is to improve marketing and help profitability and consumer awareness.

The UK food industry is typified by the aggregate nature of food distribution, delivered to the consumer through a concentrated retail system; this process has largely removed producer identity from commodity products, in favour of retailer identity. Considering brand implications of the EU ‘designation of origin’ themes, based on unique relationships between food and land, and traditional production methods. It is possible to include both ‘hard’ (tangible, functional) and ‘soft’ (emotional) elements in brand development (Biel, 1992). Treatment of terroir factors from the perspective of both producer retailer and consumer, over a dynamic period of learning, will be a critical challenge for the emerging brands (Appendix A). Retailer assurances relating to food quality, are discussed further in the next section.

3.3.5 Multiple-retailer reassurances of meat quality

UK supermarket retailers controlled 74% of red-meat sales in February 2007 (TNS Worldpanel, 2007, cited in Duffy and Fearne, 2009:670). Their actions in relation to brand attributes which aim to give farm assurances for meat products, potentially have great influence over general consumer perceptions of trustworthy characteristics in meat products. Following a series of highly publicised meat-related food scares including BSE (1986) foot and mouth (2001) retailers started to develop their own assurance schemes. Efficiencies were sought by producers, in the form of a generic industry assurance scheme (McEachern and Seaman, 2005). The independent organisation Assured Food Standards (AFS), implements British Farm Standard, and uses the ‘Little Red Tractor’ logo as a symbol of UK Fresh Food to build consumer trust (Yee and Yeung, 2002). Multiple retailers’ meat packs, may contain information on farm of origin, Little Red Tractor compliance, EU designation if appropriate, in addition to the retailer’s own brand, which is clearly their first priority. Research on the effectiveness of the Little Red Tractor mark, reveals that consumers perceptions remain largely unclear on the meaning of the symbol, and its significance relevant to production methods or origin (McEachern and Seaman, 2005; Manning et al., 2007).
There is clearly a need for a comprehensive and consumer weighted perspective on meat communications in mainstream retail. This leaves no extant successful example for regional foods to follow. Communications of embedded meats will be pioneering in their development of meat product communications based on consumers’ understanding of the product. The following section will consider further the distinct qualities of agricultural products, and branding strategies used.

3.3.6 Branding considerations for agricultural products

It has already been outlined above that most regional agricultural produce does not lend itself to unlimited production. Some further points are included below following a review of literature concerning the marketing of agricultural products.

The constraints come from the area of land, and type of ground and environment which will produce a given level of nutrition for a given stock density. The topography, climate and tradition of the place will favour certain breeds of animal over others, and all breeds do not reproduce at the same rate. It should therefore be possible to work out the maximum production per annum of Lakeland HL and CSML (Quota principle) in the same way this technique is used for regional wines (Moran, 1993).

Sanzo et al (2001) cited in Fandos and Flavian (2006) considers central (core) and periphery attributes of agricultural products, central being category defining attributes, along with nutritive and organoleptic properties. Peripheral attributes are seen as those enabling differentiation such as brands, labels, design, customer advice on key attributes, authenticity, together with sustainable and cultural claims. For example, Fandos and Flavian (2006) considered the intrinsic and extrinsic attributes of Teruel ham, a Spanish dry-cured ham. They include in the intrinsic (functional) value elements such as flavour, aroma, appearance including colour, whilst extrinsic values included the shape of the elongated ham, the presence of the trotter, and the regulatory body and company brand marks.

Fandos and Flavian (2006) consider hormone use, fat/cholesterol measure, animal nutrition and welfare, food safety and health aspects, all as attributes pertaining to agricultural products which are not perceived during the purchasing process. Perhaps this claim invites a comment on the cultural context of this study (Spanish); some of those elements are certainly evident in some local producer’s literature in the UK.
Consistency of product is a key benefit brands normally offer to the customer; however, this presents a challenge to some forms of agricultural produce. Some products and components of products lend themselves to consistency, technological components can be tested, measured, rejected and replaced easily, quickly and cheaply, the quality of a micro-chip is rarely weather-dependent. Retailers tend to communicate preferences to producers who achieve it as far as they can. The consistency issue and food, is reminiscent of debates involving Commission Regulation Number 2257/94 (Hannan, 12/11/08), which laid down that bananas must be "free from abnormal curvature of the fingers" (now scrapped). Whilst some customers are aware of the links between agricultural practices and the food we eat, and variability as a characteristic of agricultural output (Harmon, 2002, cited in Sibbel, 2007). Particularly post-EU rulings (and associated publicity on the same) for required shapes for bananas and strawberries, some consumers are more forgiving, and possibly welcoming of food complete with naturally occurring variations.

Hingley and Lindgreen (2002) consider the role of relationship marketing in the marketing of fresh produce in the UK and Wine from New Zealand. Interestingly they note that suppliers find the variable nature of the fresh products sector a factor which realises close relationships.

To summarise, some agricultural products have constraints on production volume, particularly if produced in a high-welfare and traditional method. Intrinsic qualities of meat are subject to variation with age or breed of the animal, seasonal factors and primary processing. If consumers understand the reasons for variability in appearance, texture and taste, then consistency becomes less of a requirement (thereby presenting a brief for communications). The consumer’s concern for ‘other attributes’ such as local, traditional, unique related to place of production included in features presented by the product, may be supported by extrinsic features such as brand assurances (Fandos and Flavian, 2006).

The next section will evaluate the literature on place marketing which necessarily takes a broader view than that of the individual production unit.

3.3.7 Place branding
The literature on place branding is divided between place of origin branding (Kotler & Gertner, 2002; Papadopoulos & Heslop, 2002); nation branding (Anholt, 2002;
Gilmore, 2002; Ham, 2001; culture/entertainment branding (Hannigan, 2004); destination branding (Moran et al. 2002) place/city branding (Hankinson 2001; Trueman et al. 2004). The concern here is with place of origin branding which aligns place to a food product/s.

Zenker & Braun (2010) define the place brand as ‘a network of associations in the consumers’ mind based on the visual, verbal, and behavioural expression of a place, which is embodied through the aims, communication, values, and the general culture of the place’s stakeholders and the overall place design. (p5).

Kavaratzis & Hatch (2013) consider identity and place branding. They cite Kalanides’ (2011) five elements of place: image, materiality, institutions, relations, people and practices. With these elements viewed as processes rather than entities a perspective reminiscent of Massey (1994).

The particular characteristics of place include: conflicting interests of stakeholder groups, and lack of control over the branded entity compared to product branding (Frost, 2004; Hinrichs, 2003). NEFPs are anchored in a ‘place’ and possess a local identity, however these are not fixed concepts (see Figure 2.2). Place identity ‘management’ can be approached from different boundary perspectives, highly focussed at the farm level, local at multiple farm level or regional/county level, the selection may be based on strategic considerations. Iverson & Hem (2006) consider the challenge of building favourable provenance, to capitalise on for regional produce, whilst the case products benefit from the fortunate perceptions which much of the population hold for ‘The Lake District’ (Lefebure, (1987). Moran (1993) offers diverse theoretical interpretations of geographical indications, summarised in table 2.1.

Hannabuss (1999) wrote of experience as a commodity provided by the tourism and heritage industries; in this sense places are commodified and marketed. He writes of nostalgia, and the past as a place or domain which holds our emotions. Colomb and Kalandides (2010) see the two desired outcomes of place branding as “to form a unique selling proposition that will secure visibility to the outside and reinforce, local identity to the inside” (2010:175). This is achieved by associating information and appealing values to the place in the memories of a target group.
Mayes quote seems particularly apt for lifescapes and NEFPs, in the suggestion that place identities emerge “from the intrinsic features and history of a given place and a shared (personalized) relationship to these elements” (Mayes, 2008:125).

Two recent journal articles have attempted to track the conceptual development and heritage of place branding and its likely future direction (Karavatsis & Ashworth, 2008; Niedomysl & Jonasson, 2012). Karavatsis & Ashworth (2008) chart four distinct phases in place promotion: from the seventh to the nineteenth century places were promoted with the goal of settling empty land, selling land and to attract industries (Ward, 1998). From the nineteen nineties onwards the authors cite ‘the stage of planning instrument’ whereby local goals needed to be made attractive to investors, tourists and local residents (Ashworth & Voogd, 1990 & 1994; Barke, 1999). Similarly planners sought to invest in the image of their place (Barke, 1999) or to reinvent an attractive place in a post-industrial scenario (Ward, 1998). The third stage is that ‘of corporate brand’ where emotional and psychological associations between company and place are invested in (Kavaratzis & Ashworth, 2005). Place branding has a multidisciplinary heritage and is itself an emerging discipline.

As Karavatsis & Ashworth (2008) go on to discuss the future of place branding, they consider the element of competition (between cities) and cite Cox (1995) quoted in Jessop (1998).

“Weak competition is socially disembedding, whereas strong competition involves the territorialisation of economic activity.”

Cox (1995:218)

It may be interesting to consider how competition amongst farms or amongst sheep breeds may increase the embeddedness of regional meat. Niedomysl & Jonasson (2012) take this power theme further, constructing a spatial competition framework, which incorporates level of place marketing, hierarchy of power and spatial distance. These authors (ibid) are scathing of marketing researchers treating places as ‘spatially extended products’. Their view is that “competition between places for capital is the very reason for the existence of - and thus a key factor in understanding – place marketing” (ibid, 2012:225).
Giovanardi et al (2013) offer an analytical semiotic framework which they term ‘brand ecology’. Brand ecology is a summative term for the complex interplay between procedures, mechanisms and symbols which feed into the development of place brands. Three streams of influences under the headings of: syntax (significant actors, meaningful events, and transformations); semantics (the relationship between signs and what they represent) and pragmatics (semantics and syntax in action, or as lived in a social context). These authors (ibid) argue that place marketing literature has tended to focus on the syntax (Warnaby et al, 2010) whilst place branding literature has focussed on semantics (Klink, 2001), and recognise the importance of the interrelationships between these aspects by the inclusion of pragmatics.

The objective within this thesis is not to brand place; it is to develop brands for products which are heavily reliant on their place for their distinctiveness. Much of the place branding literature struggles to find a conceptual consensus, amongst a wide range of disciplinary perspectives and empirical studies on place (Lucarelli & Berg, 2011). Issues with disparate perspectives are partly resolved in the case of NEFPs, in that the products can act as a lens through which to define the characteristics and dimensions of place. The next section will consider literature specific to consumer food choice.

3.4 The structure of the literature on food choice

The purpose of this section is to expose what the literature offers to the understanding of consumer interaction with regional food, and specifically naturally embedded meats (See 2.3.3). Firstly it is pertinent to acknowledge the existence of many factors influencing food choice, and to evaluate the conceptual development of food choice understanding relative to a focus on NEFPs and specifically naturally embedded meat. Given the strong relationship between food and terroir, as described in the PDO criteria, and the heritage of GI, as well as the definition of NEFP (See Chapter 2) the product focus within this thesis demands consideration of relevant factors of ‘embeddedness’ or specificity of place. This is a concept which requires further review. Literature considering consumer behaviour in response to the regional geography takes on a food significance in this sense. ‘Meat’ is another value laden concept involving life, responsibility, death and flesh which provoke strong emotional reactions. ‘Lamb’ and specifically ‘salt marsh and HL’ are evaluated from the literature.
A wide literature has developed which seeks to explain considerations which consumers may make in decisions concerning food choice. Many of these authors are to be found in edited texts such as that by Frewer and van Trijp (2006). Literature on food related buyer behaviour offers numerous descriptive food choice models (Khan, 1981; Shepherd, 1989; Gains, 1994; Grunert et al., 1996; Sobal et al., 2006). These models share various collections of influencing factors on food-decision making, which can be categorised broadly into one of three domains: product, person and situation.

Models of buyer behaviour have been developed for use in predicting and analysing consumer choice (Chisnall, 1995). The following section will consider how NEFPs sit within the literature on food choice. Grunert’s (1996) conceptualisation of factors influencing food preferences introduces the broad range of factors which can play a part in consumer decision-making relating to food. (see also Khan, 1981 Shepherd, 1989; Gains 1994; Sobal et al., 2006). Taking food quality as a multi-dimensional phenomenon, Grunert (1996) modelled a conceptual framework for the assessment of food quality, wherein the weighting of food attributes denoted in Figure 3.3 by each consumer would be unique. This model includes extrinsic quality cues, however this has generally been interpreted as attributes relating to packaging, promotional and situational elements. The credence elements assume no visual verification is available to the consumer. For regionally embedded food products there is the notion of a shared landscape, and observation of the growing animal in the landscape, these are not accounted for here.
Consumers’ perspectives of geographic indication in foods provided a distinguishing characteristic for regional foods (Tregear et al., 1999). This research cites literature in the tourism and food sectors, which reveals consumer desires for ‘genuine’, ‘original’ or ‘real’ products and experiences (Hughes, 1995; Ritzer, 1996; McCannell, 1989; cited in Tregear et al., 1998:386). It goes on to cite the work of Urry (1995) and explain that perceptions of quality and authenticity result from subjective constructs by the individual, which draw on tangible and intangible aspects of the product and the situation of its consumption.

Focus group discussions (Kuznesof et al., 1997) confirmed the importance of authenticity of a ‘regional food’, exemplified by the comparison of Newcastle Brown Ale, which was seen as a defining symbol of Newcastle and part of the culture, whilst Phileas Fogg tortilla chips, a brand which had heavily communicated its place of production as ‘Medomsley Road, Consett’ was seen to lack aspects of tradition and heritage. Indeed literature on regional foods, has sought to define and model factors related to heritage of regional food, as built upon perceptions of regional customs such as employment, recipes, food preparation and service, together with place related factors such as climate and geomorphology (Kuznesof et al., 1997). Aside from the central
authenticity requirements, regional foods were found to comprise product related factors, personal and situational factors as shown in Fig. 3.3

Figure 3.4  Factors Affecting Perceived Authenticity of Regional Foods.

Source: Kuznesof et al., (1997)

Product related factors include the name, packaging and ingredient details, which are examined in making the judgement on authenticity as a regional food. The situational factors comprised the purchase or consumption place and context, which would either enhance or detract from the regional authenticity of the food. Personal factors cited included ‘knowledge’, either general knowledge and or first-hand ‘experience’ with the food in question. This section could represent knowledge of the food production process and experience of seeing it as part of the landscape, although this was not a consideration of the study (Kuznesof et al, 1997). The paper concludes that perceptions of regional foods are varied, but tend to be tied closely to perceived authenticity, which they infer from a mixture of the factors in Figure 3.4.
Going back to the central theme of ‘authenticity’ as a defining characteristic of regional foods, more consideration must be given to the components of this concept (Tregear, 2001). It is clear that appellations of origin (AO) and geographical indications (GI) are considered as separate notions from merely identifying provenance. The focus moves to the concept of ‘specificity’ in relation to the locality, and to the respect for local customs (commercial practices) which have led customers to expect given quality characteristics from a product which boasts a particular origin. This fits well with definitions of NEFPs and draws a distinction between products with a heritage, and new products. From a consumer perspective, NEFP fits Kuznesof et al.’s regional food construct of specific physical and/or sensory and/or symbolic features relating to a geographical location. The product may be processed using a distinctive method. It provides varying levels of value to the consumer, depending on the consumer’s experience and knowledge of the relevant product and region, and the situation of consumption.

3.4.1 Culture, consumption situation and food choice

The following section considers the influence of culture and situation on food choice.

Consumers tend to behave in such a way that they have learned will be expected in their culture; their decisions are in line with norms and expectations of those of the same ‘tribe’. Each tribe member may have different expectations placed upon them, depending on life-stage, age, income or other (Fishler, 1988). As expressions, language and food and heritage vary not only amongst countries, but also within regions of one country, they are a component of cultural identity (Pangborn, 1975; Levy, 1981).

Axelson (1986) describes cultural activities related to food as ‘foodways’ whilst behaviour related to food are ‘food habits’ or:

“the way in which individuals or groups of individuals, in response to social and cultural pressures, select, consume, and utilize portions of the available food supply” (Axelson, 1986:346).

The constituent food supply will reflect the society’s cultural, environmental and economic heritage, including migratory influences, impacts from wars (Pangborn, 1975).
Axelson (1986) cites Leininger on uses for food within a culture:

“for nourishment, to express friendliness and maintain interpersonal relationships, to promote and maintain their social status, to cope with stress and tension, to influence others’ behaviour, and for religious and creative expression.”

(Leininger, 1969)

Socio-demographic variables believed to have direct influence on food decision-making include: income, household size, education, gender and age, wife’s employment status, ethnicity and race. These variables seem less able to predict behaviour than psychosocial determinants. Axelson (1986) stated a point that is all too obvious today, that even when individuals have the level of income which facilitates a good diet, their choices were found to be nutritionally sub-optimal (p358). Psychosocial determinants of eating patterns include food knowledge and attitudes, including perceptions of food symbolism; these were found to explain part of food related behaviour (Axelson, 1986; Olsen 1999). How relevant is food symbolism for products which are so visible in the landscape?

The situational factors involved in food provisioning and consumption include the variables present in the environment in which these processes are undertaken (Marshall, 1993). With regard to provisioning the key concept of ‘availability’ becomes important, Kuznesof et al (1997) link the retail outlet or catering establishment as situational variables which may influence the consumer’s opinion on authenticity. Similarly ‘access’ as attendance at the farmers’ market or farm shop, may confirm authenticity, yet prove inaccessible for some consumers (Szmigin et al., 2003).

The ‘context’ or location of purchase in geographical terms is significant, given the greater emphasis placed on communications materials, in that the intention to purchase/consume NEFPs when outside a consumer’s own region, results in reliance on external communications and claims relating to ‘embedded’ status. McEachern & Schröder’s (2004) study on value-based labelling in meat, found as one of its results that consumers were particularly interested in value-based choices when entertaining dinner guest, but not when cooking for themselves or the household. This study illustrated how the value system outlined above is adjustable according to the situation.
3.4.2 The fit of NEFPs in consumers’ perceptions

Firstly, in view of ‘NEFPs consumer behaviour’ the literature derives from a number of different academic disciplines. Rural geography and rural development journals offer insight into the community and economic contributions offered by the development/support of regional food business (Ilbery & Kneafsey, 2000; Tregear et al., 2007) Whilst human geography offers some insights into the meaning of place (Seamon, 1997; Cresswell, 2004). Food science journals offer a perspective on consumer reactions to meat (Acebron & Dopico, 2000, Bernabeu & Tendero, 2005; Resano et al., 2007; Font i Furnols et al., 2006 & 2008) Agricultural related journals rarely include studies on consumer values and meat (McEachern & Schröder, 2002) Food, Marketing and Consumer Studies journals offer consideration of consumer perception of regional foods and how this information may shape policy and marketing strategies of regional food producers (Kuznesof et al., 1997; Tregear et al., 1998; Ilbery & Maye, 2006). Only in recent years has research been carried out which considers food as an integral part of consumers’ ‘lifescapes’ comprising the distinct production features of a region, its heritage of industries and community identity (Goulding, 2001; Barham, 2003; Convery et al., 2005). This holistic view of the consumer, incorporating a context in which individuals operate, both directly corresponds to, and justifies the chosen methodology of means end chain analysis, which uncovers food related decision-making as a component part of a consumer’s broad value scheme (Chapter 6).

Having adopted the NEFP definition of regional food, which echoes prevailing legislation tying food to place, it is clear from the discussion of typicity above that the food/place relationship is not a static concept. The distinctive quality of food from a particular location, as perceived by consumers, can vary over time in relation to environmental factors of migration, trade, industrialisation and agricultural policy, as well as varying between different consumers. This draws into question the exclusion of some foods currently considered as ‘speciality foods’ from the definition of ‘regional foods’. Could the development of new food products (which do not seek to emulate traditional regional food products) based on current regional and geophysical or human resources emerge as regional foods? If a region provides the topographical conditions for production of a regional food typical of those conditions in another country, does its ‘novelty’ bar the regional effect? Tregear’s ‘traditions’ would be absent or misplaced, similarly there would be lack of compliance with Mason & Brown’s (2007)
'longevity' their classification of regional food, requires products that have been made or produced for 75 years. (pxi) Berard and Marchenay (2007) describe ‘tradition’ as implicit in PDO and PGI, but explicit in TSG, explaining: “....‘traditional’ means proven usage within the Community market for a period showing transmission between generations; this time period should be the one generally ascribed to one human generation, at least 25 years” (p 5 – increased to 30 years in the latest revision of 2012). Perhaps we need to consider a new category of nouveau regional foods? (Wilson and Fearne, 1999). The following section examines the communal identity markers of food culture.

The ESRC funded ‘Eating Places’ project resulted in Cook et al’s paper (1998) which encouraged readers to reject the ‘globalisation’ perspective on food as simply ‘mass-market consumables’, examine food items as things with their own biographies and geographies, and to deconstruct our shopping baskets accordingly. Similarly, but more specifically some efforts have been made to convince readers of the pre-eminence of the ‘region’ value. National England’s (2002) study entitled ‘Eat the View’ tied the role of consuming regional food with maintaining the regional landscape.

Other themes in the literature which influence consumers to choose regional rather than conventional foods include:

- Economic factors – ensuring grocery spend goes back to the local economy (Youngs, 2003)
- Sensory factors – freshness and quality perceived to be higher in less-travelled food (Archer et al., 2003; Youngs, 2003).
- Perceptions of health – nutritional values associated with freshness, and trustworthy husbandry and heightened awareness following the BSE crisis and subsequent Foot and Mouth (Archer et al., 2003; Youngs, 2003; Miles et al., 2004).
- Lifestyle factors – reflecting ethical concerns about food quality, food safety, fair trade, community involvement and personal identity (Fischler, 1988; Groves, 2001).
- Community relationships – proximity, trust, reciprocity and social connection (Hinrichs, 2003; Kirwan et al., 2006)
The personal identity benefit is used less often as a cue for regional foods but complements the recent trend in ‘nostalgia’ (Brown, 1999; Goulding, 2001). The link between personal identity and place is illuminated by Belk’s studies (1987, 1988; Belk and Austin 1986) which found significance in the ‘self-defining role of places and experiences’. McCracken (1986) described the value individuals and cultures place on the past, the visions of a ‘golden age’ imbued with values which may not be authentic to the time, but instead are ‘what we want to remember them as’. Hence symbols, images, relics of the past hold a power in the present to confer these values to the consumer. Brown (1999) shows this phenomenon evident in retro-branding, from products such as Marlboro cigarettes which have conveyed idealised images of the ‘wild-west’, to ‘new’ confectionary which is presented as an extension of long established brands, such as chunky Kit-Kat. Wilson and Fearne (2000) reflect on postmodern society’s twin concerns of globalisation and the search for novelty, and link this to the resurging demand for tradition and place/rootedness, or endogenous schemes (Morley et al., 2000).

Mugerauer uses the term ‘environmental hermeneutics’ as an interpretation method which involves “what things are and how they are related to other things in the webs of particular lives and places” (Cited in Cresswell, 2004:4) Convery et al., (2005) discuss the concept of ‘lifescapes’, which is used to articulate the relationship between landscape, livestock, farming and rural communities on different levels, from spatial to emotional and ethical. These relationships are often taken for granted; they form a backdrop to immediate operational aspects of life. Significantly the epidemic of foot and mouth in 2001, and subsequent culls of livestock caused fissures in these lifescapes as the livestock were removed. Belk (1988) describes as particularly notable, the evidence cited of diminished sense of self, which is brought about when possessions are lost or stolen. This raises the question of how Cumbrians perceive products which are so visible in the landscape.

Indeed literature on regional foods has sought to define and model factors related to heritage of regional food, as built upon perceptions of regional customs such as employment, recipes, food preparation and service, together with place related factors such as climate and geomorphology (Kuznesof et al., 1997). Whilst many foods may include reference to ‘place of production’ in their extrinsic cues, the degree to which the flavours or ingredients are dependent on the locale vary considerably. This gives rise to
the concept of ‘authenticity’ which from a product perspective, is communicated to the consumer via the name, description on the label, appearance and ingredient information (Kuznesof et al., 1997).

3.4.3 Consumer food choice and meat

This section will first review literature with a broad meat perspective and then focus on lamb. Culinary rules of the culture will often relate to sourcing, cooking and consumption of foods (Fischler, 1988). Cultural events may place people and food in ritualistic situations, where the product takes on different values from those it holds outside these situations, such as allocation of the duty of carving the meat at Christmas. Embedded social traits in relation to food provide reference points for both sides of product communications, and therefore should be clearly understood. Some of the literature draws on the food science perspectives, relating to meat quality variables, the ‘search goods’ for which quality can be evaluated before purchase, for example by format, colour, size, smell, price and other brand-related cues (Becker, 2000; Bernabeu & Tendero, 2005). In relation to beef, Grunert (1997) (amongst other considerations) cites Shorland’s list of organoleptic factors (1970).

“consumers look for tenderness, juiciness and flavour and associate this with fresh appearance, maximum lean, absence of gristle, and a bright red colour”. Shorland (1970:2)

The study presents these in differing priorities as expressed by consumers from different cultures. Similarly (Font i Furnols et al., 2006) chart the different lamb flavour strength preferences across German, Spanish and British consumers. However, contemplation of consumption of animal protein can provoke strong reactions from consumers, some of whom regularly eat meat.

The prevalence of a food-science stance taken by literature on consumer decisions of meat purchase, does not adequately represent those consumers who have an aversion to thinking about or interacting with meat, or associating their meat consumption with the killing of an animal, whilst remaining consistent consumers of meat. Kubberod et al., (2006) considered ‘the effect of animality on disgust response at the prospect of meat preparation’ considering responses from adolescents and adults in Norway. Kubberod et al., (ibid) outlined the three facets of animality, namely the ‘meat typicality’ which is largely represented by red meat, and the presence of blood. The second being ‘animal
nature typicality’ which refers to the degree to which presentation of the meat is in a form which is not representative of the animal – such as burgers, or which is representative of the animal – tongue. The third facet is that of ‘personification’ which measures the emotional distance between human and animal, the closer the animal i.e. the more pet-like, the more disgusting they are perceived as food items. Of these three factors, the only element which did not find representation in all samples examined by Kubbarod et al., was personification, which only gave true results for the female segment. The literature falls short of evaluating the implications of this type of reaction in relation to research or communications concerning meat products. The prevalence of this phenomenon is un-measured; it clearly represents an obstacle to mental processing of thoughts relating to meat for the affected consumer, whilst at the same time providing an obstacle for primary data collection in the research process. The following section considers how lamb may be conceptualised as a product.

3.4.4 Lamb, from anonymous commodity to regional character

In the past British lamb was marketed as a generic commodity with generic advertising undertaken by the Meat and Livestock Commission (MLC), (E.g. ‘Be creative, Slam in the Lamb’ campaign funded by the slaughterhouse levy, 1986). This type of advertising convinced consumers of the simplicity of cooking lamb and sought to increase the total sales of lamb. As a commodity product, HL is somewhat disadvantaged against other lamb breeds, producing a relatively small carcass, with a slow growth rate, and usually producing only one lamb per year (two lambs per year being the norm). In the branded meat market, these factors place limitations on the achievement of ‘authentic’ yet high-volume production. However, the development of HL as a regional food requires communication of regional-specific values, the development of a brand can go some way to achieving this. The brand communicates values associated with the product, to responsive customers, who find enrichment in their lives as a result (Lannon, 1986).

Research undertaken by Fearne & Kuznesof (1994) evaluated the development of Northumbrian Lamb, and cited the following advantages of branding:

- “providing an identity by helping establish the desired image,
- helping the consumer to recognise produce quality,
- creating customer attraction,
- helping to establish acceptance preference or loyalty amongst consumers,
- encouraging repeat purchases which in turn assures the product a degree of protection,
- facilitating the expansion of future product lines,
- allowing price differentiation.”

The Welsh Lamb and Beef Industry Working Group (1999) identified the following strategic goals for lamb and beef:

- “to differentiate Welsh lamb and beef products in the market so that they compete more on quality and less on price;
- to strengthen the added-value supply chain; and
- to develop an integrated approach to improving the quality and cost-efficiency of primary on-farm production” (cited in Morley et al., 2000:277)

The Welsh situation as depicted by Morley et al., (2000) highlights the need for planning and coordination of the actions of many agencies. This role was undertaken by the Food Director of the Welsh Development Agency, which itself operates within policy directives of the National Assembly for Wales. Notably the part of the new federation structure of the MLC, responsible for English Beef and Lamb Executive (EBLEX), does not take a role in regional branding of meat in England. Instead the process develops in a fragmented manner involving initiatives around specific producer groups.

3.4.5 Lamb as a food product
Traditionally products have been interpreted in the marketing literature as ‘bundles of attributes’, the attributes of a product being those features which are capable of producing benefits for the consumer. Over time, market orientated companies will monitor the changes in benefits required by consumers, and adjust their products accordingly (Kotler, 1988:6). This response is clearly limited where the product is derived from a living animal. This focus on attributes has resulted in literature which broadly aims to assist in the ‘attribute management’ approach to marketing, by scrutinising types of attribute, and how consumers interact with these. In line with this approach it will be commercially useful to discover the value-influencing attributes, of the case products.
Darby and Karni (1973) and Andersen (1994) from the field of information economics, sought various ways of categorising attributes, which are important to customers at different stages of the purchase process such as ‘search’, ‘experience’ and ‘credence’ categories, where ‘search’ attributes (as given above) are those which a consumer might look for in a product and can be identified prior to purchase, ‘experience’ attributes are those such as taste which can be experienced only on consuming the product, and ‘credence’ attributes are those which represent beliefs which the consumer holds in relation to the product.

Literature which deconstructs ‘experience’ for lamb consumption conventionally emerges as the output of of food science studies, much of it taking a partial pan-European perspective (Font i Furnols et al. 2006, & 2008;). The focus here is very strictly the lamb taste, with testing undertaken in laboratory-like conditions.

Becker (2000) discusses the flexibility with which the ‘credence’ term has been used in the literature, citing Darby and Karni (1973) using the term where there are

“information asymmetries between seller and buyer are such
that sellers are also experts who determine customers’ needs”

Examples cited include medical and auto-repair services, which reject conventional demand theory, as the consumer is unaware of the detail of the problem/need, and its corresponding repair/cure/service upon which to place a demand. Becker (ibid) later rejects this aspect of credence theory as unimportant for considerations of meat quality. However, given the limited cooking abilities increasingly prevalent, it may be that this scenario is equally applicable to meat purchase, using the skills of the butcher to define the requirements of the selected meal (Kirwan, 2006; Leith, 2004).

Anderson and Philipsen (1998) took a stance on the credence attribute which resulted in four separate sub-divisions. The first division of ‘bundled credence attributes’ being described in the same way as outlined by Darby and Kani (above). The second they termed ‘stochastic credence characteristics’ which relates to consumer experience of a brand and the confidence which a consumer holds in that brand of product being reliable (this is an extension of the work undertaken by Smallwood and Conlisk, 1979). The third division is the ‘standardised credence characteristics’ which sum up industry requirements for sale, such as disclosure of origin, use by date etc. The fourth category
includes “hidden credence characteristics” these are not discernible in the finished product, but do characterise the process of production. These could refer to husbandry standards, adherence to certain principles – organic or slow food.

The credence characteristic is clearly tied to consumer knowledge. For example, for a consumer to select ‘X local farm lamb’ over ‘English Lamb’, requires trust in the supply chain, without having full information on the processes within it (consumers are often unaware of the process of the abattoir system, or the existence of supermarkets’ proprietary cutting plants, or the prerequisites for meat to be labelled ‘English’). There is no evidence other than the label to confirm that the meat is truly from ‘X local farm’ if it is sold in a supermarket such as Asda/Booths or at a butcher’s shop. (However the situation is more transparent if sales are made directly by the producer, via farm shop/internet or farmers’ market). In this sense credence attributes inform the search process/provisioning strategy. Some of the supply chain aspects relate to processes governed by trading standards regulations, and therefore periodical inspections. However, some relate to issues of trust which buyers make, which are concerned with authenticity. This type of trust may occur with different levels of awareness, as consumers may possess only sketchy knowledge of production systems. For example consumers may assume a particular farm or regional fell meat, has endured most of its life on the farm or fell, and was not recently bought from a lowland producer at auction and placed on this particular farm or fell for merely a few weeks before being sold as meat from this particular place. Here we might consider Andersen and Philipsen’s (1998) latent credence characteristics, i.e. those which do not currently influence buyer behaviour, but which may in the future (as opposed to manifest credence attributes which currently influence the buyer behaviour of some consumers). These considerations emphasise the complexity of credence characteristics relating to regional foods and raise questions concerning trust and current levels of consumer knowledge.

Having considered various insights to the attributes pertinent to the consumption experience, from the perspective of the physical product/related cues, and from the product/production process, the conceptual development continues by evaluating the relationship between different attribute categories. The following research illuminated a relationship between search and experience attributes.
Bredahl et al (1998) found that consumers demanded taste, tenderness and juiciness, in short ‘experience’ attributes, but the same consumers used ‘search’ attributes such as colour of the meat and presence of marbling to predict the presence of these ‘experience’ attributes. Northern (2000) in his study considering communications of meat quality, then replaces the term ‘search attribute’ with ‘cue’.

Another relationship between attribute categories comes from consideration of Craswell et al’s (1998) ‘process’ attributes, which bear close relationship to themes which consumers would include in ‘credence attributes’ (animal welfare, use of growth enhancers, organic production, amongst others). Andersen (1994) established that ‘credence’ attributes could not be predicted by ‘intrinsic’ attributes, and could only be communicated by ‘extrinsic’ attributes. Consumer behaviour and understanding relative to search, experience and credence attributes of regional lamb remain largely undisclosed.

Marketing convention would lead us to assume people buy regionally branded meat because they appreciate certain characteristics about the meat, and because there is a fit between need or want and the product on offer. The attributes (discussed above) can be cross-tabulated with intrinsic and extrinsic cues for meat as shown in table 3.2.

### Table 3.3 Cross Tabulation of Attributes and Cues, for Meat Purchase

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>Intrinsic cues</th>
<th>Extrinsic cues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Search quality</td>
<td>Colour, leanness, marbling</td>
<td>Brand/label, place, price, origin.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(quality in the shop)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience quality</td>
<td>Colour, leanness, texture,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(eating quality)</td>
<td>gristle, tenderness, smell,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>flavour, juiciness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence quality</td>
<td>Freshness</td>
<td>Origin, producer, organic,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e.g. food safety concerns)</td>
<td></td>
<td>feed, hormones, organic,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>fat/cholesterol, antibiotics,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>salmonella</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Whilst the search qualities are those which can be detected by the senses in the purchase situation, or read on accompanying packaging/similar, the experience quality is only perceived on consumption. The data above relates to ‘meat’ but how do aspects of regionality manifest themselves along these dimensions?

### 3.4.6 Literature specific to the consumption of lamb

The literature relating to lamb consumption is not extensive, relative to that on ‘meat’. It reflects the ‘aggregate commodity’ perspective of red meats which has been prevalent from many parts of the industry and in the literature (Burton et al. 1993; Becker, 2000; Grunert, 1997; Jones et al., 2003; McCarthy et al 2003). An early study ‘measuring attitudes to lamb’ identified clusters of consumers most likely to be receptive to differing promotional strategies (Baron et al., 1971). Consumer perceptions logged in this paper come from a food era when supermarkets still had novelty value and the ‘housewife’ role was more prevalent. Fearne and Kuznesof (1994) (briefly) considered consumer attitudes towards Nothumbrian lamb. There is a gap in the literature in analysis of current consumer perceptions of lamb and of regional lamb.

Jones, Lewis and Warkup (2003) exposed much of the production and agricultural, auction-related classificatory vocabulary, relevant to lamb production. They reflect systems which require lamb as a single product, citing that 73% of lambs slaughtered in the UK are sired by rams from a relatively small number of sheep breeds (MLC, 1998 cited in Jones et al., 2003:365) Themes include how the ideal carcass weights, fatness and conformation, inform genetic improvement programmes, which aim to satisfy future market needs. The output here reflects the indirect wishes of a majority of consumers, as expressed through a survey of retailers and abattoirs. The ethos of the part of the industry reflected in this paper is to illustrate optimum strategies for efficient high-volume production. The scenario is striving for efficiency in mass-production of the relatively homogenous commodity of lamb much in the same way as we might for mass production of industrial dining chairs. The relevance of the paper to this thesis is its description of the antithesis of the regional lamb production scenario, and the insight it offers into structural barriers facing the ‘non-conforming’ lamb product, not least the aggregate, indirect and hence very standard consideration of consumer preferences. This high volume and low price thinking is supported by the conventional Maslow-
inspired perspective, that eating is primarily about satisfying a physiological need, and only in times of surplus food and income does it involve satisfaction of higher level needs (Foxall et al., 1998).

The agricultural and food-science domains include considerable research into ovine feeds (Masters et al., 2006) and reproductive efficiencies for lamb, and price, eating quality and fatty acid composition (Angood et al., 2007). Rarely these include a consumer perspective such as the Australian study which focussed on the search variable of colour (of lamb), and consumer acceptability with the intention of defining acceptability thresholds (Khliji et al., 2010). The brevity of this section, confirms the gap in the literature for more detailed studies on consumer perception and attitudes towards purchase and consumption of specific and regional meats. A regional food selection can be ‘value-heavy’ / high involvement option for consumers who are financially able to be concerned with more than satiety (Drichoutis et al., 2007). However, literature on the products of inefficient landscapes, with sub-optimal returns, claimed better flavour and seasonal-variations, such as regional lamb, is rarely available.

Focus on lamb from the food science perspective clearly gives pre-eminence to the product. A marketing thesis may rightfully focus on the consumer, and the product contribution to consumer lifestyles. The following section will consider the role which food choice plays in identity.

If products are known as entities comprising bundles of attributes, consumers strive to gain their chosen identity through selection of a particular set of values. McEachern and Schröder’s (2002) paper focuses on ethics and meat consumption. They cite Holbrook’s (1999) eight universal values:

They comprise:

- Efficiency
- Play
- Excellence
- Aesthetics
- Status
- Ethics
Consumers (unconsciously) select some/all of these in varying degrees to reflect their own value system, which fits their desired role-identity (Petkus, 1992). The rewards to the individual of operating within this system (taking decisions which are congruent with held values) are ‘a sense of integrity and virtue’ whilst incongruent decisions result in psychological discomfort. For example values relating to place, local economy could be linked to efficiency from a sustainability perspective, to excellence from a quality perspective, to aesthetics from a ‘eat the view’ perspective, to spirituality via a ‘romantic’ landscape connection etc. It is this value system which guides consumer processing of product attributes and subsequent purchase decisions considered further in the next section.

3.5 Summary

Studies on the consumptionscapes of NEFPs reveal the product’ attributes which relate to the specificity of location (geophysical associations, quality-related, identity-related, social, emotional) are the salient values for NEFPs (Holoway & Kneafsey, 2000; Youngs, 2003; Sage, 2003; Szmigin et al., 2003; Kirwan, 2005). These values present themselves as part of the mosaic of the nation brand (Anholt, 2002). However in the case of NEFPs the specificity of place finds focus on a food product, thereby bringing into play three potential streams of brand literature: product, place and agricultural.

Mainstream product-focussed brand literature offers perspectives on value creation and value management through stages of brand development. It examines consumers’ reflection in brands, as they might reflect on the landscape (Aaker, 1996; De Chernatony, 2004, 2007; Haig, 2003; Kapferer, 2007; Keller, 2003; Murphy 1987, 1990). Place branding literature reminds us of the importance of the experience of a place, reminiscent of Enteleca’s ‘Eat the view’ (Colomb and Kalandides, 2010). It throws up questions about competition between places, and the relationship between levels of competition and embeddedness of the place brand (Karavatis & Ashworth, 2008). Agricultural brand literature highlights the limitations of power and reach allied to an NEFP brand, whilst also emphasising the potential strength of their USP (D’Aveni, 1994 cited in Thode & Maskulka, 1998; Fandos and Flavian, 2006).
Although the process of branding has become the dominant form of communicating with consumers in the marketplace, there may be limits beyond which NEFP brands should not go (Schlosser, 2001; Bakan, 2004; Boyle, 2003; Klein, 2010; Kanner, 2013). There are potential pitfalls for NEFP producers adopting the brand process without modification, if they are to maintain their elevated positions in the marketplace (see Pitt et al., (2006) for discussion on symbolic capital ibid, p124). Branding is therefore a process which may offer NEFP food producers both insight and caution relative to the potential interplay of product characteristics and consumer actions in the marketplace.

The pragmatic marketing question is ‘what criteria do consumers use to judge meat as ‘embeed’?’ The lifescape and consumptionscape concepts are not evident in consumer food choice models (Khan, 1981; Shepherd, 1989; Gains, 1994; Grunert et al., 1996; Sobal et al., 2006). The models offer a multi-variate approach to understanding consumer food choice. Grunert (1997) states that multi-attribute approaches relate to consumer perception, so can conceivably cope with search, experience and credence attributes. However, they are not able to process the interrelationship between attributes. Following this line, the compound nature of finding the desired local breed of lamb, farmed locally and sold direct by the producer, all of which collectively result in an excellent meal, may have a synergistic value greater than the sum of individual attributes. This type of situation needs a hierarchical model such as means-end chain theory (Gutman, 1982, 1991). Means-end chain analysis is explained further in Chapter 5.

The two case studies in Chapter 4 examine the customs and heritage involved with two NEFPs, HL and CSML.
Chapter 4 The Cumbrian Context of HL and CSML

4.1 Introduction to Case Studies

Previous context chapters have already outlined the importance of regional foods in respect of traditional socio-economic opportunities in rural regions and in terms of cultural and community investment or revival. In order to provide a focus for this thesis two commodity products have been chosen as vehicles against which branding theory may be applied, in order to highlight where these processes may require modification for the nature of agricultural products, namely lamb meat.

As regionally embedded foods, the justification for the selection of the two cases are: that HL is a potential breed-focussed brand, with strong links to a particularly well known landscape, rich heritage and tradition on the Lakeland fells. Whilst CSML is not breed-specific, it’s unusual grazing characteristics and foreign gastronomic fame is not well-known in the home market, therefore whilst on the surface they may appear similar as ‘lamb’, they present vastly different branding challenges.

The case studies summarise the literature available on breed, husbandry in the production environment and heritage. The first case to consider is that of HL.

4.2 Case Study One: The HL as a Cumbrian regionally embedded food

The aim of this case study is to consider aspects of Lakeland production relative to the development of the HL brand. The first section examines the identity of the HL with Lakeland, and how this is represented by the animals’ tendencies for territorial habits, by EU legislation and by the potential of full brand development. The case will then consider potential place-related attributes, drawn from the HLs’ historical association with Lakeland. Finally, consideration is given to current claims used by producers/retailers of HL.

4.2.1 The HLs’ Identity with Lakeland, and EU Status

HL sheep have a long association (ten centuries) with The Lake District. However, recent changes in EU farming support (impact felt from 2005) have threatened the continuing practice of hill farming, bringing about the potential loss of associated husbandry skills and knowledge (Denyer, 1993). Efforts are currently being made to
develop the value of the HL both in terms of its wool products and meat. This case focuses on the marketing, and specifically the brand development, of Herdwick meat.

In consideration of the concept of identity, the role of boundaries is significant. A person identifies which variables, practices, norms of behaviour are within their boundaries of acceptance and use, and which are outside them and hence rejected. From this perspective of identity, the HL forms an interesting case as it operates within three very different boundaries.

The first boundary to consider here is the ‘heaft’, a feature of the traditional husbandry associated with this breed in Lakeland. However, it is one of a number of hefted breeds in the British Isles. As a lamb, the Herdwick learns where its grazing boundaries are on the fells from its mother, in the absence of any physical boundaries such as walls or fences on the high fells. This area is termed the heaft, and heafting is the process of hereditary ‘boundary-related’ knowledge being passed through generations of HL. The heafting process represents the animal’s own intimate knowledge of its environment and this characteristic strengthens the association between the HLs and the high grazing land of The Lake District. This habitual boundary also makes a contribution to the workload of the hill farmer, as flocks can be located within known limits, saving the costs of physical boundaries and their maintenance (Denyer, 1993).

Secondly, ‘Lakeland HL’ (as a meat product) benefits from the EU legal boundary of ‘Protected Designation of Origin’ (PDO) offering certain protection to producers in terms of the integrity of the regional product. The concise definition of the geographical area specified in the PDO documentation being the County of Cumbria (Official Journal, 2006). This establishes HL as a product possessing quality or special characteristics which are essentially a result of the area in which it is produced. The current lists of PDO registrations for fresh meat (Class 1.1), for the UK are included in Table 4.1.

Thirdly, the externally communicated boundary of the HL brand, which is, in essence, the shorthand for the identity of the product. The branding process involves communicating values relating to the product which strike a chord with consumers; hence it is a dynamic entity which will evolve over time. This element is only emerging with HL. A logo was designed specifically for the development of the box scheme ‘HL Direct’, similarly other producers have developed their individual promotional
materials. HL is now a feature in northern retailer Booth’s chiller cabinets between January and May, a space occupied by CSML from the Holker estate between July and November (Booths’ press release 02/02/06).

**Table 4.1 Lamb registered with PDO status in the UK (Fresh Meat)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the Product</th>
<th>Registration</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lakeland Herdwick Lamb</td>
<td>PDO</td>
<td>17/5/13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isle of Man Manx Loaghtan Lamb</td>
<td>PDO</td>
<td>3/4/08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shetland Lamb</td>
<td>PDO</td>
<td>23/11/96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orkney Beef</td>
<td>PDO</td>
<td>21/6/96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orkney Lamb</td>
<td>PDO</td>
<td>21/06/96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Europa website, door database.

Booths’ own stylised depiction of a HL, along with the ‘HL Direct’ logo appear on the retailer’s HL recipe card. The value of the brand is in how it is perceived by the consumer. However, there is much more to a brand than a logo. In fact it can be counter-productive to have a logo without a full brand as those using the brand need to understand and communicate its meaning. Davidson (1997) identified the branding iceberg, where it is the logo and the name which comprise the 15% visible above the waterline, whilst below it the remaining 85% consists of values, intellect and culture. The following section considers the link between consumer identity and brands, and outlines the specific brand-management considerations pertinent to the process of ‘place brand’ development.

### 4.2.2 Identity, possessions, places and the past

The ‘place’ of the HLs is romantic and wild, a reputation founded in the mid-eighteenth century, assisted by the careers of William Wordsworth, Samuel Taylor Coleridge and Robert Southey, a group who established the tradition of aesthetic creativity in the Lakes and became known as the Lake Poets. Later Norman Nicholson, one of the modern poets, born in Millom in 1914, who was heavily influenced by Wordsworth’s themes, in the excerpt below makes reference to HL in the landscape:
“Beneath the Herdwick fleece of mist,  
You can feel the heave of the hill.”


The longevity of the HLs’ association with Lakeland, and the considerable emotional impact of this place with residents and visitors, offers both rich ingredients for development of the brand and scope for broad market recognition of it.

4.2.3 Lakeland as a place-brand ingredient for HL – recent connections

The epidemic of foot and mouth in 2001, and subsequent culls of livestock brought intense media coverage of the epidemic brought much of the rather specialist information relating to the HL into the wider public domain. The HL’s heafting ability, and its role in Lakeland ecology was discussed in national news forums (Cumbria Foot and Mouth Enquiry, 2002). In the field of communications, the foot and mouth crisis of 2001 placed HL ‘centre stage’ along with other affected stock, in the regional media at least. Post-foot and mouth, the HL are more widely known, and valued by both locals and visitors to Cumbria. This new level of awareness provided a stronger starting point from which to develop the brand.

The current Cumbrian regional food communications situation is crowded with traditional and novel food products using the ‘place’ of origin/production as an attribute. For example: Lyth Valley Damson Gin, Wabberthwaite Sausage, Hawkshead Pickles, Grasmere Gingerbread, and Kendal Mint Cake. Messages offered by existing brands represent background noise to the communications offered by a new brand. Each one extols its own links to the place, and by promoting itself in that way, influences the customer’s perception of that place. It is then a potentially problematic communications landscape into which a HL brand enters.

4.2.4 Herdwick’s PDO registration

Formal application was published (June 2012) for ‘Protected Designation of Origin’ (PDO) status for HL (originally proposed as specifically the male ‘wether’ lambs, and the mutton from geld ewes) applying to all HL output from Cumbria. This process involves the application being prepared and sent to Defra who will hold consultations on the application, once it is finalised by Defra the application is sent to the European Commission for consideration, there it is published in the European Journal for
comment, and if there are no significant objections the PDO is granted. This is a process of two to three years in total (Pers.com V.W.).

PDO status carries with it the requirement that the HL is from “lamb and sheep of pure-bred flocks of Herdwick ewes and rams that have been born, raised and slaughtered in country of Cumbria”. (Official Journal C162.08.06.12). The registration also documents that HL can be finished for slaughter with hay, grass or silage and/or supplementary feed, if the supplementary feed is locally sourced (ibid). The justification being that certain qualities or characteristics of the product are essentially specific to that area. The area was defined as Cumbria (allowing for processing and packaging) despite the concentration of the HLs on the fells surrounding the Duddon Valley, the Coniston and Butermere Fells, through Borrowdale and Wasdale up to the highest peaks in England the Scafell.

It is now relevant to discuss the process of developing the brand through identification of product attributes which may be of value to customers.

4.2.5 Heritage, husbandry and headlines relating to HL

It is possible to consider here factors relating to the cultural history, and husbandry practices associated with the HL to elicit potential product attributes. Looking at the history of the breed, the first HL sheep are thought to have arrived with Norse settlers in the 10th Century. Dickson in his Cumberland Glossary writes:

“The sheep came from a Norwegian Vessel and were taken possession of by the Lord of the Manor and on their increase being found hardy and suitable for the Mountains were let out in flocks with the Farms.” (Cited in article dated 1915, BD TB 83/6/1 Barrow Records Office)

The old Norse term ‘Herd-vic’ can be traced to the 12th century; it means sheep farm. By the 18th century it was attached to the breed rather than the farm (Denyer, 1993). The population of HLs in the early 20th century was estimated at half a million, whilst currently approximately 50,000 are kept commercially on around 120 farms in Cumbria. (Official Journal C162.08.06.12).

Production trends in the broad commodity market for lamb, have changed to meet growing demand for (unnatural) spring lamb over recent decades (Mintel, 2004). Prior
to this, farms held flocks of male sheep up to five years of age, for the mutton market. These wethers (castrated males) were kept to produce annual income from wool, to maintain the outer boundaries of the heft (as this was their domain) and to provide a substantial carcass for sale. Successive generations of female sheep maintain the extra ‘hefting’ responsibility, farmers reinforce this knowledge base by maintaining ‘landlord flocks’ comprising a selection of female breeding sheep which are collectively hefted to cover all the boundaries of the farm’s grazing land. This flock then forms the basis of the sheep farmers breeding stock.

The Lakeland landscape directly influences the management of the HL flocks. The geography of the lakes offers limited valley-bottom land called ‘in-by’. The value of this land is in its ability to produce fodder crops, for use during winter, namely hay or silage. It is for this reason that the HL are kept on the fells for as long as possible. The land on the high fells is often unenclosed common land, the sheep inherit knowledge of the boundaries of their grazing from their mothers. When lambs return from winter lowland grazing they are able to find their mothers on the land they were weaned on. Table 2 outlines the movements of the HL throughout the year. (Denyer: 1993).

Regional farming practices which evolved in relation to flock management are mostly eroded by more effective communications and transport links. ‘Shepherds meets’ were events where shepherds would come together and return any sheep that had strayed onto their grazing land to their owners. The annual meets, attended by up to fifty farmers were social occasions, with singing, sports, eating and drinking, these have now been replaced by meetings at public houses (Denyer, 1993). Table 4.2 summarises the seasonal changes for the stock.

More recently mention of HL was noted by its absence in the biographical-film, ‘Miss Potter’. Miss Heeliss (Beatrix Potter’s married name) spent part of her fortune on Lakeland farms, and developed an interest in the HL (Denyer, 1993). On her death in 1943, she left 14 farms, sheep and 4000 acres of land to the National Trust with the instruction that pure Herdwicks be kept on the farms (lakedistrict.gov.uk).

There are other notable external reference points for HL. HL mutton is known as the mutton eaten at the Coronation Dinner in 1953 (Lakeland Herdwick PDO Application, n.d.). The publicity associated with this formal appearance was lost in a time when lamb was a commodity. However, this fact represents another valuable heritage
element and appears on the HL Sheep Breeders’ Association website. Another Royal is promoting interest in mutton, HRH Prince Charles he and the The National Sheep Association stress the eating quality of the older animal (National Sheep Association, 2006). The above information would seem to offer rich pickings for brand development.

Table 4.2 The Herdwick Year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Late November</td>
<td>At three years of age Ewes put to the rams on the in-bye for conception</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Around Christmas</td>
<td>Ewes returned to the fell until April (without supplementary feed)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April-May</td>
<td>Ewes to the in-bye for lambing. The majority with single lambs return to the fell in May. The minority of Ewes with twin lambs kept on the in-bye until they are clipped.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July-August</td>
<td>All sheep are clipped (sheared), starting with the geld sheep (those without lambs).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September</td>
<td>Lambs weaned. Ewes (those able to breed again generally &lt;6yrs old) return to the fell. Older ewes may be kept on low ground to produce cross bred lambs, or sold as ‘draft ewes’ to others for the same purpose. Or kept geld and finished as mutton or speciality products e.g. HL air-dried mutton.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October</td>
<td>Castrated male lambs (weathers) are sold as ‘stores’ to lowland farmers to be fattened to slaughter weight, or fattened on the home farm.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November</td>
<td>Female lambs (gimmers) winter on lowland Cumbrian farms, at the end of March they return to the home farm and find the ‘heaft’ where they sucked their mothers as lambs. In the future they will teach their lambs where on the fell they should graze.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Geoff Brown, Herdwick Sheep Breeders’ Association cited in Southgate and Southgate, 2003:15 adapted)
4.2.5 **Current HL Branding Initiatives**

Post-foot and mouth, The National Trust appointed a temporary ‘HL Officer’, to assist in business development on certain HL-producing farms in Cumbria. This might build the expectation of a consistent message from those farms. However along with different visual logos of the HL itself, different mixes of claims about the product can be found. Current producer and retailer’s communications are summarised in Appendix A. The HL brand is currently fragmented, with different logos and claims available to the consumer according to the point of purchase. Surprisingly many of the logos include elegant horns, which are a feature with rams only, so relatively rarely seen. The impetus to develop brands has come from producers, or producer groups, whilst the branding process prioritises the individual contribution of the husbandry attribute of the product, in favour of the shared heritage of the place, culture and history as potentially perceived by the consumer.

Surely the purpose of marketing regional food shares with other products the desired outcome of regular sales, with rewarding margins. However, the breed and environmental conditions typical of the HL mean it can’t afford to attain mass-market appeal, if it is to remain authentic. There is a balance to be found then between message, market and management of the authentic product which may be facilitated by control features of the EU registration.

4.2.6 **Discussion and questions relating to HL as a potential brand**

The claims made currently by HL producers overlap, rather than repeat (Appendix A). Some farmers clearly prize the influence their husbandry (and butchery) can have on the quality of the meat they produce. Whilst this attribute is not breed-specific, it may reveal a desire for an individual identity (or usp), amongst HL producers. Perhaps this is the most important feature for HL consumers too, but there is no research data to support this.

Reflecting on the marketing process, the situation outlined above raises many questions: Given the significance of place/production method to the authenticity of HL, has the marketing of this regional product allowed the production orientation to dominate the marketing process? Do different husbandry techniques offer scope for product diversification, a ‘High Fell HL’ and an ‘In-by HL’? Do distinct market segments exist for these? It is possible to consider various routes for HL output from farms, in
the form of restaurants, retail, local customers, visitors, more distant markets, each of these may require different communications considerations.

Given that the producers are acutely aware of the production volume limitations of the breed in its native upland environment, and the different fat/meat condition resulting from extended lowland grazing. Is it a communications case of ‘Vorsprung durch technik’ (progress though technology) meets lamb chop? In that the (presumed) superiority of the traditional husbandry, involving stock on the high fells, requires communicating to consumers? Time on the fells is not a characteristic stipulated in the PDO registration. Do consumers first need to be educated on hill farming practices before they can appreciate the product? Or should the taste of the end product drive consumer purchasing actions? Or perhaps other HL-heritage associations are given higher priority by consumers?

4.3 Summary
Effective branding of HL is a process still in development. This chapter has shown HL has something to offer consumers as a brand, in terms of the historical, territorial and cultural aspects of HL heritage. The challenge will be to define the brand and its unique offering in a way which most effectively connects with existing and potential customers’ values.

By investing in the branding process producers will gain the opportunity to differentiate their product, encourage repeat purchase and benefit from price differentiation. Further benefits of developing brand identities for regional foods which have been ‘overlooked’ to date, include promoting the recognition of livestock, and livestock husbandry practices which are in balance with local environmental conditions, and hence contribute to safeguard regional breeds, the visual characteristics of the Lakeland fells and traditional hill-farming practices. These factors have a part to play in the brand’s mission and vision.

The heath, and PDO boundaries mentioned above, emphasise the HLs’ identity with Lakeland and its unique flavour resulting from terroir features. However, current communications from producers reflect another line of acceptance that of the craftsmanship of the producer, in both animal husbandry and butchery processes (Appendix A).
The regional food sector in Cumbria is dynamic, product promotional literature abounds with links to the place of origin and its particular qualities or traditions, yet few if any of these products comply with the requirements for PDO registration. This status offers HL an EU mark of quality, and specificity, linking the product to Cumbria. The new status of the HL could potentially increase the margins of Cumbrian hill farmers, and open new European markets to them. However, production of the breed cannot rapidly respond to increasing demand, whilst remaining authentic.

The current fragmented approach to communicating the values of the HL product to consumers, permits a unique relationship between producer and customer, as messages are not replicated amongst producers. The potential has been outlined above, for the development of a strong brand, rich with traditional, cultural and environmental value references. Participation of consumers in the branding process will inform the selection of brand values which maximise customer satisfaction. However, intense promotion of the HL brand could result in demand pressures which force short-cuts in production at the expense of authenticity.

Management of the branding process is vital to ensure that customers perceive and value the authenticity of the HL amongst many new ‘Cumbrian’ food products. If the HL brand is linked to place (in the current era), then we cannot assume that consumers’ perceptions of place will remain appropriate to the HLs’ heritage.

4.4 Case study two: salt marsh lamb as a Cumbrian regionally embedded food

The different product focus requires a different structure to this case and draws on a different set of literature. The case offers firstly an introduction to the product concept, the associated literature, followed by a definition of the product. The dynamic nature of the UK’s salt marsh resources are then outlined, and placed in context amongst other producing nations. Some impacts of grazing on the ecology of the salt marshes are examined, followed by examination of human intervention to develop salt marsh land resources. Husbandry practices involved in using the salt marsh are considered along with reference to studies outlining the physiological consequences of elevated sodium consumption on sheep. Next an outline of product characteristics is given, from a culinary perspective. Finally, given the significance of the role played by salt in this product, not least in its title, it is examined along with the heritage of culinary
connotations with which it is associated. Firstly the concept of salt marsh lamb is considered.

4.4.1 Introduction to the product concept and to the associated literature

In France salt marsh lamb has an established a culinary reputation for its taste and tenderness, notably the ‘Agneau pre-sale’ which grazes the salt marshes surrounding Mont Saint Michel in Normandy (Prince, 2011). The places of production, the salt marshes, are dynamic geographical features which extend by accretion, reduce by erosion or change their shape depending on tides and river flows. Management of flocks grazing salt marshes can demand skills akin to those of sailors, reacting to tide tables and wind forecasts, although stock held on the marshes for a continued period ‘learn’ the rhythm of the tides and lead the flock to elevated land as necessary. Salt marsh pastures, although far from uniform, are inhabited by iodine-rich flora suited to the environmental conditions, notably spartina and saltwort. It is the terrain and its flora which defines the quality of salt marsh lamb, rather than the breed of the animal. CSML grazes around the Cartmel Peninsula on Morecambe bay, itself a site of special scientific interest SSSI, and along the northern Cumbrian coast to the Solway Firth. The Solway Firth has been used for grazing since the settlements of the Cistercian monks in 1150AD (Cumbria County Council, ND). Yet in the UK the attributes of the product have rarely been appreciated.

Unsurprisingly the volume of academic literature relevant to research concerning salt marsh lamb as a consumer product, is limited. This case study aims to collate information available from: ecological sources (UK Biodiversity Group, 1999; Lefeuvre et al., 2000; Bos et al., 2005; Wolters, et al., 2005) concerning the grazing environment. Farm husbandry sources, concerning production aspects (producer web sites and producer press). Interdisciplinary studies which link biodiversity to rural development opportunities (Buller et al., 2006) or identify food as a dynamic aspect of social geography (Morris & Kirwan, 2010). Literature concerning different regions where salt marsh lamb is valued (Kietal et al., 1996; Laffaille et al., 2000; Cross, 2006). Meat-marketing studies (Stanford et al., 1999) which examine product-specific marketing features, from the recent regional case of Wales, where salt marsh lamb has been promoted as a regionally branded product, and from culinary sources (Friedrich, 1999) which stress the specific attributes of this product. The outcome of this review will
identify potential and existing branding attributes for salt marsh lamb against which current Cumbrian products may be measured.

### 4.4.2 Salt marsh lamb defined and UK resources

Led by the French experience with the product, salt marsh lamb is that which has grazed (production norm is for a minimum of 60 days) on salty, iodine-rich flora of coastal pasturelands (Friedrich, 1999). This grazing land is regularly covered by the sea, the special range of fauna able to thrive in these saline conditions are thought to contribute to the “fine muscle texture, and exceptional flavour” of the lamb (rungisinternational.com).

The eating qualities of salt marsh lamb are relatively common to the output of all producers, days on the marsh may emerge as a differentiating feature, as it seems to be emerging in PDO applications (see PDO application for ‘Pres-sales de la Baie de Somme’ 28/8/2012, which specifies 75 days in 12 months (which also forces further reflection on the HL case).

French researchers (INRA) have been working on authenticity tests for meat and milk products according to diet. Their trials with salt marsh lamb have found the chemical make-up and (easily identified) pigments in fat tissues as successful determinants of production standards (Long, 2006). Increased intake of sodium chloride via drink/feed has been found to result in reduced fat and increased protein in the sheep carcass. (Walker et al., 1971 and Kraidees et al., 1998, cited in Masters et al., 2006:11).

Researchers at the Universities of Bristol, Exeter and Gloucestershire together with the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research are currently examining links between quality food production, rural income opportunities and biodiversity protection. This project brings together plant science, meat science and social science. The biodiversity of salt marsh farms, heather moor farms and moorland farms are being examined. (Buller et al., 2006).

The Environmental Agency’s Biodiversity Action Plan BAP (1999) estimated the UK’s salt marsh area at 45,500 hectares, with most of this (32,500 hectares) in England. It also estimates that at mean high water line, 24% of the English coastline consists of salt marsh vegetation. Rising sea level and erosion contribute to annual (UK) loss of 100 hectares per year. Whilst in the north-west, both the presence of coarse sediments and
isostatic uplift contribute to negate the rise in sea level. Approximately 80% of UK salt marsh is classified as SSSI (BAP, 1999). Over the longer term and for the UK as a whole, a rise in sea level could significantly reduce the amount of salt marsh available as pasture, thereby limiting the supply of salt marsh lamb.

North-west European salt marshes have been classified into three regions, reflecting climate, distribution of salt marsh plants and sea currents: Firstly the central North-Atlantic extending from Scotland and South Scandinavia to Northern France. Secondly, the Southern North-Atlantic, covering south and south-east England, Brittany, south-west France, and north-west Spain. Thirdly, the German Baltic shore is distinct because of its tidal range, geomorphology and salinity of the submerging water. (Dijkema, 1990, cited in Wolters et al., 2005:252) This information would seem significant in that it places Cumbrian salt marsh in a different category to that of Brittany’s ‘agneau presale’. The extent of this significance depends on the variation in fauna between the two zones, and the resulting differences in organoleptic results from lamb produced there. Wolters et al’s study (2005) focussed on de-embankments of salt marshes and hence did not include salt marshes in the north west of England which remain largely without embankment. Interestingly the embanked polders suffer from sediment deficit and can subside to below mean sea level, whilst the open salt marsh benefits from regular deposits of sediment from the tide, and provides a natural buffer for dissipating wave energy. (Moller et al., 1996, cited in Wolters et al., 2005:250).

Salt marshes do not provide uniform grazing for sheep or other stock. Fauna differs in line with particle size in the sediment, typically more sandy on the west, and fine sediments on the east coast of Britain. Some fauna exist within temperature limits which allow their presence in the southern salt marshes, but prohibits them from the northern salt marshes. On a micro-scale, individual marshes will be divided into zones populated by specific fauna, tolerant of that particular zone’s frequency of inundation by the tide. Salt marsh vegetation is made up of halophytic, or salt tolerant species which have adapted to a given frequency of immersion by the tides. Species at the lowest level, such as glassworts Salicornia spp may be immersed by 600 tides per year (BAP, 1999). Given the association between flavour of the lamb and its forage it seems reasonable to propose that subtle taste differences may exist amongst salt marsh lamb depending on specific regional conditions and associated fauna (Prince, 2011).
4.4.4 Salt marsh ecology and grazing

Various studies discuss the impact of sheep grazing, on other species sharing the salt marsh (Bos et al., 2005; Laffaille et al., 2000). Laffaille (2000) highlighted the detrimental effect on juvenile sea bass, resulting from sheep grazing of the Mont Saint-Michel Bay. Whilst the sea bass feed on the crustacean Orchestia gammarellus found in the tall Atriplex portulacoides plant communities of non grazed zones, the activity of grazing encourages replacement of A. portulacoides with Puccinellia maritima a much shorter vegetation which provides a habitat for a different range of species, which are not easily caught by sea bass.

Bos et al (2005) studied salt marsh ecology in the Netherlands, Denmark and Germany. They considered the effects of cattle and sheep grazing on the salt marsh, on the feeding habits of spring staging geese, preparing for migration to Arctic breeding areas (Barnacle Geese Branta leucopsis and Brent Geese Branta bernicla bernicla). Their review shows that cattle grazing had ceased in 42% of the mainland marshes in Schleswig-Holstien, Germany. This was in response to policies favouring the natural development of this area (Stock & Kiehl, 2000 cited in Bos et al., 2005, p2). Bos et al (2005) estimated 40% of the salt marsh area of the Netherlands is ungrazed, and 10% of that of Denmark. (Kempf et al., cited in Kiehl et al., 1996 ; 1987; de Jong et al., 1999, cited in Bos et al., 2005, p2). Bos et al’s (2005) findings show that the absence of livestock grazing on salt marshes leads to declining suitability of the zone as a feeding habitat for geese. It is the cattle and sheep which create an environment in which plant species preferred by geese, can thrive. Similarly, Norris et al (1998) considered the effects of grazing management on the redshank Tringa totanus, which nests on the salt marshes in Great Britain.

The BAP (1999) gives a balanced view on the policy of grazing on the salt marsh, commenting that the shorter vegetation, and reduced diversity of invertebrates and plants is attractive to waders and wintering and passage wildfowl, whilst the tussocky longer grasses which emerge in the absence of grazing, favours breeding waders.

These findings suggest that sheep grazing on the salt marsh must be managed with great sensitivity, to avoid or minimize negative impacts on other inhabitant/user species. Whilst some consumers may value salt marsh lamb only as a culinary component resulting from a specialized environment, others (possibly local to the production site)
may value salt marsh lamb with understanding of, and value placed on its positive role in a defined ecosystem.

**4.4.5 Human intervention and the salt marsh as a land resource**

Human habitation of the salt marsh dates from prehistory (Phillips, 1970; Coles and Orme, 1982, cited in Cook and Moorby, 1993:56). During Roman times, North Kent Marshes, Somerset Levels, Essex Marshes and Lincolnshire Fens all experienced activities of transhumance grazing during summer periods (Cook and Moorby, 1993). Grazing on the salt marshes was considered common land (Williams, 1990). Between the twelfth and fourteenth centuries, monastic institutions were at the forefront in reclamation of wetlands including: Christ Church Abbey (Canterbury) active in Romney Marsh (Gardiner, 1988, cited in Cook and Moorby, 1993, p57), Muchelney and Glastonbury Abbeys in the Somerset Levels, and other monastic houses in Fenland (Goodwin, 1978; WWA, 1979 cited in Cook and Moorby, 1993:57). The Cistercian monks who founded Furness Abbey, made full use of land resources for grazing and iron ore smelting (Natural England, ND). Some of the grazing land of Wallend Marsh (East Sussex) and Romney Marsh was brought into arable use at this time.

Cook and Moorby (1993:58) cite five reasons for draining marshes:

1. The improvement of navigation associated with the straightening and embanking of waterways.
2. The improvement of coastal protection or reduction of flood risk in river valleys.
3. Improvement of access to marshland resulting from the control of flooding.
4. The control of water table height at strategic times of year to suit particular land uses.
5. The creation of ditches which act as ‘wet fences’ to constrain livestock or supply irrigation water.

Cook and Moorby (1993:59) also propose a classification scheme for wetlands ranging from the primary stage of saline/freshwater wetlands, which subject to increasing hydrological management, results in a sequence of wetland forms, to the tertiary state of polderlands. Polderlands are subject to intensive agricultural use for grass or arable crops, they are no longer subject to tidal impact, and receive only rainfall (Wagret, 1968, cited in Cook and Moorby 1993:59). The Morcambe Bay salt marsh complies
with the primary stage, which is “unenclosed tidal mudflats, creeks, saltmarsh.” (ibid p60).

The dynamic nature of the salt marsh ‘place’ offers an interesting case for human reflection/association. Casey’s work ‘The Edge(s) of Landscape: A Study in Liminology’ offers insightful frameworks which seem easily transferable to the cases (in Malpas ed. 2011). He describes an internal boundary as elements such as pathways in forests, these lack the exactness of borders as the width may vary, but they bring parts of the landscape together, and give direction to people who use them (ibid, p100). This aspect seems transferable to the case, in particular the heft boundary. Whilst the external boundary of the landscape, which meets diverse sea currents which have within them their own boundaries as do the land. He goes on to describe the energies which exhibit themselves at the edge of the land, their offer of other vistas, other worlds containing other places. Casey (ibid) also writes of the energies which accumulate at the edge, exhibited by coastline and sea, which energize each other to produce dynamic biophysical uses (ibid, p104).

4.4.6 Salt marsh lamb husbandry
Friedrich (1999) refers to the French ‘pre-sale’ appellation being applicable to lamb which has spent a minimum of 60 days grazing the salt marshes. This begs the question why such a limited period of time? Given tidal and other variations is unrealistic to expect conformity to any particular pattern of activity by all farmers using salt marsh pasture. Explanations for the time a herd is on the marsh are likely to be situation specific. Following are some considerations which may influence the duration of salt pasture grazing:

Masters et al (2006) have considered the consequences of high mineral intakes by sheep in saline regions of Australia. They identified a study by Mayer and Wier (1954) which reported increased weight loss in lactating ewes consuming 13.5% sodium chloride in the diet when compared to ewes consuming 9.1% or less. Whilst they saw no detrimental effects with growing lambs consuming 12.8% sodium chloride. Other reports signal that wethers are more tolerant of salt in drinking water than reproducing ewes, which can exhibit consequences of reduced lambing or increased lamb mortality. (Peirce, 1968a, Peirce, 1968b and Potter and McIntosh, 1974, cited in Masters et al.,
This highlights the effect of lifestage of the animal on the extent of time it may graze the salt marsh.

The presence of fresh water on the salt marsh is significant, in that the combination of salt in both water and feed (salt tolerant pastures) can result in low feed intake and growth. If however, fresh drinking water is available then the animal can feed on greater amounts of salty feed, and increase the salt excreting capacity of the kidneys. This cannot occur if salt is present in both feed and water (Masters et al., 2006:9). This offers an example of resource limits affecting the length of time stock can graze the salt marsh.

Salt marshes along the Bristol channel and the Parrett estuary are managed by English Nature, during the months of May to September farmers are permitted to graze their sheep on the ‘salterns’. Here concern for the ecosystem governs management decisions affecting the length of time the stock graze the salt marsh. Grazing here includes Sparta grass, sea lavender and samphire. The salt marsh offers health advantages to the herd removing the need for worming and reducing the incidence of footrot. These examples reinforce beliefs in the antiseptic qualities of salt

“The older animals which have grazed the marshes before, remember their way to them, leading the lambs when the season comes, without needing to be herded.” (Fisher, Somerset. www.levelsbest.co.uk).

Salt marsh lamb is produced in various other locations, these are considered next.

4.4.7 Regions placing value on salt marsh lamb:

The following section considers the characteristics of salt marsh lamb production from different countries.

France

The sandy, salt marshes around Mont Saint Michel bay are developing at a rate of 20km per year, prompting a plan to destroy the existing causeway and replace it with a bridge, there are also plans for a dam on the tidal Couesnon River which flows into the bay. The water rising up the river at high tide will be flushed downstream to wash away
around 3 million cubic metres of sand mud and sediment from the base of the monument (Cross, 2006)

Table 4.3. Four Varieties of L’Agneau Pré-salé

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variety</th>
<th>Origin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Le grévin (a Suffolk cross)</td>
<td>Grazed on salt marshes around Mont Saint Michel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L’estran</td>
<td>From the Bay of Somme et d’Authie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agneau des herbus</td>
<td>From Ille et Villaine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agneau des Havres du Contentin</td>
<td>From Harves du Contentin</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: gastroville.com

Total production of the L’agneau pré-salé is estimated at 10,000 lambs per year. The Suffolk breed, the Roussine (or Rouge de la Hague) and crosses between Suffolk and Hampshire, or Ile de France breeds (in the Baie de Somme) are found in this region. The age at slaughter is 120-200 days, the carcass is hung for a minimum of 3 days, with a local preference for two weeks. Only 10 carcasses from Havres du Contentin are sold through Rungis per year, with the vast majority being sold in the region of production (rungisinternational.com).

Qualities of the product are said to result from the lamb’s diet of over 60 different herbs, thereby reducing strong lamb flavours, and replacing them with a fresh flavoured meat, which is tender and juicer in texture. Herbs cited as important in contributing to the final product are: obione, salt meadow grass, spartina, saltwort, sea milkwort, sea mugwort, coastal fescue and seaside plantain, all said to contribute to a fine muscle texture, with subtle aroma of iodine, maritime plants and a light nutty taste (rungisinternational.com).

Germany

The mudflats of the Lower Saxony Wattenmeer National Park is known for its rich habitat for crabs, shellfish and seal colonies. The Weser salt marsh lamb is a regional delicacy. (www.visit-germany.info/web/en_us/) The German Whiteheaded Mutton (Weisskopfiges Fleischschaf) is the result of cross breeding the local Wilstermarschshaf with the English Leicester, Cotswold, Hampshire and Oxfordshire. These breeds fatten on the dike grass, and are able to withstand the damp sea climate (Sheep 101).
Sweden

Styrsö is an island in the southern archipelago of Gothenburg. Here the Hellsviks sheep owners’ association are actively engaged in new product development based on the salt marsh lamb or Saltängslamm. This development in the region of Västra Götaland, recognised the need for the development of a strong brand (Leader+ Magazine, 2007).

Canada

Two sites in Canada produce salt marsh lamb: A non-profit making cooperative operating on Île Verte an island along the St Lawrence north east of, Quebec produces (Terroir Cuisine & Products website, n.d.). The second is a slightly different product ‘Salt Spring Lamb’, from Salt Spring Island, British Columbia is exported throughout North America. This lamb does not appear to feed on salt marshes, rather the grass it feeds on as pasture or hay, has been subject to sea breezes which carry salt. In addition to local pasture these lambs are fed whole barley, and alfalfa during lactation. (McColm, ND)

The UK

Some of the UK productions sites are detailed below. CSML is produced by four farmers involved in grazing their flocks on the salt marsh near Cartmel. Farmers receive £4.00 per head premium by selling through Holker Estates marketing scheme (Riley, 2004). The activities of Holker Hall, selling from farms belonging to/adjacent to its estate adds a noble aspect to the brand, whilst distribution in other parts of the coast is unbranded, and distinguished only by name in local butchers. The gastronomic currency of links to the French product seem underutilised.

Gower salt marsh lamb, Weobley Castle Farm and Sommers Lane Farm joined forces to market their lambs as Gower Salt marsh lamb, with a production rate of 1,500 lambs per year. They claim the outstanding flavour of the fat and meat is largely owing to the existence of ‘Sparta grass’ in the salt marsh. (www.wda.co.uk). The salt marsh in Powys, accepted into the Tir Gofal whole-farm agri-environment scheme, results in an annual payment for the next decade (Davies, 2004).

The Romney marsh (Kent) was traditionally heavily exploited for the production of salt marsh lamb, this offers the region a strong heritage on which to build their brand.
“In the 19th Century, the (Romney breed) sheep formed an important part of the Romney Marsh landscape and economy, soon becoming one of the most successful breeds in the world. There were as many as a quarter of a million sheep across the Marsh. To look after them, farmers and landlords employed the services of self-employed shepherds called ‘Lookers’ to tend the flocks and move them around the marshes. Today the only evidence of these people are the remains of weather shelters or lookers’ huts which can still be found dotted over the marshes. The sheep were also an important commodity as their fleece was highly prized within the woollen industry.”

(slowfood.org.uk)

The following example provides detail on the activities of one producer of salt marsh lamb from Somerset: The maturity period is longer for salt marsh lambs that for those raised on improved grassland. The Suffolk ewes are tupped in October, wintered on permanent pastures, lambs born in March, kept inside for one week, returned to permanent pasture until May when they move to the ‘salterns’ where they remain until September. Some lambs may be killed at 14/15 weeks, but most are slaughtered in October/November at around 28 weeks (England in particular website). As already stated the salt marsh lamb is not breed-specific, whilst the above example uses Suffolks, an East Sussex organic farmer uses Romney cross ewes on the Pevensey levels (Hole, 2006).

4.4.8 The culinary character of salt marsh lamb
The Fisher family farm Suffolks, they produce a ‘deep coloured meat, with little fat but good marbling and a distinctive taste and texture’. Carcasses are hung for ten days between slaughter and cutting. They have plans to develop salt marsh mutton. (www.england-in-particular.info/goods/g-case1-30.html)

4.4.9 The concept of sea salt
It is a metallic compound known as NaCl or sodium chloride. It was recognised as early as the 6th century that salt has an essential function in maintaining the equilibrium of liquids in the body. Without salt we are in more danger of dehydration than we are without water to drink. (Toussaint-Samat, 1994:457) Sea salt in its natural watery state,
is accompanied by magnesium chloride, potassium and calcium and magnesium sulphates, as well as iodine and organic micro-particles (ibid p459).

Whilst there exists tremendous potential for first-time buyers to misconceive salt marsh lamb as taking on a salty flavour, or having a high salt content (the ills of a high salt diet being in the thrust of recent Government nutritional guidelines, with communications featuring a rather memorable slug). Salt is a much more complex food additive with a rich and lengthy set of associations. Toussaint-Sammat, (1994) outlines the symbolic value of salt and rituals involving salt, relate to its origin and the uses made of it. Salt comes from the sea, which is regarded as the source of life. It protects and purifies food, it prevents food from rotting and putrefaction. In symbolism used by freemasonry, it represents the creative female principle, the mother, and the giver of life. Romans gave salt to new born babies, with the meaning of bestowing wisdom. Roman Catholic baptisms include salt in the holy water, with the purpose of destroying the traces of original sin. Sacrificial victims of the Romans and Jews were purified with salt to make them acceptable to the Gods. Apparently the Devil is known to avoid salt, and salt may be thrown in the fire to repel demons. Salt is also used in exorcism rites of many religions.

In that salt never spoils, it is used as a gesture of a true bond of fraternity. Salt is seen as a gift from God, and is sacred. To spill salt represents losing the protection of God, and can be thwarted by throwing a pinch of salt three times over your left shoulder (towards the evil spirits behind you). Leonardo da Vinci’s ‘Last Supper’ shows a spilt salt cellar under Judas’s elbow. (ibid p474-5).

Salt is more recently the feature of public information communications (using Sid the Slug character) campaign ‘Salt – watch it’ which encouraged a reduction in intake of salt, linking its consumption to heart disease (FSA). In terms of recency the salt connotation is then neagative.

4.5 Salt marsh lamb summary
Salt marsh lamb participates in an ecosystem which although has a heritage in the UK, it is not widely known. It provides an important potential to farmers active on the west coast periphery and Morcambe Bay areas of the Cumbrian perimeter. The product is not unique to the Cumbrian coast, being produced in other counties and in other countries. Inclusion of the word ‘salt’ is beneficial in terms of the heritage of
connotations associated with the valuable mineral, however this takes on a negative overtone from recent public communications concerning salt and diet. The gastronomic claims for the light flavour of this meat have heritage in France, but are relatively unknown in the UK. Development of this brand would seem to require a significant educational challenge for consumers.

4.6 Synthesis the history and development of the cases of HL and CSML

As shown in the cases both of the case study lamb breeds are emblematic of their place of production. HL has a timeless quality about it, as a breed suited to geophysical conditions of the upland fells, they seem a permanent part of the landscape. CSML follows the eb and flow from the marshland, in line with the tidal pattern. The value of this visual presence in the landscape is largely un-measured, this thesis will explore the conceptualisation of visual presence in the landscape (VPL). More pragmatic concerns which motivate study into regional lamb relate to the potential which the case products may allow farmers to operate profitably, using land which is considered marginal, using traditional and sustainable methods.

The role of the visual landscape in people’s lives was raised, with particular reference to the focus given to this topic during the Cumbrian foot and mouth outbreak in 2000, and thereafter. The role of place and time, and the permanence of place connotations was discussed. The impact of the dynamic geomorphology of the salt marshes was relevant here. Heritage was found to be integral to consumers’ interpretation of authentic regional foods as able to define a place (Tregear, 2001) yet what if heritage exists without wider knowledge of it? How might forgotten regional foods emerge?

Both types of lamb cannot be produced in vast volumes. Apart from the volume dimension which is ‘number of animals’ it is important to remember the carcass size differential between a lithe upland breed such as HL to a fat pasture-fed, lowland lamb. The salt marsh area has a limited capacity forcing a limited production possibility for whatever breed are grazed there. The limited volume dimension of the case products is thereby re-emphasised. In the UK the conventional market mechanism for lamb as a commodity, aims for maximum efficiency, and margins, which come from high volume production of a homogenous raw material. The strategic pressure is therefore to find a value which counterbalances (or more) the low volume constraints, and extract leverage
from it. Therefore the HL and CSML present an interesting challenge to conventions in meat marketing also.

As has been outlined in Chapter 3, the literature available relating to UK consumer perceptions of regional lamb breeds is scarce. The examples in this chapter show that the chosen regional lambs have gravitas in their local and heritage characteristics, which remain used on an ad-hoc basis in most existing communications (Appendix A). Whilst the history and myths surrounding the heritage of these lamb products can be found (largely outside academic literature), there is no corresponding measure of consumer perceptions of these, a situation which this thesis addresses.

If we perceive consumers as people with direction, spending energy on striving to achieve certain outcomes, then where do regional food products fit into the lives of these dynamic consuming entities? Are consumers attuned enough to rural matters in that they can evaluate the implications of different husbandry approaches on the final product? Or is the breed/Lakeland mix of attributes enough information for consumers, without detail on the microclimate of the high fells? If we are to move from consuming lamb as a commodity, to consuming specific breeds from specific environments, then how does the consumer perceive differences in breed, and influences of the environment?
Chapter 5 Theoretical Approach and Research Process

5.1 Introduction

The conceptual foundation for this thesis links food to a ‘lifescape’ context, somewhat novel in the genres of food product research, in that it is unconstrained by considerations of food as an ingested substance (Frewer, 2006) or food as an economic good (Ritson & Hutchins, 1995) or competing product (Steenkamp, 1989; Grunert et al., 1995). Instead it considers the living animal, the landscape and consumers’ identity in relation to place, as the points of reference for brand creation. Given the novelty of this stance, the primary data will aim to explore, rather than confirm or reject, presupposed relationships. Exploratory research enables marketers to increase their understanding of respondents’ attitudes, behaviours, emotions and preferences (Wilson, 2006). Gathering unique personal perspectives and preferences demands an interpretive and qualitative approach. The philosophical perspective of phenomenology enables social scientists insight into an individual’s perspectives on the world by attempting to record things from their unique viewpoint (Sullivan, 2010; Bryman, 2012). Individuals will divulge their perceptions of embedded food products and self-concepts which will enlighten the brand development process for the case products.

Data was collected using interviews making use of means-end chain theory (MEC) which considers access to consumers’ product or behaviour, knowledge and meaning structures (Gutman, 1982; Olson and Reynolds, 1983). It was used to explore the presence of cognitive structures in memory which record the respondent’s evaluations of the product in relation to themselves. This MEC process is highly suited to the brand related objectives of the thesis, as it reveals the connotations which resonate with respondents relative to the case products; these may subsequently be used in brand development.

Data was analysed by structuring the perceived values offered by a product into ‘ladders’ which generally start from attributes of the product, reaching increased levels of abstraction to terminal values at the top. Laddering is an in-depth technique used to develop an understanding of how consumers relate attributes of products into meaningful association with respect to self was developed by Hinkle in 1965 (cited in Reynolds and Gutman, 1988). The ladder is also used as a metaphor/structure on which to hang the benefits which brands offer to consumers (Keller, 2003). The chapter begins by defending the choice of a phenomenological approach over others.
5.2 The Adoption of a qualitative or quantitative research paradigm in marketing

This thesis involves research focussing on human experience, perceptions and feelings and the selection of a phenomenological approach needs to be set in the context of the many relevant research approaches practiced. As well as considering the range of approaches, it is important to acknowledge the development of the conceptualisation of marketing knowledge over time, and associated pervading ontological and epistemological stances.

Firstly the characteristics of qualitative and quantitative research approaches are summarised. Table 5.1 shows the extreme opposite points of a continuum of approaches that reflect qualitative and quantitative stances. Most market researchers will select stances which fall somewhere between these two positions.

Table 5.1 Characteristics of Quantitative and Qualitative Paradigms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualitative Paradigm</th>
<th>Quantitative Paradigm</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Qualitative methods preferred</td>
<td>Quantitative methods preferred</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Concerned with understanding human behaviour from the actor’s frame of reference.</td>
<td>2. Seeks out the facts or causes of social phenomena without advocating subjective interpretation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Phenomenological approach</td>
<td>3. Logical-positivistic approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Uncontrolled, naturalistic observational measurement.</td>
<td>4. Obtrusive, controlled measurement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Subjective; “insider’s” perspective; close to the data.</td>
<td>5. Objective, “outsider’s” perspective; distanced from the data.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Validity is critical; “real,” “rich,” and “deep” data</td>
<td>8. Reliability is critical; “hard” and replicable data.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Adapted from Reichardt and Cook (1979).
In terms of Table 5.1 content and considering the evolution of thought about marketing, the discipline emerged from economics. In the 1920s it mainly concerned itself with the collection of figures relating to sales and production volumes. The quantitative paradigm was dominant at this time (Bartels, 1974). In the 1950s marketing took on more of a management rather than a measurement role, in line with the development of the “four Ps” and “The marketing concept” (ibid:74). In the late 1950s, buyer behaviour became of interest, as consumers were seen as psychological entities with values beyond that of participant in the economy (ibid). In this sense the management perspective was accompanied by the conceptualisation of consumers not only as rational choice agents, as defined in classical microeconomic theory, but in purchases made for symbolic (Levy, 1959) and experiential reasons (Holbrook and Hirschman, 1982). In parallel to these developments there was a swing away from focus on rational choice, considerations of utility from microeconomics and classical decision theory. Two major theoretical perspectives have dominated the social science scene as delineated by Bogdan & Taylor (1975).

One [positivism] traces its origins to the great social theorists of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and especially to Auguste Comte and Emile Durkheim. The positivist seeks the facts or causes of social phenomena with little regard for the subjective states of individuals... The second theoretical perspective [idealism] stems most prominently from Max Weber. [The theorist in this tradition] is concerned with understanding human behaviour from the actor’s own frame of reference (Bogdan & Taylor, 1975:2).

The former approach maintains popularity in market research as the commonly termed multivariate technique (Hoek et al., 2004). The move towards more ‘irrational’ buyer behaviour encompassing an ‘experiential view’ of consumption (Table 5.1, Qualitative Paradigm), rather than a information processing approach (Holbrook & Hirschman, 1982).

“This experiential perspective is phenomenological in spirit and regards consumption as a primarily subjective state of consciousness with a variety of symbolic meanings, hedonic responses and aesthetic criteria.” (ibid:132).
From the above quote the actor’s own frame of reference denotes an ontology which cites experience as reality.

The struggle for acceptability of qualitative research results against a tradition of quantitative market research has endured. The academic community have been divided and defensive in the face of the growing popularity of qualitative approaches.

“They are defensive, unrealistically supposing that their livelihoods are jeopardized by the projective techniques and ethnographies that they imagine will replace their surveys, regressions and multivariate methods. At the 1998 conference of the Association for Consumer Research, such persons complained that qualitative researchers were taking over the conference” (Belk, 2006:138).

The ontological perspective undertaken in this thesis views reality as experienced by ‘people being in the landscape’ where the landscape is viewed as an extension of the consumers’ identity, and provides the context for life experience as well as including the product focus of this investigation. It is each individual’s interpretation of the value of the landscape and its products which are central here. This stance is interpretivist as opposed to positivist which might seek to identify key causal factors in relationships with the landscape or to establish levels of correlation between factors, which would more comfortably fit a multivariate approach.

5.2.1 Origins of phenomenology

Edmund Husserl’s, work Logical Investigations (Vol. 1 published in 1900, Vol. 2 in 1901) is considered seminal in the development of phenomenology, or the study of things as they appear, without consideration of causal explanations (Smith et al., 2009). Husserl was keen to reject the idea of separation between egos and worlds (or subject and object). In this sense the only knowledge humans could have would be gained through conscious experience. Following this interpretation reality is something approximate to what is thought about things in general (Bohm, 1980) or experience. For example. “Interpretive social science,” Taylor says, “cannot by-pass the agent’s self-understanding” by creating some purportedly neutral scientific language. (1985: 118).
However, various methods collect respondents’ own words. The importance of respondent phrasing and open questions is underlined by the selection of the research approach, and by the decision to use soft, as opposed to hard laddering interviews (explained in 5.3.3).

5.2.2 Rationale for adoption of the phenomenological approach amongst others

After outlining the arbitrary nature of distinctions between paradigmatic, strategic and theoretical dimensions of different research approaches, Patton (2001:132) provides an outline of the variety of perspectives used in qualitative inquiry which incorporates a ‘singular burning question’ that is seen to illustrate the distinct nature of one perspective to another (Table 5.2). Whilst these are distinct theoretical perspectives, some are closely related: Phenomenology for example has several derivatives including: heuristic research, symbolic interactionism and ethnomethodology (Patton, 2001).

Table 5.2 Comparative Table of Qualitative Methodological Approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perspective</th>
<th>Disciplinary Roots</th>
<th>Central Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethnography</td>
<td>Anthropology</td>
<td>What is the culture of this group of people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autoethnography</td>
<td>Literary arts</td>
<td>How does my own experience of this culture connect with and offer insights about this culture, situation, event, and/or way of life?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reality testing: Positivist and realist approaches</td>
<td>Philosophy, social sciences, and evaluation</td>
<td>What’s really going on in the real world? What can we establish with some degree of certainty? What are plausible explanations for verifiable patterns? What’s the truth insofar as we can get at it? How can we study a phenomenon so that our findings correspond as much as possible to the real world?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constructionism/ constructivism</td>
<td>Sociology</td>
<td>How have people in this setting constructed this reality? What are their reported perceptions, “truths,” explanations, beliefs and worldview? What are the consequences of their constructions for their behaviours and for those with whom they interact?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phenomenology</td>
<td>Philosophy</td>
<td>What is the meaning, structure, and essence of the lived experience of this phenomenon for this person or group of people?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heuristic inquiry</td>
<td>Humanistic</td>
<td>What is my experience of this phenomenon and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Discipline</td>
<td>Question</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnomethodology</td>
<td>Sociology</td>
<td>How do people make sense of their everyday activities so as to behave in socially acceptable ways?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symbolic interaction</td>
<td>Social psychology</td>
<td>What common set of symbols and understandings has emerged to give meaning to people’s interactions?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semiotics</td>
<td>Linguistics</td>
<td>How do signs (words, symbols) carry and convey meaning in particular contexts?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hermeneutics</td>
<td>Linguistics, philosophy, literary criticism, theology.</td>
<td>What are the conditions under which a human act took place or a product was produced that makes it possible to interpret its meanings?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narratology. Narrative analysis</td>
<td>Social sciences (interpretive): Literary criticism, literary nonfiction.</td>
<td>What does this narrative or story reveal about the person and world from which it came? How can this narrative be interpreted to understand and illuminate the life and culture that created it?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecological psychology</td>
<td>Ecology, psychology</td>
<td>How do individuals attempt to accomplish their goals through specific behaviours in specific environments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Systems theory</td>
<td>Interdisciplinary</td>
<td>How and why does this system as a whole function as it does?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaos theory: Nonlinear dynamics</td>
<td>Theoretical physics, natural sciences</td>
<td>What is the underlying order, if any, of disorderly phenomenon?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grounded theory</td>
<td>Social sciences, methodology</td>
<td>What theory emerges from systematic comparative analysis and is grounded in fieldwork so as to explain what has been and is observed?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orientational: Feminist inquiry, critical theory, queer theory, among others.</td>
<td>Ideologies: Political, cultural, and economic.</td>
<td>How is X perspective manifest in this phenomenon.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The content of table 5.2 gives an impression of the epistemological context in which each ideology operates, and the associated questions usefully suggest the focus of both the research outcomes and their data focus. In this thesis the initial objective is to gain a
coherent and informed description of the respondent’s experiences and feelings in relation to the landscape and product in question. There is no desire to identify patterns or to establish the truth (positivist and realist) neither does it seek to reveal how individuals construct their worlds in a social setting (constructivism). This thesis does not focus on the system of lamb production and consumption (systems theory) or seek to develop theory from observations (grounded theory). The phenomenological approach gives value to experiential claims and memories from respondents, to enhance the understanding of cognitive consumer processes related to lamb consumption. This fact clearly separates the approach from discourse analysis/narratology (where text, dance, discussion, myth or other practices which are imbued with meaning are analysed) (Larkin et al., 2006). In conjunction with the interpretive analysis of the initial descriptive data collected. Findings are analysed in their wider social, cultural and theoretical context. Such interpretation may be directed by an understanding of existing theoretical constructs which puts the approach in contrast with grounded theory (ibid).

In comparison with other research methods, such as conjoint analysis, which aim to predict consumer behaviour based on attribute listing, the MEC provides marketers with greater understanding of why certain attributes are important to consumers (Olsen & Reynolds, 2001). The identification of profound relationships between abstract values and product attributes facilitates the design of informed customer communications (Reynolds & Gutman, 1988). This is done by making direct appeals to the core or fundamental issues which have been identified as important to the consumers.

5.3 Means-end chain analysis
The following sections outline literature pertinent to the chosen method.

5.3.1 Origen and development of MEC analysis
During the 1960s and 1970s the literature on beliefs advocated that people retain beliefs in a hierarchical structure (Katz & Storland, 1959; Rokeach, 1973). After the 1980s there was development of a new wave of literature from the research which developed around study of means-end chains (Gutman, 1982; Zeithaml, 1988; Walker & Olsen, 1991). This means-end chain theme had its roots in the work of Kelly (1955) on personal construct psychology (PCP). PCP suggests that people’s understanding of the world is the result of an active, constructive process rather than a passive reaction to some external reality (Ross and Nisbett, 1991). Philosophers such as Merleau-Ponty
and Sartre and psychologists such as Allport and Kelly have observed that people structure their goals and means in an effort to create coherence in their lives (Ritson and Elliot, 1995).

The use of MEC analysis, in the field of marketing came about in the late 1970s, as work by Gutman (1978, 1982) Gutman and Reynolds (1979) became influential. The roots of the ideas related to evaluation of alternatives to maximise satisfaction, draw directly on the economic concept of utility, and the rational consumer’s desire to maximise utility. Zeithaml (1988) wrote of perceived value as:

"the consumer's overall assessment of the utility of a product based on perceptions of what is received and what is given"


The means-end approach has developed through its use and application to business situations, and has been adapted intuitively to resolve research problems, particularly in the area of consumer decision-making (Olsen & Reynolds, 2001; Zanoli & Naspetti, 2002; Costa et al., 2004; Grunert et al 2004; de Ferran & Grunert, 2007; Lind, 2007; Barrena & Sanchez, 2009; Santosa & Guinard, 2011). The fundamental relationship which this methodology ‘assumes’, is that between customer decision-making and their desired end states. In that end states are abstract and overarching, they correspond to the ‘lifescape’ perspective (being - the way I perceive my life in this place).

5.3.2 MEC analysis and alternative methods

Various methods have been developed with the motive to explain how beliefs affect attitude towards choice options. These mostly comprise different variations on the expectancy-value model, where beliefs related to the various behavioural options are categorised by their strength (the purchaser’s judgement that this option will provide expected benefits) and by the evaluation (valence, desirability) of the attributes or consequences which are linked to the option by belief. A sum of the evaluations, weighted by the strengths is presented as a measure of attractiveness of the option. The highest scoring option, is defined as the one which would be selected, with this choice being called the attitude towards the option. Fishbein’s (1963) attitude model, and Fishbien and Ajzen’s (1975) Theory of Reasoned Action is perhaps most widely known. But Lewin’s (1963) field theory, and Toleman’s theory of purposive behaviour (1932) are earlier examples of a similar approach. These approaches show how consumers
prioritise across a range of product/service options in order to fulfil their requirements. These methods require the participation of the respondent in a technical scoring process, in one instance in time and without context.

Whilst other methods may result in attribute consideration, for example Grunert (1997) states that multi-attribute approaches to consumer perception, can conceivably cope with search, experience and credence attributes. However, they are not able to process the interrelationship between attributes. The compound nature of finding lean steak of the right beef breed, sold in the butcher’s shop recommended by an esteemed friend, which results in an excellent meal, which contributes to establish a particular social standing, or level of self-fulfilment - may have a synergistic value greater than the sum of individual attributes, and may contribute to multiple ‘end states’. This type of situation needs a hierarchical model such as means-end chain theory (Gutman, 1982, 1991).

Studies of involvement have shown that consumers’ willingness to process evaluation criteria for a product/service will depend on its personal or self-relevance. Involvement is then the result of interaction between the product schema and the self-schema it is not a characteristic merely of the product (Claeys & Vanden Abeele, cited in Olsen & Reynolds, 2001:366). There are different forms of involvement including: involvement with the product (product category or brand) (Block, 1981; Day, 1970; Zaichowsky, 1985), situation involvement (Houston & Rothschild, 1978), and involvement with advertising message or communications (Andrews et al., 1988; Battra & Ray, 1983; Krugman, 1966). Each type, infers a perceived personal relevance of the object, situation or communication to the needs and values of that individual (see McEachern & Schröder, 2004 above on provenance of meat).

The time dimension of involvement is thought to be enduring with a product, whilst involvement which is related to situation or message is transitory (Claeys & Vanden Abeele, cited in Olsen & Reynolds, 2001:359). Enduring involvement withstands different situations, and is not the result of any specific set of circumstances pertaining to one situation. In very general terms Costa et al (2004) classify meat-related purchase decisions low involvement. However, this thesis addresses lamb which is a NEFP and sold for prices thirty percent and more, higher than the generic equivalent, rationalisation for the price differential is assumed to invoke higher involvement. In
the wider consideration of the thesis’s final aims involvement may be significant in relation to visitors to Cumbria, and permanent residents, and their respective attitude towards Cumbrian food products, but is equally relevant to permanent residents who are attuned to ‘local’ cues in varying degrees across different situations. Involvement, rather than a separate method, is a concept which assigns a level of priority from the respondent to the subject of the thesis.

5.3.3 A critique of MEC: Limitations and Mitigations
The following section summarises literature which is critical of the MEC analysis method, and that which defends it.

The challenges involved in using soft-laddering include: demands for higher levels of inference and steering on the part of the interviewer, and less-rigid answers from the respondent. In this respect there is more potential for interviewer bias to develop, than with the rigid process of hard laddering, which carries its own weaknesses including: forced responses, different samples used for attribute selection, to subsequent laddering interviews (Costa et al., 2004). The qualitative data collected will not constitute an accurate representation of results for any population. It aims to explore the links which consumers reveal between their own schema of self and the schema of the product. The links are inferred from the recorded expressions from the respondent. They do not necessarily reflect a verbal account of actual behaviour (Zanoli & Naspetti, 2002). Relative to axiology, the interpretivist stance adopted in this thesis accepts that the researchers’ values will inevitably influence the research process.

The MEC approach assumes decision-making to be ‘voluntary and conscious’ so that cognitive evaluation is being made between competing options, in relation to their potential contribution towards desired end-states. Responses elicited from respondents may reflect their conscious decision-making, as they calmly contemplate their actions, and reasons for purchase which are important to them.

The respondent’s capacity to reveal these cognitions required for MEC analysis, the level of respondent awareness of cognitions (level of self-awareness) sometimes termed ‘cognitivism’ has been brought into question by Bagozzi & Dabholkar (2000). They argue that:
“Information processing research rests, in turn, on principles from cognitive psychology (e.g., J.R. Anderson, 1983; Barslau, 1991) and from social psychology, particularly social cognition (e.g., Fiske & Taylor, 1991) and attitude theory (e.g., Eagly and Chaiken, 1993). These traditions do not question the validity and ontology of internal psychological states and processes, but rather assume their existence and attempt to study their representation, functioning and relationship to behaviour.”


Respondents’ responses are therefore accepted without question or verification in MEC. These authors go on to cite Nisbett & Wilson (1977) who support the view that the information sought by researchers using MEC is not available in the respondent’s awareness, and that instead “subjective post hoc interpretations of one’s own responses or behaviour” are given.

These limitations are summarised in the following table together with actions taken by the researcher to mitigate their effects.

### Table 5.3 Limitations of MEC and Corresponding Actions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Limitations</th>
<th>Actions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Demands inference and steering by the interviewer.</td>
<td>Use of a consistent theme list to build on the same points of discussion with all respondents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elicits less rigid answers from respondents (Costa et al., 2004).</td>
<td>Iterative process of coding was used, in a sense backwards vertical integration towards the hard-laddering method of pre-defined answers to select from.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviewer bias</td>
<td>Maintained self-awareness of this potential failing and constant self-checking during interviews, coding and data analysis. Some acceptance that the interpretive stance will be influenced by the researcher’s values.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results not representative of the population</td>
<td>The goal was exploratory data collection, insight into the schema of self relative to that of the product, rather than a definitive truth sought. Hence snowball sampling</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The analysis of data undertaken reveals important linkages between values, across a range of consumers, this is valuable market information.

Table compiled from section 5.4.1 and reflection on research actions.

5.3.4 A defence for MEC

Bagozzi & Dabholkar (2000) note that conventionally multiple methods for each concept measure are needed to test construct validity, and this is too demanding for numerous concept-rich ladders in MEC. Bagozzi & Dabholkar (2000) propose the rejection of ‘cognitivism’ as a philosophical and psychological perspective for MEC and instead adopt a ‘social’ rather than a ‘natural’ science explanation of human behaviour, in this respect they cite the work of Harre (1998) who suggested that ‘intentionality’ and ‘normativity’ in human behaviour, fit the reasoning of discursive psychology.

“The central tenet of discursive psychology is that human thinking – including memory, reasoning, emotions and decision-making – is an inherently social activity ingrained in one’s use of language and constituted through public and private discourses. In conversations one has with other people or symbolically with the self” (Mead, 1934, cited in Bagozzi & Dabholkar, 2000:537)

Bagozzi & Dabholkar (2000) offer that these actions and reflections which emerge in conversation with others and the self, correspond to the concrete and abstract thoughts and connections which people are able to express in relation to products and “its social meaning for oneself”. The ontological position of MEC is thereby defended by its rooting in discursive psychology rather than cognitivism.

5.4 Components of means-end chain methodology

The following section considers elements involved in means-end chains.
5.4.1 Cognitive links

MEC aims to explore the cognitive links which consumers reveal between their own schema of self and the schema of the product. The chain between the two comprises: attributes, consequences and values, which follow the pattern of increasing in abstraction. Means are attributes of the product, which provide ends or values which are the source of the choice criteria which direct buying behaviour (Claeys et al., 1995). This logic is fundamental to the marketing concept (Kotler, 1991). Olson and Reynolds (1983) discuss the mental representations in closer detail covering distinct categories of abstraction including: concrete attributes, abstract attributes, functional consequences, psychological consequences, instrumental values, and terminal values.

5.4.2 Types of consequences

MEC analysis considers that there are two broad classifications of consequence resulting from a purchase; these are functional or psychological (Olsen & Reynolds, 2001). For example, lamb as a centre plate item, fulfils the functional requirement for a focal point of the Sunday roast. On the other hand HL consumed with visiting friends, may contribute to the ‘special’ quality of the occasion, and self-esteem needs of the hosts, which are classified as psychological consequences. The consequences identified as important by the respondent, should link to instrumental and terminal values or ‘ends’. Given the central nature of values to the means-end methodology, further examination of literature concerning values and their dimensions is warranted:

5.4.3 Establishing value linkages or connections

It is the linkage between the product’s attributes, its functional benefits, psychological consequences and values, which produce the ladders of meaning, relevant to each individual. The existence of similarities between these connections, across a broad set of respondents will allow marketing strategists to build programmes which will be relevant to consumer goals (Olsen & Reynolds, 2001).

Other methods of questioning endanger placing limits on the richness of response, or forcing the respondent to invent answers to fill a specified required quota. The method used by Young and Feigin (1975) presents a benefit chain analysis which links emotional or psychological benefits to product claims, or product attributes. The construction of a chain develops when the consumer is asked to provide two benefits, which are derived from one attribute, and then two benefits which are derived from each
of the two initial benefits. The process is repeated again to reveal 14 benefits. The respondent must react to a barrage of ‘whys?’, or ‘why is that important to you?’ following the provision of each piece of information or alternatively select from a pre-prescribed list of options. Hard laddering is efficient from the point of view of the researcher, as it feeds easily into software such as LADDERMAP, which can be used to produce HVMs and implication matrices (Zanoli & Nespetti, 2002). However hard laddering may force respondents to generate associations which relieve the pressure which is placed upon them for an answer, rather than revealing true associations (Costa et al., 2004).

Soft laddering is the original method. It involves the participants using their natural flow of speech, with ladders being identified and constructed after the interviews (Grunert & Grunert, 1995). Evidence has been presented to show that respondents participating in hard laddering interviews show a positive bias to the theme. This is explained by the fact they are asked why the element is important, and not given free-reign to say everything they wanted to about a product (Breakwell, 2004:312; Costa et al., 2004:407).

This thesis follows the procedure on soft-laddering suggested by Pieters, Baumgertner and Allen (1995) which is less prescriptive than the hard laddering above. Ladders are constructed following interpretation of the transcripts of dialogues between researchers and respondents.

This approach could be interpreted as contradictory to the principles of MEC analysis, in that the premise of the method is that a consumer is expected to behave in a way which reflects the cognitive links between the various levels on the ladder. However the degree to which these links are consciously apparent for each purchase decision is questionable. Consider the following scenario: It may be the case that consumers visiting a farmers’ market will judge all food provision to be local and good, and therefore purchase ‘at will’ without giving critical consideration to each item. In this case ladder elements may be shared amongst products, and the consumer may not have consciously ‘processed’ a lamb purchase separately from their other farmers’ market purchases. This being the case, the ‘Why?’ questions may be met with ‘I don’t know’ answers or ‘first things which come to mind answers’ (some hard laddering methods involve option cards generated from a first phase of interviews in order to prompt
respondents (De Ferran & Grunert, 2007). Whereas, in a broad discussion on lamb and its attributes, the perhaps partially shared consequences and values, may be identified by respondents, and ladders subsequently constructed. Similarly local food habits may become automatic, so that reasoned action does not come into play at each purchase incident, or at each consideration of the product, the consumption-relevant cognitive structure simply needs further unpacking through general discussion (Grunert and Grunert, 1995).

Soft laddering was employed because of fears of intimidating and alienating respondents with hard laddering, and because ‘soft laddering’ seemed to offer more opportunities for probing. Soft laddering is also recommended where the cognitive structure of the respondents might be weak, owing to limited involvement or experience of the product (Zanoli & Naspetti, 2002). Each research method has its weaknesses and those associated with MEC are now considered.

5.4.4 MEC outputs for branding and communications

Given the intention of this thesis to make recommendations for communications based on respondent supplied information, these considerations give rise to the question ‘what level of awareness do consumers experience in relation to communications?’ And ‘what is the relationship between perceptive processes which relate to their own actions, and those relating to the communications they are exposed to?’ Ruey (1999) writes of a ladder running between ‘awareness’ and ‘action’, relating to ‘hierarchy-of-effects’ advertising models, as product communications seek to push products into consumers’ perception, attitudes and belief systems. Investigation of these themes goes beyond the boundaries of this thesis.

The means-end chain model accounts for the fact that products are not simply purchased for what they are or the attributes they possess, but also for the meaning they engender in the mind of prospects (Reynolds and Gutman, 1988). The meaning which products have for consumers are linked to the values consumers hold, however these linkages are not necessarily at the ‘front of consumers’ minds’ on making a purchase decisions, and therefore not revealed easily by direct questioning (discussion on values in Chapter 3). The discussion format of the laddering-interview, can be organised in such a way that it encourages the respondent to reflect on why elements they bring into the discussion are
important to them. This process helps the respondent reveal the values they hold, and the linkages between those values and the product in question.

The transcriptions of interviews facilitate identification of attributes, consequences and values, the elements in the cognitive map becoming gradually more abstract. Hierarchical value maps are constructed following this process to identify the links which consumers feel personally significant, and reveal the identification of different motivational drivers for consumers. These can be seen as customer-based brand values for use in the synthesis process to develop brand meaning (Boatwright et al., 2009).

Having evaluated the method relative to the purpose of the thesis it is now logical to include details on implementation of the method.

5.5  Data generation

The thought processes behind the research design, and detail actions undertaken to produce primary data for the current thesis are now given attention. Firstly research aims are presented; secondly consideration is given as to how respondents were made aware of the research, and the context of interviews. Subsequently attention is given to decisions made during data processing and analysis.

5.5.1  Consideration of research objectives and respondents

The operational research aims were exploratory, to find the place of HL and CSML in local people’s value systems, with a view to informing marketing communications in general and specifically developments in brand-building.

In marketing terms the process will uncover latent brand equity constituents. Whilst the concept of brand equity is usually written about in the generic sense, it is made up from the achievement of brand resonance with consumers. However, how consumers associate the brand with their own specific values, will vary from one consumer to another (Aaker, 1991). Initial thoughts on potential respondent groups included the following (Table 5.4)

| Table 5.4  Respondent Populations for Consideration |
|-----------|--------------------------------------------------|
| Tourists  | Do not possess the longevity of connection with the landscape or heritage – reject. |
| Farmers   | Strong insights on production variables and landscape qualities but less insights on relative marketplace context – reject. |

127
Retailers
Possess product knowledge but may not have insight on the landscape – reject.

Consideration of the inclusion of vegetarians
May possess landscape insights from the visual perspective but lack the holistic appreciation of landscape through product – reject.

Any Cumbrian residents of the appropriate age and socio-economic profile.
They may be recent migrants into the county, they may live in a city or large town (or have an urban *lifescape*) without a strong landscape connection – reject.

Cumbrian lamb consumers (eaters), living in a location for five years or more, which facilitates frequent viewings of production of either lamb.
These respondents have the *lifescape* experience of the lamb production in question, and after five years assumed significant local knowledge of the place and products – select.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Retailers</th>
<th>Possess product knowledge but may not have insight on the landscape – reject.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consideration of the inclusion of vegetarians</td>
<td>May possess landscape insights from the visual perspective but lack the holistic appreciation of landscape through product – reject.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any Cumbrian residents of the appropriate age and socio-economic profile.</td>
<td>They may be recent migrants into the county, they may live in a city or large town (or have an urban <em>lifescape</em>) without a strong landscape connection – reject.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumbrian lamb consumers (eaters), living in a location for five years or more, which facilitates frequent viewings of production of either lamb.</td>
<td>These respondents have the <em>lifescape</em> experience of the lamb production in question, and after five years assumed significant local knowledge of the place and products – select.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Whilst the visual perception of the product in the landscape might expose farmers and vegetarians as potentially useful respondents, the holistic view of the experience of landscape through the products was sought. Vegetarians who appreciate the landscape could consume the product with the visual senses but not with senses of taste, or ownership and assimilation with the self through lamb consumption. These being the case respondents as outlined in the last row of table 5.4 were selected.

The aim was to achieve a level of saturation of responses covering aspects of the lamb relative to personal values. Whilst group interviews or focus groups might have enabled a rich local discussion on how important the subjects (lamb types) were, it was thought that value links revealed would be truncated, because of multiple and mistimed contributions of other participants. There is then value in achieving complete ladders of value, as consequences of purchase can be revealed; these can then be seen as purchase motivators.

### 5.5.2 Recruiting respondents

Respondents were self-selecting, in that they actively responded to a request for participation. The requests were published via-school/ organic vegetable delivery company newsletters, or via a notice on a farmers’ market stall (Appendix B). Respondents were able to select their preferred place for interview. Where the interviewer travelled to the respondent’s house, the next of kin was aware of the
interview schedule and contact details. The themes and approach to interview had been discussed with supervisors and judged as feasible and practical.

One of the key filters in selecting respondents was their ‘local’ status, local to either the HL or CSML prevalent production areas in Cumbria. With the absence of any consensual cut-off point in the literature, local was defined as living in this area for at least 5 years. Following the general profile for ethical purchase (including food miles, local) all respondents were over the age of 30 (Mintel, 2008). Only meat-eaters were included in the sample.

The selection of local people for interview was based on the assumption that local people would be familiar with the salient characteristics of the lambs in question, to share the environment with them, and to understand the cultural traditions pertaining to them. Ebert (2005:567) offers that place identity is defined as “[ ...] those spatiotemporal similar attributes of a place, which form the internal target group’s perception of that place” cited in Mueller and Schade (2012:82). In the Lakeland environment, sheep are fairly permanent symbols of the landscape/place, and symbols are important in the development of group identity, for local communities (Boisen et al., 2011). The research focus was to reveal how locals’ fellow ovine inhabitants of the environment fit into their own values, identity, and consumption, an equation which essentially involves consideration of place, values and identity.

Forty laddering interviews comprised a quota sample, these were carried out between April and September of 2007. Target respondents for this research resided local to the production area of either of the case study lambs, and who were aware of (classified as non-consumers) or have eaten (classified as consumers) either lamb. Respondent details can be found in (Appendices C & D).

The use of incentives to encourage participation is well-established (McDaniel & Gates, 2008:83; Santosa & Guinard, 2011), this was coupled with involvement of a community organisation in the form of local primary schools: Selside Endowed C. of E. School situated just North of Kendal, and Grange-Over-Sands Primary School. School Newsletters included an invite to participate in the research process, by volunteering for interview at either the respondent’s or interviewer’s home or a neutral place. Calm and quiet places were selected to allow respondents to reflect on the product in question (Lind, 2007:699). Participation would result in a £5 donation to school funds by the
researcher. However, this approach generated insufficient respondents to reach the quota of twenty respondents for each type of lamb (9/20 HL and 2/20 CSML). This being the case, snowballing was undertaken via existing respondents. Additionally people were approached via a farmers’ market stall selling HL in Cockermouth, and via a note in the newsletter of Howbarrow Organic Vegetable Box delivery (no longer in operation) located in the CSML production zone, near Grange-Over-Sands. £5 payment was offered to the non-school sourced respondents; however in all cases the incentive payment was refused.

5.5.3 Approach to data collection for MEC
In the absence of a consensus on the technique of MEC and laddering, this section outlines the thought process and reference points for the design of the primary data collection process.

Certain studies advocate a two stage process, whereby ‘soft’ laddering studies are undertaken in order to elicit common concept codes and hierarchical value maps (HVMs). These may be subsequently used to design a ‘hard’, ‘check-the-box’ laddering study, used with a separate set of respondents (Rekom & Wierenga, 2007). On the surface this seems an improvement on researcher-defined response options used in some cases of hard laddering. However, the second stage may suffer from a lack of personal relevance, given participation by two distinct sets of respondents (Phillips and Reynolds, 2009). A single phase of questioning, with a single set of respondents was the chosen strategy for data collection. Attributes were achieved through a process of direct elicitation (Lind, 2007). This decision was based on the practical difficulties on eliciting two interviews from the same respondent, and from the motive of exploring a wide range of connections, rather than needing to define a dominant set of connections between product and person.

Other options for eliciting attributes, such as ‘triadic sorting’ (Reynolds, 2008) exist, but direct questioning was the preferred alternative for the current thesis (Claeys et al., 1995). The principle of triadic sorting was upheld in the first question, which was: How do you think about lamb amongst other meats? (Discussion themes Appendix E).

Returning to the pragmatic requirements of output from this thesis, what is needed is a palette of potential components to be woven into brand development. The terminal values and links to lower entities in the LMs define the motives and salient personal
rewards involved in purchase. Elements within any of the LMs, and linkages between these, may be selected for use in brand communications. The LMs reveal the organisation of experience and other information in the human memory (Grunert and Grunert, 1995). It is important to recognise that the brand development process involves further iterative stages, with conceptual and promotional testing phases. The laddering exercise is not therefore intended to provide a single final answer to a single problem. Use of the method should complement the research/marketing requirements (Chapter 1). The requirements are amplified a little below.

To expand a little further, whilst it is useful to understand the motivational results from the laddering exercise, the particular requirements of the task at hand involved non-standard producers (Chapter 2) characterised by hill or coastal farms. The brand will result as output from an acceptable narrative between both producer and consumer (Cayla & Arnould, 2008; Visconti, 2010). In that hill-farms are not homogenous in many ways (distribution channels used, husbandry traits, attitudes towards brands and consumers) they may select different aspects of their brand to push, if for example they select ‘time on the fell’ as their perceived USP, then they may like to find this aspect reflected in the data and look at the links made by respondents in their ladders. Farm’s individual efforts then result in ‘synergies’ for the breed brand (Diamond et al., 2009). Reduction of data (by setting a cut-off point) may therefore restrict the value of the data; it would also detract from the original purpose to provide a palette of understanding of nodal connections of values relevant to each lamb. The HVMs may be produced for complete experimentation with the method, however these findings will not be representative owing to the quota sampling undertaken.

5.5.4 Themes for discussion and visual prompts
Themes (Appendix E) selected for discussion were structured around a funnel approach, first asking respondents about their perceptions of lamb amongst other meats and then focussing in on a single lamb visible in the local environment. The themes covered the respondent’s experience of seeing stock grazing, and interactions between stock and farmers. Perceptions of the landscape in which this experience took place were probed, and seasonal aspects considered in landscape vistas/experience as well as seasonality in diet. Provisioning experiences were considered from the perspective of contact with the supplier, information available in retail outlets, and farm access. Key local historical incidents and personalities known by the respondents were discussed.
The use of ‘stimulus material’ and particularly in the format of pictorial representation has been associated with increased validity in respondent judgement (Looschilder et al., 1995). In this thesis the use of pictures of promotional aspects of both lamb types were shown to gauge perceptions of the product’s envisaged target relative to views of themselves. Respondents were asked who they thought the products would appeal to. At this point or at number 8 of 11 themes, prompts were used to remind consumers how the products are currently being promoted (Appendix E).

5.5.5 Data Collection

The interviews were pilot tested with two respondents, one for each product. It was recognised that the focus of discussion would vary along with the respondent’s involvement level and unique perspective on the product. No changes were made to the themes following pilot testing. This being the case the pilot interviews were included in the data set.

Interviews were conducted at respondents’ homes (30), a vacant room in a workplace (4) or at the author’s home (6). Care was taken to avoid interruption, visual distractions and background noise. Interviews lasted between 90-120 minutes. Following the triadic sorting question on lamb amongst other meats, the discussion would meander around attributes and their connotations, as the discussion developed, themes would be ticked, and if need be questions posed on remaining themes.

As already stated the soft laddering interviews were carried out on the basis that a more natural interview process reveals a better quality of data, if the respondent does not feel intimidated, or bored with the interview process, rather that they are able to speak freely about the subject under study, and reveal their cognitive connections between values and choices. It is the researcher’s role to identify the levels of abstraction which are found in the natural flow of speech, rather than passing the responsibility for this activity to the respondent.

Other considerations for the interviewing process are the reverse sequencing of key data, if the respondent reveals the consequence, or value without having revealed the preceding elements of attribute or consequence, then the researcher must recognise this and practice ‘reverse laddering’. Reverse laddering is exemplified by the question ‘What is it about the product which leads to this outcome?’
It is recognised that the involvement of a community organisation (primary school) and support given by respondents for a donation to the school results in respondents who value those entities or were interested in the topic. However, as the primary concern was that the respondent was local, and had eaten or had awareness of HL/CSML, the possession of such values did not detract from any supposed representation of the sample as locals, but may have biased the sample towards those who value the local community within the HL sample only (School-found respondents H = 9, CSML only 2) depending on their motivation.

Given that the product was to be discussed in its broad environmental context, and environmental influences on the taste of the meat were of interest, the researcher chose to interview both male and female respondents. It was not a situational meat-purchase decision which was the focus (where women prevail) rather perceptions of the meat, and how it might fit into their lifestyle.

It is important to remember during the analysis phase that the data collected is not statistically representative. As such, the process of deriving measures of cohesiveness in connections and strongest ladders/motives, will not take priority in the analysis. The objective is to match values between consumer and producers.

5.6 Ethical considerations
The topic of research is not typically intrusive (compared to NHS themes) and does not involve minors, or vulnerable individuals who may feel intimidated by the interview process. Participants self-selected into the research process by volunteering to take part, following exposure to a published invitation (Appendix B). The content of the questions did not take consideration of ethical concerns beyond the preliminary ethics evaluation stage.

Once respondents contacted the researcher, arrangements were made for the time and place of interview. Interviews were carried out at the respondent’s home, the researcher’s home or at a quiet public place, such as the Brewery in Kendal (a central cultural and training venue) – with timings arranged to miss peak service periods.

Before commencement of the interview, respondents were asked if they minded the conversation being recorded (none refused). They were informed that they may terminate the interview at any time. Anonymity was discussed and it was explained
clearly to respondents that their anonymity would be protected, and their name would be replaced by a code. Data from each respondent was given a number rather than a name, in order to maintain confidentiality.

Respondents were informed in the recruitment information that their information was being used for academic research and publication, rather than for commercial use this was reiterated at the outset of the interview. Additionally respondents were given the opportunity to question the researcher about the research process before the interview began, to ensure that the consent given was ‘informed’ from their perspective too. None of the participants withdrew from the interview process after making contact with the researcher.

During data interpretation care was taken to focus on the actual transcripts, rather than summaries of the same. Although the researcher’s own lens will always influence the interpretation, the process of checking across transcripts for findings and reflections kept the interpretation and analysis as close to the original data as possible.

5.7 Analysis of findings and identification of emergent constructs.

The process used to gather data was to make and audio recording of interviews. These interviews were then transcribed and printed (Appendices F & G). Working through the transcripts, the author would first identify product attributes, and then work up the ladders, finding consequences, instrumental values and terminal values. Costa et al (2004) notes the ‘subjective nature’ of content analysis, with results which are “often the subject of controversy” (ibid, p408). In that the objectives here are to reveal connections, rather than to pronounce strongest connections it is hoped that some of this controversy may be avoided.

Given the style of soft laddering interviews undertaken, the entire ladder would not always appear sequentially, but be made evident in answers which resulted following further probing and amplification of the themes. Eventually the complete ladders could be constructed. To present the ladder maps LMs, a mind-mapping software ‘inspiration’ was used for construction and printing only. Owing to difficulties involved in drawing LMs without any crossing lines, “considerable ingenuity” is required in building a coherent map (Reynolds and Gutman, 1988). Individual LMs for both groups of respondents were produced. Botschen and Thelen (1998) consider that the results from soft and hard laddering are fairly similar, but show that the level of
abstraction achieved in chains is a more frequent result from soft laddering, and conclude this is more able to identify complex underlying motivations relating to consumption motivation (cited in Costa et al., 2004).

Gengler et al (1995) offers a guide on MEC data analysis. The process begins with deriving a set of codes which summarise the responses and ‘go together’ sharing the same meaning. The analysis in this thesis is based upon an inductive approach and not an a priori framework. The labelling for themes was based upon their ‘best fit’ to the data rather than explicitly drawn from the literature. Although the term ‘environment’ encompasses ‘foodscapes’, it was also much broader, including free-ranging lamb, seasonal conditions present and resulting associated distinctive flavour and texture of meat. The relationship to and relevance of the findings to the literature based concepts are discussed in Chapter 7 Discussion. The exception to this was the delineation of attribute types into search, experience, and credence attributes which were viewed as contributing to the data classification and ordering process, presented in the results chapter (Barrena & Sanchez, 2009). The codes from the individual LMs are aggregated across respondents to form a matrix format – the implications matrix. The aggregation of attribute descriptions into codes for this thesis is illustrated in (Appendices H & I). Coding of data does allow themes to be identified and therefore to facilitate data analysis; however coding involves loss of original expression and detail from the respondent. On realisation of the limiting nature of advised analysis stages from previous scholars (Gengler and Reynolds, 1995; Reynolds and Gutman, 1988) the decision was taken to avoid further reduction.

The next advised step is to produce an overall matrix of codes which is then represented as a HVM. The purpose of the aggregated data in a HVM is to enable the production of an estimate of the sample’s cognitive structure. The traditional form of MEC analysis; did not detail the number of people who mention the concepts or the strength of association between concepts. These missing elements made the aggregate map difficult to conceptualise. The presence of all relationships uncovered through interview could result in a cluttered map with many crossing lines which would be equally difficult to conceptualise. There is a balance to be sought between data reduction and data retention (Gengler et al., 1995).
The reluctance to reduce the data further also excluded use of MEC software such as LADDERMAP. This software requires stipulation of a minimum frequency of occurrence of connections, in order to qualify for inclusion into the HVM. The number of mentions chosen is generally known as ‘the cut-off point’ (Reynolds & Gutman, 1988). Gengler et al (1995) advocate the use of graphic symbols to convey information effectively, and reduce the ‘mental cost’ of interpretation by using different sized symbols or thickness of line, for example, to show which concepts were most/least mentioned (Lind, 2007). With the absence of these graphical indications as to the weight of the findings, the reader must resort to Appendices H and I for attribute frequency data. Tables in Chapter 7 for information on higher level values. For the current thesis, with a relatively small sample size, the reference to attribute matrixes was not seen as too onerous and this is where frequency of data can be found (Appendices AD & AX).

Gengler et al (1995) write about design of the HVM and its ability to perform the three functions of the graphic: to record information; to communicate information and to facilitate the analysis of the data (p253). This efficiency again has to be moderated in view of the aims of this study, which is less about synthesis and more about exposure of respondent constructs.

Similarly the evaluation of different consumers’ level of involvement can be inferred from individual LMs. Gengler et al (1995) considered work by Mulvey et al (1994) which offered insights into consumers’ involvement from LMs. The concept’s level of importance was deemed to vary with involvement, the example given being that ‘control’ is a consequence offered by high-involvement consumers. Similarly the map for low involvement consumers is found to be simpler and less interconnected than highly interconnected maps resulting from high involvement consumers (Lind, 2007). Significantly this reflection highlights the earlier study’s construction of a HVM for individual consumers. However, level of involvement is not a feature of the objectives of this thesis.

In order to identify the dominant means-end chains from the HVMs, all chains must be examined. The comparison may be undertaken intuitively by considering elements and lengths of chains (Reynolds and Gutman, 1988) or mathematically (Gengler and Reynolds, 1989). The current thesis took an intuitive approach, indexicality is the
knowledge about the respondent which is held by the researcher, Grunert and Grunert (1995) predict a higher rate of indexicality in the interpretation of soft-laddering interviews. Matrices of consequences and values associated with each attribute, were developed in order to exemplify original content and linkages between elements. This approach aided the writing of themes and linkages relative to attribute codes. Reference back to individual LMs enabled the identification of the important nodal points in ladders.

How is the strength of a chain identified? The length of a chain can reach three levels: attributes, consequences and values (Gutman, 1982) or six levels: concrete and abstract attributes, functional and psychosocial consequences, and instrumental and terminal values (Olson and Reynolds, cited in Aurifeille and Valette-Florence, 1995:269). The next chapter contains details of ladders produced.

Reynolds & Whitlark (1995) showed that the strength of association between elements on a means-end chain assists brand persuasion. However in the current thesis, finding the current level and relevance of consumer knowledge of the product is only one part of the narrative. Whilst the determinants of buyer behaviour (values) influence brand design, there are essential factors about the origin of the product to consider (Hermann et al., 2002). This information has to be brought alive by the resonance of its findings with promoters/producers’ own beliefs about their product (Boatwright et al., 2009). A process of synthesis is therefore required to establish the meaning of the brand, both within the company/farm/retail organisation and for those intermediaries further down the distribution channel including retailers and consumers.

The approach to data analysis undertaken has distanced itself from the perceived reduction in descriptive uniqueness involved in hard laddering and in use of Laddermap software. The data analysis recognises the limitations of the data collected, as exploratory and qualitative, and not statistically representative of the population under study. The route followed was to collect streams of values which resulted from consideration of similar attributes (see tables in Chapter 7). The purpose in adopting this direction was to provide collections of linked consequences and values which producers/retailers may consider in the brand building process. The value opportunity analysis tool may be useful at this stage (Cagan & Vogel, 2002 cited in Boatwright et al., 2009). This process facilitates the synthesis of the beliefs farmers/retailers have
concerning their own USP and that of the specific product with consumer values. The results will be interpreted in a generic sense in this thesis (rather than focussing on a particular farm) in terms of the brand-support infrastructure which may be appropriate for development in Cumbria.

5.8 Summary

The philosophical basis for the chosen method rationalises that people interact with the world and store experiences of doing so in a hierarchical manner, and make consumption decisions based on which best contribute towards their desired goals/end states (Kelly, 1955; Katz & Storland, 1959; Rokeach, 1973; Ritson and Elliot, 1995).

This chapter has explained the qualitative characteristics of the information targeted in the primary research, taking into account the ‘lifescape’ perspective on embedded food products. The research has gathered unique personal perceptions of these products, which comprise an individual’s reference points and motivations for interest/disinterest in same.

MEC analysis permits some options or process choices, depending partly on the style of MEC interviews used. Soft laddering was adopted here as the best route to permitting respondents to respond in normal patterns of speech (Zanoli & Nespetti, 2002). Explanations have been presented which justify the data analysis process undertaken, in line with the specific objectives of this thesis i.e. to inform brand development by offering a broad palette of features and connections rather than focussing on identifying those most dominant. The method is not without its critics and psychologists resent the rooting of the method in cognitive psychology, finding that an alternative ontological basis is discursive psychology (Bagozzi & Dabholkar, 2000).

The hierarchy of values elicited from consumer interviews begins at lowest level with attributes, followed by consequences and terminal values. These become more abstract towards the top of the chain. Values which emerged from discussions about the respondents’ schema of self and HL/CSML were identified from transcripts of laddering interviews. Values were sought out using the MEC method because of parallels found between the hierarchy of values which a person possesses and the hierarchy of values constructed through the brand development process (section 3.3.3.). Brand image emerges from a synthesis between consumer consequences and personal values together
with product attributes (Reynolds and Gutman, 1984). The next chapter presents the results of this process.
Chapter 6       Results

6.1       Introduction

This chapter presents the results obtained through primary data collection. The purpose of the primary data collection was to elicit consumer perceptions and values relating to lamb and their related conceptualisation of place/region. Corresponding priorities of value from producers, retailers, relating to the lamb in question may then be matched and enhanced to develop brands which may resonate with potential consumers. The scope of the study represents a departure from other means-end studies which tend to consider the consumer and the product without a third element such as ‘place/region’ (Zanoli & Nespetti, 2002; Ferran & Grunert, 2005; Lind, 2007; Barrena & Sanchez, 2009, Sentosa & Guinard, 2011). This study aims to keep all identified values which may contribute a dimension to the ‘place’ construct of the lamb, as this represents the USP amongst other lambs.

The content of the chapter includes presentation of attributes identified by respondents as relevant to one of the types of lamb under consideration. The articulation of product attributes is important because they are the most conscious level of perception relating to the product. Particular scrutiny is placed on ‘place’ and related descriptors which respondents offered. Similarly, the links between place-related attributes and higher level values are examined. In the first part of the chapter these are considered for each lamb separately.

The chapter then considers the relative significant concepts emerging from the data by including the tables of codes for each lamb, these serve to highlight the conceptualisation of place related factors relevant to each lamb. Finally hierarchical value maps are included for each lamb, thereby contextualising the specific elements of interest in this thesis.

6.2       Presentation considerations for laddering interview results

Twenty interviews were undertaken for each lamb, and transcriptions produced (Appendices F & G). Considerable thought has been input into the mode of analysis and the presentation of results, bearing end-users in mind. The original approach was to retain as much detail as possible during the analysis to enable brand developers (farmers) to contextualise comments which they felt closely mirrored their priorities. It
was felt that valuable detail would be lost in the coding and reduction of the data. To this end Ladder Maps were developed for each of the forty interviews which are available in Figures 6.1 & 6.2 and Appendices J to AB. However, subsequently more careful explanation was required, it was found that interpreting the data solely in such an unprocessed state resulted in rather descriptive content. Attempts at discussing all value links proved an exercise in diffusion. The decision was made to retain the descriptive data and to proceed with further numerical analysis. Whilst there is greater clarity to be achieved by data reduction for the purpose of reporting, and full experience of the method to be gained by the researcher from production of summary implication matrixes, no representations can be claimed from the analysis undertaken as these are exploratory findings only.

The production of a ‘summary implication matrix’ (Reynolds & Gutman, 1988) for each set of twenty interviews allowed identification for the number of times each coded element links to another coded element. Indirect links between elements are shown by counts to the right of the decimal (Appendices AD & AX). Once all values are plotted, it is possible to select a cut-off level, which is the number of linkages which the analyst decides will provide a clear but comprehensive hierarchical value map HVM which represents the dominant perceptual connections for the lamb in question. The next section introduces attributes identified by respondents in relation to HL.

6.2.1 Attributes relating to Herdwick Lamb

The attributes form the lowest and most immediate response from the consumer in relation to the subject. In terms of type of attribute, mainly credence and experience attributes were forthcoming, with fewer search attributes (section 3.4.5) (Table 6.1).

Search attributes are characteristics such as colour, or content (fat/sugar) information about performance levels. Experience attributes are more abstract and can only be assessed when using the product i.e. after purchase. Credence attributes are where the information has to be inferred from other sources, e.g. compared to other products, or other attributes of this product. (Darby & Karni, 1973, cited in Bech-Larsen & Nielsen, 1999).

The lack of search attributes is notable, with only the negative example provided of the relative high price of Herdwick compared to other lamb. This means that Herdwick
respondents have processed a considerable amount of information in order to build the bank of credence attributes provided through interview.

**Table 6.1  Coding of Attributes Identified by Herdwick Lamb Consumers.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute Classification</th>
<th>Phrase</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Traditional</td>
<td>Origin</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Authentic Lakeland</td>
<td>Origin</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Allergy-safe food</td>
<td>Safe</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Product of trusted husbandry</td>
<td>Husbandry</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Search/Experience</td>
<td>Darker meat</td>
<td>Sensory</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The right colour meat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Excellent flavour and texture</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strong flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Far tastier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Earthy Flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Delicious Taste</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fresh</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Expected straight from the fell</td>
<td>Meat/</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product of a healthy environment</td>
<td>environment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dense meat compared to flabby lowland lamb</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lean in winter fat in summer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Longer fibres</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unstressed tender meat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Weathers 2/3 yrs. best taste</td>
<td>Special</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mutton cooked slow in the aga</td>
<td>preference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Fairly free-range meat</td>
<td>Breed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wild</td>
<td>personality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hardy and tough sheep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pretty sheep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herdwick are the dark sheep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Bought from friends</td>
<td>Distribution</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Buy from producer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Farm raised and butchered</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Farmer’s market efficiency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Customised order</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Odd-shaped joints</td>
<td>Carcass</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>features</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Search</td>
<td>Relatively expensive</td>
<td>Price</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Zone of production linked to Potter and Wainwright, Leisure Association</td>
<td>Heritage</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Product of a beautiful area</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product of a wild place</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product of a salty environment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Produced in an area of historical significance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not a typical Lakeland environment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Powerful landmark</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inlets fill up and empty</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Patchwork of frozen pockets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shares environment with rabbits, oyster-catchers, lapwings, wading ducks, wild ducks, and geese.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sheep-spotting at Grange</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Environment appreciated by older people</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product of a dangerous environment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cockle picker’s deaths</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product of a polluted place with rats</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The example of a ladder map LM is included in Figure 6.1 (The remainder in Appendices J through AB) to show how interviews were transposed into loose ladder map format. The value in including this stage is the richer detailed descriptions at different levels, which is lost through the coding process of the latter stages of this method (Reynolds and Gutman, 1988). Additionally real linkages in one mind are shown in the LMs, whereas the HVMs produce a map of most evident linkages across the sample. To clarify, the entirety of chains shown in HVMs may not actually be represented by any person in the sample (ibid). The value gained by the individual connections, and consideration of these across the sample is more valid to the exploratory research objective related to consumer perceptions of regional lamb, and it is for this reason that there is considerable focus on individual’s cognitions presented here in ladder maps LMs.

The next section presents comments on the LMs resulting from HL focussed interviews.

6.2.2 Results apparent from individual HL Ladder Maps LMs

The first part of the analysis will consider the attributes and how respondents perceived them. This part of the analysis will not necessarily analyse each ladder from bottom to apex but will make reference to linked values. This approach is undertaken because there is value in understanding consumer perceptions of product related cues.

6.2.3 HL Local

Local as an overall concept was found to encompass a number of different interpretations including: community, low food-miles, direct and speedy distribution, and being representative of place. Respondents expressed a desire to have a foothold in farming life (as opposed to resentment of the mainstream food system). This was exemplified by contact, and relationships developed with suppliers. Consumers were found to be active and engaged in the food provisioning role, they were confident and willing to ask questions about meat and its provenance. The experience of buying HL, either by taking the family on a buying trip to a farm (H LMs: 3, 4, 10, 15, 16, 19) by
visiting a farmers’ market (H LMs: 8, 9) or by buying the product via a regional retailer or butcher (H LMs:11, 20) was seen as valuable in that it directs expenditure back into the local community; they feel they have a community role, and an indirect participation in what goes on in the fells and fields of Cumbria.

Consumers view this activity as socially responsible, and may contribute to their own social-status or self-satisfaction (H LMs: 1, 2, 7, 12). In summary involvement in the community via the food provisioning process is seen positively, and acts as a motivator in the provisioning process.

Apart from the financial contribution to the local economy, direct/local purchase gives an access to farming and the countryside which some non-farm-dwelling consumers, have felt excluded from. Access to farms by ‘commercial invitation’ is seen as participation with the authentic and traditional practices of Lakeland farming, and also makes contributions to consumers’ identity with the place (H LMs: 3, 10, 15). They are more oriented to the physical environment, perceiving the lamb that they purchase as the HL they see grazing in their locality (H LMs: 4, 16, 19).

Visiting a farm with the family is perceived as a leisure activity (occasionally contrasted with walking down a supermarket aisle, by respondents), and a food provisioning activity providing a very rich learning experience for children, thereby contributing towards an exciting life (H LMs:15). It may be useful to note, from a distribution aspect, that access to farms is not only restricted to farms which advertise as having farm shops; it can also result from matured buying-relationships at farmers’ markets. The latter may be perceived as a more exclusive, and privileged access (H LMs: 2, 3, 4, 8, 9, 10).

Local also implies dealing direct with the producer. The benefits identified of this contact include the opportunity to question the producer and establish if the producer’s practices coincide with their own production preferences, on ethical or environmental grounds (H LMs: 10, 15, 16).
Figure 6.1 Example of a HL Ladder Map (H12)

- Social recognition
- Socially responsible
- Local community contribution
- Guilt-free food miles
- Hardy and tough sheep, chunky legs multi-coloured
- They look right in the landscape
- Local
- Delicious taste
- Alan Stone's work (artist)
- Product of a 'moving landscape'
- Traditional
- Allergy-safe food
- Inner harmony
- At peace
- Integrity
- 'Real' experience of food
- Comfort
- Warming winter food
- Product from 'the old days'
- Safe food
- Local community contribution
- Guilt-free food miles
- Hardy and tough sheep, chunky legs multi-coloured
- They look right in the landscape
- Local
- Delicious taste
- Alan Stone's work (artist)
- Product of a 'moving landscape'
- Traditional
- Allergy-safe food
- Inner harmony
- At peace
- Integrity
- 'Real' experience of food
- Comfort
- Warming winter food
- Product from 'the old days'
- Safe food
6.2.4 HL Distribution

In addition to much of the above, the distribution channels for HL, i.e. farmers’ market, Booths, certain local butchers, or direct from farm shops, offer a service quality which has largely disappeared from mainstream food provisioning. The direct contact between producer and consumer permits the consumer entry into another way of life to which they would not normally have direct contact with - the rural and agricultural life (H LMs: 8, 9, 10, 11), and a sense of community, new relationships offer a new and exciting dimension to life, (H LMs: 1, 3, 4, 7, 12, 15, 18, 19). Along with other local products HL offers consumers the chance to connect with the local farming community (H LMs: 2, 20).

6.2.5 HL Purchase format – whole/half lamb

Relationships with farmers have resulted in consumers buying a whole or half a HL (H LMs: 2, 3, 4, 8, 9,). This novel format has resulted in new experiences for the consumer including the recognition of the need to deal with inconvenient product format – all cuts from the animal. (Whilst the supermarket channel acts as a pooling function for lamb carcasses, with alternative routes for low value cuts). This results in challenged repertoires of cuisine, where determination and success terminates in enhanced self – respect. Purchase of the entire animal carcass also reinforces the ideas of tradition and the ‘real’ process of meat production, there is very clear association of meat with a dead animal.

6.2.6 HL Price

The relative expense of HL is countered by certain benefits including: implicit quality guarantees, participation in an exclusive provisioning system, the opportunity to learn about factors which influence the quality of animal and meat, tapping into the identity of the producer. These factors overall contribute to a more exciting dimension to (retired) life. Respondents spoke of taking on a role as supplier to an extended family/friends network, thereby extending the traditional UK role of provider to the immediate family only and resulting in feelings commensurate with a comfortable life or a life with added excitement (H LMs: .8, 9).
6.2.6 HL Sensory

The anticipation of a ‘different taste’ and a new culinary experience is important to some consumers. For those interested in food it is seen as exciting and challenging, and contributing to social responsibility, inner-harmony and hedonism (H LMs: 1, 2, 3, 8, 9, 10, 11, 13, 20).

Some consumers identify the darker colour of the meat, which they interpret as confirmation of quality. The darker colour is perceived as deriving from either the breed or the length of time the meat has been hung (sometimes compared to ‘bright red’ colour of meat in supermarkets). There is therefore visual satisfaction in meat, and those who have exacting standards and know something about the meat process can see the colour as an indication of meat which has been prepared well for market (H LMs: 6, 9, 10, 19). The distinctive taste of the lamb provides a new culinary experience, exciting and challenging to respondents, and contributing to personal growth and comfort. The sensory satisfaction built on this product contributes to happiness and inner harmony of the respondent.

Some respondents identify a ‘fresh’ quality to the meat that is allied to its local, and low-food miles attributes (H LMs:19, 20). Other respondents tend to relate ‘fresh’ to the flavour resulting from an animal which has matured in a relatively wild, upland environment (H LMs:2, 15). The former would tend to work against consumers’ concerns about meat being held for extended periods in the distribution chain, and the resulting integrity of the product. Whilst the latter is more of a custodial attribute of the HL product, which appeals to those who know the Lakeland uplands and recognise the qualities of the landscape. The knowledge of precise provenance confers connotations of the place to the final product.

Taste is interpreted by respondents in different ways, from varying degrees of superlatives: good, delicious, excellent, to more descriptive representations ‘earthy flavour’ and relative descriptions (to other lamb) strong flavour, far tastier (H LMs: 2, 3, 6, 7, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 18, 19, 20). Respondents are certain about flavour pay-offs with HL, they are confident to select it for social eating occasions, it has value as a culinary-reputation-building component. Its provenance is perceived as having direct impact on flavour; this contributes to sensory satisfaction at mealtimes, family contentment, exciting and ‘real’ food experiences. ‘Real’ food (H LMs: 12), relating to
the fact these animals are part of the local landscape and seen on a daily basis. There is a seasonal ‘winter-warmth’ attribute of particularly ‘slow-cooked’ food based on HL, which would seem to relate to perceptions about the ability of the animal to withstand the upland environment in winter (H LMs: 3, 20). These experiences are linked to achievement of inner harmony, recognition of a world of beauty, self-respect, a sense of accomplishment and family security-related needs.

6.2.7 HL Flavour/Environment Link

Whilst the environment is perceived as contributing to the flavour, texture and trust in the authenticity of the meat, respondents have various expectations of HL, which reflect their understanding of farming in the different environments of upland and lowland in Lakeland:

Firstly, as the environment of the upland and associated flora are used in customer communications, the customers expect the lamb to be taken to market straight from the fell. Customers may ask which farm the lamb is from and will achieve a level of knowledge commensurate with their need for verification of product authenticity. This process impacts on their ambition, social recognition and self-satisfaction.

The upland environment is seen as a healthy environment that has positive resulting effects on meat flavour (H LMs: 2, 9, 10, 15, 16, 17, 20). In this sense it has ‘pure’ connotations, so qualifies as a product that is safe and satisfying for the family, and contributes towards family-security.

Some consumers commented on the physical condition of the animal, with HL perceived as fit and healthy animals compared to ‘flabby’ lowland lamb. In eating terms, this is perceived to translate to dense meat, which is expected to be lean in winter and fat in summer, thereby reflecting the condition of the animal in its environment (H LMs: 12, 16). These comments clearly place the food product in its place of production, and show a strong understanding of place and season. The meat changes in quality along with the seasons, and mirrors the ease of habitation in this environment.

Knowledge and concern is apparent in relation to the stress endured by animals in the slaughter process. HL is perceived by some as unstressed and consequently tender meat (H LMs: 3, 10, 11). The tenderness is seen as a reward for good husbandry, a considerate approach to farming driven by ethical concerns over financial gain. These
factors facilitate responsible purchasing, and contribute towards consumer’s inner harmony and sense of accomplishment.

The components above describe consumers whose understanding of meat goes far beyond that of most consumers (which often justify the claims made on polystyrene and cling-film packs). These knowledgeable consumers have a holistic and considered view of lamb, husbandry and the landscape. For them there is a flavour and enjoyment that they can logically attribute to husbandry activities, and to the environment of production. It is a ‘cognitive-assisted’ taste that these consumers experience.

6.2.8 HL Perceived Personality
Consumers perceive the HL with a personality that is wild and ranging free, hardy and tough, dark yet pretty at the same time, there are no external boundaries to enclose this character that knows its domain. The HLS’ ability to battle the environment embodies the product with sustaining qualities that provide warmth and comfort to the consumer. As the animal is in ecological balance with its environment, by supporting the industry through purchase of the lamb consumers preserve a local tradition in farming; they are in balance and in contact with their community. The permanently pleasing nature of the landscape (including the HL) and contentment from community relations, contribute towards values associated with the inner-harmony of respondents, their social recognition, and a world of beauty.

6.2.9 HL Heritage
The Lakeland landscape is conceptually linked to those who have captured a view of it: Beatrix Potter who didn’t write a children’s story about sheep, but tied the HL to the legacy of her farms, and Wainwright shared the landscape with HL as he compiled his walking guidebooks. These and other individuals (Wordsworth, Ruskin) who have interpreted the special qualities of ‘Lakeland’ which may now be attached to ‘a place of production’ (H LMs: 5, 6, 9, 11).

6.2.10 HL Origin
A sense of a belonging to the place by some respondents expressed via acknowledgement of the HL as authentic heritage, therefore ‘the obvious choice’ as a meal component, particularly in a wider social setting. Also family heritage in terms of place and values in relation to food (H LMs: 6, 10, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 19). These values
are linked to self-satisfaction, social recognition and responsibility, the achievement of wisdom, inner harmony, and an exciting life

6.2.11 HL Safe
HL is seen as safe and natural, lamb being signalled as the meat which people with allergies can eat. Faith is expressed in traditional values, offering a ‘real’ experience of food, linked to integrity and wisdom (H LMs: .5, 6, 7, 8, 12, 20).

6.2.12 HL Husbandry
HL offer the respondents the opportunity to reward the producer for good practice, for those who value social responsibility. This leads to pleasant social interactions and ultimately pleasure for the consumer (H LMs: 7, 8, 9, 11).

Special preferences were mentioned in relation to the characteristics and flavour of the HL, with a preference for weathers or 2/3 year old sheep having a sweet and gamey flavour, a component to a meal which reinforces family reverence (LMs: 16). HL was also viewed as important enough to be the central focus for a dinner party, accompanying a traditional cooking format in the form of an ‘Aga’ cooker, where it would be left for most of the day, possibly cooked in hay, resulting in an excellent texture of meat, conveying the capability of the chef, and respect from herself and guests (LMs: 3, 11,) or reinforcing the ‘successful provider’ role (LMs: 9, 16,).

6.2.13 HL HVM Summary
The points discussed above show how HL is perceived and summarise the connections made by consumers between product attributes and their values. In order to provide a visual representation of the dominant connections between attributes, consequences and values, the codes, summary implication matrix and linked HVM have been processed manually (Appendices AE through AG). These show that consumers generally value the interaction and communication with local producers, and recognise they are reducing their food-miles burden. Respondents recognise their gain of community membership/support benefits which link to the achievement of social recognition. The satisfaction achieved through eating a product which pleases the senses, satisfies the self and others, and produces pleasure. The ability to provide high quality food contributes to respondents’ self-esteem. The local and fresh attributes of the meat, along with knowledge of the breed appearance are linked to respondents’ link to the landscape, either to sustain it or continue to enjoy it in its grazed condition; this ability is linked to
values of inner harmony. There are three main strands to this diagram which represent the enjoyment of place via the local community, the enjoyment of place by self, satisfaction via consumption of a product of that place. The next section considers CSML.

Table 6.2 Coding of Attributes Identified by Salt Marsh Lamb Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of respondents (n = 20)</th>
<th>Phrase</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Credence</strong></td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transported less</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fresher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Less stressed meat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Experience/Search</strong></td>
<td>Samphire-rich grazing</td>
<td>Flavour promise</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Connection between grazing and meat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Different forage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Salt affects flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘Sea weedy-taste’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Credibly different</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Search/Experience</strong></td>
<td>Darker colour meat</td>
<td>Organoletic</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Meat lighter in colour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Moist meat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Acceptable to the family (no allergies)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Search for producer information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Organic?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Visual appearance of food</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Experience</strong></td>
<td>Booths communications</td>
<td>Community</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Higginson’s for a treat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sizergh Barn</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mansergh Hall</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Farmers ‘market’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Banter with producer/butcher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>From contact with producer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Credence/Experience</strong></td>
<td>Food seasonality</td>
<td>Seasonality</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Special in the spring</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brought on after spring and autumn tides</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Free-range</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not intensive production</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shoulder on the barbecue in the summer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stew/roast in the winter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Credence</strong></td>
<td>No breed/zone preference</td>
<td>Post-modern</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Windswept, scraggy and thorny</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Search</strong></td>
<td>Holker Brand - high cost</td>
<td>Commercialisation</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sets high expectations of unique flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expectations not met</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prohibitively expensive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Credence</strong></td>
<td>TV chef/other references seen</td>
<td>Credibility</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ingredient for recipe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.3 Attributes relating to Cumbrian Salt Marsh Lamb

Table 6.2 includes the coding of attributes and classification of same into search, experience and credence categories as far as possible. The codes emerged from the data as it was recorded, rather than being selected from a pre-defined list. More search attributes were present for CSML, with some search elements relating to the claims relating to flavour or to the Holker connection.

6.3.1 CSML-Results apparent from individual CSML LMs

The following paragraphs include comment on the CSML results evident in LMs. Reynolds & Gutman (1988) comment that three-quarters of an interview sample will produce three or four ladders, whilst one-quarter of the sample may not produce more than one ladder, depending on involvement. The reader may notice that LMs are presented with a rich amount of detail and minimal reduction. The reason for not reducing data to a single word fulfilment of each value level, was to retain potentially rich brand ingredients. Figure 6.2 offers a sample ladder map, the rest residing in Appendices AF through AV).

6.3.2 CSML Local

CSML can be perceived as a valuable novelty product, in that it provides a topic of conversation between customers and local supply-chain members. This interaction between customers and suppliers/producers facilitates the development of local networks of trust, and community membership value built through social interaction (CSML LMs: 10, 11, 12, 15, 19, 20). The focus of discussion would also tend to stimulate consideration of factors affecting meat-quality and various aspects of cuisine, thereby further enhancing food knowledge and awareness amongst participants. Requesting CSML at Booths, Holker or from a butcher, allows the respondent to demonstrate a highly principled approach to the selection of lamb, for those concerned with quality, those demonstrating accomplishment, and those re-living the way their mother used to shop (CSML LMs: 3, 5, 13, 19, 20).
Figure 6.2  Example of a Ladder Map for CSML(1)
One way people experience the place they live, is through networks of local people. The need to buy food can be met with fairly mechanical solutions (such as on-line ordering and home delivery). However, when people make the effort to incorporate interaction with local, independent butcher, or with regular farmers’ market stall-holders, into their life, the rewards are viewed as adding a richness to the quality of life (CSML LMs: 3, 5, 15). Professionals with very busy lives, seek ways of fitting the ‘local food scene’ into their schedules. For them the choice of local-food products may be limited by the extent of their own availability at the time of local events, or in relation to the producer’s location. Some will ‘binge-buy’ when they are able to attend an event, and will then freeze meat at home, for consumption over an extended period. (CSML LMs: 5, 19). In a sense they are buying aspects of a ‘rural-life’ through interaction with producers, or possibly just what they perceive as ‘the best food they can access’ with a professional salary (CSML LMs: 5, 6, 7, 15). People rationalise this approach in relation to their circumstances, their ability to self-reward as desired (CSML LMs: 10, 13).

Sentiments appropriate to the band which correspond to this type of perception may include: Finest range, Cumbria’s Best, Our Farming Community

CSML as all lamb, is seen to fit family requirements, be they the comfort of a traditional roast, or allergy-friendly food. Lamb is also viewed as semi-organic, as it is perceived as extensively farmed, and generally a more ‘natural’ product than pork, beef or poultry. It is a product which can be consumed with peace of mind/ a safe option (CSML LMs: 6, 7, 8, 15).

Regional products such as CSML are seen to provide a focus of this type of interaction indicated in the points above. The points above are not all exclusive to CSML, but to the category of regional meat products.

Direct contact with producer/suppliers, presents the consumers with the opportunity to verify that meat complies with their desired production/husbandry requirements. These may relate to use of antibiotics or miles to market (CSML LMs:.1, 5, 6, 10, 12, 15). The use of the local butcher is seen as ‘the solution’ to meat-based food-miles, and additionally to provide meat of better quality and flavour than the big four supermarkets, thereby contributing to the quality of life of the respondent. Similarly regional food-authorities, such as Booths, Higginson’s, Holker or Farmers Markets are
perceived by some as taking the responsibility of finding excellent food, ‘off the shoulders’ of the consumer, and thereby contributing to feelings of discernment and food security for the family (CSML LMs: 3, 11, 15, 16, 19).

CSML is perceived by some as a product to invest thought into, and the act of doing so, the consideration of grazing, saline environment, specific plants evident on that area, reminds some people of their family’s food heritage (CSML LMs: 1, 2, 6, 10, 11, 14, 15, 17, 18, 19). They remember glimpses of the past, when as a child, they saw older family members devoting time to food production and preservation (CSML LMs: 3, 5). This provoked response to product information contributes towards the respondent’s quality of life.

CSML is ‘seen’ in-situ by locals, they see generic sheep, of no particular breed, with no characteristics which they remember (CSML LMs: 1, 2, 14, 20). However the collective vision of sheep on the marsh is familiar. One respondent recounted an image of sheep on the edge of the marsh being fed a mound of hay/silage which they climbed upon, and were “…..consuming with frozen winter breath”, she observed this scene as she drove to work (CSML HVM: 16). This was remembered as a beautiful vision, which should have been captured on camera. The experience performed the function of confirming the respondent’s pleasure of living in a beautiful place.

6.3.3 CSML Flavour

This attribute would seem to be ‘a given’ in that the link between different diet and uniquely flavoured meat is fairly logical (understood from exposure to corn-fed chicken campaigns). However there are difficulties for some consumers in this relationship, these difficulties are complex and numerous:

Some consumers hold a mixed view of the environment of the marsh. They are able to describe it in either romantic or cynical terms, relating to either beauty or pollution, and they could therefore interpret communications concerning the site of production in either a positive or negative light (CSML LMs: 1, 2). The ability of respondents to hold two contradictory opinions resulted in LMs containing ladders which are incongruent, with each other.

Some consumers have become so de-sensitised to food, that they are shocked by the association between meat and a living animal. To protect themselves from
(presumably) any sense of associated guilt, they seem to impose mental blocks which prevent them from processing information which relates to the live animal, as they do not want to connect it with a food ingredient they use. So the consumer self-censors away from processing information, relating to the live animal. (they remove a rung from their ladder!) This has repercussions for communications, as some people do not want to be reminded of live animals, when they are preparing to purchase/consume meat (CSML LMs: 2, 18). They are able to enjoy the taste without the need to understand the contributing factors, it is the flavour which contributes towards hedonism or fulfilment.

Some consumers possess sensitivities relating to the death of an animal, and develop their own strategies to deal with information, motivated by self-protection values, or by the need for a sensual taste experience without clouding it with technical detail (CSML HVM: 20).

In the absence of a clear, proven and publicised relationship between grazing and meat flavour, some respondents have made their own views up on these, believing the meat to be either more flavoursome resulting from the grazing (CSML LMs: 6, 10, 14, 15, 17). Others believe that the flavour of the meat bears no relation to the grazing used (CSML LMs: 1, 2, 7, 10, 11, 18). However they prefer its local credentials or feel assured by the feed involved/other. Two respondents inferred a ‘sea-weedy’ taste might be present (CSML LMs: 6, 15). Similarly the saline environment is believed by some to affect the texture of the meat in a positive way, to have the effect of tenderising the meat, or to have a positive effect on the flavour (CSML LMs: 6, 11, 14, 15, 17). Whilst other respondents believe the saline environment to have no effect at all on the meat texture/flavour (CSML LMs: 1, 2, 7, 10, 11, 18). Those most convinced of the flavour input from the environment comprised a mix of respondents with/without experience of CSML consumption.

The sheep on the marsh are seen in collective form, but without any striking or remembered features; they are perceived as sheep of no particular breed, which have good flavour, resulting in contentment for the consumer (CSML LMs: 7, 14, 17, 20).

CSML in that it is a ‘new product’ provides the promise of an exciting new culinary experience for some consumers. Further up the ladder this feature relates to self-discovery, fulfilment, a beautiful life, or a simple life, generally factors relating to contentment (CSML LMs: 10, 11, 13, 14, 15, 17). For those whose CSML eating
experience was not thwarted through lack of notable distinction in flavour (CSML LMs: 2, 7, 10).

6.3.4 CSML Organoleptic
There is uncertainty regarding some attributes. The communications which stress the freedom of the marsh grazing-land, tend to imply organic qualities. Some consumers are confused about the status of CSML in this respect (CSML LMs: 1, 5, 8). The concerns linked to this uncertainty affect the ability to plan provisioning efficiently and have repercussions on the respondent’s trust (HVM 5) quality of life (HVM 8) and peace of mind (HVM 1).

There is a value aligned to grazing and health-related aspects of the saline environment, a throwback to the Victorian connotations associated with ‘the sea air’.

The relative cost of CSML against non-branded lamb is seen as disincentive. Particularly for those who have bought it with high expectations of a unique experience, and have been subsequently disappointed with the outcome, this detracts from feelings of fulfilment (CSML LMs: 2, 7, 10). However, for some the high price is not an obstacle, it even confirms the superiority of the novel product, and contributes to values of self-discovery, and associated sensual rewards (CSML LMs: 2, 3, 5, 6, 13, 14, 15, 20).

6.3.5 CSML Time
The seasonal attribute seems very important, it ranges from the traditional springtime connection to the format of cooking used in different seasons. Clearly this factor is not exclusive to CSML but it also applies to CSML. Many respondents feel the need to mark the seasons with different food products, and Booths’ communications, which associate CSML with the summer, reinforces the seasonality of the product. The consumers use food to mark time (and the traditions of consumption in different seasons), to reflect on life, to ‘bench-mark’ these same events in years gone by, and to audit their own current stage in life (CSML LMs: 1, 5, 6, 16, 20).

There are also links to time, in the extensive production method, which implies timelessness, perceived by some as an open ended production schedule (unlikely), and feeding into escapism motivations (CSML LMs: 6, 12).
There are links to time in the CSML’s environment, namely the tides, which have a daily pattern, and have well-known high tides in spring and autumn. The participation of the CSML in the rhythm of nature, is perceived as contributing to a powerful visual landmark, a place of great significance to the identity of those who look out on the Bay daily (CSML LMs: 1, 12, 16, 20).

There is a timeliness related to heritage and the perceived superiority of English lamb, compared to the French product, some regard lamb as an emblem of England (which takes on historical connotations), and therefore contributes to ‘Englishness’. The presence of the CSML on the geographical extremities of the land seems particularly relevant to this view (CSML LMs: 12, 13).

6.3.6 CSML Post-modern

By breaking down the commodity of lamb into distinct sub-products such as HL, and CSML, the selection of meats available for consideration becomes broader, and thereby contributes to the variety requirement in people’s food provisioning, and contributes towards a sense of place and identity (CSML LMs: 1, 7, 8, 12, 14, 16, 19, 20).

By consuming food items perceived as ‘wild’, respondents feel assured that chemicals have not been used liberally as perceived of ‘intensive farming systems’. The same respondents speak of collecting ‘wild food’ such as blackberries, in places they know of, where the fruit is not exposed to traffic pollution. They are in search of ‘really wild-food’. CSML is interesting to them, because it is seen to roam freely on the marshes. Their motivation is linked to self-discovery and escapism, they perceive themselves to be sampling the untamed world that is now so hard to find (CSML LMs: 1, 5, 6, 7, 12, 14).

6.3.7 CSML Community

Some respondents were near or in early-retirement; they felt that they had earned the right to make selections for their own pleasure. They were in a phase of life which is about rewarding themselves for all the effort and achievements and economies which they had made earlier. Some of them have downsized from large family houses to a flat, and are enjoying a third phase of life without so many responsibilities. This renewed enthusiasm for life influences their attitude to food; they have time to attend farmers’ markets, and to get to know community members involved in food production and retail. CSML is identified as a ‘treat’ item, associated with a day out and a visit to a
well-known butcher or place. Expressed in this way CSML is a life-cycle-marking product. This generation is now doing what their mothers were expected to do all their lives, to go out and shop daily, in specialist retailers. They experience the place through social interaction, and identify themselves with the local community, their motivations are fulfilment and achievement of a better quality of life (CSML LMs: 9, 13, 16, 17).

A respondent spoke of an extended period of time as a vegetarian, and reflected upon that as a training ground for examining food products carefully (CSML LMs:15). Such consumers are extra-sensitive to the condition of the meat that they consume. They need to confirm the condition of the meat they consume is acceptable to them, so they value the opportunity to question the producer. Subsequently, through repeat purchases, relationships develop which are based upon a trusted supply route. CSML as a local meat product falls into this category, however, the number of retail outlets for CSML are more limited. CSML is available in Higginson’s butchers at Grange-Over-Sands, some other independent butchers around the south side of Morecambe Bay, Holker food hall, and Booths - places where knowledgeable retailers can be questioned, but producers cannot. This represents a shortcoming in distribution, compared to other regional meats. For some this direct contact with producer is a nostalgic exercise, a throwback to the way food used to be bought when they were children, or when producers themselves brought their goods to market (CSML LMs: 5, 6, 7, 16).

Some consumers openly state that the supermarkets do not provide the social richness present at a farmers’ market, or a specialist retailer’s premises (CSML LMs: 7, 13, 15, 16, 19, 20). The CSML features in a community-based scenario, which exists in a transient form (farmers’ market) or a permanent form (new or established specialist retailers) which offers social interaction through the provisioning process, which is reminiscent of the past.

6.3.8 CSML Credibility

Some respondents perceive CSML to have been endorsed by experts, and have confidence that it is a superior product (CSML LMs: 9, 11, 17). CSML featured on the Open University Production, ‘Coast’, although respondents couldn’t remember if the programme had focussed on Morecambe Bay or another marshland, they were convinced of the product’s special quality. Similarly, one respondent had sought out CSML because they were following a recipe demonstrated on TV, by chef Nigella
Lawson, who had commented on her preference for CSML. These scenarios are unusual in that they represent the experience of ‘local’ interpreted by different sources and delivered via a ‘national’ medium. It gives the impression that local people prefer to turn on their TV, rather than open the door and experience the place. From some perspectives this can be understood, in that respondents were older, at the time of life when they do less driving or hiking around the coastal zone, and find TV watching more accessible. But this was not true for all. CSML is perhaps ‘too wild’ for these consumers, their concerns are comfort, simplicity and minimal adventure.

6.3.9 CSML Environment

The environment of Morecambe Bay is clearly perceived as having multi-faceted qualities, some of which are negative and some of which are positive. There is the romantic view of the Bay, the artist’s perspective looking at fells, and beach and sea, with wildlife. It was described as a ‘powerful image’ which is in contrast with the ‘subtle and delicate’ flavour differential of the CSML product (CSML LMs: 1, 2, 6, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17, 18, 20). Some attributes of place are associated with the product, the sense of freedom, of the open expanse of the Bay, which feed-into escapism values.

The Bay is not seen at untouched by man, unlike the Lakeland fells. The Bay exhibits geometric drainage channels, the viaduct which carries the railway from Ulverston to Arnside, and the pollution which is perceived to come from land in the form of sewage outflows, and litter dropped around the beaches, and from the sea with rubbish washed onto the shore. One respondent was very aware of the historical developments associated with the Bay, and their influences on contemporary life. This knowledge enhanced the respondent’s visual appreciation of the place, including watching sheep grazing on the growing marshland.

The interesting revelation is that people can push themselves in both directions (positive and negative) about the Bay. They acknowledge the romantic view, but can also describe the Bay in negative terms, which may be based on supposition rather than truth.

One respondent perceived the West coast to be detached from ‘Lakeland’ and not relevant to their ‘Lakeland life’. This person was clearly aware of the limits to ‘local’ in their minds, and could delineate clearly a boundary around their local food choices.
(CSML LM 8). This links in to personal-geographies, and to people’s identity with place.

People know that the sheep graze on the marsh grass, but they do not have an insight into the peculiar husbandry requirements which go along with this particular environment. Some respondents claim no relationship between environment/grazing and taste, others admit that the link had to be explained to them, despite having seen sheep grazing at different points around the Bay. Very few respondents (CSML LMs: 12, 14) had any knowledge of the French CSML delicacy. For some the taste of the meat is important, they do not want complication in order to achieve contentment or pleasure.

There is an obstacle that prevents some people from associating the environment of production and the final meat product that is the association between animate sheep and inanimate meat (CSML LMs: 2, 15, 18). People defend themselves from being implicated in the slaughter of animals, through purchase of meat, by self-censorship in relation to information on the live animal. This defence mechanism seems to restrict their level of enquiry and hence level of product understanding. This self-imposed process is in the interest of the respondent’s peace of mind and contentment.

6.3.10 CSML Social
The social situation of going out for a meal provides some respondents with the opportunity to select CSML, based on family events or health benefits (CSML LMs: 6, 13).

6.3.11 CSML Commercialisation
For some it seems communications are ‘over-selling’ the product’s distinctive flavour. Some respondents who have eaten CSML express dissonance when comparing taste and price differentials; they also express disdain at the assumed Holker-related mark-up in price (CSML LMs: 2, 7, 9, 10).

One respondent translated the Holker connection as quality, and found it complemented their rural lifestyle, resulting in simple pleasures and contributing to a higher quality of life (CSML LM:3)
6.3.12 CSML HMV Summary

The points above show how consumers and non-consumers link the attributes of the product to their own values. Moving from a summary of individuals to a frequency-based summary implication matrix for CSML and HVM (following Reynolds and Gutman, 1988). Appendices AW through AY show the coding, summary implication matrix and HVM for the most common linkages across individual LMs. CSML is seen as one of a number of local foods and adding to the variety of local food selection, particularly where provisioning is restricted to local butchers. The networking with suppliers or retailers results in community benefits which contribute to the quality of life benefits. The flavour of CSML is seen as a positively reflecting on the environment of production and associated grazing. Respondents enjoy the flavour because their cognitions of enjoyment are justified in their constructs of place and its influence on the quality of the meat. Such enjoyment is linked to rewarding the self with a treat of quality food, and contributing to quality of life. The next chain is one with its origin in the CSML attribute of landscape, this is linked to memories of watching the sheep graze the salt marsh, the vision of the animal in its environment is linked to a sense of accomplishment, which contributes to feelings of inner harmony or self-esteem. There is also negative association given from consideration of the association between food and this particular landscape, these thoughts are linked to reflection on nature, and the impact of their decisions relative to the ecosystem. Interestingly some respondents revealed both the positive and the negative view in relation to CSML the landscape. The attribute landscape also links to recall of experiences of seeing the sheep grazing the salt marshes, this is a place consumption experience, which reinforces the ties which they have with the place.
6.4 Comparison of HL and CSML results

The following section considers how HL and CSML respondents’ conceptualisation of place differed, between the two lambs in question. It draws on tables collated around place-related attribute codes for HL and CSML.

6.4.1 The respective codes for HL and CSML

To compare perceptions relating to the two lambs Table 6.3 presents a sequence of place–related codes which are common to both lambs, followed by some which are distinct. The corresponding ladders to these codes which appear in HVMs have been collated in Tables 6.3-6.16.

6.4.2 The ‘local’ construct for HL and CSML

Table 6.3 HL Place Attribute 1, Local

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Contribute to local community</td>
<td>Socially responsible</td>
<td>Individualism</td>
<td>Social recognition</td>
<td>Inner harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Guilt-free food miles</td>
<td></td>
<td>Community role</td>
<td></td>
<td>Social recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Personal knowledge of provenance</td>
<td>Participation in an alternative system</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beyond price comparison</td>
<td></td>
<td>Individualism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eradicate doubts by asking and buying direct</td>
<td>Learned behaviour from Mum</td>
<td>Ambitious</td>
<td></td>
<td>Self-satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Social recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Role in social functions with visitors</td>
<td>Social enjoyment</td>
<td>Identity embedded in local society</td>
<td></td>
<td>Pleasure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Social recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Guilt-free consumption</td>
<td>Ethical and sensory satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Inner harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Low food-miles</td>
<td>Relationship with supplier</td>
<td>Exciting life</td>
<td></td>
<td>Social rewards</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

163
Table 6.4  CSML Place Attribute 1, Local

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Concern for animal husbandry</td>
<td>Questions retailers</td>
<td>Desire for conscience-free food</td>
<td>Critical</td>
<td>Principled</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aversion to mainstream supermarkets</td>
<td>Aware of CSML in France</td>
<td>Culturally aware Leisure activities</td>
<td>Comfortable life</td>
<td>Self-reward Local identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sheep-spotting from the prom at Grange-Over-Sands</td>
<td>Able to be discerning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trusted source</td>
<td>Generic lamb</td>
<td>Limited concern for production details</td>
<td>Defer the responsibility to others</td>
<td>Food Security</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Fell Bred’</td>
<td>Worry about use of antibiotics</td>
<td>Sheep have a natural life</td>
<td>Past experience of grandparents producing and preserving food</td>
<td>Quality of life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Concern about food miles</td>
<td>Attempts to recreate the past</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Concern about loss of food seasonality</td>
<td>Personal food heritage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional roast lamb</td>
<td>Meets family requirements</td>
<td>Central family focus</td>
<td></td>
<td>Family contentment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dislike of semi-processed meat in one local butcher’s shop</td>
<td>Arnside butcher’s has a negative ambiance</td>
<td>Suspicious of food provided by others</td>
<td>Logical contradictions</td>
<td>Food security Local identity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wouldn’t question the butcher</td>
<td>Price less important than food miles</td>
<td>Pinwheels from Sizergh barn</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local so transported less</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sizergh Barn or Mansergh Hall</td>
<td>Quality and flavour</td>
<td>Sense of place</td>
<td></td>
<td>Local identity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Variety of local lamb is good</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialist</td>
<td>Ideal for daily</td>
<td>Personal verification of</td>
<td>Experience of</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fit personal requirements</td>
<td>Limited sourcing options</td>
<td>Forced repetition in provisioning</td>
<td>Food options defined by my lifestyle</td>
<td>Peace of mind</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Careful production</td>
<td>Daily selection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mum always used the local butcher</td>
<td>Better quality and flavour</td>
<td>Cook for one, small quantity, best quality</td>
<td>Professional Earned the right to choose</td>
<td>Maturity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question and banter</td>
<td>Loyalty scheme</td>
<td>Local community network</td>
<td>‘Feed off’ others</td>
<td>Social status</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

 Whilst both sets of respondents presented attributes which were coded as ‘local’ (Tables 6.3 and 6.4). It is now relevant to consider the composition of this construct, and the instrumental and terminal values to which it is linked in each case. For both lambs there is a product verification function of ‘local’, exemplified by direct contact with the producer, where queries about diet, husbandry, or other can be made. These concerns may link to memories of mothers’ conversations with the butcher, about quality or more contemporary ethical concerns in line with a drive to act in line with their principles or to achieve a sense of self-satisfaction. Both cases consider the environmental issue of food miles as being reduced by their decision to purchase local lamb, this benefit offsetting any increased price paid for the product and enabling the buyer to act socially responsibly, achieve inner harmony, and to satisfy the need to trust in the supply chain. Both cases share a community aspect to ‘local’, benefitting from interaction with other local people whilst at the same time contributing to the local economy, allowing respondents to achieve a level of social status and local identity based in local social recognition. Both lambs are seen as appropriate as a central focus for a meal with family or visitors, reinforcing local identity and supporting family contentment and enjoyment. In both cases respondents expressed personal knowledge of the ‘local’ production environment; they enjoyed participation in an alternative food system as part of self-reward or to achieve inner-harmony. In summary for both lambs ‘local’ means to feel part of the community, to enjoy a connection with the farming sector, to vote
with their expenditure to achieve ethical values and to consume lamb as a food in which they trust, which they have seen raised in the local landscape.

### 6.4.3 The ‘environment’ construct for HL and CSML

**Table 6.5  HL Place attribute 3, Meat/Environment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Meat/Environment link</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expected straight from the fell</td>
<td>Eradicate doubts by asking, and buying direct.</td>
<td>High expectations from self and others</td>
<td>Ambitious</td>
<td></td>
<td>Self-satisfaction, Social recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product of a healthy environment</td>
<td>Distinctive flavour reflection of the diet</td>
<td>Meals enjoyed by family and friends</td>
<td>Providing for the family</td>
<td></td>
<td>Family security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dense meat compared to flabby lowland lamb</td>
<td>Sweet-gamey taste</td>
<td>Independent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Wisdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lean in winter fat in summer</td>
<td>Reflects condition on the fells</td>
<td>Identify with place</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Inner harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longer fibres</td>
<td>Enjoyment of the taste/texture</td>
<td>Family contentment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Happiness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unstressed tender meat</td>
<td>Guilt-free consumption</td>
<td>Ethical and sensory satisfaction, Responsible purchase</td>
<td>Independent</td>
<td></td>
<td>Inner harmony, Sense of accomplishment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reward good practice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

166
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>Product of a beautiful place</td>
<td>Area of historical significance. Defining moment – lambs on the hay with winter-breath.</td>
<td>Spices from Egypt and India. Visual appreciation of place TV and real experience</td>
<td>Historical influence on contemporary life Taste the quality relate to the samphire and grass mix Busy mind</td>
<td>Transience Hedonism Active life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product of a wild place</td>
<td>Product of a lovely environment</td>
<td>Quality of English lamb over the French</td>
<td>Emblem of England</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product of a salty environment</td>
<td>Tender meat No recognised effect on product</td>
<td>High, unique flavour expectations Good flavour Meat and animal separate concepts</td>
<td>New experiences Where I see myself Uncomplicated food requirements for contentment Self censorship on food information</td>
<td>Inner harmony A Comfortable life Peace of mind</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Produced in an area of historical significance</td>
<td>Spices from Egypt and India Perspective on history of place</td>
<td>Life in our time</td>
<td>Transience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not a typical Lakeland environment</td>
<td>West coast detached from the Lakes Not relevant to my Lakeland life</td>
<td>Where I see myself</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nt</td>
<td>Powerful landmark</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inlets fill up and empty</td>
<td>Patchwork of frozen pockets</td>
<td>Rhythm of nature</td>
<td>Nature</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Artists Fiona Clucas and Paul Clarke</td>
<td>Powerful place landmark</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A world of beauty</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shares environment with rabbits, oystercatchers, lapwings, wading ducks, wild ducks, and geese.</td>
<td>The sands, dangerous place</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheep-spotting at Grange-Over-Sands Silverdale</td>
<td>Leisure Activities</td>
<td>Achievement</td>
<td>Self-reward</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Slow to connect grazing site to flavour influence</td>
<td>CSML expected to be moist</td>
<td>Overt member of the community</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>USP rivalry between retailers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Local business competition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment appreciated by older people</td>
<td>Lamb expected to be rich in flavour</td>
<td>Local and fresher, less packaging</td>
<td>Busy life</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Source via butcher.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A sense of accomplishment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product of a dangerous environment</td>
<td>Rich flavour but not so different from other lamb</td>
<td>Food matters</td>
<td>Fulfilment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Inner harmony</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product of a polluted place with rats</td>
<td>Disgust at production environment</td>
<td>Distancing association though negative experience</td>
<td>Real critical evaluation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pollution effects? Is CSML organic?</td>
<td>Avoid processed food. Grandparents produced and preserved food</td>
<td>Personal food heritage reference</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quality of life</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

168
The environment theme was responded to in different ways from each cohort and this may have resulted from the theme being introduced differently by the interviewer/writer (Tables 6.5 and 6.6). The meat/environment link is evident in the attributes of the HL, whilst impressions of the place of production are more evident in the CSML responses.

The environment of the salt marsh is viewed positively as ‘wild’ ‘beautiful’ ‘product of a salty environment’ ‘shares the environment with rabbits, oyster catchers, lapwings, wading ducks, wild ducks and geese’ there are ‘patterns of man-made geometric channels’. The environment is recognised as dangerous, and for some a dirty and polluted place. It is not an environment free of human shaping.

**Table 6.7** HL Place Attribute 6 Breed Personality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute:Breed personality</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Fairly free-range meat      | Flavour a reflection of wild and semi-wild grass diet  | Enjoyment of eating Participation in an alternative system  | Desire for quality food Individualism Community role Environmental harmony  | Family well-being  | Family security  
Inner harmony  
Social recognition  
A world of beauty |
| HL Breed personality attributes of Herdwick Lamb Wild | No barriers  | Natural diet  | Natural process  | Part of landscape  | World beauty |
| Hardy and tough sheep       | Warming winter food  | Comfort  | At peace  |  | Inner harmony |
| Pretty sheep                | Visual satisfaction  | Ethical and sensory satisfaction  |  |  | Inner harmony |
| HL are the dark sheep       | Distinctive flavour reflection of diet  | Meals enjoyed by family and friends  | Providing for the family  |  | Family security |
Herdwick is ‘expected straight from the fell’, it is a ‘product of a healthy environment’, it is free-range and perceived to wander at will (Table 6.5). It is the antithesis of factory farming. The quality of HL is perceived to change with the seasons and conditions on the fells.

Herdwick lamb is expected to be ‘dense meat’ compared to ‘flabby lowland lamb’, to be ‘lean in winter and fat in summer’ another recognises ‘longer fibres in the herdwick lamb’ or a ‘sweet gamey taste’ or ‘distinctive flavour reflecting the diet’. HL is recognised as ‘unstressed tender meat’. Some of the sensory attributes (Table 6.13) such as ‘earthy flavour’ link to a visual understanding of the type of earth which has resulted in that flavour, and the cognitions achieved through local producer connections. Experiential knowledge of the place is inferred to HL where it’s ability to offer ‘winter warmth’ is achieved by its ability to stay up on the fells during winter (Table 6.7).

Unlike the CSML, HL are seen as distinct ‘type’ of sheep. They are variously described as ‘pretty sheep’ or ‘dark sheep’, ‘wild’, ‘hardy and tough’ they are said to provide ‘visual satisfaction’ as part of the Lakeland landscape (Table 6.7).

The ‘salty environment’ is linked with ‘good flavour’, the rewards of the environment and the freedom with which the stock roam on the marsh is recognised in the taste. Some expect the CSML to be ‘moist’ others expect a more distinctive flavour reflection of the environment than they actually find. Thoughts about the environment were linked to values relating to a world of beauty, escapism, transience, social status, inner-harmony, contentment, a comfortable life and identity. The specific husbandry requirements of grazing sheep on the marsh do not appear in respondents ‘considerations’.

The ethical and sensory satisfaction achieved from ‘responsible’ purchases of HL result in independence, a sense of accomplishment and inner harmony. The flavours of the meat are identified with the place and contribute to wisdom and inner harmony values. The enjoyment of the taste/texture of HL leads to family contentment and happiness, or satisfies the need to provide for the family and contribute towards family security. The relationships achieved by getting to know providers allow for new experiences and achievements which are important to those who are ambitious and strive for social recognition and self-satisfaction.
### 6.4.4 The ‘distribution’ construct for HL & the Community construct for CSML

#### Table 6.8 HL Place attribute 4, Local Distribution Network

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local Distribution Network</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bought from friends</td>
<td>Provisioning in the local community</td>
<td></td>
<td>Local identity</td>
<td>conservative</td>
<td>Social recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buy from producer</td>
<td>Participate in a provisioning system used by our ‘culinary expert’ friends</td>
<td>Experience the place of production</td>
<td>Shared identity</td>
<td>An exciting life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farm raised and butchered</td>
<td>Confidence in food quality</td>
<td>Experience the place of production</td>
<td>Improved knowledge of meat</td>
<td>Good provider</td>
<td>Comfortable life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmers’ market efficiency</td>
<td>Developing knowledge of meat</td>
<td>Relationship with supplier</td>
<td>Quality requirements satisfied</td>
<td>Conduit to supply family and friends</td>
<td>A comfortable life, Self-respect, Social recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customised order</td>
<td>Respect for producer</td>
<td>Responsible purchase</td>
<td>Independent</td>
<td>Sense of accomplishment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Table 6.9 CSML Place attribute 3, Community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community</td>
<td>Booths Communications</td>
<td>Slow cook hot pot</td>
<td>Earthy home</td>
<td>Simple pleasures</td>
<td>Part of the ecosystem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Aversion to mainstream supermarkets</td>
<td>Cultural awareness</td>
<td>Achievement</td>
<td>A sense of accomplishment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Aware of CSML in France</td>
<td>Leisure activity</td>
<td>Self-reward</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Respondents speaking about HL explained their entry route into another ‘way of life’ and another set of relationships with farmers (Table 6.7). The new relationships offered

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-related to HL</th>
<th>Related to food quality</th>
<th>Related to community</th>
<th>Related to quality of life</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Higginson’s for a treat</td>
<td>Local guarantee</td>
<td>Higher quality</td>
<td>Importance of food quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mansergh Hall Sizergh Barn</td>
<td>Variety of local is good</td>
<td>Quality and flavour</td>
<td>Sense of place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmers’ market</td>
<td>Contact with producer</td>
<td>Avoid stressed meat</td>
<td>Nostalgia Critical evaluation of food</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frequent provisioning options</td>
<td>Avoid antibiotics</td>
<td>Experience of place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>See what I buy, buy bulk and freeze</td>
<td>Personal verification of quality</td>
<td>Some self-censorship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Outraged at animals in transport, vague supply routes to market.</td>
<td>Peace of mind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banter with producer/butcher</td>
<td>Like mother shopped</td>
<td>Better quality &amp; flavour</td>
<td>Earned the right to select the best</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trusted source</td>
<td>Limited concern for production details</td>
<td>Defer responsibility to others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Like mother shopped</td>
<td>Nan liked shoulder best, need fat for cooking (CSML lean claims) I like it pink.</td>
<td>Independent minded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust from contact with producer</td>
<td>Traditional lamb roast</td>
<td>Meets family requirements</td>
<td>Family focus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Family contentment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

at Grange-Over-Sands. Able to be discerning

Importance of food quality

Quality of life

Higher quality Support local community Extra expenditure worthwhile

Identity

Nostalgia

Simple pleasures

Self-discovery

Identity

Peace of mind

Better quality & flavour

Earned the right to select the best

A better life

Food Security

Self-respect

Self-discovery
a new and exciting dimension to life, the experience of the place of production – the farm, led to new knowledge of meat and its relationship to the land, an appreciation of the quality characteristics of HL and new local relationships. These afforded social recognition with a wider community and reinforced local identity. The quality aspects of the HL led to feelings of satisfaction, which contributes to self-respect and a comfortable life.

Some CSML respondents valued the community aspect of sourcing food relative to feelings of nostalgia relative to the way parents shopped. Some reflected on visits to specific retail outlets which comprise part of a leisure experience which also facilitated their exercising of discriminatory selection and local preference. These elements contributed to identity construction/confirmation and quality of life confirmation.

6.4.5 The ‘commercialisation’ construct for CSML

Table 6.10 CSML Place attribute 5, Commercialisation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commercialisation</td>
<td>Holker Brand - high cost</td>
<td>Advertised therefore good</td>
<td>Cost addition</td>
<td>Trust TV influence and experience</td>
<td>Busy mind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sets high expectations of unique flavour</td>
<td>High expectations</td>
<td>Costs more</td>
<td>Cost addition and Financial limitations</td>
<td>Willing to try</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cashing in on the environment</td>
<td>Expectations of something a bit special</td>
<td>Disappointed that the flavour wasn’t superior</td>
<td>Expectations of something a bit special</td>
<td>Compulsion to disassociate animal with meat</td>
<td>Self-protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prohibitively expensive</td>
<td>Cooking style would mask the subtle flavour</td>
<td>Traditional lamb roast</td>
<td>Cooking style would mask the subtle flavour</td>
<td>Meets family requirements</td>
<td>Central family focus</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Holker Hall link to CSML is seen variably as a sign of quality, or an entity (Holker) not expected to expose itself as a commercial organisation, or seen as an organisation with prohibitively expensive pricing (Table 6.10). Some respondents are supportive of the nobility and see this link as enhancing trust in a provider of high quality food products. These expectations can be set at a high level, coupled with claims of distinctive flavour and high prices. Some respondents found the experience of CSML did not live up to their expectations. Some find that the brand and the place of production permit participation in a local process, which helps them feel part of the local ecosystem.

### 6.55 The ‘heritage’ construct for HL and ‘credibility’ construct for CSML

#### Table 6.11 HL Place attribute 5, Heritage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Heritage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone of production linked to Potter and Wainwright</td>
<td>Distinctive flavour reflection of diet</td>
<td>Meals enjoyed by family and friends</td>
<td>Providing for the family</td>
<td></td>
<td>Family security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leisure association</td>
<td>Low food miles, high nutritive value</td>
<td>Relationship with supplier</td>
<td>Exciting life</td>
<td>Social harmony</td>
<td>Social rewards</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The characters which respondents linked to the place of production included Beatrix Potter and Alfred Wainwright, they also thought about leisure pursuits undertaken on the fells (Table 6.11). The grazing of HL was recognised as distinctive and contributing to meat flavour, whilst the proximity of production offered benefits of low food-miles and the perception of ‘high nutritive value’. The distinctive flavour of the HL was recognised as providing successful meal occasions, which contributed to the need to provide for the family and contribute towards the achievement of family security.
Table 6.12  CSML Place attribute 7, Credibility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Credibility</td>
<td>TV chef/other references seen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Uncomplicated food requirements Contentment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recognised from TV ‘Coast’</td>
<td>Product of a lovely but dangerous environment</td>
<td>Posesses credible value Good flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td>A comfortable life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TV ‘Coast’ programme link</td>
<td>Justification of quality</td>
<td>TV influence and experience</td>
<td></td>
<td>Busy mind Active</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ingredient for recipe (Nigella)</td>
<td>High expectations Unique flavour expectation</td>
<td>Willing to try</td>
<td></td>
<td>Minimal adventure Inner harmony</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Immediately evident is the limited number of personalities cited in relation to the landscape (Heaney). Heritage was only a feature in relation to CSML with one respondent who knew the history of Arnside as a busy port. More apparent with the case of CSML was the endorsement of the product values in TV programme Coast and recommendation in a Nigella Lawson recipe demonstrated on TV.

6.4.7 The ‘time’ construct for CSML

Table 6.13  CSML Place attribute 4, Time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Shoulder on the barbecue in the summer Stew/roast in the winter</td>
<td>Adaptable to the seasons</td>
<td>Requires minimal effort</td>
<td></td>
<td>My survival</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Special in the Spring Part of the Easter celebration No price evaluation – it’s what I want</td>
<td>Frustration with mono-producer/retailers re-provisioning</td>
<td>Logistics of supply No time to value personal contact</td>
<td></td>
<td>Quality of life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Free range Wild</td>
<td>Product of a lovely environment Quality of English ‘lamb’ over French</td>
<td>Emblem of England Central family focus</td>
<td></td>
<td>Family contentment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Time appears as a multifaceted construct in relation to CSML (Table 6.13). One respondent related her busy life to the seasons, and low-effort cooking styles for CSML which linked to her ultimate aim – her survival. Another respondent saw CSML as special in the spring time, as part of the Easter celebration. She saw CSML as contributing to the quality of her life, but found intermittent supply events such as farmers ‘markets difficult to fit with her busy schedule. The insight that sheep are brought onto the marsh after the spring and autumn tides offers another dimension to time, this respondent identified the rhythm of nature evident in this powerful landmark. Another respondent identified the season as important, as she marked the passing of time with food selection appropriate to the season, she gained comfort from such tradition, reflecting on the passage of time related to her self-awareness of the passing years of her life. There is a sense of freedom from the constraints of time by a respondent who views the grazing CSML as ‘wild’. Time is a strong element tied to consideration of CSML it is less a feature for HL where respondents simply note the difference in the amount of fat on the meat, between the summer and winter.

6.4.8 The constructs of ‘sensory’ for HL, ‘flavour’ and ‘organoleptic’ for CSML
The decision to code organoleptic qualities as ‘sensory’ for HL and ‘flavour’ separately to ‘organoleptic’ for CSML resulted from some respondents’ dissatisfaction with the flavour attribute (Tables 6.14 and 6.15). HL performs very well in terms of respondent recognition of a distinctive flavour variously described as: good taste, delicious taste, excellent flavour and texture, darker meat, earthy flavour, strong flavour, far tastier, distinctive meat of the right colour. Colour, flavour and texture are detailed. These qualities are linked to the wild diet (noted plant names only heather), and knowledge of the provenance of the HL. Linked consequences of the flavour attributes of HL are psychological satisfaction such as winter warmth, more pragmatic satisfied meal occasions, novelty in food exploration and participation in an alternative system. This appreciated food item contributes to various end states, such as self-esteem, inner-harmony, wisdom, family security, a world of beauty, social recognition, a sense of accomplishment, happiness.
## Table 6.14  HL Place Attributes 7 Sensory

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute Sensory</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Good taste Fresh</td>
<td>Low food-miles</td>
<td>Relationship with supplier</td>
<td>Exciting life</td>
<td>Social harmony</td>
<td>Social rewards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High nutritive value</td>
<td>Winter warmth</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Family security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delicious taste</td>
<td>Warming winter food</td>
<td>Comfort</td>
<td>Real experience of food</td>
<td>Integrity</td>
<td>Inner harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>At peace</td>
<td></td>
<td>Wisdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excellent flavour</td>
<td>Flavour areflection of wild and semi-wild grass diet</td>
<td>Enjoyment of eating Participation in an alternative system</td>
<td>Desire for quality food</td>
<td>Individualism</td>
<td>Family security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and texture</td>
<td>Fresh</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Community role</td>
<td>Inner harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Personal knowledge of provenance</td>
<td>Supports the ecological balance</td>
<td>Environmental harmony</td>
<td>Social recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Beyond price comparison</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A world of beauty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Darker meat</td>
<td>Food reference points confirmation of quality</td>
<td>Successful meals</td>
<td>Meet high expectations from self and others</td>
<td>Ambitious</td>
<td>Self-satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Social recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earthly flavour</td>
<td>Enjoyment of food</td>
<td>Social enjoyment of food</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pleasure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strong flavour</td>
<td>Excellent texture</td>
<td>Dinner party focus</td>
<td>Capable</td>
<td></td>
<td>Self respect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A sense of accomplishment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Far tastier</td>
<td>Enjoyment</td>
<td>Novelty food exploration</td>
<td>New frontiers Improved knowledge of meat</td>
<td>Provider</td>
<td>Comfortable life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Personal growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distinctive earthy flavour Meat of the right colour</td>
<td>Enjoyment of the taste/texture Visual satisfaction</td>
<td>Family contentment Sensory satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Happiness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Inner harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attribute</td>
<td>Consequences Level 1</td>
<td>Consequences Level 2</td>
<td>Consequences Level 3</td>
<td>Consequences Level 4</td>
<td>Values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flavour</td>
<td>Slow to connect grazing site and flavour</td>
<td>Butchers seeking a competitive edge</td>
<td>Competition between local businesses</td>
<td>Local community network</td>
<td>Social status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>‘Feed-off” others</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Used to buy pickled samphire</td>
<td>Turf and clover</td>
<td>Anonymous sheep</td>
<td>Food is not technical</td>
<td>Enjoyment without the detail</td>
<td>Sensual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Different forage Salty environment</td>
<td>No recognised effect on the meat</td>
<td>Meat and animal separate concepts</td>
<td>Myopic view of supply chain</td>
<td>Simple life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flavour enhanced by the special grazing</td>
<td>Salty</td>
<td>No breed awareness</td>
<td>Glimpse of the Bay</td>
<td>Beautiful life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grazes on samphire, thrift, wild chervil and thyme</td>
<td>Better flavour</td>
<td>Romantic view salt gives a nicer taste</td>
<td>Critical view</td>
<td>Rational</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seaweedly-taste</td>
<td>Saltier</td>
<td>Like to try</td>
<td>Relish new experience</td>
<td>Self discovery</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salty environment Grazing on an unusual selection of plants</td>
<td>Healthy non-specific breed of sheep</td>
<td>Good flavour</td>
<td>Uncomplicated food requirements</td>
<td>Contentment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salty environment</td>
<td>Tender meat</td>
<td>High expectations</td>
<td>Willing to try</td>
<td>Minimal adventure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural salt content</td>
<td>Excellent flavour (we don’t add salt when cooking)</td>
<td>Taste is everything</td>
<td></td>
<td>Hedonism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Different grazing</td>
<td>Cashing in on the environment</td>
<td>Dissonance on flavour</td>
<td>Self-censorship of pre-meat queues</td>
<td>Self protection</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

178
disassociate animal/meat

Horrible grass, rat infested zone, sewage outfall

Experience

Dissatisfied with flavour

Irish lamb preferred

Taste of lamb from Kildare (home)

Family farmed, killed and matured

Produced and killed on the farm

DIY approach to meat

Food security

Fed on good quality grass

Rich flavour not so different from other lamb

Food is important

Fulfilment

Fed on good
quality grass

Rich flavour not
so different from
other lamb

Food is
important

Fulfilment

CSML, respondents recognise the different grazing available on the marsh, the salt-tolerant plants such as samphire, thrift, wild chervil and thyme. Some recognise a distinctive flavour and some do not. There is no breed to recognise here, some respondents appear positively conditioned about the place and the environmental conditions. Resultantly their beliefs left them inclined to accept the unique qualities of the product, and unwilling to be cynical of it. Other respondents could not countenance the thought of animal/meat and so could not consider the pre-meat state or any of its influences. Others recognised only a slight flavour difference from other lamb.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organoleptic</td>
<td>Meat lighter in colour</td>
<td>Rich flavour but not so different from other lamb</td>
<td>Food matters</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fulfilment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moist</td>
<td>‘Seaweed-y-taste’</td>
<td>Like to try</td>
<td>Relish new experience</td>
<td></td>
<td>Self discovery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual appearance of food</td>
<td>Priority over organic</td>
<td>Daily selection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Healthy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Darker colour
Used to buy pickled samphire
Turf and clover
Anonymous sheep

Unaware of breeds
Food is not technical
Enjoyment without full examination
Sensual

6.4.9 The ‘husbandry’ construct for HL and ‘credibility’ construct for CSML

Table 6.17 HL place attribute 8 Husbandry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Consequences Level 1</th>
<th>Consequences Level 2</th>
<th>Consequences Level 3</th>
<th>Consequences Level 4</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Husbandry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sense of accomplishment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product of trusted husbandry</td>
<td>Reward good practice</td>
<td>Responsible purchase</td>
<td>Independent</td>
<td></td>
<td>Pleasure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good animal husbandry</td>
<td>Tastes good</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CSML respondents reported less direct contact with producers than those of HL (Table 6.10). Customers are less likely to be escorted to the zone of production by CSML farmers than HL farmers, given the physical dangers associated with it. CSML was afforded credibility by responses which included memories of TV shows which gave it a positive review. These afforded second-hand views of the animal in the environment (Coast) or celebrity endorsement of the quality of the food ingredient (Nigella Lawson). There is less direct knowledge of husbandry details relating to CSML.

HL on the other hand is made credible by established and experiential knowledge of the husbandry and daily life of the animal (Table 6.8 & 6.17).

6.5 Summary

The attributes highlighted in the results presented above link to a range of values most of which can be categorised into three broad groups: Those which relate to the inner self (self-discovery, self-satisfaction, self-respect, self-reward, inner-harmony, a sense of accomplishment, personal growth, wisdom, maturity, fulfilment, nostalgia). They express values which relate to their social selves, and their identity in the local community (social-recognition, social rewards, family security/contentment, trust). They also express values which relate to their lamb-linked cognitions/discourses of the
local landscape (experience of place, identity, beautiful life, sensual, hedonism, a part of the ecosystem, a world of beauty, healthy, where I see myself). The dimensions of place which respondents reflected upon, in relation to the case lambs are internal, community and landscape. These themes will be analysed further in the following discussion chapter.
Chapter 7 Discussion

7.1 Introduction
This chapter begins with the acknowledgement that various demands must be met within it: firstly there is a need to discuss findings relative to the objectives of this thesis and the literature review. Section 7.2 respondents’ perceptions and values relating to regional lamb and place will be discussed, incorporating consumer characterisations of HL and CSML in their production environments. This discussion will follow the structure of the literature strands discussed earlier namely: perceptions of the landscape incorporating the embedded lamb, perceptions of the landscape and experience of place through community.

Secondly there are expectations of certain type of data outputs from the MEC analysis process. Section 7.3 implications of the hierarchy of benefits identified by respondents through the MEC analysis, is considered with reference to existing brand development ideas.

Thirdly there are the demands faced by the input requirements of the branding process. In response to these requirements Section 7.4 outlines the transition from value chains using various models to facilitate brand development for embedded meats is discussed.

7.2 Perceptions and values relating to regional lamb
Discussions with respondents about HL and CSML revealed that the product offers a focus for their consideration of the place that they live in, in three dimensions. These comprise firstly their direct perceptions and relationship with the landscape occupied by the HL and CSML. Secondly, their own internal value links in relation to the place they live. Thirdly, their values which relate community to the place they live. It is possible this ‘consumer centred’ tripartite may develop into the socio-psychological construct which is the brand. (For contrasting perspectives see Ilberry and Kneafsey, (1999) and Murdoch et al., (2000) who link ecology, quality and locality as characteristics of embedded foods). These streams will now be discussed (Table 7.1).
Table 7.1 Matrix of Dominant Chains and Both Lamb Cases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dominant MEC summaries</th>
<th>HL</th>
<th>CSML</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Landscape” - My perception of the landscape and terrior factors including the embedded product</td>
<td>HL are free ranging, consuming high quality food resulting in distinct lamb with good flavour and texture. Recognisable breed with sturdy legs and character, visible on the Lakeland fells and valleys.</td>
<td>CSML are wild nondescript sheep, consuming salt tolerant plants. Resulting in meat with a subtly-unique flavour. Living in a beautiful and healthy environment (some dissenters) replete with dangers. Visible on the salt marsh at Grange-Over-Sands/Silverdale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Place identity” What the place can do for me</td>
<td>Self esteem (Mix) Social recognition (Extrinsic/self-enhancing) Inner harmony (Intrinsic/self-transcendent) Hedonism (Mix)</td>
<td>Self-esteem (Mix) Place identity (Intrinsic/self-transcendent) Inner harmony (Intrinsic/self-transcendent) Part of the ecosystem (Intrinsic/self-transcendent) Quality of life (Extrinsic/self-enhancing)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Whilst the attributes define the means by which a respondent will discriminate between alternatives, the higher level values will reveal the significant personal achievements important to that individual. These values represent respondent life-aims, to which the case product has relevance (Wansink, 2003). Broadly brand design should mirror the attributes and values revealed by respondents to achieve resonance with them. The attributes highlighted in the results (Chapter 6) link to a range of terminal values most of which can be categorised into three broad groups these are discussed in the following sub-sections incorporating relevant literature.

7.2.1 Perceptions of place (incorporating embedded lamb)

The first group of values reveal lamb-linked cognitions and affections of the local landscape (place identity, inner harmony). Respondent perceptions of the product in this landscape incorporate ideas relating to ‘wild’, ‘free range’ and ‘high-quality natural
The products are seen as in ecological balance with the environment (CSML not completely). The landscape also permits the HL to demonstrate its sturdiness by withstanding the harsh winter conditions on the fells. Similarly the environment of the salt marsh is thought to be wild and harsh, and survival here on the boundary is admired. However, there is no ‘breed character’ to attach the survival qualities to. Thus the products HL and CSML provide a focus upon which respondents can focus needs to express their ‘territorial embeddedness’ by identifying with their place, landscape and culture (Watts et al., 2005).

Across the responses, mentions of the landscape appear mostly at attribute level, although some come into consequences, as the respondent appreciates the quality of the lamb by rationalising the role of the environment (Table 7.4 & 7.16). Notable are mentions of the features of the breed (HL only) and the animal in the landscape to confirm the broader perceptions of the food product. In terms of the literature on credence characteristics, respondent beliefs about lamb quality related to the production environment are not expert-dependent (Darby and Karni, 1973) but instead build on knowledge gained through observation of ‘the production processes’, an insight available to consumers in relatively few industries. Following Anderson (1994) credence characteristics developed around organic or slow food principles which are learned by the consumer from ‘extrinsic attributes’ such as literature, promotions and packaging which are distinct from direct observation. Grunert (2005) offers a view on the significance of credence qualities to the purchase decision diminishing over time, as consumer first-hand experience with the product outweighs the credence element. However with the case products, the credence attributes are constantly reaffirmed with lifescape-based experience of the living animals.

Some respondent perceptions of the Lakeland fells are technical in terms of the grazing available, the permanence of the animals on the fells and the hefted tendency of the animal. It is possible to identify some aspects of fetishism in these responses (Morris & Kirwan, 2010). They also react to the landscape on an emotional level, outlining the visual satisfaction achieved from the place, defining HL as authentic Lakeland or CSML on the marsh with healthy sea air. Recognition is given to the pragmatic needs of farmers to make a living from farming, and in so doing to maintain the ‘look’ of the Lakeland fells (HL). CSML is not perceived to offer similar landscape maintenance qualities. Williams et al., (2004) consider the concept of “placefulness” meaning the
extent to which corporate branding activities and strategies “reinforce the sense of place of a destination...” and go on to recommend that commercial organisations consider the active involvement of local stakeholders’ values in their strategy development (ibid:6).

Aside from aesthetic considerations of the Lake District fells, the heritage of reverence for the fells (Wordsworth 1770-1850, Ruskin 1819-1900, Potter, 1866-1943, Wainwright, 1907-1991) provides a confidence building function for establishment of Lake District fell-linked brands, and more technical farm husbandry detail. It also provides valid ‘mythology/heritage fodder’, for brand culture and brand personality (Charters & Spielmann, 2013). This confidence is based on the existing high level of landscape awareness and esteem. Although the respondents did not cite many precise examples of cultural contributors from the past, the existence of some, provides an ‘industry of adoration’ for the Lakeland fells, and this is the context in which respondents live, and tourists visit. The heritage of credibility for the place in which HL is produced may contribute towards diminished purchasing risk for new consumers (Jacobsen, 2009).

Whilst there is no similar heritage of romantic writing about the salt marsh, there is a heritage of sea-side enjoyment which is tempered by the presence of sinking sands at various points around the coast. Grange-Over-Sands is included in these. Rindell (2013) discusses image heritage and image-in-use finding that customers retain past images and can see their past in the present. This phenomenon was evident in nostalgic thoughts of provisioning style for both lamb types. Some of the traditional values associated with healthy environment which are related to the cleansing qualities of salt-water bathing, or taking in the sea air (photographic record in Swain’s Grange-Over-Sands, 2005) are positive comments which respondents linked to the environment and to CSML.

Respondents did not comment on the appearance of the CSML grazing stock. The CSML lacks the specificity of breed characteristics and this offers a weaker focus for the brand than that of HL. However Thode and Maskulka (1998) remind us that the focus for the product can be managed; whilst all Burgundy wine is made from Pinot Noir grapes, the grape variety is not mentioned on the label, instead it is the chateau which produces the wine which is celebrated. Perhaps this is an example for Holker Hall could follow. HL perceptions relate to the colour of the animal as this changes
throughout the lifecycle, and in relation to breeding lines. Comment is also made in relation to their sturdy legs, and the interest they may have shown in a walker’s packed lunch. These are fairly endearing comments, and reflect some emotional attachment to the breed. Reflecting on the brand process, some of this information corresponds to the Who are you? brand question (Keller, 2008).

The place branding literature seems to offer little when place is a non-urban landscape. Jacobsen (2012) examined investor-based brand equity in places, and lamented at the lack of conceptual development in measuring place brand equity. Warnaby (2009) comments on the predominantly urban focus of place marketing research. Kemp et al., (2012) measure self-brand connections in Austin, Texas which has branded itself as a ‘music town’. They quote Pike (2005) stating: “without buy-in from stakeholders, place branding strategies are likely to fail” (cited in Kemp et al., 2012:508). Whilst the situation in Cumbria is very different from a city branding project, this sentiment was upheld in this thesis by the involvement of consumers and non-consumers in the interviews.

7.2.2 Internal Identity Reflections

The second group of values are those lamb-linked cognitions which relate to the inner self (e.g. self-discovery, self-esteem, self-respect, self-reward, a sense of accomplishment, wisdom, nostalgia). The practical (community experience) element in relation to lamb purchase discussed below. However, allied to this is the thinking and learning about meat, its qualities and implications for cooking. This is a cognitive involvement with the product results in the values expressed above, and potentially converts customers into brand ambassadors (Andersson and Ekman, 2009). The climatic and topographic features of the landscape, provide almost a lambscape in Cumbria. Absent from the Cumbrian cuisine is a strong traditional dish based on lamb, excepting the nationally popular roast lamb, as an option for traditional Sunday lunch (Mason, 1999). Lamb hot pot is a tradition in Lancashire, and Scotch Pies (north of the border) include lamb. There is a gap in the market which HL and CSML could fill. This tends to leave the conceptualisation of lamb as a feature of the landscape rather than a feature of a particular well known regional dish.

This gives more importance to place’s symbolic function, whereby the appreciated landscape may transfer its heritage of esteem, its credibility and aesthetic qualities to the
person who accepts it (via experience, or through buying its products or brands) as part of their identity (Jacobsen, 2009). The Cumbrian landscape is seen to encompass the past, culture and nature. Respondents spoke of the history of Arnside as a port, and of current observations of the farmer collecting the sheep from the marsh/fell, and of the impact of the tides for CSML and the seasons on the production environments for both HL and CSML (Phillips, 2005, cited in Brown & Kothari, 2011). These observations add depth and breadth to notions of place identity and could be found with those who experience the landscape with a “learned, literate and conscious” eye (Heaney, 1991, cited in Malpas, 2011:13).

Cumbria as a place providing the context for ‘mental life’ or life filled with valuable and identity building experiences exhibited itself in various consumer responses (Malpas, 1999). There is an enhancement of belonging to a place or ‘insider access’ gained by going onto farms to purchase meat. This gives access to areas normally private, which provide the backdrop to a unique purchase experience. Respondents also revealed stored memories of sheep grazing the fells or the salt marsh. In this sense the sheep have provided a focus for appreciating the landscape, rather similar to the way an artist might provide a focal point for a landscape painting. These stored memories provide mental overlays which are added to local knowledge and heritage features, akin to Cambray’s “place that is, of course, half fictional and half real” (Cited in Malpas, 1999:185).

However, not all respondents are able to link such a vision with their thoughts of meat. These people regard animal and meat as two separate and shorter constructs, such that the consideration of the animal in the landscape or any other aspect of the living animal’s life are cognitively disconnected from thoughts of meat (Kubberod et al., 2006). It is impossible to achieve a complete MEC for the topic from these respondents. Similarly these respondents would be likely to respond negatively to brand stories which connect meat to visual representations of the living animal.

7.2.3 Experiencing place through community
The MECs include values which relate lamb-linked cognitions and affectations to respondents’ social-selves and their identity in the local community (social-recognition, social rewards, family security/contentment, trust).
There are various aspects of the brand literature which seem appropriate to measure against these findings: The first of these is the developing phenomenon of the experience economy/experiential marketing/consumer experience tourism (Mitchell & Orwig, 2002; Baker, 2003; Jacobsen, 2009). This experience offers opportunities for increased involvement on the part of the consumer and for building trusting loyal relationships.

“consumers are willing to pay an extra price for products and services that hold qualities, feelings, values, meanings, identity and aesthetics” (Stigel and Frimann, 2006:250).

For embedded food products, the brand can provide a convenient and efficient way of presenting orientation to the specifics of ‘embeddedness’ of the product (Jacobsen, 2009). The symbiosis between animal and environment in this case, is explained during farm visits or discussions at farmers’ markets/butchers shop. Ilberry and Kneafsey (1999) describe small-scale food producers as “...profit sufficers rather than profit maximisers...” giving priority to community support over self-interest. This idea leads more to values of inner harmony on the part of the producer, rather than the social recognition found with respondents (Appendices AE & AY). The perception from interviews undertaken by the author rather corresponded to the correlation between higher prices and higher social recognition.

Sage (2003) discusses the concept of ‘regard’ developed by Offer (1997) which:

“arises out of the intrinsic benefits of social and personal interaction, from the satisfaction of regard...[and is]
...preferred when trade involves a personal interaction, and when goods and services are unique, expensive, or have many dimensions of quality.” (Offer, 1997:450 cited in Sage, 2003:48).

Sage (ibid) goes on to discuss the development of relationships and the involvement of gifts. Whilst none of the respondents mentioned this in particular, they all expressed relationships with producers in positive terms, and the practice of giving extra, to a loyal customer is common in local farmers’ markets (Pers.comm.).
Marsden et al., (2000) discussed the products at farmers’ markets as a basis around which to construct and develop relationships. They developed three types of short food supply chain.

- Face-to-face: personal direct purchase involving interaction/discussion around which relationships develop. E.g. farmers’ market/ farm shop.
- Spatial proximity: products are sold by those who have some legitimate connection/belief in the type of product sold. For Cumbrian examples Plumbgarths/Mansergh Hall/Sizergh Barn Shop.
- Spatially extended: where the producer and place information is transmitted to consumers outside the region of production, such as the Made in Cumbria Shops at M6 service stations or Cumbrian representation in Borough Market in London.

The point of this list is to show how complex producer-customer interfaces can be. It also illustrates the distance which trust and authenticity can be extended, through credible distribution channels.

Allied to the discussion of community involvement was the idea of shopping ‘the way mother did’ expressing nostalgia for the way things used to be or for indulging in childhood memories. In this sense the comfort of childhood may be relived, or a sense of continuity with family experiences (Kessous and Rous, 2008). This kind of nostalgia relates to domestic socialisation practices ritualised within families. It is how we have functioned in this place. Personal nostalgia relates to autographical and episodic memory. The effect of personal nostalgia on the cognitive processing of information about a product is said to mitigate the production of negative thoughts (Baker and Kennedy, 1994; Belk, 1990, 1991; Davis, 1979; Havlena and Holak, 1991; Holak and Havlena, 1992, 1998; Holbrook and Schindler, 1991; Muehling and Sprott, 2004; Stern, 1992).

7.3 Implications from the derived hierarchy of benefits

The HVM for each lamb show broad similarities in terms of the value chains, whilst having different uppermost values. As shown in sections of 7.2.13 and 7.3.10, there are broadly three chains of value for each lamb which are outlined in the row content of Table 7.1.
Whilst the objective here is to establish distinct functional and emotional connections to input into the branding process for each lamb, the table also serves an unintended function which is to show alternative focal points and associated benefits gained from consumption of the landscape and involvement with the local community (Morris and Kirwan, 2010). This is a less pragmatic outcome but reveals some aspects of people’s rootedness and interaction with their place, which the products play a part in (Morley et al., 2000).

7.3.1 Consideration of terminal values

Before going on to discuss the differences in terminal values arrived at for each lamb, it is important to consider how these have been arrived at. Across the various published studies which have used MEC, when compiling ladders, some researchers select terminal values using a ‘best-fit approach’ such as Vannoppen et al., (2002) who select from Schwartz’ (1994) ten universal value types. Other studies use a mix of values which appear on a list (Rockeach, 1973; Schwartz, 1994) but do not restrict themselves to these, and extra terminal values are extrapolated in a more ‘emergent approach’ from analysis of ladders (Amatuli & Guido, 2011). Rockeach (1973) does recognise that values will change over time, and therefore it is realistic to assume that lists created in 1973 will not include terminal values which relate to ‘environmental concerns’, or ‘globalisation’ inspired values which have grown in our collective consciousness over more recent decades. Schwartz (2009 cited in Crompton, 2010) includes a value entitled universal which does include environmental concern amongst other things.

Terminal values are not generally verbalised directly in soft laddering interviews (compared to hard laddering where respondents might be asked to select from a list); rather they are intimated from the content of the discussion, and areas signalled as important by the respondent. For this thesis, the author had read Rockeach (1973) and was aware of the Schwartz list (1994); however where necessary original terminal values namely: part of the ecosystem and place identity were derived from the data.

7.3.2 HL terminal values and supporting chains

The terminal values which earned a place in the HVM for HL included self-esteem (13 counts) which relates to judgements about self-worth. In terms of Table 7.1 this aspect (along with hedonism) relates to the third row. Influencing the feeling of self-esteem is the satisfaction of knowing that responsible decisions have been made regarding food
miles, by buying local HL. Another element feeding into the achievement of self-esteem is the ability to provide safe and trusted food for self and family. This credibility afforded to HL is evident with happy and successful meal occasions where HL with valued colour, flavour and texture attributes is the focus. The final link most noted to self-esteem is that where the respondents recognised that purchase and consumption of HL represented the achievement of high standards. Allen et al., (2002) write about the ‘expressive’ function of human values, and there were some links evident between social status and purchasing which ‘fits a higher earning lifestyle’ which may support an expressive function (HLM15). For others the links are perhaps more internal, representing knowledge and linked to terminal values of wisdom or inner harmony (HLM14). These are positive associations representing achievement, successful and safe family nutrition, and environmentally responsible behaviour.

The second most popular terminal value from HL respondents was social recognition (10 counts) and relates to row 2 in Table 7.1. Direct sales via friends, or following on from links made at farmers’ markets, or indirect sales via the local butcher or Booths fresh meat counter all allowed social interaction, and led respondents to feel that they had contributed something to the local community. Depending on the personality of the respondent these actions may be altruistic (H LM 12) or may like to support an alternative distribution system (H LM 3) - which invokes reflection on the ‘crafting revolution’ gathering a pace in the USA (Walker, 2008). Their purchases may also result in a level of recognition, membership and status which they like to have in their local community (HLM8,11).

Inner harmony (10 counts) is the value (linked with landscape) which relates to row one in Table 7.1. Here visual aspects of the herdwick together with local qualities are linked to aspects of the landscape which are either scientific (H LM 2,) regionalist (H LM 14,16) or spiritualistic (H LM 12).

Hedonism (5 counts) obviously points to the pleasure of eating good food, as part of a satisfying life(H LM 9). The sensory attributes of the HL (H LM 3, 8,11,16), ensure successful and enjoyable meals. This is the simplest of the chains and perhaps the most product-like response. The next section looks at the chains presented on the CSML HVM.
7.3.3 CSML terminal values and supporting chains

Self-esteem (10 counts) appears as a terminal value in the CSML HVM with its base in the attribute of landscape. Landscape is linked with a sense of accomplishment where recognition is given to the ability to have an enjoyable life, with leisure time spent watching the sheep grazing on the marsh, in later years (CSML LM12) or sourcing interesting food (CSML LM17). Another younger person lived alone on a professional salary and felt that she could reward herself with the best quality meat from a beautiful landscape (CSML LM20). In these cases self-esteem was supported by the ability to enjoy leisure activities which were landscape or food based, and to afford high quality lamb.

Place identity (10 counts) is an emergent terminal value, a logical conclusion to the chain of thought originating with the CSML attribute landscape, linked to the visual aspect of sheep grazing the marsh, and giving rise to a sense of place. Consideration of the CSML encourages respondents to reflect on the landscape as a part of their lives and their identity. Rockeach (1973) does offer ‘a world of beauty’ and it is possible to use this as a general value, but it does not have the specificity of a place local to someone, or the contribution to identity which place can make in the ‘lifescape’ sense. One respondent spoke of “glimpses of the Bay and the sheep grazing as I drive home” which the writer has also experienced as the Bay becomes visible at Grange-Over-Sands between houses overlooking the sea, for another example see 7.3.1.

Inner Harmony (8 counts) this established terminal value has the same trajectory up through the chain from the attribute landscape, as does self-esteem. Whilst Maslow’s (1954) view of self-esteem includes ideas of inner self-respect, and measuring milestones achieved with the addition of admiration from others. Inner harmony is a purer value which seems to relate more to the soul and aesthetic experience than to achievement. It is akin to Maslow’s (ibid) self-actualisation, the achievement of oneness. Some of the inner harmony values come from those respondents who can not countenance the idea of animal and meat as the same thing. They are maintaining their inner harmony by refusing to consider the repercussions of their carnivorous preferences thereby protecting themselves from uncomfortable thoughts (CSML LM 2,18,19). Others are established in a way of provisioning which they are comfortable with, and which CSML fits into. For them inner harmony represented maintaining the status quo (CSML LM 5, 8,). Respondents normally spoke of a butcher in the case of
CSML, and mostly respondents resided in Grange-Over-Sands which is a town without MRO presence.

Part of the ecosystem (5) is another terminal value which has emerged from the data rather than being fit to it. Part of the ecosystem is rooted in the CSML attribute of landscape, which is linked to the psychological value of thinking about the passing of time. Time appeared in various guises as described in 7.3.4. To summarise they include the seasonal selection of food and reminiscences of previous years input to the process of ‘life-auditing’ (CSML LMs: 1, 5, 6, 16, 20), the timelessness associated with extensive production (CSML LMs: 6, 12), time noted by the tide activity, a rhythm of nature (CSML LMs: 1, 12, 16, 20) and historical times in relation to ‘Englishness’ heritage and perceived superiority of English lamb to French lamb (CSML LMs: 12, 13). These details are not apparent in the HVM.

Certain elements in the HVM for CSML resulted in truncated chains, or those with an instrumental value rather than a terminal value at the apex namely quality of life. These appear on the left hand side of the HVM and are more instrumental than the more symbolic right hand chains (Allan et al., 2002). Instrumental values are those which are vital to the achievement of terminal values (Rockeache, 1973). So achieving a given quality of life, based on relationships, skills and acquisitions may be perceived as a precedent required to appreciate ‘A world of beauty’ or to achieve an ‘Exciting Life’. Quality of life would be in line with self-enhancing values (Schwartz, 1992). In this case the base of the chain is anchored in CSML attribute Local/fresh, which links in to preferred ways of provisioning and relationships with community members who are suppliers of CSML. Similarly the flavour attribute of CSML is linked to appreciation of the lambs’ flavour and texture qualities as a result of the saline environment; the satisfaction of purchasing quality food is then also linked to quality of life.

7.3.4 Comment on HL and CSML HVMs

The terminal values linked by respondents to the lamb in question, reveal a only a facet of respondent’s personalities, bearing in mind Rockeache (1973) estimated we each possess 18 terminal values. The next focus is to understand the significance of this information for a brand developer. Essentially communications (of which branding is a part) will activate certain values by their design. It is important therefore to have an idea of the values which consumers hold in relation to the product in order to reiterate
and strengthen selected values which the respondents deem important. It is also wise to consider the effects of communications on respondents’ other values (Crompton, 2010). The next section will consider the process options for brand development appropriate to the lambs in question.

7.4 The process of transition from value chains to brand development

Having gained insight into how respondents view the two lamb meat products it is now pragmatic to apply these findings to models relating to brand development. Firstly in relation to communicating the qualities and salient properties of a brand, the MECCAS model is discussed (Reynolds and Gutman, 1984). Secondly in relation to identifying the value opportunities from findings, the Value Opportunity Analysis model (with some adaptation) is considered for both lambs (Cagan and Vogel, 2002). Thirdly, in an attempt to consider research findings as potential brand equity constituents, HL findings are measured against Keller’s (2008) Consumer Based Brand Equity model. Fourthly, components of brand identity are categorised into constituent components of brand identity using Kapferer’s prism of brand identity (1997). Finally an original model is drafted for brand development for embedded meats which results from critical reflection on both the research findings, and on the brand development literature.

Several studies exist which consider the input of research on consumer values into the advertising process, in particular the means-end conceptualisation of the components of advertising strategy MECCAS model shown in Table 7.2 (Reynolds and Gutman, 1984; Vannoppen et al., 2002).

Table 7.2 MECCAS Model of Advertising (Reynolds and Gutman, 1984)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Driving force</td>
<td>The value orientation of the strategy; the end-value to be focussed on in the advertising.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leverage point</td>
<td>The manner in which advertising will “tap into,” reach, or activate the value, or end-level of focus; the specific key way in which the value is linked to the specific features in the advertising.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executional framework</td>
<td>The overall scenario, or action plot plus details of the advertising execution. The executional framework provides the “vehicle” by which the orientation is to be communicated, especially the gestalt of the advertising, its overall tone and style.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumer benefit</td>
<td>The major positive consequences for the consumer that are to be communicated verbally, or visually in the advertising.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Message elements</td>
<td>The specific attributes, consequences or features about the product which are communicated verbally or visually.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A question was raised earlier (3.2.2) about the delineation between branding and communications, and the theme reoccurs here. Table 7.2 outlines the design of a tv/magazine advertisement. Such an advertisement may form an introduction or awareness maintaining communication between brand and target market. In this case the MECCAS model is suggesting that the communication design takes account of those elements of MEC consumers have identified as relevant. The focus of the communication is the brand, which needs more substance (personality) longevity (essence/core values) and a relationship with the buyer than a short-lived communication.

Findings show that relationships with suppliers are valued by customers. In practical branding terms this alerts us to the importance of ‘brand community’ developments (Muniz, Jr. & O’Guinn, 2001). This also forces reflection on Davidson’s (1997) iceberg metaphor, in relation to the conceptualisation of brands relating to brand paraphernalia (logo, advertising, signage) as the above water element of the iceberg, and brand value operation as the majority of the brand make up. Visions of a Lakeland covered in 48 sheet hoardings are allayed as the development of the brands under consideration here, would seem suited to focussing on existing and new community events, characterised by direct sales.

In considering inputs into the branding process, each of the HL/CSML producing farms may each develop their own brand. This process will need additional sources of information such as: accessible markets, specific farm-identified USPs plus relevant competitor information. What can be achieved here in terms of projecting forward to a brand, is limited to an overview in response to findings.

7.4.1 Brand development
Looking firstly at one of the positivist texts on branding, Keller (2008) offers development of mental maps, where consumers brain-storm every association with a brand whilst cross referencing stages of CBBE model (2008). These associations are then categorised, for further consideration. Brand mantras (a phrase of 3-5 words) may be developed to represent the ‘spirit’ or ‘core brand promise’ which is used to inform all stakeholders of the brand’s orientation. Competitive analysis allows for ‘points-of-parity’ and ‘points-of-difference’ to be identified and positioning to be established.
Once the brand is identified and positioned complete with its values, then brand marketing programs are designed and implemented.

An alternative model is one which considers the brand a product and adapts a product development model, the Value Opportunity Analysis (Cagan and Vogel, 2002 cited in Boatwright et al., 2009). It does retain some product orientation which may appeal to/match the constraints of the farming sector. Additionally the value selections included in the model reflect a crafted product (Table 7.3). What is not immediately apparent is the perception of a hierarchy amongst values however; with some adaptation the model may be suitable for embedded meat products.

With fairly minor modification (replacement of an Ergonomics category with Terroir factors, additions to the Quality category, plus adaptation to the Aesthetics category) the VOA accommodates all of the attributes mentioned in the laddering interviews. “The outcome of the VOA is a set of multifaceted and complex attributes of the brand identity” (Boatwright et al., 2009:38). The second phase involved in use of the VOA process is synthesis: the organization of identity attributes into an actionable mission which matches the strategic competences and capabilities of the organisation. The synthesis process would need to look back at the dimensions, and interconnections of each value represented, this aspect is missing from the process as described (ibid). At this stage organisational values and competences would need to be considered also.

It is at this stage that appreciation of different levels of values must be undertaken as Table 7.3, provides a summative view of values rather than an insightful one. “Attributes only scratch the surface” Wansink (2003:112). It is those values which are “attributed to deep emotional needs” (ibid) which compel people to buy particular products. These abstract values are uncovered during MEC analysis; should feed into core brand values as well as segmentation and positioning strategies.
Table 7.3  The Value Opportunity Analysis (VOA)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Values</th>
<th>Herdwick Lamb</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Cumbrian Salt-Marsh Lamb</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adventure</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independence</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sensuality</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Point in time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of place</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aesthetics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colour</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freshness</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texture</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olfactory</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taste</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terroir factors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restricted geographical zone</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialized grazing</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU classification awareness</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core tech</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reliable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trusted practices</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Craftsmanship</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual verification</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Producer verification/</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seasonal variation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Discussion of USP or Keller’s (2008) ‘points of difference’, as well as ‘points of parity’ or category defining qualities, need to be added to the consideration of strategic branding decisions. Equally discussion of the target market must be considered (hotels, restaurants, final consumers) in order to produce a verbal identity, akin to Keller’s (ibid) brand mantra.

The third phase involves translating the new verbal identity into corresponding symbolic, visual and functional representations, such as packaging, advertising and brand community-building activities. If brands already exist, then a map is developed at this stage to evaluate current brands and to map a future for new brands relative to the range of values which now define the brand. The final stage is operational implementation of the new brand.
In order to provide a discussion which follows the hierarchical nature of both the MEC and the brand-building process, the elements from Keller’s (2008) CBBE provide a suitable model for reflection. This model assumes the “power of a brand lies in what customers have learned, felt, seen and heard about the brand as a result of their experiences over time” (Keller, 2008:86). In the following example this model is applied to the product rather than the brand.

It is pertinent to mention here that Keller’s (2008) CBBE model is related to building blocks for ‘the brand’. At the time interviews were conducted, there were several HL brands in existence (Appendix A) as well as HL being sold through butchers’ shops without the addition of a brand. The data collected on HL may be influenced by certain respondents having knowledge or experience of one/some of these brands.

### 7.4.2 HL and the CBBE model-salience

Figure 7.1 Customer-Based Brand Equity Pyramid (Keller, 2008:58)

The lowest layer of Keller’s (ibid) CBBE model is that of salience, as mentioned those interviewed were already aware of the product. As stated respondents were predisposed to a given depth of awareness and the strongest concept associated with the product was local. The aspect of awareness which the CBBE model does not conventionally measure is that related to pre-product stages. Keller’s (ibid) CBBE model requires an extra dimension here, in that awareness of the embedded nature of the lamb clearly influences respondents’ responses about HL, yet this live stage of the HL is pre-product and pre-brand. Elements which appear at this stage include features of the animal, of
farming practices, of the landscape and of the flora /grazing. If depictions of the HL are used as part of the visual identity of the brand, then there are aspects of symbol recognition which occur from the pre-brand stage. Breed name, chunky legs, unique purple/grey colouring of the mature animal. It is important to recognise that the animals are not necessarily seen from a distance, but possibly from very close proximity, via footpaths through farmyards and fell-sides, as locals and visitors chose to share the landscape/lifescape with the grazing stock.

Moving to Keller’s (ibid) aspect of salience, being the depth of awareness of the brand within its product category. This is a similar concept to ‘the evoked set’ with the higher recall related to deeper brand awareness. In the context of a product emerging from commodity respondents might be expected to mention few alternatives. Those which came into discussions compared HL to relatively few other lambs, CSML, Swaledales, and New Zeeland Lamb, as well as a notional generic supermarket/lowland lamb.

The breadth of awareness relates to the number and variety of consumption situations for the product. Key factors in this respect were access, timing and convenience. In terms of identifying HL with the desire to consume lamb, there was a common association of consumption with the winter season. A traditional family meal, or meal for a special occasion were mentioned by those inferring cooking a large joint. However HL pies were also mentioned for consumption on an occasion of lower status. Situational aspects provided obstacles to some consumption desires as respondents noted difficulties parking near outlets of HL or remembering dates of farmers’ markets.

### 7.4.3 HL and the CBBE model-performance

If we proceed up the left side of the model, this is considered the ‘rational route’ (the right side being the ‘emotional route’). The performance element of the CBBE, refers to the characteristic, style, design and price of the product. HL is perceived as lean, dense meat, with a notably unique flavour, linked to what respondents consider high-quality grazing, and cared for locally although with a free-range habit; meat is perceived to be fresher because it is local. On price about half of the non-consumers noted that they were put-off by its price. Others found the price an opportunity to contribute to the local economy, or saw HL’s quality beyond price comparison. Perhaps related to this latter point is the experience aspect of the purchase, or ‘service empathy’ which is evident in many purchase experiences described (Keller, 2008). Purchasing direct from
producer (or to some extent a trusted local butcher) offers extra: trust, excitement, community links, insight into farming, and improved understanding of the qualities of HL.

7.4.4 HL and the CBBE model-judgements
Consumers will make judgements on a brand (product in this case) based on all aspects of their experience and understanding of that product. In terms of HL, respondents perceived a high-quality product, based on distinctive taste, freshness, trust in the husbandry and environment of production.

In terms of credibility the product is seen as ‘authentic Lakeland’, this aspect is linked to the pre-product, pre-brand knowledge which consumers possess about HL. A Lakeland identity is clearly perceived as a positive one.

HL allowed respondents to fulfil needs which go beyond eating lamb. These include responsibility in relation to food miles, contributing and communicating with the local economy and community, avoiding major supermarkets (and their excessive packaging), buying the best for themselves and their family, achieving greater variety in food choice. In this sense judgements about HL were not directly related to HL. These consequences of purchasing HL go beyond the ‘augmented product’ attributes, instead these relate to embedded qualities of the product (Keller, 2008:3).

7.4.5 HL and the CBBE model-brand imagery
It is here where we consider the personality and values of the product and the history and heritage linked to HL. Traits perceived to belong to the animal include, traditional, hardy, rugged, free-ranging, semi-wild (in the natural sense), intelligent (hefting ability), fit, firm and lean, pretty sheep, straight from the fell. Visual sighting of the herdwick on the fell is a daily occurrence for many Cumbrians so these ideas come from interpretation of what they have seen, rather than from their imagination.

Some respondents are aware of reported links of the origin of HL in Cumbria as being brought by Vikings, some are aware of the Beatrix Potter connection, and some are aware of more current writers or poets who write/paint the fells including the herdwick. Similarly some respondents are aware of the importance of the wool industry in some of the Cumbrian towns during past years. Herdwick being known to produce a cloth called
Kendal Grey, which is referred to in the song entitled *D’ ye ken John Peel* (Graves, 1866).

### 7.4.6 HL and the CBBE model-feelings

Emotional responses to HL include enjoyment of tradition and nostalgia for days when shopping with a parent in previous provisioning era. Respondents also enjoy a comfort emerging from the ‘winter warmth’ of a HL stew or other dish. This point relating to admiration for the herdwicks’ stamina as it can withstand winter on the fells.

It is the experience of buying and the relationships developed with usually a single seller which results in an exciting experience. This may involve a visit to the farm or simply sharing HL information at a farmers’ market. This feeling of excitement also corresponds to feelings of community participation, which are linked to belonging to the place and to personal identity.

Security is another emotion offered by respondents in relation to purchase and consumption of HL. The security relates to food-safety, they feel reassured by direct contact with the producer, by perceptions of freshness and by having seen the product grow in its environment. This feeling of security is afforded to the rest of the family, and interpreted as buying high-quality food.

By facilitating the elements related to the embedded quality of HL under 7.2.4. the HL purchase allows the consumer to exercise a variety of principles and preferences with one action. This sense of achievement permits feelings of self-satisfaction.

### 7.4.7 HL and the CBBE model-resonance

One of the strongest responses from HL respondents was from those who felt they had built bonds with a supplier, and had developed a relationship which was important to them. Aspects of these relationships involved, greater knowledge of HL, sometimes visits to the farm thereby gaining more insight into the production context of HL, incidentally family information was shared and relationships strengthened. These relationships were characterised by action/experience, even if limited to the farmers’ market or butcher, and by a ‘sense of community’.

A level of attachment was expressed by some respondents which drew on the traditional quality of the product, nostalgia for the past, perceived natural aspects of production, the esteem which is placed on the production environment and its *terroir* qualities and the
wish to identify with the place. Some of these people have a need to feel ‘in sync’ with the ecology of the place. Others see HL as the finest and safest choice for their family and therefore feel a sense of achievement by providing the best, operating at their optimum as a provider.

7.4.8 HL and the CBBE model
Aside from the prior knowledge of emerging brands, respondents also possessed experience of the products in the landscape and as previously mentioned as part of their ‘lifescapes’ and this is a factor which existing brand-building models have no capacity for. Consideration has been given to adding an extra layer to the base of Keller’s (2008) CBBE model to represent pre-product and landscape exposure to HL, and to consider ties with the landscape as aspects of imagery and feelings sections of the CBBE model. The relationship between consumer and product can be represented in the resonance pinnacle of the model, however, it is arguable that the respondent begins a relationship with the HL prior to the production of the product/brand. This relationship comes from ties to the land, and therefore somehow needs to extend to the base of the model. Relative to the structure of the industry, the CBBE model assumes a separation between producer and consumer, with perhaps the only contact being via IMC campaigns. It is possible then to fit most of the results to Keller’s (ibid) CBBE model, with minor modification, however the fit does not celebrate the ‘lifescape’ aspect associated with HL and CSML. Having used the CBBE model to test fit, the writer’s evaluation is that no further critical points would result from the same application to CSML, and this will not follow.

7.4.9 Brand identity for HL and CSML
Kapferer’s (2008) stance is that two tools are needed to manage the brand in its early stages, one defines the brand identity (expressed in the brand identity prism), and the other specifies the competitive proposition relative to the time and market, known as the ‘brand’s unique compelling competitive proposition UCCP. Given that the competitive situation will vary from farm to farm and this was not the focus for data collection in this thesis, it is useful to consider the value of the identity prism in view of the results found. In terms of development of a brand identity, the ‘prism of brand identity’ developed by Kapferer (2008) similarly offers a structure for consideration. Charters & Spielmann (2013:4) discuss the need for a territorial brand to “gain coherence of meaning from a commonly shared mythology”, given the shared elements (breed and/or
landscape) of identity for producers of HL and CSML, cooperation on a shared mythology supporting the brands developed, may help maintain brand integrity. However definition of common aspects for the brand should consider the perception of tourists also, given their participation in the Cumbrian economy. Zenker and Beckmann (2013) discuss the difficulties involved in satisfying multiple target groups with a single idea of place. Given the comments in Chapter 3 it is anticipated that existing brand personality models may prove an uneasy fit for the results of findings in relation to the case products.

7.4.9 HL, CSML and the Prism of Brand Identity
Kapferer’s (2008:188) understanding is that at birth brands can develop in any direction, this idea is debatable with a ‘heritage’ product. Heritage products such as HL which develop brands around them are constrained by existing knowledge and expectations in the same way a mature brand might be.

The components of this three-dimensional model, include three facets on the left which are visible, and three to the right which are internal to the brand. The sender of the identity is placed at the top of the prism with the recipient below. Bearing in mind the distinction between image and identity, the identity is that which is proposed by the seller, so this depiction should be filled with what the brand creator has approved. As this section is written in general terms for a particular farm to adapt, the contents here reflect general findings; this would need to be modified to reflect the circumstances facing the farm, and its own view on its USP, culture as a business organisation etc.

To summarise Figure 7.3 and Figure 7.4, the physique is a summary of the functional aspects of the brand, and the visual aspects that first come to mind when thinking about it. A traditional text book brand would build up a personality by communicating, and judgements would be made about its personality from the content and style of those communications. In this case the personality perception comes from information in the public domain and from experiential knowledge from observation and possible interaction when driving and walking in the fells/seaside paths. Personality therefore is less under the control of the organisation than that of a recipe-based food product. The personality and physique of the band can be seen to correspond to the Landscape row in Table 7.1. The relationships and cultural context can be seen to correspond to the
Lifescape row in Table 7.1, and the reflection and self-esteem to the Place identity row in Table 8.1. Kapferer’s (2008).
The brand culture is the set of values upon which the brand is built and which steer its development. The elements included in the applied diagram correspond to cultural elements linked to HL/CSML by respondents; in fact this should be replaced by the culture of the organisation/farm developing the brand. The decision to include these here was based on the idea that links between values and traditional practice may be considered.

Relationships are important and valued relating to HL and CSML, but how do we characterize them? To be cryptic and abstract perhaps ‘link to the land and community’ represents the key relationship evident in the results best, and knowledge of this function will guide the way that more functional relationship tasks are undertaken. The reflection refers to those who may use the brand expressively to influence the way they wish to be seen as a result of using it. In relation to HL & CSML there are many principles which can be upheld by making a purchase (food miles, packaging related, landscape maintenance/ecology) as well as social and community desires. Self-image is that of the target consumer, it is what they achieve for themselves by involving themselves with the brand.
As already indicated the prisms presented here are very full, and need further refinement by a branding agent. Kapferer (2008) recommends the use of few strong phrases, without repetition of words from one section to another, in order to quickly make assessment as to which developments fit the chosen identity and which are incongruent to it. The brand identity should also serve to stimulate creative ideas for further brand development. Figures 7.3 and 7.4 serve to summarise findings on the HL and CSML and contribute towards the development of their brand identities.
Figure 7.3 Kapferer’s (2008) Prism of Brand Identity Applied to HL

Kapferer’s (1997:100) prism of identity applied to Herdwick lamb.
Kapferer’s (2008) Prism of Brand Identity Applied to CSML

Kapferer’s (1997:100) Prism of identity applied to Cumbria Salt Marsh Lamb
7.4.10 Model proposal for embedded meats

The findings of the primary research (Chapter 7) orientate regional lamb amongst literature which bears on heritage branding (Goulding, 2000; Urde et al., 2007) on nostalgia brands (Brown, 2007) on place branding (for which the literature rarely has a rural focus, Thode & Maskulka, 1998; Cai, 2002; Boisen et al., 2011) and on branding of regional food (Charters & Spielmann, in press). Whilst these sources contribute aspects of similar focus to that of this thesis, the complete mix of food, heritage, culture, brand, landscape and social networks is rarely found. Having discussed the limitation of some of the existing models used in the early stages of brand development, and having recognised the hierarchies of values relevant to both lambs, Figure 7.3 is proposed as a hierarchical model which corresponds to brand community-building requirements for embedded meats.

Figure 7.5  Brand Community Building Model for Embedded Meats

![Brand Community Building Model for Embedded Meats](image-url)
The left hand side represents the consumers’ perceptions of the product/brand which corresponds to brand image. Whilst the right hand size represents the brand building stages for farm producers.

The first stage involves research of consumer perceptions of the landscape, and an audit of the farm landscape relative to consumer findings. Then landscape is conceptualised and formalised in brand identity in a way that the consumer will understand, appreciate and possibly be further intrigued by.

The next step is to research consumers’ experience and understanding of agriculture, stock/meat production and current cooking characteristics and heritage. The corresponding needs are met in the design of the product, packaging and any extra promotional materials, such as recipes and regular contact vehicles. Customers should be encouraged to feedback direct to the producer on early experiences of use of the product – perhaps via a voucher for the second purchase. This feedback is an opportunity for relationship development, advice, customisation to meet preferences and for reinforcement of ‘regard’ (Offer, 1997).

The function of the product is the result of getting to know how the product is used by the customer and effectively packaging it for that purpose. Shared recipes and experiences will further develop the relationship. Discussions on seasonality and farm specifics will naturally ensue.

Community and distribution aspects, involve looking into enhancing producer presence at community events, extending community contact networks and strengthening community cohesion. Stratification of consumers with different involvement levels may come into play at this stage.

Priorities and values must be elicited from the customers who comprise the business buyer profiles, in order to develop ideas of business mission and core brand values. Demonstration of such values must then be invested in creatively and may demand behavioural change atypical of the farming community (Burton & Wilson, 2006). Shared goals and aspirations should encourage respectful relationships, which result in the brand achieving a good level of resonance with the customer.

7.5 Summary
Consumer perceptions and values relating to HL and CSML reveal familiarity along the three dimensions of perceptions of the landscape incorporating the embedded lamb, the landscape and self, and the place experienced through community. Consumer perceptions
also resulted in some specific and contrasting views on different aspects of the production environment. Time is a multifaceted concept for CSML whilst perceptions of the Lakeland fells achieve a similarly broad range of responses. The broad nature of findings associated with many of the values offered provides a wide variety of connotations available for use in brand development. The broad range of mostly positive perceptions relating to HL and CSML also diminishes the purchasing risk for new customers (Jacobsen, 2009).

The effective development and use of micro-brands may depend on some association and agreement amongst consumers as to how the shared brand aspects, namely breed and or landscape should be represented. The involvement of stakeholders in this process and the consideration of ‘the era of representation’ is recommended (Pike, 2005 cited in Kemp et al., 2012:508; Rindell, 2013; Charters & Spielmann, 2013).

The implications of the hierarchy of benefits include the recognition of the very wide range of functions which the case products allow the consumers to exercise. In drawing up an annotated product onion for each of these products at the inception of this thesis, place identity, participation in the crafting revolution, having a foothold in the local community, reducing a food miles account, contributing to the local ecology, provisioning the way mother used to, leisure activity in retirement, would not have been the first to come to mind. This information is a result of the soft-laddering characteristic of encouraging the free flow of speech.

Community involvement, experience marketing, brand community development, present themselves as branding strategies which can effectively respond to the value which customers place upon the community relationships build up by purchase of HL/CSML (Muniz, Jr & O’Guinn, 2001; Sage, 2003; Baker, 2009).

However the rooting of HL/CSML consumer knowledge in their pre-product and pre-brand state has provided some challenges for some existing brand development models (Keller, 2008; Boatwright et al., 2009).

Established consumer knowledge and experience of both lambs in their environments of production necessitates another dimension to existing brand development models in order to allow for the transition of value chains to brand development. The CBBE model has been measured against findings on HL, and found adequate for mass market situations where personal relationships between company and consumer are not feasible (Keller, 2008). The MEC analysis has shown that this relationship is fundamental to brand development for HL and CSML, hence its position in the centre, extending throughout the
proposed brand-building model for regional embedded meat products (Figure 7.5). Similarly the ‘developing a brand as a product’ approach was limited in its appreciation of the hierarchy of values, but may be of use with some adaptation (Boatwright et al., 2009). What is to be developed as a brand needs more conceptual thought. What has been considered so far are the findings in broad value streams. However, the lifescape concept may need further consideration as a manifestation of the current, visually incorporating view of life in a place. If this is the case, then is there an ‘aspirational lifescape’ which incorporates the value streams identified, and is this what the brand should seek to offer/satisfy.

The ‘experience’ of the either lamb in the landscape, forces reflection on the limitation of existing classificatory variables for attributes (Steenkamp, 1989). As questioned earlier is it possible to ‘backwards vertically integrate’ the experience attribute to incorporate a pre/very peripheral-product experience? Or a pre-search experience.

The final chapter will consider the fulfilment of research objectives and overall findings.
Chapter 8 Conclusion and Recommendations

8.1 Introduction
This chapter will bring together elements from all previous chapters in discussion concerning brand development options relating to the two regional lambs. Firstly it will show how the aims of this thesis have been achieved. Next a critical reflection of the findings is included to offer new insights into the marketing and branding of regional lamb including theoretical reflections, together with practical and policy contributions. Whilst these are presented as distinct sections there are some clear overlaps between academic/practical/policy recommendations. Within this discussion the consideration of ‘place’ and its manifestation to respondents will be integrated. There are various perspectives which need to be considered relative to branding initiatives which involve these products. Of key importance is the structure and location of the production units and resulting influences on the brand development opportunities and possibilities. Finally the chapter includes a reflection on the thesis and recommendations for future work. The research aims of this thesis will now be considered in turn, beginning with the analysis of the terminology appropriate to categorise HL and CSML.

8.2 Where regional meats best fit within a typology of regional food.
Chapter two has shown that the regional food sector is without clearly established boundaries, it has defied the attempts of repeated studies to delineate it amongst local and speciality foods (DTZ, 1999; Enteleca, 2000; ADAS, 2003 & 2007). This has come about via the terms of reference of commissioned reports which have veered between membership of certain food groups, or agreement/non-agreement with various defined identifiers, or consumer perceptions of the difference between food which is: regional/speciality/local/embedded. The question why these reports did not make use of the EU classifications of PDO, PGI & TSG remains unanswered. The value placed on the place, terroir, landscape and embeddedness and heritage of particular food products remains an undersold economic resource and is particularly evident for those products which are highly visible in a highly valued landscape.

The process of tending and farming HL and CSML is on view to the local population, and represents significant economic output within Cumbria, a rural county. Those who view the lamb in their production stages are also viewing livestock husbandry traits which have evolved from traditional cultural practices. This combination of the economic and the cultural produced in public view, defines the two lambs as naturally embedded food products (NEFP) (Morris and Kirwan, 2010). However, they do not sit exclusively within
this category; there are terroir traits aligned to both lambs which also fit the PGI or regional food titles. When sold locally HL and CSML also qualify as local foods. It is the latter title which was used exclusively by respondents, whilst the more fitting NEFP was only apparent in analysis of respondents’ broader rationalisations of the importance of the products.

8.3 Show the importance of regional food within Cumbria and the specific role and contribution played by sheep farming.

Judgement of the importance of regional food to Cumbria in quantitative terms has proved difficult to extract. Those who attempted on a national scale were beset with issues concerning terminology, limitations associated with population lists from third party organisations, and the pitfalls of self-classification and non-response, resulting in output composed of estimations (DTZ, 1999; Enteleca 2000; ADAS 2003 & 2007). Mason (1999) lists traditional food items produced in Cumbria (Chapter 2). The post-foot and mouth era (after 2001) brought investment from farm income diversification schemes, and in the resurrection of farmers ‘markets which continue with less vigour since the financial crash of 2008, after which such funding was reduced. Made in Cumbria recorded 250 regional food members in 2001, and only 57 food members in 2013.

The contribution of sheep farming to regional food in Cumbria is similarly hidden within more generic stock output statistics. Hill farming in Cumbria includes herdwick production but also swaledales and other breeds. Cumbrian Salt Marsh Lamb production levels are not recorded specifically within overall stock production levels. Hill farming is given considerable attention in the press as ‘a sector under threat’, as a sector it is estimated to reduce by 20% over the next twenty years (Fraser, 2014). The sheep flock in Cumbria declined by 30% from 2001 to 2010 (Harvey et al., 2013). With the average age of a hill-farmer at 58, it is the future of this industry which needs to be seen as viable from the inside, whilst offering consumers a stake in its future.

Current trends in environmental concerns, including carbon storage, and the quality of water feeding into reservoirs, means that payment of hill farming subsidies is linked to reducing stock numbers. However the heafting ability of the stock requires a given number of sheep to maintain the knowledge of the fells (Fraser, 2014). There is a balance to be sought between retaining a cultural heritage, retaining a viable economic output and investing in environmental protection.
8.4 Reveal and review consumers’ perceptions and values relating to regional lamb

Consumer perceptions and values relating to HL and CSML reveal three important dimensions of perceptions of the landscape incorporating the embedded lamb, the landscape and self, and the place experienced through community. Ladder maps reveal consumer perceptions also resulted in some specific and contrasting views on different aspects of the production environment.

The effective development and use of micro-brands may depend on some association and agreement amongst producers and consumers as to how the shared brand aspects, namely breed and or landscape should be represented. The involvement of stakeholders in this process and the consideration of ‘the era of representation’ is recommended given the presence of nostalgia in empirical results (Pike, 2005 cited in Kemp et al., 2012:508; Rindell, 2013; Charters & Spielmann, 2013).

The implications of the hierarchy of benefits include the recognition of the very wide range of functions which the case products allow the consumers to exercise. In drawing up an annotated product onion for each of these products at the inception of this thesis, place identity, participation in the crafting revolution, having a foothold in the local community, reducing a food miles account, contributing to the local ecology, provisioning the way mother used to, leisure activity in retirement, would not have been the first to come to mind (Walker, 2008; Sustain, 2002; Murdoch et al., 2000; Brown, 1999; Goulding, 2001). The soft-laddering characteristic of encouraging the free flow of speech has facilitated discussion of these links.

Community involvement, experience marketing, brand community development, present themselves as branding strategies which can effectively respond to the value which customers place upon the community relationships build up by purchase of HL/CSML (Muniz, Jr & O’Guinn, 2001; Sage, 2003; Baker, 2009).

8.5 Synthesise the history and development of the cases of HL and CSML

The case studies presented in chapter five summarise the heritage and attributes of the two case lambs, written from a perspective of brand-relevance.

Firstly the HL, its lifecycle is explained along with its territorial habit, namely its ability to learn grazing boundaries without the aid of physical prompts such as walls or hedges. This heafting ability tends to indicate that the animal knows its place, it has a certain expertise attached to that place, and its life depends on the produce of that place, in terms of the flora
which presents itself as grazing. By developing a generic HL brand, these place specific features of the product are lost. The statement here is not that the Lakeland fells are ‘not the same environment’ (which is true, different sub-strata, different soils, not to mention different aspect and altitude result in different fauna), the point here is retention of the purity of the product, which is in its intimate knowledge and experience of place. The boundary of that place is the farm.

The volume limitations on production of HL are discussed in relation to authenticity of the product (Chapter 4). The potential for a differing quality of output to be developed is identified, and this may take the form of Upland HL or Inbye HL, rather similar to the ‘extra-virgin olive oil’ and ‘olive oil’ classifications. The PDO award relates to ‘fresh meat and offal’ from the HL and includes no specification for time on the fell (UK-PDO-0005-0891). This is perhaps a consideration for the future, when technology may allow for verification.

The temporal positioning of HL is another feature to consider. Given recent trends in nostalgia (Brown, 1999) there is an opportunity to present HL as a pure, traditional food, accompanied by dated graphic images of farm practice. The advantage of this route is that the past tends to be more fixed in peoples’ minds than the present. In the sense that Sellafield-related issues or environmental influences such as ‘ash clouds’ do not affect the past-environment in the same way they do the present. However brand constituents need to have congruency and current endorsements (for example Prince Charles) may not fit with nostalgic imagery.

To summarise the HL case considers the brand essence of the HL, the brand strategy for the industry structure, potential brand communication emphasis for different markets and temporal positioning options. The CSML faces a different set of circumstances which are considered below.

The role of grazing stock on the salt marsh attracts the interest of multiple groups. Those passionate about the role of the marsh in fish and bird ecosystems can be wary about the contribution of stock on the salt marsh. However the practice of periodic grazing on the salt marsh is ancient, even if the product of it is not well established in consumers’ minds. This is latent heritage, yet to be exposed (Andersen and Philipsen, 1998).

It is possibly lifestyle rather than personality which is to be communicated for the CSML. Being of no specific breed it does not have a defined and recognised character. Instead it
occupies two places, permanent grassland and the salt marsh. It is a dynamic lifestyle, driven by nature and by the interplay between salt-tolerance and life stage.

The ‘place’ of CSML is discussed in liminology, as a place characterised by ‘morphological’ rather than ‘exact’ essences, a place which allows “the release of tension from the land to the sea” (Casey, 2011). Other connotations for the brand are provided by our perceptions of the sea and salt, the latter being somewhat tainted by recent public health messages. The emerging Holker Hall branded CSML adds a ‘noble’ aspect to the brand, whilst the French-connection is understood by some francophone foodies. Gastronomic qualities offer a fresh and light flavour, in direct contrast with the HL.

8.6 To evaluate consumer characterisations of HL and CSML in their production environments.

Consumer characterisations for each lamb are presented in HVMs (Appendices AE & AAA). Considering the traditional circular diagram of core, augmented and total product, discussion of the discussions which ensued about the two case interviews dwelt very little on examination of ‘the product’ description of meat colour, smell, the presence of marbling, neither did they dwell on packaging or claims made by supporting promotions (Dibb et al., 2001:254). Perhaps people do not think about embedded meat with reference to classical ‘product’ considerations.

For HL the core product is a cognitive, identity-related lamb choice. It is a symbol of Lakeland, visible in the landscape all year, a hardy survivor, nearly organic and considered wild. It has a strong flavour assisted by the grazing on the Lakeland fells. It is a high quality product suitable for a special occasion, or self-reward. Purchase of HL invites the consumer into the local community network, via sales direct from the farm/farmers’ market, local butcher or other, where they can develop trusting and satisfying relationships. This kind of provisioning reminds consumers of their parents, so they are operating within the local community, as well as re-living, and being comforted by memories of a past generation.

CSML offers some similar aspects to the HL. In that the provisioning routes are similar, the local community relationships are equally trust-based and satisfying. Provisioning is similarly akin to the practices of the past generation, and benefits associated with a nostalgic view accrue. Consumers reflect on the dynamic environment of changing tides, seasons, the time and tide aspect provokes reflection on life, age, and the mix with
connotations associated with the sea, results in wistful, escapist thinking. The English
tradition of lamb, and lamb on the boundary of England is recognised. The qualities of
saline plants and exposure to the healthy sea air make CSML a healthy and novel local
choice.

8.7 The hierarchy of benefits, identified by consumers which can be linked to
Cumbrian HL and CSML.

The purchase of either lamb offers advantageous ‘local’ attributes in the form of freshness,
low food miles. They are also considered high quality and simply the best lamb choice.
This trust in quality comes mainly from the visual contact and therefore perceived
transparency in production of the animal, which is also perceived as semi-wild/organic.
The trust in quality results in happy and satisfied family meals, and proud providers.
However, consumers achieve (with purchase of either lamb) extra emotional rewards
which do not exhibit in the purchase of anonymous lamb. The satisfaction of supporting
the local community, participating in the local community by developing relationships with
agricultural producers/their families, thereby gaining access to places (farms) and
community members who were not previously part of their lives. This enrichment to life is
a result of a peripheral aspect of the product (marketing mix component place), its
elements are community and place, and they link to the consumers’ identity/place values.

The specificities of either lamb come from heritage, breed, environment and husbandry,
these result in different responses:

The variety of flavour offered by the case lambs, contributes to variety, experience and
enjoyment of life or hedonism for those who enjoy and appreciate food. Regional lambs
then broaden the category of lamb for the consumer, increase options and allow for
detailed gastronomic composition.

Specifically for HL the deep coloured, strong flavoured, winter-warming meat provides
comfort and security, particular in winter months.

CSML is less understood, from a flavour perspective. Perceptions of the salt marsh
environment, the role of salt in the diet of the animal, the Holker Hall/French connection
are all mixed. Those who perceive these things positively, see the product as wild and
free, they associate this with freedom from stress, the time and tide aspect of the
environment forces reflection on life-cycle and time passing, which is linked to escapism
and contentment. This forces reflection on Wordsworth’s observation of the shepherd in the landscape two entities feeding of each other, in a symbiotic relationship.

Both case lambs are produced by multiple farmers, who make commercial decisions independently. At the initiation of this thesis simultaneously, several micro-brands were emerging for HL, alongside the Booths brand of HL, initiatives to jointly brand and sell HL in London at Borough Market via Farmer Sharp (sourcing from 24 farms) was being undertaken, as well as a local box system of sales through HL Direct. CSML is sold via butchers around the coast, and via Holker where the ‘French connection’ has been made in communications. An initial appraisal of this situation may have led to the conclusion, that this was confusing from a brand research perspective and inefficient from a brand development/resource perspective – and indeed was and remains so.

One important outcome of this research is to recognise that in brand development for these regional meats, the processes which lead to the achievement of clarity and efficiency at a regional level are at the same time erasers of value at the micro-level. From the market perspective a consumer rarely has a ‘sector’ view, they see only the meat in front of them. If in a butcher shop, meat has different farm origin labels on it – this is a familiar grocery experience for consumers, think about the biscuits aisle. As for efficiency, we must remember it is perfectly possible to design a mechanism with maximum efficiency and returns which cannot recruit a sustained membership (economists v sociologists).

Place experienced via community was a most significant finding. The ladders for both lamb types reveal considerable esteem being placed by respondents on relationships formed when buying meat direct from producers or from knowledgeable local butchers and by forming closer relationships with these community members. Purchasing direct from the producer may allow consumers access to a farm. This experience revealed latent demand in some consumers who had felt excluded from the farming community previously, for those who buy via farmers’ markets or other events they achieve a window into farming life through contact with a producer. The experience of place through food provisioning-formed community links, was very important as it added variety to the provisioning process, authenticity to the product and insight into local practice, place and heritage. The experience spoken of is generally with one producer/local butcher. This endorses the creation of micro brands, rather than a single overarching parent brand for HL/CSML.
Relative to the consideration of community it is pertinent to consider how consumers might construct a boundary around their community. It is interesting to recall the Parma Ham production defining characteristic (Chapter -2), which is produced within a geographical space delineated by rivers, the potential to divide the Lakeland landscape into valleys exists, and the salt marshes belong to different zones of the coast. Ilberry et al’s concepts of ‘short supply chains’ and ‘social and territorial embeddedness’ become very relevant (2006). Appleyard’s (1979) ‘expression of group identity through the connotive character of an environment’ is pertinent. Malpas (2007) discussed the word ‘place’ as encompassing ‘boundedness’ which seems to echo the desire for stronger ties between farming and non-farming communities. He also linked the connotation of ‘origin’ from which ‘something begins to unfold’, this is a rather forward thinking idea, alluding to positive effects on community cohesion, outputs resulting from increased, and managed farm access by the non-farming community.

8.8 Discuss branding recommendations for HL and CSML producers on the basis of research findings.

The literature outlined in Chapter 2 & Chapter 3, confirm The Lake District is a place embodied with heritage, emotional capital and awe benefitting from a resonance on a national scale (Urry, 2002). Within Cumbria amorphous nomenclature relating to place during recent lifetimes, leaves each geographical point with multiple relevant appellations. Local perception of boundaries or key defining symbols (tarn, valley, lake, and farm) of place may be more appropriate to define place. The empirical findings identify integration of farms and local communities as valuable, and may be enhanced through community involvement in the brand development process. This trend would counter the ‘definition by outsiders’ view expressed by Urry (2002) relating to The Lake District.

From the temporal perspective considering the permanence of place, Barjolle and Sylvander’s (2000) study, emphasised the transient aspect of those responsible for regional food production (referring to AO and GI) they emphasise the patrimonial quality of regional foods, in this sense the place of production will exist beyond the horizons of current stakeholders.

The mainstream branding literature has expanded to help fill the gap created by absent, fundamental, unique selling points, between one producer and another. The brand literature offers techniques which enable market response, by a brand largely independent of its products (Chapter 3). Small farm producers are not operating in this context. Their
production environment is characterised by local and regional specifics of flora and fauna and farming practice which are locked into the relative permanence of place, affording entirely defensible unique selling points.

Mintel (2011) identify a market segment which is middle aged and interested in the provenance of local foods. How a balance is achieved between volume restrictions on production of HL and CSML, and effort and willingness to engage and spend on behalf of the consumer, is something to arrive at through experimentation and testing of different distribution channels. Empirical results clearly show there is an appreciation of direct contact with the producer, and of building a trusting relationships.

Recent brand initiatives focus on the beneficial properties bestowed on the product by the environment and husbandry (Appendix A). Empirical results show scope for development of the lifescape and identity values which allow people to tie themselves to the local landscape and its agricultural communities via their food consumption. Building on the latter point, direct contact at farmers’ markets or at farm open-days or shops are possible responses. Chapter 6 includes an identification of gaps in existing models and a suggested route for farm brand development for embedded meats. Finding the balance between effective communication and avoiding ‘commodification of the countryside’ is an important consideration (Goulding, 2000; Urry, 2002).

8.9 Discussion on theoretical, practical and policy implications of brand recommendations

8.9.1 The theoretical findings of this thesis have drawn into question the adequacy of the conventional classification of attributes into search, experience and credence. It is recognised that credence attributes are formed through experience, and may influence search attributes (Darby and Kani, 1973; Anderson and Philipsen, 1998). However this experience is normally deemed to be prior experience of consumption of the product, in contrast with the case products it is the experience of the pre-production stage of the raw material for the final product which is the influencing factor.

To set the comments on attribute classification in context, these serve as categories for attributes which consumers identify as relevant to their own personal values via the means-end chain model (Gutman, 1982; Olson & Reynolds, 1983; Valette-Florence, 1997). In terms of the Total Food Quality Model (TFQM) (Grunert et al., 1996) the attribute categories and their associated values are incorporated along with multi-attribute approaches to quality perception. Significantly the TFQM is split into two time periods
before and after purchase. Brunso, Fjord & Grunert (2007) comment that the search characteristics are limited and secondary in importance to the experience of the food product in terms of determining quality. There is a slight shifting of emphasis between the implications of the findings of this thesis and the focus of the TFQM. Brunso, Fjord & Grunert (2007) assert that the achievement of quality, is less of a driver of purchase but that it contributes to satisfy purchase motives. This research confirms that respondents find consumption of the lamb in the landscape, and consumption of the local community experience to be significantly rich experiences which influence greatly the lamb eating experience. Moreover the credence characteristics are unquestionable, and perceived in a very different format to those considered in the TFQM, as they are not dependent on the information on a package or from a third-party, but built through first-hand experience.

For the case of embedded meats the TFQM may benefit from a further phase to the left of ‘Before Purchase’, termed Pre-Product Experience, to include credence building cues and experiences. The rooting of HL/CSML consumer knowledge in their pre-product and pre-brand state has also provided some challenges for some existing brand development models outlined in Chapter 6 along with an alternative model emerging from the empirical findings (Keller, 2008; Boatwright et al., 2009).

8.9.2 Practical implications of the empirical findings.

Practical implications of the empirical findings include the realisation that a multiplicity of individual farm brands is a more valid response to present the USPs of embedded meats and the wishes of consumers, than that of a regional brand. Farm brands permit specific insight relative to the landscape of the production site, husbandry-related priorities and personal enthusiasm of a producer to become part of the brand, and on which to base a relationship with consumers and stakeholders.

Although the products are embedded in the landscape and culture, the brands will be new entities. As the lambs are naturally embedded, there needs to be a drive towards locally embedding the emerging HL and CSML brands if they are to be seen as authentic by visitors. There is a deception associated with the idea of a ‘staged local brand’ meaning one that is developed for the tourists, but which does not have broad local awareness, acceptance or value (Sims, 2009). Pomering and White (2011) in the context of place branding decry the concoction of an image for tourists which “lacks legitimacy and hence persuasiveness”, the legitimacy of the new brands must be established. Therefore the first phase of branding must then have the objective of entrenching the brands locally, through
participation with local schools and local community events. In this process the social ontology of the place will serve to refine the brands into entities with local value (Aitken & Campelo, 2011). Once this is achieved then a second strategic branding phase of wider targeting to include the tourist market will follow.

In terms of policy and support the development of farm brands may cut across various product and service offerings from farms which have diversified post-foot and mouth. Therefore collaboration with initiatives and funds which prioritise diversification or tourism development for particular regions may be possible, in addition to initiatives which aim to support business development and food marketing.

8.9.3 Policy implications of the empirical findings.

In order to build pride in Cumbria’s regionally embedded meats, investment in communications about these must be supported. Unlike industrial producers, small hill/coastal farmers cannot flexibly respond to changes in product mix, to volume demand changes, or to TQM type controls on consistency (Juran, 1992). The embedded lamb products in question are crafted out of their local ecosystem, and subject to variations within it (Tregear, 2003). These limitations generally take the regional lambs out of the mainstream grocery sector (at least without the mediation of a third party) and place considerable cognitive demands on the consumer. These cognitive demands need to be addressed by supporting policy to facilitate dissemination of cultural and agricultural heritage knowledge for current and future generations, if marginal agricultural practices are to continue contributing to the economic wealth of the county.

Herdwick Lamb has achieved PDO status, yet CSML has no PGI status despite salt marsh lamb producers in Wales achieving this standard. Regional development policies may usefully include promotion of the achievement of both standards once they are valid. This would contribute generic promotion of both lambs indirectly.

Regional developmental policy will need to include rural commercial development through farm brand initiatives. For the production of farm brands the strategy and potential of farm brands will need to be sold to farmers. Consultants used should be local and have agricultural awareness in order to achieve successful outcomes. A relatively standard package of consultant/farmer meetings, community involvement, and scheduling of brand launch and supporting activities will need to be produced. In order to support new initiatives such as ‘farm open days’ a coordinating body should take responsibility for the
logistics of these activities within the context of the full raft of events taking place in the region.

8.10 Reflection on the thesis

The reflections included here relate to operation of the chosen method.

8.10.1 Soft-laddering interviews

Conduct of soft-laddering interviews is recognised as a demanding task. The temptation to allow a respondent to amplify areas of interest must be tempered by the need to develop the hierarchy of the effect of each particular nugget of information. The need to ‘reverse ladder’ must be recognised when a respondent jumps to the higher level of pay back (which first has to be recognised as such) risks cutting short a new line of information as the interviewer needs to follow each point through. As the interviewer was a novice in laddering interviewing, the results must suffer in their efficiency to extract the appropriate data. Patton (2005) discusses the importance of skilful interviewing and the impact this may have on data quality.

In addition the sequencing of research tasks comes into play. The author’s aim was to try to type up each transcription between one interview and the next. On reflection it might have been useful to construct ladder maps after each transcription was completed in order to recognise where mistakes or weaknesses might be coming into play. Essentially these were in incomplete chains, and missing reversing ladder opportunities. This factor relates to the author rushing into the field without having thoroughly prepared a realistic framework relating to timing of data processing, and without enough value being given to reflection gained through the transcription process. In the event these instances were found after having completed all forty interviews, and after locating a software which would permit drawing of ladder-maps. The learning will have to feed into the author’s further research work. That is the first perspective on initiation into soft-laddering interviewing and without wishing to negate inconsistencies outlined; this perhaps naively measures the findings against a purist view relating to a method which is hardly defined by a single rigid structure.

8.10.2 Working with the data collected

If we compare the attribute/consequence/value box-ticking involved in hard-laddering, it offers no room for story-telling or amplification around values which bring to light different perspectives based on the same attribute (Chapter 6). Sometimes hard laddering research instruments are based on coded responses to soft-laddering interviews, in which
case, detail has been collected and is then coded into narrow descriptors which become options on the hard laddering research instrument. It simply establishes that the value in question is present so that it may count towards construction of the HVM. It makes for speedy and succinct research outputs, with less detail on how the values manifest themselves. Chapter 6, shows evidence of some reticence on the part of the writer to reduce the data.

For purposes of brand development for embedded lamb, the scenarios which respondents offer echo so much the creative and ‘brand visioning’ processes used for newly formulated products, that to reduce these details via the coding process is missing a branding trick (Chapter 3). It may be possible to consider the development of recording of soft-laddering interviews in a similar vein to rich-pictures used in soft-systems analysis (Checkland and Scholes, 1990). An extra benefit of rich-picture development is the participatory side-effects which have been recognised as important in developing place-related brands (Charters and Spielmann, 2013). Perhaps it is sufficient to comment here that the process of reduction which necessarily occurs to produce the HVMs was an uncomfortable one, although it did not prevent achievement of research objectives. These comments open up ideas on non-verbal constructs in relation to brand knowledge, however they have been arrived at after the richness of verbal responses has been recognised (Coulter and Zaltman, 1994). The inclusion of a semiotic dimension could have added a valuable visual addition to the research (Harvey & Evans, 2001).

8.10.3 Derivation of an interpretivist perspective using MEC

The objective of interpretivism is to reveal an individual’s perspective on the world (Chapter 5). The soft-laddering interviews collect this data, but it is at later stages when the data are collated into HVMs that the researcher recognises it is possible to achieve a set of ladders which may not actually be represented by any one of the respondents singly. This is because it is the connections which are summed and not the individual chains from bottom to apex. Whilst most research methods will collate primary data collected, the norm is surely to have the majority view represented as the results, the HVM potentially represents a chain of thought which is not recognised by any of the respondents. For the researcher this is one further reason to focus more on individual ladder maps than on the more convenient HVM. Others suggest a response to this limitation is perhaps the selection of a homogeneous group of respondents (Veludo-de-Oliveira et al., 2006).
8.11 Recommendations for further study
The opportunities for further development evolve from findings and from use of a specific method.

8.11.1 Brand development semiotics
Reflection on the soft laddering technique with MEC has revealed that there may be opportunities to use rich pictures for local branding initiatives (Checkland and Scholes, 1990). Co-production of rich pictures may provide a way of deconstructing the lifescape experiences of the lamb to form relevant reference points (positive and negative) for brand development. Involvement of local community groups may expose the social ontology of place in a graphical and active format (Rindell et al., 2011). This study would involve an extension of Kotler and Keller’s (2005) view of brand image as “the perceptions and beliefs held by consumers, as reflected in the associations held in consumer memory”. Where these associations will come from previous experience of the pre-product, rather than earlier experiences of the brand.

8.11.2 Attribute classification and embedded meats
Further consideration of the experience attribute in relation to embedded meats to consider pre-search experiences. Similarly to reflect on composition, timing and control of experience based marketing. This study would robustly review the origin and use of attribute categories, and explore the limitations of the current set against embedded meats (Darby and Karni, 1973; Steenkamp, 1989; Andersen, 1994; Grunert et al., 1995).

8.11.3 Brand visioning for the future
Consider the trajectory of consumer thinking about local meat. Over repeated visits to farms consumers may move their focus from the farm and its inhabitants to the production process and become more aware of the ‘days on the fells/on the salt marsh’ and its influence on the taste relative to the price. How can farmers maintain the initial level of interest from buyers, and maintain perceived value. This paper would result in predictions of a dynamic life-cycle model for farm brands, which would facilitate the brand management process (Bennett & Rundel-Thiele, 2005).

8.12 Summary
The typology of regional food seems to vary with the cognitive commitment offered to it as well as the location of purchase and environment of purchase and consumption. The recognition of the term of naturally embedded food products is understood by those interested in studying regional foods, this population has not constituted a demand
significant enough to stimulate the provision of a relevant set of statistics on production of regional meats. Such lack of official identity, may mean that the products easily disappear from the fells and marshes, from generic lamb statistics and from our farmers’ markets, given changing environmental priorities (8.3). From the consumer perspective this absence would leave a void in relation to their environmental concerns, their role in the local community and their identity and with the landscape and the culture of the place in which they live. An argument has been presented for community involvement in development of micro-brands which facilitates scrutiny and appreciation of the local topography and husbandry practices as perceived by local consumers.
References


Centre for Advanced Spatial Analysis, CASA  University College London, *Cornish Migration Patterns*. 


Accessed on 24/11/09


DEFRA ERDP Report North West Chapter, Section 1.4.5 Food Processing. 

DEFRA, Government Strategy on Regional Food. 


fourth international symposium on livestock farming systems. the Netherlands
EAAP Publication 89, Wageningen.

Elliott, R., Ritson, M. (1995), Practicing existential consumption: the lived meaning of


Europa, for information on PDO/PGI/TSG applications Available


Community Trademarks for the Marketing of Agricultural Products in the
European Union. *International Review of Intellectual Property and
Competition Law (IIC)* vol. 41, (6) 1-30.
Available: [http://qmro.qmul.ac.uk/jspui/handle/123456789/2047](http://qmro.qmul.ac.uk/jspui/handle/123456789/2047)


FARMA (June 2004) original research commissioned through YouGov. FARMA the
national farmer’s retail and market organisation.

attitudes towards branded fresh meat products, *Farm Management*, 8:11,
pp.502-512.


Available: [http://www.fellsanddales.org.uk/featured_project/holker.htm](http://www.fellsanddales.org.uk/featured_project/holker.htm)


French varieties of salt marsh lamb online

French breeds of salt marsh lamb.


257


Mintel (2004) Food Retailing UK.


National Sheep Association (2006) Telegraph:02/02/06; available at: http://www.nationalsheep.org.uk/


North West Food Alliance Newsletter, Spring 2005.


Promar International (2002) North West Food and Drink Cluster Study


Rawling, W. (ND) *Homage to the HL: Cumbria’s unique breed of sheep*.


Salt marsh lamb group in Wales. Available at: wda.co.uk (Accessed 2/6/08).


(Accessed on 4/6/06)


Tregear, A. (ND) Tradition and Territory as marketing Resources in Rural Areas. Working Paper, School of Agriculture, Food and Rural Development, University of Newcastle.


In addition personal communications with Veronica Waller at Cumbria Fells and Dales, and Geoff Brown at the HL Sheep Breeder’s Association have provided information on the process of the PDO/PGI application process.
### Appendix A  The salient claims in current Herdwick sales promotional materials

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>Producer</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provenance-envir.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Taste England’s finest landscape</td>
<td>Lakeland’s gardeners</td>
<td>Hardy sheep</td>
<td>Suited to harsh conditions on the LakeDistrict fells</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provenance-grazing</td>
<td></td>
<td>Grazing wild herbage</td>
<td>Grazing heather and grasses</td>
<td>Free range Grazing on heather, mixed leaves, grasses and berries</td>
<td>Sparse diet of leaves, grasses and berries</td>
<td>Grazed on wild grasses, herbs, heathers and mosses.</td>
<td>Wild herbage of the open fells</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provenance-culture</td>
<td></td>
<td>Eaten at the Coronation dinner 1953</td>
<td>Ancient skills in judgement associated with hanging</td>
<td>Grazed on the open fells for over 1000 years</td>
<td>National delicacy.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breed specific</td>
<td></td>
<td>Slowly maturing</td>
<td>Lean meat</td>
<td>Long natural life</td>
<td>Small size with flavour</td>
<td>Greater maturity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local</td>
<td></td>
<td>Use local slaughter and cutting facilities to support the local economy. Reduce food miles</td>
<td>Heritage of the valley. Traceable</td>
<td>Cumbria’s own sheep.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumer reward</td>
<td></td>
<td>Play your part in maintaining the cultural heritage of Lakeland</td>
<td>Support as part of our heritage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food science</td>
<td></td>
<td>Contains Omega 3 fatty acids</td>
<td>High in Omega 3 Hung 7-10 days.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitive claims</td>
<td></td>
<td>Flavour superior to lowland breeds</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: compiled from web sites and promotional materials of Herdwick producers and retailer.
Appendix B  Invitation to participate as respondent

April ‘07

Participate in Some Local Research and Contribute to the School Funds at the Same Time?

Gillian Rodríguez (Hannah’s mum) is doing some research on lamb consumption, she is interested in talking to you about lamb if you have lived in the Lakeland area for a minimum of 5 years. The interview is on a one-to-one basis, which can be done at their home in Whinfell over a cup of tea, at the Brewery Cafe, or at yours, whichever you prefer. The discussion focuses on your general consumption habits and thoughts on lamb. The time element involved is 40-60 minutes.

The information gathered is for academic purposes only, and the information you give is anonymous, you will be categorised as ‘a lamb consumer/non-consumer’. None of your quotes on the theme will ever be attached to your name in print.

Each interview will result in a £5 donation to Selside School funds.

Please contact Gillian direct on Rodgz4@yahoo.co.uk, or 01539 824373
### Appendix C  Herdwick Respondent Details

| Socioec\n
|omic \n
| Class. | Date of \n
| Interview 2007 | H \n
| = consumed | Sourced |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | B | Feb | NH | School |
| 2 | B | March | H | School |
| 3 | B | April | H | School |
| 4 | B | April | NH | School |
| 5 | B | April | NH | School |
| 6 | C1 | April | NH | School |
| 7 | B | May | NH | School |
| 8 | E | May | H | Via Producer |
| 9 | E | May | H | Via Producer |
| 10 | C2 | March | H | Via Producer |
| 11 | B | April | H | Via Producer |
| 12 | E | Feb | H | Snowball |
| 13 | C2 | July | NH | Snowball |
| 14 | C2 | July | NH | Snowball |
| 15 | B | July | NH | School |
| 16 | C2 | July | H | Snow |
| 17 | E | Sept | NH | Snowball |
| 18 | C2 | Sept | NH | School |
| 19 | E | Sept | NH | Snowball |
| 20 | C2 | Oct | H | Snowball |

| Total | 8B | 1C1 | 6C2 | 5E | 9H 11NH | 9 School |
| 4 Via producer | 6 Acquaintance | 1Snowball |
## Appendix D  Cumbrian Salt Marsh Lamb Respondent Details

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Socioeconomic class</th>
<th>Date 2007</th>
<th>CSML Consumer</th>
<th>Sourced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 B</td>
<td>Feb</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 C1</td>
<td>July</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 C1</td>
<td>July</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 C1</td>
<td>July</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 C1</td>
<td>Aug</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>HB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 B</td>
<td>Oct</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 B</td>
<td>Oct</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 B</td>
<td>Mar</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 E</td>
<td>Mar</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 E</td>
<td>Feb</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 C1</td>
<td>Jan</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 B</td>
<td>Jan</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 E</td>
<td>Mar</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 C1</td>
<td>Mar</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 C1</td>
<td>Mar</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 C1</td>
<td>June</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 E</td>
<td>June</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 E</td>
<td>June</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 B</td>
<td>Aug</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 B</td>
<td>Aug</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Snowball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>10 yes 10 no</td>
<td>9 Acquaintance 2 School 1 Howbarrow 8 Snowball</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix E Themes Guide for HL and CSML interviews & Prompts

- Amongst other meats – taste, flexibility, husbandry
- Social role
- Seasonal consumption/occasions
- Health/local/ethical/wild
- Taste and environment link
- Provisioning community
- Mutton
- Who does it appeal to (add prompts)
- History
- Romantic Lakeland Vision
- Role in the landscape
Shepherd's Pie

Ingredients:
- 400g (1 1/2 lb) cooked meat or
- 500g (1 lb) chopped beef
- 2 medium onions, chopped
- 1 large potato, peeled and cut into chunks
- 100g (4 oz) mushrooms, sliced
- 100g (4 oz) button mushrooms, sliced
- 50g (2 oz) butter
- 50g (2 oz) plain flour
- 150ml (1/4 pt) milk
- 150ml (1/4 pt) hot beef stock
- 50g (2 oz) cheddar cheese, grated
- 25g (1 oz) black pudding
- salt and pepper

Method:
1. Preheat the oven to 200°C (400°F).
2. In a large saucepan, fry the onions and butter until soft.
3. Add the meat, flour, and black pudding, and stir to coat.
4. Gradually add the milk and beef stock, bring to a boil, and simmer for 10 minutes.
5. Drain the potatoes and mash with milk and butter.
6. Pour the meat mixture into a pie dish and top with mashed potatoes.
7. Sprinkle with grated cheese and bake for 20 minutes or until golden.

Lakeland Herdwick Lamb

I wandered lonely as a cloud,
Herdwicks have evolved into stocky sheep with large bones to help them cope with harsh fell conditions. Each young sheep, takes longer to mature, yielding leaner cuts of meat which are a food connoisseur's delight.

Borrowdale’s Herdwicks have been bred in the valley for generations. So you can enjoy each farm-fresh and locally prepared joint secure in the knowledge of its heritage.

BORROWDALE HERDWICK MEAT

Meat Characteristics

Gammon - Full flavoured
Meat is as tender as other breeds of lamb but with the fuller flavour of mutton. Carcasses are smaller due to sheep size, so specific cuts are a major selling point. Their external fat layer for weather protection means no marbling in the flesh, resulting in a healthier cut of meat.

Borrowdale Herwick meat is fully traceable.

OTHER BREEDS

From 4 Months Old
1 Lamb
40-50 Kilos
Lambing often in the first season.

Meat Characteristics

Milder-tasting
Paler colour.
Available nationwide.
Larger cut of meat.

SUPPORTED BY
THE NATIONAL TRUST
Herdwick
Slowly matured for people with taste

Our Farm

With our attractive upmarket, Wee Tree Farm Herdwick Sheep, a lovely place to be

Seasonal Lamb

Herdwick are the farm's own sheep and are widely considered the hardiest of all Britain's hill sheep. They are perfectly designed to withstand the severe winds and harsh conditions found on high Lake District hills. The Herdwick's meat is lean and tender, with a rich, complex flavour. The lambs are smaller than cross-bred breeds, leaner and higher in nutritional quality.

Savour the flavour of the fells

www.heritageweers.co.uk
Holker Saltmarsh Lamb
This is our famous saltmarsh lamb as seen of TV, featured on radio and in countless publications. Over 3000 acres of nationally protected saltmarsh is used to support this product and in the process it supports many farmers, maintains our coastline and provides habitats for wading birds.

The saltmarsh is inundated by the tide every month and as a result very different grasses flourish. These sea grasses produce a very flavoursome lamb which is a delicacy in France. The lamb is naturally very lean, perhaps the healthiest of its kind. Sheep are removed from the saltmarshes briefly during spring tides but are they are keen to quickly return. Whether it is the sea washed turf they prefer, the lack of fences, sea air or simply the unbeatable views; we’ll never know.

You may order whole or half lambs from Higginsons Butchers of Grange Over Sands on 015395 34367. Alternatively, individual cuts are available from our Food Hall.

FREE NATIONAL DELIVERY

£148.00

Appendix F  Transcript Sample HL

Non-Consumer of Herdwick (13)  21 Feb 2007

G Have you eaten Herdwick

D I am not aware, if I saw it on a menu, on a local restaurant menu then I would chose it, I would chose lamb over the other red meats, but I can’t claim to have eaten it.

G What is it about lamb that you would prefer over other meats.

D Em, it seems to me that it is the least intensively farmed, which might be wrong but I’ve lived near cow dairy and meat farming, and it seems more intensive, like I have seen calves inside a barn for a whole winter, and you wouldn’t see that with sheep. So it feels like the meat is more like I would chose venison, because deer are wild and they are always moving around on the hills and they are on the go and stuff, and it seems like a better choice, from healthier meat really. Because the more intensively farmed things are to me they are less healthy. That’s my idea.

G How long have you lived in the lakes?

D Since 1989
G About 20 years, is there a region of the lakes that you would associate more with the Herdicks?

D Em, not knowingly,

G In terms of geographical zones, on the lowland or on the higher land?

D Oh I definitely expect them to be high land sheep, that’s why I would find it more attractive. It sounds to me like a tough hardy breed.

G Being on the high lands, what sort of fodder might they eat, do you know any of the plants

D I don’t know the names but it can only be better up there, because it is wild and it is higher up. So there are less people, less pollution, so it is as good as it can get really isn’t it. I suppose the only pollution it gets is from the rain. I think that the water higher up is cleaner, nearer the source, whatever the vegetation is it is going to be better than the on the lowland. I mean sheep eat what is there don’t they.

G Have you heard of the hefting instinct that the Herdwick have.

D No

G The idea of learned boundaries relating to the common land.
D How long do the lambs have to stay with the mothers to learn that, you know with the lowland sheep there is this mass exodus when the lambs are taken away from the mothers, does that happen less with the high land sheep?

G Are there any aspect of sheep farming which you have noticed?

D Well I live in a shepherds cottage on a sheep farm so I see all the tending to the sheep, I think I am about 1000 ft above sea level. I see the lambs now near Kendal, but I know that the lambing near me is later, not until the end of April/May, so I am aware of that. So I am aware of the lambing time approaching and these tinsy winsy new born babies are all over the road and I have to drive very carefully, so they don’t go under the car. I see the shepherd and I see the sheep every day.

G Do you recognise the herdwick

D I am pretty sure the ones near me are not herdwicks, I think they have a darker wool, purpley colour and grey. They are pretty sheep, very bonny. The ones I see definitely none are Herdwicks.

G What do you think of the idea that the taste of the meat might be affected by what it consumes, I mean could you tell the difference between New Zealand lamb and Herdwick.

D Yes I could tell the difference that makes absolute sense to me.

G So you would expect the taste to reflect the herbage of the top of the fells

D Yes definitely

G You said you would normally chose foods locally sourced, what drives you to do that

D I think it is health ethics, environmental, not sure which would come first. I often buy organic but that isn’t always local, so I will often buy organic over non organic because I think it is healthier. I would assume the herdwick is a healthy choice and from a local point of view I think it is great to support local producers, and its got to be fresher hasn’t it. Its bound to be fresher, and stuff that has travelled I do think it suffers in some way, I don’t think it has the energy in it as the fresh stuff.

G Is there any feature about your meat purchase which drives your food decision making

D My shopping’s for all of us, my diet is much more healthy since I had my children, from the idea of being a responsible parent and filling their bodies with healthy food. Cause my eating wasn’t that healthy before I got pregnant. Since then I am much more aware, I think if you don’t bring children up on healthy food, then it is much harder for them to make the choice later on. I think unhealthy food choice is really easy, and they don’t necessarily know what food is. So I will do my best and they can make their choice later on, and if they dip into unhealthy food then it won’t be so detrimental, because they have a good start. They will go through that stage and come through the other side, I think it is fundamental to their growing up to know that. So mostly I cook, I buy fruit and veg.
and we eat meat quite minimally, Matty is vegetarian so I can’t get any meat down her. When we lived in Ireland we ate a lot of lamb, that was the most that I have eaten of lamb when I was living in Ireland.

G Was there any particular kind

D There was just a lot of it, in the shops it has a really high profile, the lamb so I would buy it in the shops. So I just felt driven to buy and eat lamb as we were surrounded by sheep farming. We ate a lot of lamb

G If you invited family around for a meal perhaps people not familiar with the area, and you cooked them herdwick lamb, what might you tell them about it.

D I did have that feeling that they are wilder and harder and they have a very thick fleece and they look really pretty they are really cuddly, I like the look of them, some sheep can be quite ugly. I think I could talk about them quite warmly. With herdwick aswell, the textile stuff, I could talk about the use of the fleece locally, and there is a Herdwick association I think I don’t know what else.

G Is there any aspect of the history of the lakes that you might associate with the herdwick.

D No I am not big on history

G Any artists?

D Alan Stone

G Is he the guy in between Windermere and Bowness?

D Maybe I am more familiar with his line drawing which is in charcoal on very textured paper which is quite large scale. They are minimal but say everything there is to say about a sheep. He has a mural in the Penrith library. That is who I associate with it locally.

G Poetry

D I listen to contemporary poetry, which I really like and I am less drawn to the historic stuff, oh I read a book by Fred Nevinson which is a farmer who lived in the house I now live in he was a shepherd, I read his book and there is a lot of poetry he wrote. And also there used to be these meets, shepherds meets, and they would perform and sing, and it was all about the hunting and shepherding. He is dead now but Brian moved out, his son, and he has done shepherding all his life. I read that poetry and it has such a connection to where I am living.

G These people who have done shepherding, what activities do you think about

D The herding, bottle-feeding lambs that have been rejected, there’s a barn up the valley where I see them being herded for sheering, they herd them up at the top gate sometimes and they do something up there, and I think they might be injecting them, the sheep seem not too happy about it, there is always, the sheep seem frightened an there is
always a load of shit on the road, because they do when they get frightened, so up at the top gate, they are administering something.

G They do inject them instead of dipping and they worm them

D I have a friend at Boroughbridge you know in the dip, everything that goes in his house comes out of it smelling of sheep dip. They store it under his house. And as soon as he opens the door in his house, it smells like antiseptic or something. I never knew what it was but now I know they store it in the room under his house. I remember driving around Cumbria for years I have smelt that smell in various places, and I thought what is that smell of germoline or something, and I never new what that smell was and it is sheep dip. I remember once in Kendal there were a load of sheep coming down the street once and they all stank and there was this great smell so they had obviously been herded somewhere to be dipped, so there is the dipping and the shearing and the lambing and the herding.

G It is lovely to see a large herd isn’t it. I was going to ask you about the seasonal pattern of your knowledge of the sheep,

D Well there is the highland and the lowland time so there is that, they are more in the lowland in the winter and in the summer they are right on the top. So the grazing areas are different in winter and summer. Apart from that the sheep tend to just hang out don’t they, they don’t appear to need looking after, they seem to need one another, but as long as they are all together, they’re hardy, when I go home to my warm cosy house I have really come to respect them, I think respect to you, you know out here all weathers.

G The shearing, its nice to see, but it has changed from the small scale social task of many hands to become industrial, there are contractors which do the rounds don’t they now, not like in the pictures in the book you mentioned by Nevinson.

D It must be such a relief to shed that heavy load.

G And the lambing

D What I associate with the lambing is a lot of foxes being killed, our neighbour displays the fox tails like trophies, which I find quite offensive actually. She has got about 15 fox tails just hanging recently, when I got home the other day there was a whole fox hanging over the wall in a very bad state, a very bad state, it looked like it had been killed by a machine-gun actually, I did actually complain about that, they had left it where the children could see it. I said it was disrespectful to an animal and disrespectful to us to leave it out like that. I associate that with the lambing time as well, they don’t want the fox to have any of their lambs.

G About the uptake of a name, it used to be the case that you might have eaten Herdwick lamb but you wouldn’t know it, now it is more likely that it would be branded as Herdwick, what do you think of that development

D I like it I think it feels good, even the word Herdwick is lovely it’s a nice word and it conjures up…….yeah I think its good and its and appreciation of what is really around rather than being a bit homogenous, because with mass production and supermarkets things are a lot more homogenous. And that doesn’t appeal to me as much as things being a lot more individual and more recognised, I like that.
G What about the costs involved does it matter

D When things are tight it does matter to me, but I’ve probably got less money than those around me but I will always spend more on healthy food, because I feel that there is my health insurance, I am not paying into some daft health insurance fund, because they probably won’t be very good when you’re seriously ill really. So I think of those extra money….that’s the one place …I don’t smoke and I hardly drink, I hardly spend on alcohol, there are a lot of things I am happy to cut back on in order to have healthy food. And I will spend a bit more, and I am not someone who has a lot of money, so it is important.

G What sort of people do you think buy this kind of product, people with high level of income or discerning people

D I think it would be people across different incomes now, because there are people who chose lifestyles now which don’t generate a lot of income but they do it with awareness of, you know it’s a conscious choice to live differently, so they might not be high income. Then again a lot of people on high incomes don’t necessarily have time to cook or eat properly, and they will eat convenience stuff, and food isn’t necessarily a priority for some people who are high earners really. So I think it is a bit across the board really.

G But you definitely associate local food with better quality food

D Generally yes, it is not an easy option, so people devote themselves to it because it is what they really want to do, or they have a passion for doing it, and when things are done in that way, its fresher, its maybe done from a better outlook, its smaller scale and smaller scale to me often, and for smaller scales to survive they have to be offering quality, because they can’t compete with high volume. Its not easy making money in a local small business, and that is a reason to support it and pay a little bit more. A lot of cheap thing, there’s a lot of, involve a lot of exploitation in getting them at that price, that’s another ethical thing. So local does feel like quality, it’s a bit like the arts and crafts market you can only survive offering quality because there is so much imported.

G What about the place you purchase these products, where do you buy meat?

D Sometimes I buy organic meat, I suppose Herdwick wouldn’t have the organic label but it probably is as good as, isn’t it. So sometimes supermarket, I buy organic chickens in the supermarket, and when I am feeling quite rich, I buy, there’s a guy who has an organic meat thing at the Wednesday market, he was there today, and I buy organic lamb which is really nice, and he sells organic chickens, but his chickens are so much more expensive than the Morrisons ones. So occasionally I will buy from there because they do taste much nicer than the Morrisons ones, but I can’t actually afford to buy from him all the time, but his lamb is lovely. I don’t frequent butcher’s shops because I don’t buy a lot of meat, so I don’t really go, and the reason I started buying from the organic man in the market is because I used to buy from the organic veg stall, and then he set up next to the organic veg stall, then the fish shop is just there as well. And I really liked that because I thought I can get my fish, my veg and meat and its all really healthy and that’s really nice. But I can’t always afford to go to the organic market, so I go to Morrisons, mostly I go to Morrisons. So I would buy it from Morrisons, because the supermarkets are getting on that sort of bandwagon now, aren’t they, aren’t they? No,( I think they tell us that they are.) Well Booths is good, yes Booths is different. I really like Booths for that region, but
my shopping at the till is always hefty. So when I am flush I will go to Booths because it feels like a completely different shopping experience.

G   Have you ever bought anything direct?

D   No I haven’t, the farm where the foxtails are they sell lamb, but buying direct I would need a freezer and only recently I have bought one. Oh Raymond Crawford gave me some meat when I first came here (landlord) he would just reach into his freezer and give me some really nice bits of local meat, I always thought Oh that’s nice it has just gone straight from the local farmer into his freezer, and then he’s handed it over, and there is something about that. I would find it attractive, but unless I find myself in a situation where it is relatively sort of available, and I haven’t really found it. I am thinking about the lamb now I would like to eat some.

G   What is this Lamb Henry you were mentioning?

D   Its in a sauce, I don’t do it but I ‘ve had it at a pub in Shap, the one on the right as you go in. The pub is quite good not very good, I am fussy about my food. I normally cook it in the oven, I have bought mince lamb and I do that like a bolognaise, but I haven’t done it for a while with Matty becoming vegetarian it has sort of, yeah yeah, I haven’t don it for a while.

D   I was going to say that in Cumbria they are really good at promoting local food, the newspaper always has a section and the shows. I always go around tasting and I would like to buy my food from these people, you know talking directly with the producer, I don’t always follow it up afterwards. The farmer’s market that is the other place, you know when you asked me where, I used to make the effort to go, but I haven’t recently.
Appendix G Transcript sample CSML
Non-salt marsh lamb consumer 1

21 Feb 2007

G You have never bought salt marsh lamb deliberately

K No I don’t think so.

G Are you aware of it being sold

K There is a butchers on the front at Arnside, run by a French guy, and whenever I go in there, I don’t like the feeling of it, so I don’t buy anything in there.

G You don’t like the feeling of the butchers, what is it?

K I don’t know, when he first opened he sold a lot of meats that were, sort of processed, so there would be like chicken breasts in coriander and lemon sauce, and everything seemed to be coated in gloop, and I don’t know just the colour of the meat to me, I don’t know. I am not the only one who has said that, there’s something about it I’d rather go to the butchers at Milnthorpe, and there is no rhyme or reason. It looks clean, in Arnside, and I noticed last year that it did have a sign outside a particular offer, a blackboard saying local salt-marsh lamb.

G And the one in Milnthorpe does that sell it too?

K I wasn’t aware that they do, I don’t buy it an awful lot because it is rather expensive, for a leg, which is what I would tend to buy. Or sometimes minced lamb and make you know.

G And if it was minced lamb would you notice the breed?

K Yes, occasionally I think it does say ‘local’ in Milnthorpe, but I can’t remember specifically.

G Is there any particular value that you think it might gain by being from the local salt marsh.

K Presumably the flavour would be better with the local grazing and the transport of the animal would be better. I presume, well I remember a farming family called the Blands, and they have a farm with the land on the embankment, and they let the sheep on there after the high tides, and they take the turf off there as well.

G Why do they take the turf off?

K To sell it, as turf for gardens. I know that he grazes his sheep on there so I presume the local salt-marsh lamb will be from there, unless it is from the other side of the estuary and I don’t know what the land is like there.
G Which other side Ulverston?

K No a bit further back this way, what is that place, Witherslack, you see a sign going off to the left, those are all flood fields aren’t they. Between Witherslack and Grange. Directly opposite us is Whitbarrow Scar, so that apron of land in front of there.

G I was thinking what the fodder is there and how it might compare with the fodder of other lamb

K I suppose you romantically think that the salt that will be in the grass will make the meat taste nicer. But, then I suppose it is a tidal estuary and it will have slurry outlets and it will have a high nitrates. But then I have a friend who is an environmental scientist at Lancaster Uni and he says that the estuary is exceptionally clean. So in his research, so I don’t know who you believe.

G You walk a lot on the edge there do you know the names of the plants you find there?

K You get a bit of samphire, thrift, I can’t think of anything else.

G And do you see the sheep grazing where you walk

K Yes on the embankment the sheep are out there, after the spring and the autumn high tides they put them out.

G Have you ever seen them bring the sheep in because there is going to be a high tide?

K No, cause I think they put them out after they have lambed and after the spring tide, then bring them in, they are out there in the autumn though, I can’t remember when they do bring them in, but I remember being out there and it being frosty and there being sheep. And also that all of a sudden the footpath is so much nicer to walk on, they tend to collect, they sit on the embankment because on the other side of the embankment there is a piece of woodland and they go down there once it gets cold. Presumably it’s a bit sheltered, so when it is cold it is very muddy and covered in crap basically along the footpath along the top.

G Do you ever go around the Holker area, have you been to Holker Hall, they sell the Pre-sale salt marsh lamb, likening it to the French product.

K The French influenced stuff hasn’t appeared on this side of the estuary.

G Is there any particular breed of sheep which you would associate with grazing on the local salt marshes.

K Yes but I don’t know the names of them, unless they are Herdwick, I know they are not Herdwick, but I could spot them. I don’t know the names of breeds of sheep. When you go around the country you see that they are different, I can’t remember where I went recently and saw some sheep which looked so huge, to what I am accustomed to seeing. They have some of the same in Silverdale.
G: How would you describe the ones which you would see on the salt marsh

K: Just bog standard sheep, small, they don’t have very long necks, they aren’t like the little Jacobs, they are just normal sheep. Not very many black ones or not tri coloured.

G: Its quite a nice environment for them to live in isn’t it.

K: I guess they live a pretty-organic life really, apart from the dipping, and presumably they give them worming stuff don’t they, I don’t know.

G: I have read that sheep grazed on the salt marsh are wormed less.

In terms of lamb what do you cook

K: You seal a leg off and put it in a, I can’t remember the name of the dish, it might be Moroccan. Then you put white wine, oregano and lemon and put a lid on and cook it like that. Otherwise it tends to be links lamb, as I have said to you earlier we have just bought a full lamb, and we had great fun trying to decipher which part is which before we put it in the freezer in bags. We have eaten the liver.

G: What type of lamb is that?

K: I don’t know I didn’t ask him, they do have some Jacobs, but I don’t think it is one of those, I think he keeps those more as a pet. He is not a proper farmer, he is a retired headmaster and he is an artist as well. If you said a few breeds I might recognise it.

G: Well there are Leicester’s, Suffolk’s, Swaledales, Rough fell sheep, Jacobs. How often do you have lamb.

K: I do buy it more than any other meat, because I believe it to be more organic than any other meat, but I can’t afford to buy organic meat very often. We have lamb and mint koftas that sort of thing. Recently I started buying more beef, I stopped eating it years ago, even before BSE, and now I think it is probably one of the safest meats to eat. So slowly started eating more of it. Maybe once or twice a month.

G: If you buy the minced lamb to make koftas, because you feel it is more towards organic style than many other meats, do you check where it is from?

K: I just assume that it is local because it is from a local butchers. I do get some from Sizergh Barn, and there you can see if it is from Mansergh Hall, or wherever, Pinwheels I buy if I am in a rush home from Kendal.

G: What are pinwheels

K: Its minced lamb and sage or thyme and rolled on a puff pastry and you can put them straight in the oven. If I go to a supermarket, then I buy organic meat, and if they have one which says the beef comes from Argentina and the other is Scottish beef, I will pick up the Scottish meat regardless of the price. I sort of am aware but I wouldn’t ask in a butchers.

G: Why is the Scottish better?

K: Just so that it is not imported and fresher, so food miles. Sometimes price affects my choice, it just depends how much I have to spend.
G I think of you growing up in this landscape because I know you grew up in Arnside and played on the beach. What would you tell your guests about the lamb if you cooked it for them.

K Just that it is local, this is local produce from a local butcher.

G Might you expect it to taste any different?

K I don’t know how much flora and fauna…….you’d like to think that there are, I presume that the is wild thyme and chervil and things like that in the salt marsh, I don’t know that there is. You do get some tiny flowers in the spring and summer, white and purple, the purple ones could be thyme. Probably that you would hope that that lamb had a good life it was local, that it didn’t have to go far to be slaughtered. I didn’t know that a Suffolk sheep was not local to this area. You would like to think that it was a local breed.

G Have a look at this promotional material from Holker and sample.

K Everything there is pretty much what we spoke about, they mention the local butchers, the only thing I find slightly amusing is the local ‘Lakeland Flavour’, I mean what is a Lakeland flavour, bit of limestone hmm. There is a bit about it far from tasting salty I wouldn’t have thought it would taste salty but I would have thought it might have affected the taste of the meat. So I suppose having it described as light and sweet, I mean what is a ‘light’ flavour anyway? They are trying to push the high quality by comparing it to the Pre-sale, but I hadn’t heard of that before. There is nothing unusual there. It goes on about Higginsons quite a lot.

G What do you think about the addition of the Holker brand to the product?

K What do you mean

G Well Holker Hall, have their own delicatessen,

K Yes I remember spending a lot of money there last time I visited. Yes I think it is good, there is an industry to support, catering, it’s a local business which provides an income, they get their income from this, they don’t make money from people walking around the gardens not at this time of year. You want to go somewhere where you can have a tea and a nice fat cake don’t you.

G You’ve got children, how many of your decisions on food purchase are influenced by that fact?

K You become more opinionated don’t you. Because your children make you stand up to be counted. I think they probably, when my children were born, 13 years ago, that is when I became aware of the organic movement, and I feel that then is when it started. I used to have to go out of my way to buy a jar of organic baby food. Whereas now you can readily buy it, so there has been a huge expansion. So maybe if I had had children 10 years earlier it would have not been an issue. During the maturing phase of those 13 years, I still do care about what I am putting in my mouth. I can’t bring myself to buy a cheep chicken. If I am out at a restaurant I will err away from the chicken because I think it will be the cheapest that they can lay their hands on.
Where is that worry coming from, is it because of the effects it may have on your health or because of the ethical considerations in relation to the production process.

Both, I think on the health side it will just be a one off. If I went to someone’s house and they had bought a cheap as chips chicken, I would just eat it as a one off, and not make a fuss.

Its not just health then its also the production ethic

Yes and sheep do have a fairly natural life

You mentioned the romantic notion that lamb may take on the flavours from the surroundings. Are there any other claims which you might make about the sheep in this environment.

I guess they are kept with their mothers for as long as possible, which is true of most lambs. There is also a minimum of human interference around here. they are left to their own devices, it is a common sight to see a drowned sheep laying on the estuary. They are brought in for sheering and lambing, the production side.

The landscape is wild rather than tame, it sounds quite dangerous

Yes there are so many people that have been killed, there was the father and son out with his phone, I know people who walk with their dogs right across, but I think they are mad. I saw a couple of lads over a few days doing some cross country training, just running across the sands, I just think it is not worth the risk. But then I have been brought up with it. Before Arnside I lived in Morecambe, as long as I can remember you know, tides are dangerous, the sands are dangerous. You don’t mess with that. Every summer the lifeguards are sent out and there is someone stuck in the sands, to different degrees.

So you have the danger of the sands, the tides and the fog, the boar that comes in, does that affect the whole of the estuary or just Arnside?

It tends to come in the way that the channel is at the moment is on the Arnside side rather than the Grange side, so it comes in on the Arnside channel and floods over. Because the River Bela comes in through Milnthorpe and cuts up the estuary and flows along the marsh bank the other day, there was a kingfisher there, just opposite the kingfisher restaurant.

the marsh is famous for its birds and waders on their migration routes isn’t it?

The geese tend to be on the other side, on the Holker side. Its fantastic when they get ready to go in the autumn. It is a beautiful place.

What about the heritage of the landscape in this zone

Well it was more fishing was not it, there was a port at Arnside and Milnthorpe, there is a section of the railway bridge that used to open for taller ships. Further round at Silverdale, a big area of marshland which was near the car park, has completely gone now, the estuary has changed and it has gone away completely now. There is no grass or sandbank it is just down to the limestone. So that I have seen over the past 4/5 years. I tell you which bit has changed, at Sandside where The Ship is, there is a bank of grassland, and that has some interesting plants in it. We lived at the other end of the village then and
there were some plants I hadn’t seen before. The grange side has changed a lot. It used to be sand up to the shore, but now it is grassed, so that is another change I have seen change. It is better for the sheep.

G So that is when you feel safe to walk on it, when the grass develops.

K Yes I do, and I keep that as my boundary, unless it has been baking hot nad there have been low tides, because you can see, you can see how dry the sand is once the salt starts to come to the surface it must be pretty firm to walk on, but I am still hesitant about going too far. I am probably overcautious.

G Did you ever hear the story about the children from the orphanage being taken across the sands and never coming back, it was the sands at Greenodd which we saw most as children, but we knew of this menace, via this story.

K No I haven’t heard that. There is a big divide between the north and the south of the estuary, apart from the railway bridge it is a very long way around, a long wiggly road.

G Do you know of any artists associated with that landscape

K There is an artist called Fiona Clucas she does a lot based on the estuary, Paul Clarke is an abstract artist and he does things based on the floral patterns on the sands, lots of local artists paint the sands, it is a powerful landmark. No older ones that I can think of. No literature related to the estuary either, or myths and legends. We could develop one!

G Do you notice any seasonal change in the saltmarsh

K The flowers and the samphire, all the little inlets in the salt marsh, they fill up either from the tide or the river, then the tide goes out and you are left with these tiny patchwork of frosted pockets. There are also man made channels, the geometric shapes and they freeze as well, and take a season to regenerate.

G With the herbage you noticed a change in the spring, is there a change in the autumn

K Maybe a change in the colour of the grass

G So the other wildlife which you would notice along with the sheep would be

K Birds, nothing else, oh rabbits. You see wild duck, oyster catchers, lapwings, wading ducks. They do nest on there a friend of mine belongs to the Natural History Society and she asked me as a specific question ‘if I was asked not to walk my dog on that apron of land during a certain time when the ducks were breeding would I object to that’, it was going to be a proposal at a meeting. So I know that they are trying to encourage ducks to breed

G Is it locally prized as a leisure resource?

K I think so yes, but also there is a car park half way along for disabled people, so it has a specialist use, which has been promoted.
## Appendix H  Attribute descriptors and coding HL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute type</th>
<th>Phrase</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience/s</td>
<td>Traditional Amb</td>
<td>Origin</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>earch</td>
<td>Authentic Lakeland</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Allergy-safe food</td>
<td>Safe</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Product of trusted husbandry</td>
<td>Husbandry</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Search/Exp</td>
<td>Darker meat</td>
<td>Sensory</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>erience</td>
<td>The right colour meat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Excellent flavour and texture</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strong flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Far tastier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Earthy Flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Delicious Taste</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fresh</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence/exp</td>
<td>Expected straight from the fell</td>
<td>Meat/enviro</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>erience</td>
<td>Product of a healthy environment</td>
<td>nment link</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dense meat compared to flabby lowland lamb</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lean in winter fat in summer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Longer fibres</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unstressed tender meat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence/exp</td>
<td>Weathers 2/3 yrs best taste</td>
<td>Special</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>erience</td>
<td>Mutton cooked slow in the aga</td>
<td>preference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence/exp</td>
<td>Fairly free-range meat</td>
<td>Breed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>erience</td>
<td>Wild</td>
<td>personality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hardy and tough sheep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pretty sheep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herdwick are the dark sheep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Bought from friends</td>
<td>Distribution</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Buy from producer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Farm raised and butchered</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Farmer’s market efficiency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Customised order</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Odd-shaped joints</td>
<td>Carcass</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>features</td>
<td>features</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Search</td>
<td>Relatively expensive</td>
<td>Price</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Zone of production linked to Potter and Wainwright/ Leisure Association</td>
<td>Heritage</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendix I  Attribute descriptors and coding CSML

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>Phrase</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transported less</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fresher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Less stressed meat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience/Search</td>
<td>Samphire rich grazing</td>
<td>Flavour promise</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Connection between grazing and meat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Different forage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Salt affects flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘Seaweedy-taste’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Credibly different</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Search/Experience</td>
<td>Darker colour meat</td>
<td>Organoleptic</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Meat lighter in colour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Moist meat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Acceptable to the family (no allergies)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Search for producer information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Organic?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Visual appearance of food</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Booths communications</td>
<td>Community</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Higginsons for a treat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sizergh Barn</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mansergh Hall</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Farmers’market</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Banter with producer/butcher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>From contact with producer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Food seasonality</td>
<td>Seasonality</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Special in the spring</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brought on after spring and autumn tides</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Free-range</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not intensive production</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shoulder on the barbecue in the summer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stew/roast in the winter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>No breed/zone preference</td>
<td>Post-modern</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Windswept, scraggy and thawny</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Search</td>
<td>Holker Brand - high cost</td>
<td>Commercialisation</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sets high expectations of unique flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expectations not met</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prohibitively expensive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>TV chef/other references seen</td>
<td>Credibility</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ingredient for recipe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Product of a beautiful area</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product of a wild place</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product of a salty environment</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Produced in an area of historical significance</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not a typical Lakeland environment</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Powerful landmark</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inlets fill up and empty</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Patchwork of frozen pockets</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shares environment with rabbits, oyster-catchers, lapwings, wading ducks, wild ducks, and geese.</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sheep-spotting at Grange</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Environment appreciated by older people</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product of a dangerous environment</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cockle picker’s deaths</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product of a polluted place with rats</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credence</td>
<td>Not aware of breed</td>
<td>Anonymous</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Excellent choice from a restaurant menu</td>
<td>Social</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix J  Ladder Map for HL consumer 1

- Social recognition
  - Responsive and participative in local community
    - Contribute to threatened farming activity
      - Few food miles
        - Purchase direct from producer
          - Less packaging
          - Local
            - Relationship with producer
        - Environmentally responsible
          - Awareness of landscape dynamics
            - Result of healthy, natural lifestyle
              - Tastes good
            - Self-esteem
              - Environmentally responsible
Appendix L  Ladder Map for HL consumer 3

Self-respect

A sense of accomplishment

Capable

Dinner party focus

Excellent texture

Strong flavour

Mutton cooked slow in aga

You can taste the heather

Social recognition

Conservative

Local identity

Provisioning from the local community

Bought from friends

Stress-free meat

Excellent texture

Strong flavour

Mutton cooked slow in aga

You can taste the heather

Bought from friends

Stress-free meat
Appendix M  Ladder Map for HL consumer 8

- An exciting life
- Shared identity
- Experience of the place of production
- Participate in a provisioning system used by our 'culinary expert' friends
- Buy direct from producer
- Relatively expensive
- Farm-reared and butchered
- Far Tastier - breed/weather or fresh air
- Odd-shaped joints visually imperfect meat
- Imperfect cooking experience
- Enjoyment
- Confidence in food quality
- Improved knowledge of meat
- Novelty food exploration
- Individuality
- Provider
- Resilience
- Self-esteem
Appendix N  Ladder Map for HL consumer 9

- Social recognition
- Providing for the family
- Meals enjoyed by family and friends
- Distinctive flavour reflection of diet
  - Herdwick are the 'dark ones'
  - Product of a healthy environment
- Conduit supply to family and friends
- Relationship with supplier
- Ambitious
- Developing knowledge of meat
  - Efficient supply system
    - Farmers' Market
    - The meat is hung for two weeks
- Family food security
- A comfortable life
- Self-respect
- Family food security
- Relationship with supplier
- Conduit supply to family and friends
- Meals enjoyed by family and friends
- Providing for the family
Appendix P  Ladder Map for HL consumer 11

- Social recognition
  - Identity embedded in local society
  - Role in social functions with visitors
  - Local
- Hedonism
  - Social enjoyment
  - Enjoyment of food
  - Earthy flavour
- Self-esteem
  - Independent
  - Responsible purchase
  - Reward good practice
  - Respect for the producer
  - Product of trusted husbandry
  - Smaller cuts than other breeds
  - Customised order
- Unstressed, tender meat
  - Hedonism
- Identity embedded in local society
- Social recognition

308
Herdwick mutton has an amazing flavour. We question the butcher we like to know where it is coming from. We like to support the local community. I would expect Herdwick straight from the fell. The grass and the wild flowers must be good fodder. The only guarantee is to buy direct from the farmer. The competitor cook. Cook it in damson and brown ale. Achieves high standards. Wisdom. Self satisfaction. Reflect on mother's knowledge. Authentic lakeland. Local community product. We like to support the local community.
Appendix R  Ladder Map for HL consumer 16

- **Family security**
- **Wisdom**
- **Inner harmony**
- **Family meal-time contentment**
- **Independent**
- **Identify with place**
- **Meat expert**
- **Part of the Lakeland fells**
- **Sweet-gamey taste**
- **Wootnotesize{eathers} 2/3 yrs old are tastiest**
- **Dense meat compared to flabby lowland**
- **Lean in winter fat in summer**

**Family security**

**Wisdom**

**Inner harmony**

**Family meal-time contentment**

**Independent**

**Identify with place**

**Meat expert**

**Part of the Lakeland fells**

**Sweet-gamey taste**

- **Wootnotesize{eathers} 2/3 yrs old are tastiest**
- **Dense meat compared to flabby lowland**
- **Lean in winter fat in summer**
Appendix S  Ladder Map for HL consumer 20

- **Responsibility**
  - Ecologically sustainable
    - World of beauty  
      - Part of the landscape
        - Natural process
          - No barriers
            - Natural diet
              - Wild
  - Social recognition
  - Exciting life
  - Relationship with supplier
    - Low food-miles
      - High nutritive value
        - Winter warmth
          - Slow-cooking
            - Game-like flavour of mutton
              - Good taste
                - Local
                  - Fresh
                  - Associate with leisure activity - walking
                  - Exciting life
Appendix U  Ladder Map for HLnon-consumer 5

Self-esteem

Ethically acceptable

Part of the local culture of the lakes

They are hardy I see them in Coniston

Well-reared meat

Safe choice - shortcut to 'good food'

Inner harmony

Family food security

Mother's role satisfied Family mealtimes

Good family food

Focus for generosity

Hedonism

Meat from Plumgarths where I go because I can park

Gifts for friends away

Self-esteem

Ethically acceptable

Part of the local culture of the lakes

They are hardy I see them in Coniston

Well-reared meat

Safe choice - shortcut to 'good food'

Inner harmony

Family food security

Mother's role satisfied Family mealtimes

Good family food

Focus for generosity

Hedonism

Meat from Plumgarths where I go because I can park

Gifts for friends away
Appendix V  Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 6

- Social recognition
- Wisdom
- Self-esteem
- Knowledge of local culture
- Duties of a mother
- Safe food
- Fits family requirements
- Easy to cook
- Lean
- Fed on natural diet
- My favourite meat
- Dark strong-flavoured meat
- Traditional Westmorland breed
- Good, authentic, local taste from the fells
- Desire to participate in local culture
- Traditional Westmorland breed
- Good, authentic, local taste from the fells
- Desire to participate in local culture
Appendix W  Ladder Map for  HL.non-consumer 7

Inner Harmony

Conscientious consumer - aware of staff treatment in MROs- actively ethical

Community link

Give value to

Local

Sell it at Mansergh Hall & Booths

Hedonism

Tastes good

Healthy

'Good' food choice

Good animal husbandry

Community link

Conscientious consumer - aware of staff treatment in MROs- actively ethical

Inner Harmony

Give value to

Local

Sell it at Mansergh Hall & Booths
Appendix X  Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 14

- Wisdom
  - Imaginative
    - Strategic purchaser cheaper cuts from well produced meat
      - Logical cost implications
        - Suited to high-level craggy pastures
          - Flavour of unforced production
  - Self-respect
    - Moral obligation to know origin of meat
      - Distinctive taste
        - Independent
          - Leiner than lowland lamb & smaller carcass
            - Rare-breed quality
              - Natives of the Lake District
          - Wild meat attributes
            - Sense of place
              - If you care for it eat it
                - The landscape is a result of their grazing
          - Social class marker
            - Intellectual
              - Inner Harmony
                - Sense of place
                  - If you care for it eat it
                    - The landscape is a result of their grazing

Appendix Y  Ladder Map for HLnon- consumer 15

- Self-respect
- Achievement
- Family security
- Achieved the right to choose
- The best meat option
- Fits higher earning lifestyle
- Distinctive
- Good taste
- Fresh
- Expensive
- Support local production
- Local
- Carefully produced
- Sell at Mansergh Hall or Sizergh Barn
- Local landscape feature - noticed around Coniston and Langdale
Appendix AA Ladder Map for HL non-consumer 18

- Desire to avoid plastic packaging in supermarket
  - Expensive
- Alternative to supermarket high prices
  - Farm shop preferred
  - Sweeter than beef
  - Anonymous amongst sheep to me
- Moving into another phase of life-cycle and cooking
- Internal focus on family needs
  - Capable and controlled
- Now novice purchaser lost tendency to consume in child years
  - Greasy
  - Scravy
- Personal growth
  - Recognises the need to re-learn cooking
  - Quality of life
  - Control of individual preferences in favour of family requirements
  - Self-imposed abstention
- Family food security
  - Responsibility
  - Moving into another phase of life-cycle and cooking
  - Internal focus on family needs
  - Capable and controlled
  - Now novice purchaser lost tendency to consume in child years
  - Greasy
  - Scravy
  - Personal growth
  - Recognises the need to re-learn cooking
  - Quality of life
  - Control of individual preferences in favour of family requirements
  - Self-imposed abstention
  - Family food security
  - Responsibility
Appendix AC Value codes HL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Concrete attributes</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Abstract attribute</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Functional consequence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Distribution</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Local/fresh</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>High quality nutrition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Carcass features</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Unstressed</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Support local community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Origin/traditional</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Husbandry</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>No food miles guilt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Safe</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Sensory</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Supply the extended family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Meat/environment link</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Breed personality</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Dinner party focus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Special preference/health</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Breed appearance</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Reward good practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Price</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Flavour/texture reflects the herdwick’diet/environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Heritage</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Psychological consequence</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Instrumental values</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Terminal values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Provisioning and cooking like mother did/the way things used to be</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>Achieve high standards/capable</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>Wisdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Sustain local ecology/part of the Lakeland fells/sense of place</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>Behave responsibly</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Exciting life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Socially responsible/ regard</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>Family food security</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>Social recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
<td>34</td>
<td>Individuality</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>Inner harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Imaginative solutions</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>A world of beauty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>44</td>
<td>Self-esteem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Hedonism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

321
| 25 | for heritage & culture | 36 | Self-satisfaction Purist Quality of life |
| 26 | Real food experience/seen them on the fells | 37 | |
| 27 | Comforting warming winter food | 38 | |
| 28 | Community networking/supplier | | |
| 29 | Enjoy eating HL/ Successful meals | | |
| 30 | Confidence in food quality | | |
| 31 | Fits a higher earning lifestyle | | |
Appendix AD Summary Implication Matrix HL

323


Appendix AE Hierarchical value map  HL

- Social recognition
  - Behave responsibly
    - Enjoy eating HL/ Successful meals
      - Sensory
      - Local/ fresh
      - Breed appearance
    - Family food security
      - Achieve high standards
      - Quality of life
    - No food miles guilt
      - Sustain local ecology/ part of the Lakeland fells/sense of place
  - Support local community
    - Distribution
  - Community networking/ supplier
    - Self-esteem
    - Hedonism
    - Inner harmony
    - Achieve high standards
    - Quality of life
    - Sustain local ecology/ part of the Lakeland fells/sense of place
    - Enjoy eating HL/ Successful meals
      - Sensory
      - Local/ fresh
      - Breed appearance
    - Family food security
      - Achieve high standards
      - Quality of life
    - No food miles guilt
      - Sustain local ecology/ part of the Lakeland fells/sense of place
    - Social recognition
      - Achieve high standards
      - Quality of life
      - Sustain local ecology/ part of the Lakeland fells/sense of place
      - Enjoy eating HL/ Successful meals
        - Sensory
        - Local/ fresh
        - Breed appearance
      - Family food security
        - Achieve high standards
        - Quality of life
      - No food miles guilt
        - Sustain local ecology/ part of the Lakeland fells/sense of place
  - Self-esteem
  - Hedonism
  - Inner harmony

No food miles guilt

Social recognition

Behave responsibly

Family food security

Achieve high standards

Quality of life

Enjoy eating HL/ Successful meals

Sensory

Local/ fresh

Breed appearance

Inner harmony
Quality of life

Higginsons Holker SML

Negative perception of Production environment
- Rat-infested zone
- Sewage outfall
- Loss of open-air pool

Flavour not satisfying
- Horrible grass
- Awful mud

Self-esteem

Integrity

DIY

Producer killed best but illegal

Family farmed, killed and matured lamb preferred

Food quality important

Independence from Cumbria

Extra expenditure worthwhile

Away from home

Support community

Quality higher

No knowledge of sheep breeds

Home to Kildare

Irish lamb tastes better

Local guarantee

Flavour not satisfying

Irish lamb tastes better

Extra expenditure worthwhile
Appendix AHLadder map for CSMLnon- consumer 4

Inner harmony

My survival

Best choice for me

Fast and cheap

Requires minimal effort

Confidence in food quality

Convenient

Costs more

Adaptable to the seasons

Acceptable to the whole family (no adverse reaction)

Easy to cook

Sunday roast and second day

Holker Brand

Environment of mixed value

Products of a dangerous and dirty place

Shoulder on the BBQ summer

Stew/roast in Winter

My survival

Confidence in food quality

Acceptable to the whole family (no adverse reaction)

Easy to cook

Sunday roast and second day

Holker Brand

Environment of mixed value

Products of a dangerous and dirty place

Shoulder on the BBQ summer

Stew/roast in Winter

Inner harmony

My survival

Best choice for me

Fast and cheap

Requires minimal effort

Confidence in food quality

Convenient

Costs more

Adaptable to the seasons

Acceptable to the whole family (no adverse reaction)

Easy to cook

Sunday roast and second day

Holker Brand

Environment of mixed value

Products of a dangerous and dirty place

Shoulder on the BBQ summer

Stew/roast in Winter

My survival

Confidence in food quality

Acceptable to the whole family (no adverse reaction)

Easy to cook

Sunday roast and second day

Holker Brand

Environment of mixed value

Products of a dangerous and dirty place

Shoulder on the BBQ summer

Stew/roast in Winter

Inner harmony

My survival

Best choice for me

Fast and cheap

Requires minimal effort

Confidence in food quality

Convenient

Costs more

Adaptable to the seasons

Acceptable to the whole family (no adverse reaction)

Easy to cook

Sunday roast and second day

Holker Brand

Environment of mixed value

Products of a dangerous and dirty place

Shoulder on the BBQ summer

Stew/roast in Winter

My survival

Confidence in food quality

Acceptable to the whole family (no adverse reaction)

Easy to cook

Sunday roast and second day

Holker Brand

Environment of mixed value

Products of a dangerous and dirty place

Shoulder on the BBQ summer

Stew/roast in Winter

Inner harmony

My survival

Best choice for me

Fast and cheap

Requires minimal effort

Confidence in food quality

Convenient

Costs more

Adaptable to the seasons

Acceptable to the whole family (no adverse reaction)

Easy to cook

Sunday roast and second day

Holker Brand

Environment of mixed value

Products of a dangerous and dirty place

Shoulder on the BBQ summer

Stew/roast in Winter
Appendix AI Ladder map for CSML consumer 6
Appendix AK Ladder map for CSML consumer 10

- **Self-esteem**
  - Sense of accomplishment
    - Critical desire for free conscience re-food
      - Holker is too expensive
      - Cheaper cuts
      - Search for producer information
      - Local
    - Concern for animal husbandry
      - Financial limitations
      - Preference for cold lamb, fat has sugary taste
      - Rich flavour but not so different from other lamb
      - SML fed on good quality grass
      - Lighter in colour SML
      - Product of a treacherous environment
  - Questions retailers
    - Preference for free range chickens
    - Questions retailers
  - Food matters
    - Inner harmony
    - Fulfilment
      - Sense of accomplishment
      - Self-esteem
      - Inner harmony
      - Fulfilment
      - Food matters
      - Critical desire for free conscience re-food
      - Holker is too expensive
      - Cheaper cuts
      - Search for producer information
      - Local
      - Preference for cold lamb, fat has sugary taste
      - Rich flavour but not so different from other lamb
      - SML fed on good quality grass
      - Lighter in colour SML
      - Product of a treacherous environment
      - Concern for animal husbandry
      - Financial limitations
Appendix AL Ladder map for CSML consumer 11

Self-esteem
  - Defer responsibility to others
    - Limited concern for production details
      - Dominant perception of generic lamb
        - Family memories of Irish Stew
          - Generous cut
        - Trusted source
          - From local butcher
  - SML Ingredient for recipe
    - SML very expensive
      - French like it and they value food more than in the UK
        - Salty environment
          - Tender meat
        - High Expectations
          - Unique flavour expectation from the landscape
            - Willing to try
              - Minimal adventure
                - Inner harmony
  - Inner harmony
    - Minimal adventure
      - Willing to try
        - Unique flavour expectation from the landscape
Appendix AM  Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 13

Self-esteem

A sense of accomplishment

Self-reward

Leisure activities

Cultural awareness

Aversion to mainstream supermarkets

Able to be discerning

Sheep-spotting from the prom. at Grange

Aware of SML France

Hedonism

Freedom from daily feeding obligation

Eat out with the family

Enjoying semi-retirement

Mum was a housewife I am not

Memories of Mum's roast lamb

Quality of meat is worth the fat

Higginson's for a treat

Expensive

Local butcher

Local lamb on the label at Booths

Individual producer in mind

Favourite meat

Ingredient for Hot Pot

Can be fatty

Mum was a housewife I am not

Enjoying semi-retirement

Memories of Mum's roast lamb

Quality of meat is worth the fat

Hedonism

Freedom from daily feeding obligation

Eat out with the family

Quality of meat is worth the fat

Can be fatty

Aversion to mainstream supermarkets

Able to be discerning

Sheep-spotting from the prom. at Grange

Aware of SML France

Self-esteem

A sense of accomplishment

Self-reward

Leisure activities

Cultural awareness

Aversion to mainstream supermarkets

Able to be discerning

Sheep-spotting from the prom. at Grange

Aware of SML France

Hedonism

Freedom from daily feeding obligation

Eat out with the family

Enjoying semi-retirement

Mum was a housewife I am not

Memories of Mum's roast lamb

Quality of meat is worth the fat

Higginson's for a treat

Expensive

Local butcher

Local lamb on the label at Booths

Individual producer in mind

Favourite meat

Ingredient for Hot Pot

Can be fatty

Mum was a housewife I am not

Enjoying semi-retirement

Memories of Mum's roast lamb

Quality of meat is worth the fat
Appendix AN Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 14
Appendix ALOadder map for CSML non-consumer 15

- Exciting Life
- Escapism

- Vegetarian experience - training ground for food examination
- Nostalgic
- Preference for the way things used to be

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try

- 'Seaweed-y-taste'
- Saltier
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Farmers' market
- Faster throughput
- Local

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh

- SML
- Holker

- Eat less meat, but of good quality
- Relish new experiences

- Like to try new experiences
- Relish new experiences
- Trust

- Cost addition
- Moist
- Fresh
Appendix AQLadder map for CSML non-consumer 8

- Inner harmony
- Peace of mind
- Forced repetition in provisioning
- Limited sourcing options
- Fit personal requirements
  - Local produce
  - Organic
  - Fresh
- Identity
  - Where I see myself
  - Aware of limits to 'local'
    - Not relevant to my Lakeland life
      - West Coast where I've seen them grazing is detached from the Lakes
        - Not typical of the Lakeland environment
          - Product of a wild place
Appendix AR Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 9
Appendix AS Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 12

- **Family contentment**
  - Central family focus
    - Meets family requirements
      - Traditional Lamb Roast
        - Identified as local by Butcher
        - SML & Organic prohibitively expensive
      - Cooking style would mask the subtle flavour
        - Suitable for middle-eastern cuisine
      - Quality of English lamb over the French
        - Emblem of England
          - Product of a lovely environment
            - Wild
              - free-range
              - Not intensive production
              - Windswept, scraggy, thawny
  - Identity
    - Meets family requirements

Appendix AT Ladder map for CSML consumer 16
Appendix AU Ladder map for CSML consumer 17

Self-esteem

Contentment

Uncomplicated food requirements

We have time to enjoy buying good food now

Possess credible value & Good flavour

Healthy non-breed-specific sheep

Grazing on an unusual selection of plants

Salty environment

Product of a lovely but dangerous environment

Recognised from TV 'Coast'
Appendix AV Ladder map for CSML consumer 18

- Health
  - Satisfaction doesn't require detailed product knowledge
    - Generic product requirements
      - Traditional Roast Joint
      - Holker Brand
    - Just another retailer
  - Inner harmony
    - Self censorship of food information
      - Meat and animal are separate concepts
    - No recognised effect on product
      - Product of a dangerous environment
      - Different forage
      - Salty environment

- Health
  - Satisfaction doesn't require detailed product knowledge
    - Generic product requirements
      - Traditional Roast Joint
      - Holker Brand
    - Just another retailer
  - Inner harmony
    - Self censorship of food information
      - Meat and animal are separate concepts
    - No recognised effect on product
      - Product of a dangerous environment
      - Different forage
      - Salty environment
Appendix AW  

Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 19

- Self-esteem
  - Self-motivated
  - Independent-minded
- Identity
- Hedonism
  - Pleasure
  - Food as a leisure activity
- Social history and food
- Argue against common belief
  - I like it pink
  - Need fat for cooking and taste (SML lean claims)
  - Nan liked shoulder of lamb best
  - Lamb was lamb, no concept of breed or place
  - Like Mum shopped
  - Local butcher
- Does not label as much as others
- Stocks tough fell usually
- Buy bulk and freeze
- Farmer's market
- Not direct or mail order
- Silverdale area seen deep grazing
  - Silverdale expected to be moist
  - Same connection as for Herdwick with heather etc.
- Local business competition
  - USP rivalry between retailers
  - Local community network
  - Feed-off others
  - Some self-censorship
  - Vague on supply routes to retail
- Outraged at animals in transport
- See what I buy
  - Large
- Local community network
  - Social recognition
  - Peace of mind
  - Some self-censorship
  - Feed-off others
- Independent-minded
- Argue against common belief
  - I like it pink
  - Need fat for cooking and taste (SML lean claims)
  - Nan liked shoulder of lamb best
  - Lamb was lamb, no concept of breed or place
  - Like Mum shopped
  - Local butcher
- Does not label as much as others
- Stocks tough fell usually
- Buy bulk and freeze
- Farmer's market
- Not direct or mail order
- Silverdale area seen deep grazing
  - Silverdale expected to be moist
  - Same connection as for Herdwick with heather etc.
- Local business competition
  - USP rivalry between retailers
  - Local community network
  - Social recognition
  - Peace of mind
  - Some self-censorship
  - Feed-off others
- Independent-minded
- Argue against common belief
  - I like it pink
  - Need fat for cooking and taste (SML lean claims)
  - Nan liked shoulder of lamb best
  - Lamb was lamb, no concept of breed or place
  - Like Mum shopped
  - Local butcher
- Does not label as much as others
- Stocks tough fell usually
- Buy bulk and freeze
- Farmer's market
- Not direct or mail order
- Silverdale area seen deep grazing
  - Silverdale expected to be moist
  - Same connection as for Herdwick with heather etc.
- Local business competition
  - USP rivalry between retailers
  - Local community network
  - Social recognition
  - Peace of mind
  - Some self-censorship
  - Feed-off others
- Independent-minded
- Argue against common belief
  - I like it pink
  - Need fat for cooking and taste (SML lean claims)
  - Nan liked shoulder of lamb best
  - Lamb was lamb, no concept of breed or place
  - Like Mum shopped
  - Local butcher
- Does not label as much as others
- Stocks tough fell usually
- Buy bulk and freeze
- Farmer's market
- Not direct or mail order
- Silverdale area seen deep grazing
  - Silverdale expected to be moist
  - Same connection as for Herdwick with heather etc.
Appendix AX Ladder map for CSML non-consumer 20

Identity

Self-esteem

An exciting life

World of beauty

Pure pleasure

Maturity

Earned the right to chose

Out and about

Food doesn't need to be too technical

Self-awareness

Reflection

Professional

Sense of place

Unaware of breeds

Time

Cook for one so select good meat

Turf and clover around the edge of the Bay

Anonymous sheep

Traditional comfort

Better quality and flavour

The Bay is a place for artists

I used to buy pickled samphire

Mark time by food selection

Like Mother shopped

Salt marsh lamb

Darker colour meat

Season is important

Local butcher

Sainsbury or Booths

Pure pleasure

Identity

Self-esteem

An exciting life

World of beauty

Pure pleasure

Maturity

Earned the right to chose

Out and about

Food doesn't need to be too technical

Self-awareness

Reflection

Professional

Sense of place

Unaware of breeds

Time

Cook for one so select good meat

Turf and clover around the edge of the Bay

Anonymous sheep

Traditional comfort

Better quality and flavour

The Bay is a place for artists

I used to buy pickled samphire

Mark time by food selection

Like Mother shopped

Salt marsh lamb

Darker colour meat

Season is important

Local butcher

Sainsbury or Booths

Pure pleasure
Appendix AY Value codes CSML

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Concrete attributes</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Abstract attribute</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Functional consequence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Non-flavour</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Local/fresh</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Appreciation - flavour/texture reflects the diet/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Organoleptic</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Flavour</td>
<td></td>
<td>environment+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Commercialisation</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Time</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Appreciation - flavour/texture reflects the diet/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Network</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Credibility</td>
<td></td>
<td>environment-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Landscape</td>
<td></td>
<td>Adds to varied diet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Low food miles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fits my way of provisioning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Seen sheep grazing the marsh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Positive reflections</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Critical perspective/</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>Part of the ecosystem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>on landscape</td>
<td></td>
<td>Integrity</td>
<td></td>
<td>Place identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Nostalgia for childhood</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>Independence</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>Inner harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>experiences of</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Sense of</td>
<td></td>
<td>A world of beauty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>provisioning and</td>
<td></td>
<td>accomplishment</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>Escapism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>eating local food.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Self-protection</td>
<td></td>
<td>Self-esteem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Community networking/supplier</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Family</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Hedonism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>contentment</td>
<td></td>
<td>Healthy/active/secure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
<td>36</td>
<td>Social recognition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

344
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>18</th>
<th>19</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>21</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence in food quality/ethics</td>
<td>I can reward myself with quality food</td>
<td>Can’t discuss an animal relating to meat</td>
<td>Thinking about the passing of time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of life</td>
<td>My survival</td>
<td>Sense of place</td>
<td>Peace of mind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>41</td>
<td></td>
<td>An exciting life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>345</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix AZ Summary implication matrix CSML
Appendix AAA  
Hierarchical value map for CSML

- Quality of life
- Community/networking with supplier
- Fits my way of provisioning
- Local/fresh
- I can reward myself with quality food
- Appreciation - flavour/texture reflects the diet/environment positively
- Positive reflections on the landscape
- Seen sheep grazing on the salt marsh
- Landscape
- Sense of place
- Thinking about the passing of time
- Sense of accomplishment
- Self-esteem
- Inner harmony
- Place identity
- Part of the ecosystem
- Quality of life
- Community/networking with supplier
- Fits my way of provisioning
- Local/fresh
- I can reward myself with quality food
- Appreciation - flavour/texture reflects the diet/environment positively
- Positive reflections on the landscape
- Seen sheep grazing on the salt marsh
- Landscape
- Sense of place
- Thinking about the passing of time
- Sense of accomplishment
- Self-esteem
- Inner harmony
- Place identity
- Part of the ecosystem

347